Citizenship, Nationalism and Islam: The Hidden Stories of Girls' Educational, and Emotional Experiences in Balochistan

By

Sidra Rind

A dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment of

the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

(Educational Policy Studies & Curriculum and Instruction)

at the

University of Wisconsin-Madison

2019

Date of oral examination: 05/03/2019

The dissertation is approved by the following members of the Final Oral Committee:

Dr. Nancy Kendall, Professor of Educational Policy Studies

Dr. Michael Apple, Professor of Educational Policy Studies

Dr. Stacey Lee, Professor of Educational Policy Studies

Dr. Simone Schweber, Professor of Curriculum and Instruction

Dr. Lesley Bartlett, Professor of Curriculum and Instruction

Dr. Li-Ching Ho, Associate Professor of Curriculum and Instruction

Dedication

I dedicate my dissertation to my academic advisor and mentor prof. Nancy Kendall, her family, and my mother.

Abstract

My research examines how the education system, tasked with shaping citizens and their relations to one another and to the state, works in the gendered and socio-religiously segregated terrain of Pakistan, to (re)fashion women's experiences of political and social citizenship. I examine the production of a 'Pakistani' identity with respect to three main signifiers – religion, gender and nationalism – among the young girls of Pakistan. To do so, I conducted curricular and educational policy content analysis and ethnographic fieldwork in Quetta, Pakistan. While using critical ethnographic stance, I demonstrate how schools (re)produce and (re)configure Pakistani girlhood. On the one hand, textbooks and teachers construct the 'ideal' Pakistani Muslim woman by restrictively locating her in school and private, domestic spaces. On the other, female students and teachers contest such (re)presentations of the ideal by strategically employing narratives of belonging – whether to family, kin, class or ethnic, religious and national groups. In recording this ongoing contestation, my dissertation offers new insights into the co-construction of citizenship and belonging in schools and engages broader debates about how young women are or are not incorporated into community, national, and international politics and polities.

Acknowledgments

This dissertation would not have been possible without the patience, dedication and faith of my academic advisor prof. Nancy Kendall. She has been an exemplary mentor and guide. She truly models what it means to be a mentor, educator, and researcher, and I have no doubt she will continue to be a constant source of inspiration for people.

I am extremely grateful to the distinguish committee members of my PhD dissertation. I would like to thank Prof. Simone Schweber, prof. Lesley Bartlett, prof. Michael Apple, prof. Stacey Lee, and prof. Li-Ching Ho. I sincerely thank all of you for your valuable insights, comments, time, and guidance in completing this dissertation.

I am very thankful to my wonderful friends especially Miriam Thangaraj, who is also my mentor. Without her encouragement, advice, and support, I would never had made it this far. Pallavi Chhabra, the most caring and supportive friend anyone could ask for. I appreciate her constant encouragement and support.

I would like to extend my heartfelt gratitude to all the research participants in Pakistan, who welcomed me and trusted me enough to talk about their lives, schooling and experiences. Without their help, this dissertation would not have been possible. Also, I would like to thank the Fulbright Pakistan program and the University of Wisconsin-Madison's partial financial support in supporting the coursework and dissertation for my PhD.

I want to thank my dearest children Rehan and Alishba, my lovely parents, and my caring siblings for their continued support and encouragement. Finally, to Atique, my exceptionally supportive friend and life companion. It is because of his love, care, and support that I have made it through.

Table of Contents

List of Maps

Chapter One: Introduction

One of the most important goals of education is to evolve the minds of the young generations to become better citizens. Such an approach equips youth with proper skills, knowledge and sense of obligations towards their home, society, country, and to the extent possible, the whole world. Furthermore, it also prepares them to participate in civic affairs and play their roles in strengthening their society in a democratic way. However, the political underpinning of education is an ongoing debate amongst academics. Foucault considers education as an arena where power discourses are regulated (Ball, 1990). Bourdieu (1977) asserts education's role in reproducing dominant culture in schools with the aim to legitimize and perpetuate existing power structures in society. It seems universally true that schooling, as a distributive mechanism in society, is influenced by the politics of social class, gender, race, culture and religion. These play pivotal roles in developing individuals' notions about how to understand and practice citizenship.

Research Questions

This research examines the construction of citizenship in educational discourse and practice in Pakistan. Particularly, I examine how identities are constructed in and by curriculum and instruction in the government-run girls' high schools that the majority of girl students in Pakistan attend. In other words, the study explores the ways the educational policies, curriculum,[1] pedagogical practices, and school experiences construct girl students' citizenship in Pakistan. It aims to:

[1] Here I utilize Kelly's definition to define curriculum that includes four major dimensions of educational planning and practice: the intentions of the planners (official curriculum), the procedures adopted for the implementation of those intentions (formal curriculum), the actual experiences of the pupils when tile curriculum is enacted in the classroom (actual or received curriculum), and the unintended learning that occurs as a by-product of the organization of the curriculum and school (hidden curriculum) (Kelly, 1999). Please see more for details: Kelly, A.

1- Explore the representation and construction of Pakistani citizenship in formal curricular texts.
2- Understand how students perceive the textbooks and instruction and construct notions of citizenship and national identities.
3- Investigate how teachers, through their classroom instruction, construct Pakistani citizenship.
4- Suggest research implications in the light of the data collected.

For all of these questions, the study focuses on the intersection of religion, ethnicity, social class and gender with notions of Pakistani citizenship.

Research Rationale

Girls' education is an umbrella term that comprises the primary, middle and high school levels in the Pakistan government schools. It also comprises of all educational policies with reference to female literacy, school access, curriculum, female teachers, school physical facilities, etc. Girls' education is subjected to the forces of both demand as well as supply barriers such as poverty, parents' education and a variety of socio-cultural factors, coupled with lack of school facilities, curriculum, teaching materials and inadequacy or absence of female teachers, which are the main reasons for the persistent gender disparities and gaps between male and female education. Because of the nature of the PhD research that is always very specific and focused, my broader aim is to better understand and potentially in time inform and improve girls' education policies and practices in general, but the specific aim is to learn about their educational

---

V. (1999). The Curriculum: theory and practice. London: Paul Chapman Publishing Ltd.

experiences and perceptions as regards citizenship education in girls' schools.

Education plays a very important role in shaping the citizens of the modern polity. In schools, this task is done by the curriculum (textbooks and hidden curriculum), formal instruction, and the messages students (girls and boys) receive by interacting with their peers and teachers. Keeping these things in mind, the true aim of this study is to present a more holistic picture of the construction of citizenship identity within Pakistani educational institutions by tracing the transformation of the official curriculum into the actual or received experiences of students and the resultant perceptions of students of their citizenship.

In a developing country like Pakistan, educational research, if undertaken, is seldom concerned with an examination of the socio-cultural roots and effects of official knowledge. Moreover, the curriculum is revised not on the basis of research, but as and when it suits the government. There is also very little literature available on actual classroom practices. Similarly, because of teachers' poor subject knowledge and the nonexistence of libraries, the textbook, in many cases, is the only book that a student will read, and a teacher will use. We, however, cannot assume that what is in the text is actually taught or learnt. Teachers may mediate and transform the text material when they use it in the classrooms. Students, too, bring their class, ethnic, religious and gender backgrounds with them in the classroom, all of which influence their reading of the texts and may lead them to accept, reinterpret or reject what they read. To take account of the fact that for each text there are multiple readings and interpretations, it is necessary to look into the ways students' perceptions are shaped by not only what they read and are taught but also the class climate and school ethos in which this process takes place. There is, then, a need to look at the ways education is shaping students' sense of who they are as Pakistanis and its implications for social relations in Pakistan by adopting an extended view of

curriculum encompassing the written education policy, the curriculum and textbooks as well as the ways the written curriculum is translated into school experiences and practices.

During my literature review phase, I found a diverse body of literature on the status of women in Pakistan[2]. Despite this, there is very little research on women and education in Pakistan. Thus, I contribute to this literature in the hope of providing intellectual stimulus to further research and policy improvement in this respect.

Literature Review

This study explores the way the curriculum, pedagogical methods, and school-based and school-family interactions and relations shape students' senses of citizenship in Pakistani schools, within the broader framework of the socio-cultural and political economic systems in which schooling occurs. The study focuses particularly on the interaction of four signifiers of citizenship identity: gender, religion, ethnicity, and social class. This chapter critically analyzes and reviews the previous literature on these dimensions of citizenship to develop a theoretical frame of reference for conducting empirical work on the relationship between citizenship identity and curriculum and instruction.

Citizenship

The term citizenship is commonly used in two senses. First, it can be used to refer to the way in which a person engages as a member with particular rights and responsibilities within the constitution and laws of a state in which they have (or hope to have) status as a citizen[3]. Second,

---

[2] Weiss, 1986 & 1998; Mumtaz and Shaheed, 1987, 1998; Jalal, 1991; Saigol, 1993, 1995, 1997; JamaI, 2002; Khan, 1992; Jahangir and; Zia, 1994; Haq, 1996; Saeed and Khan, 2000; Sathar, 1996; Jamal, 1995,2002; Naseem, 2004)

[3] I utilize here the definition of Guibernau. According to him a nation-state is " [A] modern phenomenon, characterized by the formation of a kind of state which has the monopoly of what it claims to be the legitimate use of force within a demarcated territory and seeks to unite the people subjected to its rule by means of homogenization, creating a common culture, symbols, values, reviving traditions and myths of origins, and sometimes inventing them". Please see for more detail: Guibernau, M. (1996). Nationalisms: the nation-state and

the term can also be applied in a wider sense - in the way an individual perceives and practices being a member, according to his or her own perceptions of what is right as a human being, in a particular society, and/or as a member of an interest group (Isin &Wood, 1999).

On a general analytical level, citizenship is understood as status (social, economic, civil, political rights and entitlements), identity and practice (the exercise of those rights and entitlements, agency). In other words, it is the outcome and the process of exercising citizenship in the vertical dimension (citizen/state) and the horizontal dimension (citizen/citizen) in a given society (Shamim and Sever, 2004).

The concept of citizenship began with the Greeks where all free men shared in the decision-making and operation of common affairs (Heater, 2004). However, formal citizenship for these individuals had to wait for the shift in the balance against free men in favor of monarchs during the age of absolutism in Europe. The late eighteenth-century revolutions in America and France brought the citizen and citizenship onto the stage of modern politics, which called for equality, social fraternity and national sovereignty (Sear, 1997). In the nineteenth century, citizenship acquired its current connotative and denotative meanings, and citizenship became a cardinal feature of European state constitution (Faulks, 2000).

The development of citizenship in the west was given a classical formulation by the British sociologist Thomas Humphrey Marshall (1950). The following extended citation is the definition of citizenship by Marshall that is generally accepted as the starting point for further discussion about the concept of citizenship that is currently embedded in international infrastructure such as the United Nations:

---

nationalism in the twentieth century. Cambridge: Polity Press.

> [Citizenship has] three parts, or elements, civil, political, and social. The civil element is composed of the rights necessary for individual freedom-liberty of the person, freedom of speech, thought and faith, the right to own property and to conclude valid contracts, and the right to justice… The institutions most directly associated with civil rights are the courts of justice. By the political element, I mean the right to participate in the exercise of political power as a member of a body invested with political authority or as an elector of the members of such a body. The corresponding institutions are parliament and council of local government. By the social element, the whole range from the right to a modicum of economic welfare and society to the right to share to the full in the social heritage and to the life of a civilized being according to the standards prevailing in the society. The institutions most connected with it are the educational system and the social services. (Marshall, 1950: 10-11)

For Marshall, these civil, political and social rights build up to the individual, who is regarded as the basic unit of society. The recognition that political citizenship may not be effective if social and civil rights are not exercised is implicit in this definition. However, Hall and Held (1989) have pointed out, such a definition of citizenship opens the way to view citizenship as a multi-layered concept. Even though if we further interrogate the relationship between nation and state, it would be clear that political subjects are often involved in more than one political community, the boundaries of which can be local, ethnic, national or global, and many extend within, across, or beyond state lines.

Marshal also talked about duties and obligations in his essay titled "*Citizenship and Social Class"* (1950), where he defines citizenship as "a status bestowed on those who are full members of a community. All those, who possess the status, are equal with respect to the rights and duties with which the status is endowed" (p.102). Similarly, Bryan Turner (1992) has noted that citizenship is also a set of practices – juridical, political, economic, and cultural. Such conceptualizations have been criticized by progressive academics based in the west (Yuval-Davis, 1997 b; Faulks, 2000; Freedman, 2002; Arnot, 2000) as being blind to gender, race, class, disability and sexual differences within a country.

Thus, citizenship can be described as both a set of practices (cultural, symbolic, and economic) and a bundle of rights and duties (civil, political and social) that define an individual's membership in a polity (Isin & Wood, 1999). It is important to recognize both aspects of citizenship – as practices and as status – while also recognizing that without the latter, individuals cannot hold civil, political and social rights. In the same vein, many rights often first arise as practices and then become embodied in law as status. Citizenship is therefore neither a purely sociological concept nor purely a legal concept but a relationship between the two (Isin & Wood, 1999). While then, citizenship can be defined as legal and political status, from a sociological point of view it can be defined as competent membership in a polity, thus emphasizing the constitutive aspect of citizenship (Turner, 1994b). But those who do not posses the civil, political and social rights to exercise such citizenship would be denied to become a competent and full-fledged member of the polity in the first place. Thus, the sociological and political-legal definitions of citizenship are not mutually exclusive but constitutive (Turner, 1990, 1997).

Today in the West, the concept of citizenship presents an individual as a free and autonomous being, who acts in the political/public sphere and receives social entitlements and privileges based on individual citizenship. This concept is deeply gendered, as it is defined in opposition to the sphere of private work in which women are generally more engaged and that is associated with them (Freedman, 2002). Contemporary feminist work on citizenship has established that citizenship is not a neutral concept but one that is gendered, sexualized, raced, and classed (Alexander, 1997; Anthias and Yuval-Davis, 1989; Walby, 1994; Philips, 1995, Lister, 1997; Yuval-Davis, 1997; Rousse, 1998). The feminist literature on the gendered nature of citizenship demonstrates that women are in fact outside the frame of patriarchal citizenship. It

argues that women's status as citizens is written by a sexual contract, which denies them free and equal status on a par with that of men (Pateman, 1988). It also reveals that there is an enormous gulf between the apparent guarantee of full citizenship for women and actual lived experiences of women (Leech, 1994).

Among many other feminist intellectuals, I find Yuval-Davis's work very relevant to my study. She precisely points out that although the study of citizenship cannot capture all the different dimensions of social control and negotiations in different aspects of life, it can " throw light on some of the major issues which are involved in the complex relationship between individuals, collectivities and the state, and the ways gender relations (as well as other social divisions) affect and are affected by them" (Yuval-Davis, 1997, p.6). She goes on to suggest that rather than focusing on the public/private division we should think of citizenship in terms of three different spheres: the state, civil society, and the domain of the family, kinship and other primary relationships. Since each of these spheres lays claim on a different importance in the determination of the political, civil and social rights of citizens, she suggests that a study of citizenship must include an "examination of the individual autonomy allowed to citizens (of different, gender, ethnicity, region, class, stage in the life cycle, etc) vis-à-vis their families, civil society organizations and state agencies" (Yuval-Davis, 1997, p.15). She proposes that a theory of citizenship must be flexible enough to deal with the changing global situation and contemporary reconstruction of state and society. Noting that state institutions are increasingly being privatized, she finds it analytically useful to separate the notion of citizenship from that of nation-state. Once citizenship is understood as a concept wider than just a relationship between the individual and the state, she contends, it becomes a useful political tool in women's struggle

for citizenship against oppressive relations and practices that are authorized in the name of culture and tradition within their families and communities (Yuval-Davis, 1997).

In an examination of Bryan Turner's comparative typology of active and passive citizenship, Yuval-Davis suggests that we should dispense with the dichotomous concept of citizens as subjects of an absolute authority or as active political agents. She points out that even the most dramatically active states include some people who are much more passive, too disempowered or alienated to even engage in the formal act of voting. As Yuval-Davis says, "Gender, sex, age, and ability as well as ethnicity and class are important factors in determining the relationship of people to their communities and states" (Yuval-Davis, 1997, P.84). Further, she draws our attention to the intersecting and interacting nature of categories such as gender, race, class, ethnicity and geographical location, which problematize the very notion of community to membership of which a citizen can lay claim.

This is especially important in many "Third World" states, especially in Muslim states, where outward-facing formal citizenship structures (e.g., Constitutions) may be structured in relation to the individual, but where other formal structures and social structures are constructed in relation to individuals as members of families, clans, tribes, ethnic or religious subgroups (Yuval-Davis, 1997). It is argued that Muslim women have a "diminished" citizenship due to strong patriarchal structures (Kandiyuti, 1991; Walby, 1994; Saigol 2003). Muslim states predominately have located women within patriarchal structures as subordinates: mother, wife, child and sibling. Women do not enjoy "thick" citizenship status as in Tilly's notion,[4] emerging

4 Charles Tilly (1996) defines citizenship: "a continuing series of transaction between persons and agents of a given state in which each has enforceable rights and obligations based on persons' categorical membership and agents s' relation to the state" (p, 8). He further elaborates that this citizenship is not uniform category but "can range from thin to thick: thin where it entails few transactions, rights and obligations; thick where it occupies a significant share all transactions, rights and obligations sustained by state agents and people living under their jurisdiction" (p. 8).

from the fact that her relationship with the state is not direct but articulated through a mediator. This intermediary is her father, her brother, her husband, and, by extension, her family or tribe. Patriarchy dynamics mobilize kinship structure, morality and idioms to legitimate male and elder privilege. The state grants women rights as citizens; these rights, however, can only be actualized through the males in the family, who have control over women's actions and conduct. Defining women's rights and responsibilities has been a masculine enterprise (Lazreg, 2000; Zubaida, 2001). The impact of patriarchy on the gendering of citizenship has been profound because kinship has permeated all domains, all spheres of life: private/public, state/civil society/kinship, and governmental/nongovernmental/domestic in Muslim countries (Joseph, 1999a; Charrad, 2000; Altorki, 2000).

Furthermore, religion is a central force in politics in Muslim countries like Pakistan, directly marking the gendering of citizenship (Keddie, 1999; Joseph, 1999a; Saigol, 2003; Shaheed, 2002,). In most Muslim states, the male and female citizens as legal subject have been constituted as both a religious identity and a political identity. Citizens in such states have experienced their relationship to the state as mediated through religious communities. Muslim states have imagined their citizens to be differentiated by religious attachments and primordial identities and loyalties preceding the state. This "civic myth" has fostered a series of state-sanctioned religious intermediaries between the state and citizens (Joseph 1999a). Muslim states have mandated compliance with the rules of religion; they have constituted the legal subject in terms of religions.

The contentious interpretation of Islam's role in the gendering of citizenship practices and laws can be vividly seen in most of the Muslim states. Mernissi (1996) argues that Islamic

sharia[5] has been a masculine discipline. Barbara F. Stowasser (1996) argues, "Islam has been contested from within by traditionalists, modernists and Islamists. I argue that these differences of opinion and interpretation of Islam's position on women's citizenship was explained with self-interest to gain authority and legitimacy. Stowasser (1996) also concludes that Islam was used for social and individual interests and has now become an ascendant need for the powerful only as long as its advocates have been situated in positions of power.

Gendering of citizenship is the outcome of the interlacing of individual, family and the state, the meshing of public and private and the rootedness of religion and politics. Different power brokers, actors, communities or social groups differ in their views and understandings regarding citizenship in any given society. There are varied opinions on what kind of rights and entitlements citizenship should include in any particular society. It is also pivotal to comprehend how both laws and people think citizenship could and should be exercised by different groups. Furthermore, some social and cultural constructs such as ideological, religious, ethnic, and class-related cleavages also strongly impact on gendered notions, concepts, and practices of citizenship. Therefore, I argue that to understand girls' experiences of citizenship in Pakistan, we have to explore the formal efforts, practical negotiations, and uses of force to shape citizenship related to power relations among different actors and the state. These are gendered, classed, raced, and laced through with religious, family, and clan traditions that are both reflected and challenged by formal state laws and the history and political economy of the family, region, and state itself. This research explores how girls' citizenship is structured by these forces in Balochistan, Pakistan at this point in the history of the Pakistani state.

[5] *Sharia* is a sacred law of Islam. It is used to refer both to the Islamic system of law and the totality of the Islamic way of life. It is derived both from: the divine revelations set forth in the Quran, and the sayings and example set by the Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) in the *Sunnah*.

Education and Citizenship

Since education is the most important institution of socialization after the family, its significance to the construction of national identities and citizenship identity is widely acknowledged (Oliver and Heater, 1994, Lowe, 1999; Philips et al., 1999; Shibata 2004; Davila Balsera, 2005). In Europe and the U.S., the role of education in shaping the citizen of the modern polity has been of central concern to theorists of democracy and of nationalism. Gellner's analysis of nationalism sees formal schooling as a pivotal transformative experience that establishes the homogenous culture and form of communication that give birth to industrialized nations, which in turn confer specific abstract rights on citizens, different to the localized and tradition-bound rights of the non-state polity (Gellner, 2006). Foucault describes schooling as instilling the regimented discipline of the body and mind fundamental to modernity and life within the modern state (Foucault, 1977). Gutman has pointed out how education not only sets the stage for democratic politics, but plays a central role in educating citizens to support the continuation of basic democratic ideals and practices for the next generation; thus questions of the purposes and distribution of education are central questions for political theory (Gutman, 1999).

Education in Muslim states is one of the most important 'public' spaces made accessible to women in the course of 'modernization' and therefore is important in defining the changing roles of men and women in society. In relation to the contested notion of citizenship in Muslim states, the pivotal role of education has to be understood as defining and redefining concepts of gendered citizenship by the state and the political/religious groups that struggle to control it. This centrality is based on the important role of women as biological reproducers of members of ethnic/national groups. More specifically, women in Muslim societies are perceived as

‘metaphors for the integrity of Islamic community, expressing its purity in an idiom common to Muslim culture, honor and … chastity (Peteet, 1993 cited in Davis, 1997b). This means that the provision of different approaches to education for girls and women has been important to the regimes and political parties or groups in Muslim states. Education, particularly female education, in Muslim states has become the arena in which women’s symbolic centrality as bearers of gendered collective identities is expressed and contested, both within the country and in reaction to external forces.

In Pakistan, the notion of democratic citizenship described above is complicated by the trauma and insecurity that Pakistani women and men have experienced during and with different governing regimes (i.e. military and unstable democratic) since independence, and the longer history of British colonial governance. It has always meant belonging to a contested national entity (either for ideological, religious, ethnic or other reasons, or a combination of these factors). It means being manipulated by state authorities who want to define and redefine what is to be a Pakistani male or female citizen in order to fill its ranks and project its image both internally, within the nation, and internationally.

In addition, there are various internal divisions among Pakistanis that impact their concepts of citizenship and add to its fragility – including gender, ethnicity, language, religion, parochial affiliation, politics, ideology, social class, disability, material and family status, urban or rural origin, and much else besides.

Political Processes and Prevalent Notions of Citizenship in Pakistan

In Pakistan, the authority and power of constructing or determining the ‘reality’ and the official truth lies with the state. The state, according to Naseem (2006), monopolizes the production of truth and rationality by defining what is rational, reasonable, and credible. The

division of societies into different levels and forms of inequalities and differences takes place through varied discourses of religion and education. These differences are then compartmentalized into mutually exclusive areas. These discourses create social hierarchies in terms of class, gender and other inequalities. Many scholars agree that after independence in 1947, these discourses were largely exclusive of each other; however, from the 1973 constitution promulgation, they started to merge under state sponsorship in such a way that the influence of the religious discourse on education has become predominant (Zia, 2003; Shaheed, 2002). This development evidently started with the beginning of General Zia-ul-Haq's regime in 1977 and has continued until the present. These discourses reproduce the masculine state, the tribute-gathering economic structure, and the patriarchal value system (Naseem, 2006). The post-colonial Pakistani state evolved with a unique nature and character since its inception. I deem it necessary to look into that evolution process and understand the underlying causes and patterns of how and why gendered identities are constructed in the country as they are**.**

Pakistan is an ideological state. It is one of the two countries created on a religious ideology after the Second World War following the process of decolonization in the entire world, especially within the Indian sub-continent. The 2nd World War was not the cause of independence motive for the Muslims of the Indian sub-continent, because the independence movement started around the time when the British came to India in late 18th century;[6] however, the 2nd World War paved a quick path towards independence. The creation of Pakistan was based on the religious ideology, that is, a 'separate homeland for Muslims'. The creation of Pakistan followed the idea and a sense of realization that the Muslims of India demanded the right to determine their own future, separate from greater India. Like any other newly independent

[6] The British first came to the Indian sub-continent as merchants of the East India Company before 1757.

country, Pakistan, after coming into being in 1947, had to choose a political system suiting the dreams and desires of its citizens.

Following the legacy of the Mughals,[7] the people of Pakistan could have opted for a monarch system. Since their demand had been a separate land for the Muslims of India, their option could have been to choose theocracy. However, Muhammad Ali Jinnah, the founder of Pakistan envisioned a secular state and had a moving vision indicated in the following words:

> You are free to go to your temples; you are free to go to your mosques or to any other place of worship in this State of Pakistan. You may belong to any religion or caste or creed – that has nothing to do with the business of the State... We are starting in the days when there is no discrimination, no distinction between one community and another; we are all citizens and equal citizen of one State... Now I think you should keep that in front as our ideal, and you will find that in course of time Hindu will cease to be Hindu and Muslims will cease to be Muslims – not in the religious sense, because that is the personal faith of each individual but in the political sense as citizen of the State[8].

The religious leaders,[9] who had initially opposed the idea of a separate state for the Muslims of India, lobbied for a theocratic (Islamic) state after the independence.[10] Since Jinnah and other political actors were Western-educated elite, they envisaged that the new state would uphold the values of individual liberty, civic equality and religious diversity. They did not aspire to Islamic theocracy (Ahmed, 2004). Later, in 1956, the political leaders and people of Pakistan chose parliamentary democracy[11] as its political system; nevertheless, the same constitution named Pakistan as the 'Islamic Republic of Pakistan'. This was also affirmed by the

---

7 Islamic imperial monarchs ruled over most of the Indian subcontinent during 16th and 17th century.

8 Inaugural speech of Muhammad Ali Jinnah in the Constituent Assembly. In: Human Rights and Democratic Development in Pakistan, Hina Jilani, Democratic Development Studies, Montreal/Quebec, Canada, 1998, p. 42- 43. English edition publication supervised by Human Rights Commission of Pakistan.

9 For instance, leaders of the Jamiat-e-Ulama-e-Hind

10 For example, Jamiat Ulama-e-Islam and Jamat-e-Islami

11 A system of government where the people exercise their political power by electing representatives to parliament to make laws

constitutions in 1956 and 1973; however, the 1963 constitution called for presidential form of democracy.

Although constitutionally a democracy, Pakistan has been under military dictatorships for more than half of its life. There have been many ups and downs in the political history of the country. Even when there were so-called democratic parties in power, democracy has been limited to the formal participation of people in choosing their representatives in elections. On the other hand, the military dictatorships also used the same tactics and tried to seek legitimacy through holding elections, especially at the local level and declaring their leadership to be working for democracy (Ahmed, 2004). For common citizens, this has blurred the distinction between dictatorship and a real democracy. There have been several movements against democracy in Pakistan, sometimes evident and sometimes hidden. These controversies have created tensions about the form of government for Pakistan and the role of citizens (Zia, 2003).

Pakistan's democratic processes have been routinely suspended by military regimes and thus promoted undemocratic practices of citizenship. Military regimes in Pakistan dissolved the national assembly (the sovereign legislative body), suspended the constitution, kept tight control over the media (with the exception of general Musharraf),[12] and General Zia's regime (in 1984)[13] banned students' unions, which ended the flurry of the student activism that had begun after independence (Khan, 2006). Military regimes in Pakistan also constitutionalized measures for centralized leadership, which limited citizens' power in influencing government structures.

Along with military regimes, an authoritarian state-sponsored belief system, i.e. 'Islamic ideology', has been promoted by military and democratic regimes and used to deny rights to

12 General Pervaiz Musharaf a military dictator and president from 1999-2008

13 General Zia-Ul-Haq a military dictator and president from 1977-88

disadvantaged and minority groups and women in Pakistan. For example, General Zia, an Islamic ideologue, launched a formal 'Islamization' movement that legitimatized 'Islamic ideology', especially with regards to the education and legal fields. General Zia co-opted extremist religious factions and appointed their leaders to key government positions, including the Pakistan Ideology Council, a consultative body of Islamic theologians that wields enormous influence in educational matters. He also instituted Federal Shariat Court.[14] Both of these legal bodies exist to this day (Ahmed, 2005). This regime implemented discriminatory laws such as the Hudood Ordinance[15] and increased the punishment for blasphemy from imprisonment to death.

Zia's Islamization's movement resulted in the use of control over women and minorities. In terms of education, the "highest priority" was given to the revision of curricula so that "Islamic ideology permeates the thinking of the younger generation," and society is refashioned according to Islamic tenets.[16] Separate institutions and curricula were prepared for female education related to the distinctive role assigned women in Islamic society.[17] Citizenship was now defined essentially in religious, masculine, militaristic, and apolitical terms.

---

[14] Established in 1980, this court consists of 8 Muslim judges appointed by the president among retired or serving in the Supreme Court or High Court. Three of these judges are required to be well versed in Islamic law. This court is on petition by a citizen or its own motion, has the power to examine and determine as to whether a certain law is objectionable to the teachings of Islam. If not, then government is required to take the necessary steps to bring the law in accordance to the injunction of Islam.(http://www.supremecourt.gov.pk/web/subsites/scp50/Articles/2/1.pdf Retrieved on July 2nd, 2010)

[15] The Hudood Ordinance was enacted in 1979 under Zia's Islamization. It is most criticized for criminalizing all extra-marital sex, and making it exceptionally difficult and dangerous to prove an allegation of rape. A women alleging rape is required to provide four adult male witnesses of 'the act of penetration', and if the accused man is Muslim, the witness must be Muslim themselves. Failure to prove rape places, the women at risk of prosecution of adultery, which does not require such strong evidence (Farooq, 2006). (http://www.globalwebpost.com/farooqm/writings/gender/rape_fiqh.html Retrieved on July 5th, 2010)

[16] Ministry of Education, 1979, p.2

[17] ibid. p.3

The Islamization of the legal system, with its essential anti-woman bias, was designed to generate a sense of power in the Pakistani male. Though it is argued by a number of scholars that the Islamization process failed to generate the desired legitimacy for the Zia regime, I contend that it was successful in legitimizing a formal form of patriarchy and gender inequality. As Naseem (2006) states, though "Zia politics of Islam did not win him a mass base but his Islamic rhetoric, its impact on gender relations, and the consequent strengthening of the patriarchy did win him a large following" (p. 96). This has been proven by the fact that four elected governments could do little or nothing to repudiate this legacy.

Women's Citizenship Rights

Due to the history of colonialism, increasing ties of dependency on the "West", the wide income gap between urban and feudal rich and poor, religious conservatism, customary laws and low literacy, there is a great discrepancy between the constitutional rights of citizens and social, cultural, and political practices (Government of Pakistan, 1997; Said Khan, 1988).

The state of Pakistan provides constitutional guarantees of equal rights of citizens, including women. In practice, these rights are severely undermined due to persistent inequalities sustained by relations of gender, class, religion, geographical location and so on. Oppressive practices against women and girls often institutionalized through "customary" and "tribal" laws are perpetuated through stultifying constructs of "culture", "tradition" and "religion" (Jalal, 2002).

A universalized notion of the "fundamental rights" of citizens has been included in all three constitutions that have been written since the country's creation. However, these rights have almost lost their significance since they have been suspended for long periods in Pakistan's history by both military dictatorship and democratically elected authoritarian regimes, which

have relied on violence and coercive power to maintain the state's legitimacy. The present constitution, written in 1973 under a democratically elected government, has given women a citizenship status that appears surprisingly egalitarian. The chapter on Fundamental Rights of Citizen states:

1. All citizens are equal before law and are entitled to equal protection of law.
2. There shall be no discrimination on the basis of sex alone.
3. Nothing in this article shall prevent the state from making any special provision for the protection of women and children. (Constitution, Chapter 1: Fundamental Rights; Article 25: Equality of Citizens)

Moreover, while laying down the Principles of Policy, the constitution declares in Article 34 that: "Steps shall be taken to ensure full participation of women in all spheres of national life" (Constitution, Chapter 2: Principles of Policy). In practice, however, as acknowledged even in the government's reports, the promise of equality has not only been ignored but blatantly violated (The Report Commission of Inquiry for Women, 1997).

Furthermore, due to a number of amendments under General Zia ul Haq and the introduction of a series of ordinances, the Constitution of 1973 has been changed almost beyond recognition both in its spirit and its applicability. Thus, the reintroduction of the original constitution is a standing demand of women's groups such as the Women's Action Forum (WAP Workshop, 1991, November 7-8).

In the area of formal political participation, women in Pakistan have always had the right to vote. They are eligible to stand for seats in the legislative assemblies comprising the National and Provincial Assemblies and the Senate. Women are also constitutionally able to contest for the highest executive and political positions of President and Prime Minister, though this has

always been a subject of debate by politico-religious parties. Seats have to be reserved for women in Parliament; otherwise, they would be unlikely to be represented in the assemblies (Shaheed, Zia & Warraich, 1994). However, the potential power of reserving seats for women has been nullified by a process of indirect elections, in which women representatives are elected by members of the national assembly, which is dominated by men. Thus, elected women have to cater to male electoral colleges rather than the women whose interests they are supposed to represent (Shaheed, Zia & Warraich, 1994). In any case, representation itself is an ambiguous process in Pakistan since the mode of election is frequently changed by the government in power – ranging from parliamentary multiparty basis, to presidential form through electoral colleges or non- party-based elections. While an exceptional woman or two have sometimes reached positions of power, mainly due to family and class positions, women have very little access to formal political power whether as political representatives or voters (Shaheed, Zia & Warraich, 1994).

In addition to constitutional guarantees of gender equality, Pakistan has also acceded to international instruments on human rights. As a member of the United Nations, Pakistan is a party to the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UNDR) and is pledged to "reaffirm faith in the fundamental human rights, in the dignity and worth of the human person, in the equal rights of men and women". It is also a signatory to many significant international treaties and documents which uphold human rights and women's equal status, including the Forward Looking Strategies for the Advancement of Women (FLSAW) and the Vienna Declaration recognizing women's rights as human rights. Pakistan has also ratified the United Nations convention for the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW) (Shaheed, Zia & Warraich, 1994).

Education and Women's Citizenship

The educational site in Pakistan is perhaps the most significant place for the constitution of gendered citizenship. It is a space in which international, national, and family norms of gender and of citizenship interact and intersect. Educational discourse, according to Naseem (2004), is not only the primary site where meanings of signs such as woman, man, mother, father etc. are gendered; it also provides the techniques of discipline (the school system and pedagogical practices) and surveillance (examination) for naturalization of meaning (the process through which meanings of different words/terms/notions are rendered unproblematic) and normalization of subjects (the process through which subjects stop questioning).

The analysis of various educational policies used in the past[18] for the education of citizens in Pakistan reveal that education has been used as a key institution for national integration, and the maintenance and development of ideological commitment.
Each of these policies aimed to produce 'good citizens'; their aim was to reproduce the government's ideology through producing citizens of a particular kind (Dean, 2005). The subjects/courses that are taught in K-10 and that are mainly responsible for developing national consciousness in students include islamiat (Islamic Studies), social studies, languages and, to some extent, general science. Social studies, which is a combination of history, geography and civics, is a key educational site for national identity formation (Saigol, 2004). Beyond the formal curriculum, aspects of the "hidden curriculum", such as school uniform, punctuality, school assembly, and modes of address between students and teachers also help students learn their place, attitudes, and relationships to other citizens. The school assembly is the main co-curricular activity used for the promotion of patriotism and national feelings.

[18] The All Pakistan Education Conference 1947, The Sharif Commission Report 1959, The New Education Policy 1972-80, National Education Policy and Implementation Program 1979.

Identity and Citizenship in the Pakistani Curriculum: Review of Literature

As one of the primary goals of the dissertation is to analyze the construction of citizenship in the formal Pakistani curriculum, the following literature review presents the major themes of identity and citizenship that other researchers have identified as being presented in citizenship education[19] curriculum and textbooks in Pakistan from grades 1 through 10th.

Analyzing 66 Social Studies and Pakistan Studies textbooks used in state educational institutions, Aziz (1993) concludes that today many young Pakistanis do not have access to a balanced and truthful history of their own country. Jalal's (1995a) analysis of social studies textbooks confirms that the rewriting of national history from an Islamic point of view was assigned the highest priority by the state. Analyzing the social studies, civics and Pakistan Studies textbooks used in state-run educational institutions, Salim (2003) notes that particularly after 1971, educational discourse overemphasized the two-nation theory[20] in the form of the Ideology of Pakistan and stressed tracing the roots of the Pakistani nation in the neighboring Islamic lands to the west.[21]

Analyzing Pakistani curriculum and textbooks, Saigol (2004, p. 120) observes that in the

---

[19] Citizenship education includes multiple traditions, such as historical tradition, geographical position, sociopolitical structure, economic system and global trends. Furthermore, it informs children about their rights, responsibilities and services for the community as citizens. In Pakistani schools, social studies, history, Pakistan Studies and Civics are the subjects/courses that cater to citizenship education. The civics curriculum is a collection of basic history of Pakistan, sociology, and political science. The main areas of Pakistan studies and social studies are the history, economy and geography of Pakistan (Ahmed, 2004). For more detail please read the methodology section of this paper.

[20] The Two-Nation theory is presented as the basis of creation of Pakistan. It is an ideology, which states that Muslims and Hindus are two separate nations from every definition; therefore, Muslims should have a separate homeland in the Muslim majority areas of India, where they can spend their lives according to the glorious teachings of Islam.

[21] Pakistan Studies textbooks are being revised to give a more moderate version of the two-nation theory. Also, middle school history students will be taught about other religions, as well as ancient civilizations, in an effort to promote tolerance (Dawn, 2007).

Zia era “religion as an instrument of homogenization and control became center stage. Almost all the official sites of knowledge production were put to the task of reimagining an Islamic nation”. Similarly, Rosser (2000) states that the process of discarding, vilifying, and mocking all the non-Islamic history of the sub-continent and associating it with the ‘other’ began under Zulfikar Ali Bhutto and reached its climax under Zia-ul-Haq.

Rahman’s (1999) study on the impact of language teaching on students’ worldview in Urdu-medium schools concludes that the representation of Pakistani identity as Islamic is achieved by presenting all Muslim leaders, especially Jinnah and Iqbal,[22] as orthodox Muslims and suppressing any aspect of their thoughts and behavior which do not conform to this image.

The curriculum and textbooks do not differentiate between citizenship education and Islamic education (Nayyar and Salim, 2003; Ahmad, 2004: Dean. 2005). Analyzing the current education policy and social studies textbooks used in secondary schools in Pakistan, Ahmad (2004: 45) concludes that the textbooks present "Islam not simply as a belief system but a political ideology and a grand unifying worldview that must be accepted by all citizens.” Drawing on the analysis of social studies curriculum and textbooks and a review of teaching and learning processes in 11 schools in Sindh, Dean (2005) arrives at similar findings.

The reimagining of Pakistan as an Islamic state was achieved through the diminution of the citizenship of non-Muslim citizens of Pakistan (Saigol, 2002a, 2004). Religious minorities are largely excluded from textbooks (Bajwa, 2008; Naseem, 2006). All non-Muslims who contributed to the development of Pakistan are “persona non-grata as far as the textbooks go” (Hasanain, 2003: 92). These omissions reinforce prejudices against non- Muslims, promote religious intolerance (Nayyar and Salim, 2003), and exclude non-Muslim students from national

[22] Mohammad Iqbal, the Islamic poet-philosopher who played a vital role in the birth of Pakistan, was the first to advocate the formation of independent Muslim state for the subcontinent.

identity (Nayyar, 2003a, 2003b).

In their analysis of the English textbooks produced by the Punjab Textbook Board, Matto and Hussain (2003) note that the most striking feature of textbooks is the absence of women. The textbooks convey a consistent message that women have a subsidiary status in the Pakistani society and that their legitimate space is inside the four walls, performing the household chores associated with nurturing and caring for the family. In her analysis of primary and middle Urdu, English and social studies textbooks, Jafri (1994) concludes that women are not only under-represented and stereotyped but are shown as having no separate identity beyond that of their fathers, husbands and brothers.

Similarly, the findings of a study conducted by UNESCO,[23] which analyzed the national curriculum and 194 textbooks from class 1-10 in various subjects, showed that the curriculum depicts a strong gender biases favoring males in Urdu, English and Pakistan Studies, and the curriculum provides no guidelines to textbook developers on addressing the need for a balanced representation of gender. The textbook analysis reveals that some books "portray stereotypes of restricting education to boys, celebrating the birth of son ... recognizing men's work and not that of women" (Mirza, 2004: 13).

In a post-structural analysis of the Pakistani curriculum and Urdu and social studies textbooks, Naseem (2006) argues that these materials discursively constitute gendered citizens through tantalization, classification and normalization. The textbooks exclude women visually by making them less visible, and also by fixing the meaning of the images that articulate gender in the texts. The long list of national and religious figures includes few women.

[23] Mirza. M. (2004). Gender Analysis of School Curriculum and Textbooks. Islamabad: UNESCO.

Since the military has ruled Pakistan most of the time in its history as a nation-state, the textbooks glorify the army and war occupies a prominent place in them. This reinforces the image of the army as the savior of the nation and diverts students' attention from internal political issues to national security (Aziz, 1993). The textbooks present the masculine military as the protector of the national territory, which is portrayed as feminine (Naseem, 2006). The texts to which the students of state-controlled schools are exposed seek to strengthen Pakistani nationalism and rally support for the military (Rahman, 1999). During the Ayub years, Pakistan seriously indulged in the process of official mythmaking by establishing a large central bureaucracy to "manufacture an ideology for Pakistan, one that glorified the army as the state's key institution" to be passed on to successive generations through the school curriculum and official media (Cohen, 2005: 67).

The glorification of war and military heroism in textbooks, however, started under the democratically-elected government of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto (1971-1977) to recreate the image of the army after its shameful defeat in 1971 (Nayyar and Salim, 2003; Rosser, 2003; Saigol, 2004). Comparing the educational policies and curriculum texts produced under Ayub (1958-1969), Bhutto (1971-1977) and Zia (1977-1988), Saigol (1995) concludes that in spite of subtle and significant differences in the curriculum and textbooks of the three eras, the immense overlap that exists between them emphasizes the centrality of the (masculinized) military to state power even under civilian rule.

What hope does such a strong gender bias in the curricular materials leave for women's empowerment? In a survey, 1069 women participants belonging to different social strata and from all provinces of Pakistan, termed education as essential for women's empowerment (Shaheed, 2002b). However, the type of education currently being offered was seen by some as

actively detrimental, because it reinforces the inferior status of women through its content (Durrani, 2007). “Thus education, instead of empowering, actually disempowers women” (Naseem, 2006: 452).

Curricula and the “Other”

While “Pakistani” women are consistently constructed as different and second-class citizens in relation to men in the textbooks, the textbooks also play an important role in constructing the ‘other’, who does not belong in Pakistan at all. The textbooks construct multiple enemies and religious others, including Hindus, Christians, Jews, and Sikhs, with reference to whom Pakistani identity is defined. However, the major 'other' against whom the Pakistani identity is constructed is Indians in general and Hindus in particular (Saigol, 2004, 2005). India is conflated with Hindus and all Pakistani ‘others’ are labelled in religious terms to embed Pakistani identity deeply within Islamic identity. A single monolithic identity is imposed on each religious ‘other’ of the Pakistani Muslim identity. “The Hindus appear in textbooks primarily as inherently evil, wicked, perfidious, cruel and conniving” (Saigol, 2004: 122). The textbooks depict a gendered representation of wars with India/Hindus in which the Hindus are denigrated and feminized and the Muslims masculinized and valorized (Saigol, 1995; Naseem, 2006).

The curriculum and textbooks ignore civic values, critical thinking, civic participation and freedom of speech (Ahmad, 2004; Dean, 2005). Dean (2005) notes that the textbooks mention the duties of citizens but do not discuss their rights in a democratic state. Her study is the only one that goes beyond textual analysis to include the analysis of textbooks in use, though her observation period is very short-only 2-3 days in one school. She observes that the teaching-learning methods used are formulaic, boring, and exam-focused, as teachers just transmit textbook messages and ensure their rote memorization. Little interaction takes place between

teachers and students and even less so among students. She, however, does not offer an account of how students use the curricular content in constructing their identities. Similarly, Hasanain (2003) concludes that textbooks do not mention contemporary issues or contemporary heroes from civil society. Moreover, by portraying one interpretation of reality as the truth, the education system curbs critical thinking. The literature reviewed is silent on the effects of textbooks on students' perceptions of what it means to be a Pakistani citizen. Some have speculated on the issue (Jalal, 1995a; Saigol, 2002a; Nayyar, 2003b), while Ahmad (2004) has suggested an empirical investigation in this area. There is a gap of knowledge on how the curriculum is enacted and how textbooks are used by teachers and experienced by students and how these educational means are used by students in constructing their citizenship.

Chapter Two: Methodology

This chapter offers the methodological viewpoint used in this research, the rational for its use, as well as the strengths and problems associated with it. The research design, including the research questions, strategy used for exploring the questions, assessment of the field and sampling issues, are presented next. This is followed by an explanation of the data collection and analysis. Finally, a discussion of issues of credibility, ethics, and the limitations of the research is presented.

Critical Ethnography

I have utilized Critical ethnography that allows for a presentation of the experiences and perspectives of Pakistani girl students and to understand how they make sense of and enact their understandings of citizenship. Through this research, I show that the experiences and perspectives of girl students provide valuable insights into the working of discourses and coercive state practices that attempt to construct their identities as citizens. This also provides useful insights into how resistance can be mounted.

The word “critical” in critical ethnography refers to its intellectual stance, which is historically derived from the epistemic orientation of critical theory (Carspecken, 1996). It is originated in the Marx and Frankfurt schools of thought, and subsequently got institutionalized within its unique historical, political, socio-cultural and ideological contexts (Durrani, 2007). It also gets some influence from post modernism while using a political stance, which makes it very unique (Jordan and Yeomans, 1995). Therefore, critical ethnography contains both a critical research paradigm as well as an ethnographic method.

Critical ethnography thus fits my research and theoretical influences as it deals with the power struggle between structure, the power inherent in curriculum and its concepts of political

citizenship, and agency, the power of girl students to interact with those presentations on their own terms.

Research Design

This ethnographic study has been executed in Balochistan, which is one the least developed provinces in Pakistan. Being a Pakistani citizen, I originally belong to Balochistan. I was born in the capital city Quetta. I was raised in different parts of Balochistan. My father spent his professional life as government health officer and was posted to far flung areas of Balochistan throughout his life. That was the reason that I received all of my secondary and higher secondary education in parts of urban and rural Balochistan till my appointment as a lecturer at the government girl's college in Quetta. Being a recipient of the Pakistani public education, I always have the desire to bring up the real picture of the public schooling especially from the perspectives of girl students in Balochistan. This was one of the driving forces that I decided to execute my PhD field research in Balochistan. Before going into the details of the research design, I would like to shed some light on the geographical, social, political and economic aspects of Balochistan.

Balochistan

Historically Balochistan was divided into three parts namely Northern Balochistan, Western Balochistan and Eastern Balochistan which are controlled by the three countries of Afghanistan, Iran and Pakistan respectively. After Pakistan's independence 1947, the Eastern Balochistan is now one of the provinces of Pakistan that comprises of over 134,000 square miles of rugged and rocky land and mountainous regions. It is divided into four major areas known as the Upper Highlands, the Lower Highlands, the Plains and the Deserts. Baluchistan is bordered on the north and east by its respective provincial neighbors, the North West Frontier Province

(NWFP), Punjab, and Sindh. To the west is Afghanistan and Iran and to the South is the Arabian Sea. The stark contrast between its rugged mountains and arid expanses of semi-desert wasteland has resulted in a unique people, whose tribal structure, traditions and customs reflect the harsh environment in which they live (Dunne, 2006).

Figure 1: Map of Pakistan

Figure 2: Map of Balochistan

Source: http://carnegieendowment.org

Baluchistan is multi-lingual, multi-ethnic and multi-cultural. Due to the barren and infertile physical environment, the people of Baluchistan have historically been nomadic, although in recent years many tribes have abandoned their nomadic life and settled permanently (Dunne, 2006). According to the 1998 census, the total population of the province was 6.5 million people in that year. The ethnic Baloch[24] (i.e., the Balochi, and the Brahui speakers) are the largest ethnic group in the province that formed 54.7 percent but do not constitute a majority. Their number is closely followed by Pashtuns that made 29.6 percent[25] with the rest divided

[24] Titus (1996: xi) explains "the transliteration of ethnonym "Baloch" into English. Prior to 1990, the term was spelled a myriad of ways- 'Baluch', 'Baloch', 'Belooch', 'Biloch'- the most common being 'Baloch'. In 1990 the provincial government of Balochistan decreed that the official English spelling was to be 'Baloch', and this has become the accepted standard in Pakistan".

[25] The Pashtuns claim to be 35-40 percent of the population and may well be right. Apart from the general weakness of the Pakistani bureaucracy when it comes to gathering information, the main parties among the Pashtuns successfully urged their Pashtuns followers to boycott the last census in 1998, in the hope that this would help the

between other ethnic groups which are Sindhis[26] and Hazaras.[27] Finally there are Punjabis,[28] Urdu speaking refugee (Mohajirs)[29] "settlers" (as they are known by the Baloch and Pashtuns), who moved to this region under British and Pakistani rule. While each of the ethnic groups (i.e. Baloch, Pashtun and Bruhvi) that populate Baluchistan has unique characteristics, they all conform to a similar tribal culture that values loyalty and hospitality, believes in "an eye for an eye and a life for a life" and adheres to the simple rule that "he shall take who has the power, and he shall keep who can (Awan, 1985)."

The basic political organization in Baluchistan is the tribe and their loyalty to their tribal chief. Their traditional form of government is the Sardari system: a centuries' old system in which tribesmen pledge their allegiance to Sardars, or tribal chiefs, in exchange for social justice and the maintenance of the "integrity of tribe" (Kundi, 2005). Sardars are traditionally elected by a Jirga, or council of elders within a tribe. The Jirgas are also responsible for dispensing justice—and perform the three-fold duties of police, magistracy and justice (Awan, 1985). However, after the independence of Pakistan in 1947, the system has evolved and submerged into the government's formal system of justice, police and magistracy, especially after the early 1970s the role of Sardars was minimized in state affairs by the then prime minister Zulfiqar Ali

---

Pashtun Afghan refugees to merge with the local Pashtun population, become Pakistani citizens, and boost Pashtun political weight in Balochistan (Leiven, 2011).

[26] A Sindhi speaking ethnic group, who migrated from Sindh or India during British or Pakistani rule. Sindhi is also an ethnic group native to Sindh province of Pakistan.

[27] Hazara is an ethnic group. They arrived in Balochistan during the 1980s Soviet war but also after fleeing persecution under the Taliban regime in the 1990s. They developed close links with their Pakistan Hazar patrons who fled from Afghanistan to escape from then ruler Amir Abdul Rahman (1880-1901), where they suffered severe political, social and economic repression. They are Shia Muslims of Mongolian origin form the central highlands of Afghanistan, and around of them 550,000 now live in Quetta and a few other towns (Census of Afghans in Pakistan, UNHCR 2007). Their fellows Baloch and Pashtun neighbors in Quetta, on the other hand, are Sunni Muslims. Their upbringing from their ancestral territory in Afghanistan has helped turn the Hazaras community of Quetta into a remarkably well-educated and dynamic community (possibly also with the help of aid from Iran, though they deny this fervently) (Leiven, 2011). They have by far the best hospitals, schools outside the cantonment in Quetta. Tragically, though, their cemetery also bears witness to the many Hazaras killed in recent years in anti-Shia terrorist attacks by the Sunni sectarian extremists in Balochistan (Leiven, 2011).

[28] Punjabi speaking ethnic group native to Punjab, a province of Pakistan.

[29] North Indian Muslim immigrants, who migrated from India to Pakistan during partition.

Bhutto. Presently, Sardars are the leaders of tribes, but normally cannot make decisions on matters relating to the governmental institution. In other words, they are no more in authoritative position.

Economically marginalized, Balochistan is an understudied region. The province has some of the lowest social indicators in the world and is deeply marked by unequal gender outcomes. According to the Pakistan Social and Living Standards Survey report 2012, the literacy rate is 41 per cent, with a mere 19 per cent of the female population literate and 60 percent of the male. The province also faces the highest incidence of preventable deaths among mothers, infants, and young children. In 2012, the maternal mortality rate (MMR) was 996 per 100,000 births and the infant mortality rate (IMR) was reported around 111 per 1,000 births (PDHS, 2013). The main reasons of such low numbers are poverty, poor government investment, patriarchy, social bias, religious extremists and self-indulgent tribal leaders. In fact, in past few years, government of Pakistan, UN and World bank reports pointed out poverty reduction as one the seventeenth priority sustainable development goals (SDGs) to be achieved by 2030. However, the reports fail to bring forward the economic and political inequalities across ethnic and regional divides. Furthermore, there is lack of attention to the current political turmoil caused by the independence movement in Balochistan, which is a retaliation to the economic deprivation and the continuous historical exploitation of the province (Harrison, 2006).

Balochistan draws global attention because of its strategic location and gigantic mineral resources. A large number of metallic and non-metallic minerals have been discovered in the province. Mineral deposits include copper, barite, fluorite, gypsum/anhydrite, limestone/dolomite, magnesite, chromite marble and Sulphur (Harrison, 2006). The province is rich in energy resources and produces around 36 percent of the primary energy in the form of

natural gas, coal and electricity. However, for many decades, the Punjabi dominated central governments have denied Baluchistan a fair share of development funds and paid only 12 percent of the royalties (Harrison, 2006).

Balochistan has 760 kilometers long coastal belt along the Arabian Sea. The coastline is 70 percent of country's total coastal belt. It has huge potential for development of fisheries, tourism and seaports. (Lieven, 2011) The province is in the spotlight once again due to the China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC), which is a collection of infrastructure projects that are currently under construction throughout Pakistan especially in Balochistan.

The political unrest in Balochistan has roots back to Pakistan's creation and the 1948 annexation of the Kalat state — the biggest region in the province. The Baloch people especially the nationalists and most separatists call the annexation a forceful act by Mohammad Ali Jinnah, the first governor general of Pakistan of that time, to forcibly merge it to Pakistan. They still consider it an act of internal-colonial occupation of the province marked by post-colonial bombings, hegemony of the Urdu language in schools, control of the military and bureaucracy by the Punjabis and the Muhajirs, economic disenfranchisements, and political exclusions (Towghi, 2007).

Since 1948, there have been four insurgencies in Balochistan: in 1948, in 1962-69, in 1974-77, and the current nationalist movement that began in 2006 after the killing of the one of the Baloch tribal leaders – Nawab Akbar Bugti by the Pakistani military forces (Ahmer, 2016). In all of these nationalist movements, the conflict with the central government over control of land and resources remained a fundamental issue and resulted in the deployment of the Frontier Constabulary (FC)[30] and the strengthening of security infrastructure in the province.

[30] The FC is a paramilitary force of Pakistan, which is currently deployed in Balochistan and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa to maintain law and order. The FC soldiers also guard the borders of Pakistan with Afghanistan and Iran.

Towghi (2007) skillfully elaborated the three main grievances of Baloch people in Balochistan that reflect a general sense of being exploited as a colony by Punjab (the most powerful and populated province of Pakistan). First, the Baloch people demand for an equal or a fairer share of royalties generated by the production of natural gas in their province. The second major grievance is that the people of Balochistan want to be included, rather than marginalized, in large development projects. The third grievance is that the Baloch people do not like army's establishment of new military cantonments in their province. There are numerous reports by the Human Rights organizations in highlighting the continued enforced disappearance and killings of suspected Baloch militants and opposition activists by the military, intelligence agencies, and the paramilitary Frontier Corps (Human Rights Watch World Report, 2012, 2013).

The recent Baloch independence movement is different from the previous ones. There is sporadic violence all over Balochistan, in cities as well as in remote areas, done by a Baloch separatist militant group Balochistan Liberation Army (BLA).[31] Although the targets are usually government installations and personnel, civilians also suffer loss of life and property.

> Despite what appear to be significant new strengths, according to Grare (2013): The Baloch nationalist movement is weak and divided. It is divided between radicals and moderate. Radicals are divided among themselves. The movement does not seem to have a clear strategy either. On the one hand, if the Baloch nationalists are unable to gain independence, the army is also unable to stabilize the province. Presently, it is lose-lose

---

[31] BLA has claimed responsibility for a number of bomb blasts, acts of sabotage, and rocket attacks on government installations. The central government claims that the BLA, supported by nationalist tribal chiefs, namely Attaullah Mengal, Khair Bux Marri, and the late Akbar Bugti, are behind the violence. But it has not been able to provide any evidence for that. The BLA keeps claiming responsibility for attacks, but it is still not clear who is its leader, how it recruits its activists, and from where. It is speculated that there is not one but three groups, the others being the Balochistan People's Liberation Front (BPLF) and the Balochistan Liberation Front (BLF). The former civilian government also claimed that "Russia and india were supporting the Balochistan Liberation Army (BLA) in its secession bid (Alivi, 2009). For more information, please read the International Crisis Report: Pakistan: The worsening conflict in Balochistan (2006)

> situation, which should logically lead to negotiation between the two sides. However, there are no foreseeable signs of negotiation between the Baloch and the Army.

Today, Balochistan is slowly but surely descending into anarchy. It is a bubbling "cauldron of ethnic, sectarian, secessionist and militant violence, threatening to boil over at any time" (Grare, 2013). In order to reestablish trust, the Baloch nationalists have to be included in the provincial government. But this will produce the desired effect only if they can deliver something to the population, in the form of greater autonomy, within the federal framework for example (Grare, 2013). It remains to be seen whether the new elected government [32] will produce the desired outcomes.

It is against this background of increasing nationalist movements, strengthening ethnic tensions, and the increasing visibility of the Pakistani army in the region that I examine gender, schooling, and citizenship in Balochistan. It is for these reasons that I deliberately examine and compare three schools with different ethnic makeups, and carefully explore the experiences of girls from different class, ethnic, and religious backgrounds in each school.[33]

Location

This research study was conducted in three government girls' high schools in Quetta, the largest city and the provincial capital of Balochistan. The selection of the research sites was done due to a number of reasons. Quetta, being the provincial capital, has a higher number of girls' high schools than any other areas of the province. Since it is also where I grew up, I am able to provide a nuanced background to the particular nature of education in the area.

---

[32] General elections were held in Pakistan in July 2018 to elect the members of the national assembly and to the four provincial assemblies of Punjab, Sindh, Balochisan and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Elections were held in all four provinces, the federal capital Islamabad and in the Federally Administered Tribal Areas, which is a territory of Pakistan.

[33] In this dissertation, I do not discuss the experiences of non-Muslim girls, who were viewed as non-Pakistani, non-Balochi people by all other students and adults. While the experiences of these girls are very important and heartbreaking, they represent the other who lies outside of the debates about the meaning of Pakistani and/versus Balochi citizenship, on which I have chosen to focus here.

In Quetta, the academic year in Government schools starts from March 1st to December 16th with 10 days summer vocations in July. The annual budget is allocated two times yearly. The huge portion of budget covers salaries and pensions of the staff. For many schools, expenses are more than the budget, so teachers often have Tuck shops[34] to bear extra school's expenses. Along with school expenses, Tuck shop income can be used to provide for needy students.

There are two major educational paths at the secondary level of education. The paths are Science (Physics, Chemistry, Biology, Computers) and Arts (Home Economics, Food and Nutrition, Civics). If a girl achieves a 60% or above in her middle school examination, she, with her parents, can choose between the two. Those who receive a lower grade tend to be shunted to the arts curriculum. This is not a school, district or province's policy. It is just a common practice by school administrators, staff and teachers. In fact, the directorate of schools has sent many circulars to school to discourage this practice in government schools.

The study also highlights the secondary school curriculum because it is a time and place where more nuanced understandings of identity are created. The curriculum offered is diverse and includes numerous subjects directly and indirectly related to citizenship formation, with two specifically aimed at it, Pakistani Studies and Civics. Those classes are taught to class[35] 9th and 10th Secondary school is also the last level at which a relatively large number of students are still in school. While many girls drop out of school before secondary level, and therefore all of the girls in this study should be understood as unusual and as "educational elites" among their age

[34] A tuck shop is a small food selling retailer, which is usually run by teachers in especially in government schools in Balochistan. Teachers run it voluntarily to collect money so that they utilize the funds to facilitate girl students in schools. For instance, they buy uniform, sweaters and shoes for deserving girl students and furniture for classrooms.

[35] Class is used in government schools in Pakistan to categorize students in schools based on their ages and academic qualifications. It is equivalent to grade in the US school system.

group, this is the last opportunity to be able to research any significant group of female students, as most drop out after secondary school (Rehman, 2004). Examining citizenship formation in post-secondary school would be examining a very particular elite. Although many students drop out before secondary school, there is a great value in analyzing later education. Citizenship formation as presented in primary school is very basic, with little nuance. In addition, older students are more likely to be able to interact with the lessons they are taught, choosing to value one over the other in a way that would be difficult for most primary students (Durrani, 2007). In this vein, the subjects have further been winnowed down to girls in 9th and 10th class, as they have had the most exposure to the curriculum and are generally the most able to analyze their personal experience of their identities as citizens and how that is formed by and in reaction to the education provided to them. Along with these students, I also talked to teachers and principals, and officials from the department of education at the district, province, and ministry of education at federal level to know their views about educational policies, curriculum, textbooks in relation to citizenship education.

The curriculum studied is only the Pakistan Studies and Civic education because these subjects are specifically created by the state to create citizenship and identity in students. Certainly, other topics, including Islamic studies, help form concepts of citizenship, however they are not as simply or directly aimed as to the knowledge that the government wants to impart as inherent to nations of citizenship. I also focus only on the textbooks created by the government of Balochistan; they do not differ greatly from other texts from other areas, but it is important to focus on the specific structure provided by the state.

This research is designed to provide a thick description of the construction of national identity through the school curriculum at multiple levels. At the most surface level, this study

describes female secondary education and its relation to Pakistan. It then takes a step deeper to show the links among the official national curriculum, textbooks, and instruction. The next level of analysis describes implemented curriculum as manifested in classroom practices and school organization. Finally, at the deepest level, it focuses on curriculum as inferred from students' knowledge. The study does not systematically address the role of the family in school practices or the construction of the national imagination.

The Research Sites

I spent about 9 to 12 weeks in each of three schools in an urban setting in Quetta city, where my interest is not in the schools themselves but in using them as a means to understand a larger collection of cases. While these schools are not representative of government girls' schools in Balochistan, let alone Pakistan as a whole, retrospectivity is not an inherent goal in ethnographic research. These three schools allowed for a deep dive into how some young women understand their identities as Pakistani citizens; they differ from each other, particularly in ethnic backgrounds, providing some insight into experiences of different groups, while keeping some factors similar.

The schools where the research was conducted were: the Government Girls High School, Shaheen Road; the Government Girls High Model School, Hani Road; and the Government Girls Model High School, Zarqa Road. Each of the schools had a different ethnic composition: primarily a mix of Pashtun, Baloch and Settler students, mostly Baloch but with mix of Pashtun and settler, and a blend of mix ethnic girl students.

Government Girls High School, Shaheen Road

As noted, the community around this school was very diverse in terms of ethnicity, social class and religious sects and minorities, primarily are Pashtun (local Pashtun and Afghan

refugees). The school is the only girls' high school in the area along with many primary and middle schools in 2010. But now one middle school in the area has been officially updated to high school since 2009 and has started high school classes since then. In 2010, the school had a little over 2000 students, with around a quarter (421) in the high school. The school population had been dropping over time due to ethnic tensions, with many Punjabi families moving to Punjab. In 2010, around one quarter of the students were Punjabi, with another quarter being Afghani refugees, and a similar percentage of local Pashtun students. Most students came from poor or lower working-class families, although some had fathers with white-collar jobs.

The school principal and vice principal were Punjabi. The majority of staff was Pashtun and Punjabi, but there were quite a few Baloch teachers at the school.

School Structure

Discipline

The school was highly disciplined in terms of day to day routine. Though the principal of the school was on leave quite often but a group of senior teachers especially vice principal and senior science teachers completed tasks like doing school rounds, checking staff attendance and arranging substitutes, handling student's fines and punishments, and judging cleanliness. The school secretary was also responsible for maintaining discipline in school. Some students were also tasked with organizational responsibilities, primarily around assemblies. One of the primary forms of rules was constriction of movement: girls were not allowed to move about freely, walk in front of the principal's office and staff rooms, or use the bathroom or get water during the first two periods of the day.

Cleanliness

There were only two sweepers for the school, which was not enough to clean the entire building. Teachers thus assign daily cleaning tasks to students, that were done inside the classrooms. Picking up garbage was used as a punishment. Of note, the students considered the toilets to be unclean and generally try to not use them.

Effects of Local Violence and Threats

Due to threats from Islamic extremist groups to other schools in 2009 and 2010, most extracurricular activities were canceled. The school only celebrates the birthday of Prophet Muhammad (PBUH), but not any other holidays including Pakistani Independence Day. For many holidays, students were simply given the day off to celebrate at home. Furthermore, during my interviews with girl students, majority of girl students complained about the lack of extracurricular activities in the school.

The school has received threats from the Baloch extremist groups in 2009 to not to sing the national anthem or raise the Pakistani flag. The group also left copies for the national independent Balochistan anthem in Balochi to sing. The school staff didn't raise the Pakistani flag for four months; while they still sing the national anthem, they no longer use loudspeakers. Political disruptions have also affected the amount of time that was spent on teaching.

The school administration was amongst the number of girl schools, who received threat letters from religious extremist group called *Therik i Taliban* about girls' behavior inside the school. The letter threatened consequences to teachers and staff if facial veil (*purdah*) was not observed in schools. The letters also ordered the school administration to check for and control the use of cellphones in school. The letter also noted that they had spies in the staff and students to check for compliance.

Citizenship Education: Hidden Curriculum

The teachers in each school promoted their negative views about western countries and India and their alleged strategies to destabilize Pakistan. Furthermore, they also promoted the image of Pakistani Muslim woman with the accepted dominance of men through their lectures in classrooms. Presentations of Pakistani citizenship were also given through school assemblies and bulletin boards.

School Assembly

Every morning, there was a school assembly. It started with the recitation of the Holy Quran and was followed by the admiration of Holy Prophet. Then, a girl student said a golden saying either by Prophet Mohammad or a well-known Islamic scholar. At the end all girls and school staff sang the national anthem.

Bulletin Boards

The walls of the corridors that had bulletin boards were decorated with "golden words." The bulletin boards only had these phrases and art; there were no flyers or school information. These "golden sayings" played important role for character building for students, which they internalize every time they look at them. A few of these sayings were:

- Respect your elders.
- Silence is golden.
- God only helps those people who work hard and make an honest effort.
- Unity is the weapon of all nations.
- If we really want to love, we must learn how to forgive.

Islamic Lectures

I observed that the teacher linking the subject matter to Islamic teachings in both Pakistani studies and civics classes. One message was that only good Muslims could be good citizens. Students were also taught Islamic Studies and received unplanned lectures on Islam during free periods. Such lectures are not part of the main curriculum, and teachers told me that they lecture to train girls as good Muslim daughters, sisters and wives. According to them such lectures help girls how to behave in society, what is appropriate and inappropriate to say in different situations, and other basic morals and virtues.

My Usual Day in School – October 7, 2010

I arrived school today exact at 8:45 am. The bell was already rung, and girls were running to their classes to put their school bags inside of classes. They were wearing *chaddars* (long piece of thick fabric to wrap head and body) and they were taking it off before lining up for the morning assembly. I saw teachers in hurry running to staffroom to keep their belongings there such as their *chaddars,* copies, handbags etc. In staffroom, all teachers sat and chatted during their free period or recess. Some of them checked copies, while other chatted about their families, children, in-laws or shopping. Some of them recited holy Quran and other were busy in knitting or doing embroidery.

I ran to library to keep my notebook and handbag there because principal allowed me to do my interviews in library without any disturbance. I quickly took off my *chaddar* and put my *duppatta* (a shawl type of long soft fabric) around my chest and on my head. In Balochistan, all of the women wear a big piece of thick and soft fabric like shawl to wrap around their bodies and faces. There are many types like simple fabric, embroidered ones or with laces on them. The preferred color is black; otherwise, any dark colors are worn.

I ran to the main playground where the school assembly was held. The school had three sections; primary, middle and high. The playground was in the middle of school. It had two sections. The first one was a basketball section and it was paved and was attached with the cemented veranda of the main auditorium hall. The second section was not paved. The girls from middle and high sections were lined up on the unpaved part of the ground. While the primary section girls did not come to the main ground. They just lined up in their section, which had paved veranda because according to teachers the girls from lower section were hard to organize and to merge to the middle and high sections. It was time consuming and the assembly was time bound. Principal, teachers and staff along with the girl students from the dramatic society stood on the paved veranda of the auditorium hall, which was attached to the paved ground. Union girls (from class 9 and 10) were helping girls to lineup according to their sections and class. When all girls were lined up, the girls from the dramatic society started the assembly. There were five girls standing on the stage including the president of dramatic society. There was a loud speaker on the stage, which was used to make announcement. One of the girl stated the minutes of assembly such as the names of the girls who will recite an *ayat* from the holy Quran, read *naat* (praise of prophet Mohammad PBUH), *achi baat* (a mini lecture i.e., respect elders, cleanliness, holiday specific lectures, honesty, truthfulness, obedience etc.) and national anthem. Everything went through in the manner as described by the girl. Everything was done on loudspeaker except national anthem. To my surprise at the time of national anthem, one of the union girl turned off the loud speaker and all school sang the national anthem without loud speaker. When assembly finished, girls started marching in their class lines towards their classrooms one by one. It started from lower classes to higher classes. Each class teacher (usually a teacher who teaches English in first two periods is the class teacher of that class) stood at the doorstep of the class and started

checking girls' nails, hair, ribbon, uniform, shoes, sashes, socks etc. She also checked if the girl was wearing jewelry or having *hennah* on her hands or nail polish on her nails etc. If the girl was not wearing the proper required uniform and accessories of uniform, she was ordered to stand outside the classroom for a period or two as a punishment. After assembly, the middle and high sections turned into a soundproof area, where everything was disciple and in order except the primary section which was in the newly constructed block where girls were reading their English and mathematic lessons like they were singing rhymes.

Before assembly, all girls were responsible to clean their classrooms and the verandas. The girls of each class were assigned to cleanliness duty every day to clean the class. Their duties were to sweep and mob the floors of class and veranda, ink the blackboard, arrange the furniture inside of the classroom, dusting, window/door cleaning, bringing chalks etc. Girls also gathered garbage and put it in a big garbage bin. Girls also collected money for the supplies of cleaning for their classrooms such as straw made brooms, dusters, ink etc. There were three supers in schools who cleaned the garbage and cleaned the main grounds, corridors, principal room, library, laboratory, auditorium hall, staffrooms, computer room etc.

After assembly, I headed to library to start with my interviews. There I saw two supers were sweeping the ground with straw made brooms that were causing dust in the air. I also saw the *aya* (female maid of the school) cleaning windows and rostrums in corridors. The rostrums were supposed to have newspaper of the day but those ones months-old newspaper and magazines. There were open long corridors all around the schools with doors of classrooms. The corridors were decorated with bulletin boards and flowerpots. There are few examples of *ayat* from Quran, hadith and golden, words, which were written on bulletin board:

Quranic verses

- **“**And hold fast all together by the rope which Allah (stretches out for you) and be not divided among yourselves (Quran, 3:103)”.
- “Your Lord has commanded that you worship none but Him, and that you be kind to your parents (17:23).”

Hadith

- “Seek knowledge "even though it be in China”.
- "The acquisition of knowledge is compulsory for every Muslim, whether male or female”.
- "Seek knowledge from the cradle to the grave”.
- “He is not one of us who does not have mercy on our young and does not respect our elders.”

Golden words

- Teacher’s harsh behavior is better than the love of father.
- Silence is worship.
- Unity is a great weapon for nations.
- Cleanliness is half worship.
- These messages were there to train young girls’ mind consistently to make them modest so that they develop their characters that is acceptable in Islam and society.

I also saw four union girls cleaning and picking garbage from flowerpots and corridors. The uniform of the school was light blue shirt with white shalwar (lose trousers) with white sashes. The uniform has accessories like red ribbons, red belt, white socks and black shoes. The union girls wear extra black sashes (with their union designation labeled on) across the white

sashes. The middle and high sections girls were asked to cover their heads with the ends of their sashes.

The classrooms were decorated with colorful charts, posters, paintings and beautiful paper artwork mostly done by students. The classrooms had one room for entrance and exit purpose. The classroom entrance had the welcome chart right opposite wall of the main door. There was a goodbye chart on the top of the door. There were charts with Quranic verses, hadiths and golden words. There were desks and chairs in middle and high sections. The primary section had furniture in class 3,4 and 5, which teachers bought from within school fundraising funds through food stalls from union. The K-2 classrooms did not have furniture in classrooms except tables and chairs for teachers. The teachers are trying to raise funds for the furniture of these classes so that they would buy the furniture before the new academic year starts in March. The young ones had to sit on floor on jute matts.

The school washrooms for girls were not properly cleaned. There were four washrooms and they and had not been cleaned for ages. Students tried to avoid it as much as they could even the girls from primary section did not want to go there. The schoolteachers told me that they don't have funds to clean it. Second, if we clean it, girls will again make it dirty. There was no water in washrooms and the sewerage system was totally blocked. I tried to see the condition of those washrooms but could not got inside because of the pungent smell and dirty floors. There were two water filters donated by the rich people of the community, but those ones were out of order and girls were compelled to drink water from 4 mud pitchers, which were dirty inside out. They were not refilled on regular basis either. There were no gas heaters in any classrooms. There was cold and temp was around -1 Celsius and children were in without heaters without gas or electric heaters. Upon my inquiry later, the clerical staff told me that they couldn't afford to

pay big bills of gas and electricity. There were minimal funds allocated for it from the government. That was the reasons that the classrooms did not have gas or electric heaters.

The school had laboratory and computer rooms. Both of them were closed and teachers only opened them at the time of taking annual lab practical conducted by the Board of examinations. According to the senior teachers, the girls are very careless, and they show negligence in conducting lab tests. The same case was with school library, which was useless for students. First of all, the library had only three steel almirahs with old books. Second, girls were not allowed to check out the books because teachers were afraid of losing them. Then they would be answerable in front of principal.

Though the school was located in Pashtun dominated area but still there was a strong hold of Baloch community inside of the school. Also, many teachers told me that due to the political unrest, the shutter down and wheel-jam strikes make us to close down the school and it happens quite often. That was the reason that assembly was done on loudspeaker to let the neighborhood know that the school is training the girls properly with religious information.

Another Day – November 7, 2010

Discipline and Control

Today I was 10 minutes late to school. The moment I stepped into the school through the main gate, I realized that I missed the assembly. I saw 4 lines of girls from different classes. Each line had around 10-12 girls from all sections of school. Miss Ansa, one of the senior most teachers in her 50s, greeted and hugged me at the main gate. She was very strict, and all girls of the school were very afraid of her. As an in charge of the discipline committee, she was the one who held latecomers at the main gate. She showed me the lines of the latecomer girls and told me that most of these girls come late on regular basis. She was mad at them that why don't they

listen to her? Why do they come late every day? She then started checking their uniforms, shoes, hairpins, ribbons, belt, sashes etc. For example, she was checking the girls one by one and was telling them the following things:

- It is your duty as a student of this school to be neat and clean, punctual and obedient.
- You should wear neat and clean uniform. It does not need to be new; it just needs to be clean.
- You should wear white scarf with sashes, red belt, light blue shirt, white shalwar (trousers) etc.
- There should school badge on the right side of your sashes.
- Your hair should be tied up with red ribbons or black hairpins.
- You are not allowed to apply *hennah* on your hands. It does not matter if there was a wedding in your family or any event, in any situation you are not allowed to apply henna on your hands. If you do this, please cut your hands and keep them at your homes before coming to school.

She pointed out girls their colored shoes, colored socks and embroidered head scarves. She told students that this is not the first time that you are late today. Some of them have made it their habit of being late. She said I gave you many warnings before, but this is my final warning to you all that if you come late next time, I will take serious action and will call your parents to school. Then she said now those girls who have 2 rupees (20 cents), please step forward. This was the fine amount for latecomers. Around 16 girls came forward and gave her 2 rupees each. She took money and made a line of those girls who paid fine. Then she gave that money back to those girls and told them that “this is your reward because you were honest. You admitted it that this was your mistake and you will not do it again”. The remaining girls were standing there in

lines. They were silent and were looking at us. They did not say anything. Suddenly, one of the girls started crying. Then I saw other teachers joined miss Ansa. Miss Ansa did not notice her before. Then one of the girls in the second line brought her attention to that crying girl. Miss Ansa asked her to come to them. One of the teachers grabbed her hand and asked her why is she crying? Why did you come late today? What do you do before coming to school? The girl replied that she helps her mother out in household chores. She fills bottles, gallons and the tank with water because in her area there is a shortage of water. The water comes around 7:45 am for an hour in the morning only and she has very limited time to store water for the day. Then she has to walk to school, which starts at 8:45 am and that is how she gets late every day. After listening her story, Miss Ansa told her that you have a valid problem but why don't you ask your mother to switch duties with you. If you sweep floor or make breakfast and your mother takes care of water duty, then you could come earlier. She said that you should talk to your mother about it. The girl said yes but I read her face and it looked to me that it is not in her control. She is not the one who makes decision or asks her mother or family members to help her out. If her family members were helpful, she would not be coming late every day. I salute that girl and her courage to come to school every day regardless of her problems. In the meantime, around 12 girls came out and said sorry to Ms. Ansa with a promise that they will no be late again. Ms. Ansa said, "shabash! (well done!) I am glad that you realized your fault and I am hoping you will not do it again". Then she asked one of the teachers standing with her to take these girls to their respective classrooms. She took them inside of the school to their classrooms. In the mean time two union girls who worked with Ms. Ansa in discipline committee, brought four girls (two from class 4 and the other two from class 7). The union girls said that these girls were outside of their classrooms after assembly and were around water pitchers to drink water. The girls were

not allowed to roam or go outside to drink water during the first five periods before recess. In case of the need to go washrooms/latrines, the girls were totally dependent on their class teachers to go to latrine. Most of the time, their request got denied because teachers thought that the girls are just making excuse to go out and spend some time outside of the class. However, during my time in school, there was an incidence in primary section when teacher did not allow a girl from class 3 to go to washrooms/latrines during the first five periods. The girl could not control it and ended up of urinating in class. I felt really bad for her because not only all of her classmates were laughing at her, the teacher scolded her a lot of not controlling it. The matter was brought to the discipline committee of the school and eventually they called the girl's family to take her home. The girl did not allow to sit inside the classroom. Rather her class teacher ordered her to sit outside in the veranda area. The girl continued crying until her mother came to take her home. I really felt bad for her! She was miserable!

It was the second period and Ms. Ansa was still with these latecomer girls and girls who were outside of their classrooms to drink water during the first period. She was waiting for the apology from the remaining girls. She started lecturing them like we teachers are here to correct you morally, make you disciplined and punctual. You should give respect to your teachers and show your obedience. You should be ashamed of yourself! Since you did not say sorry to me, now your punishment is that you all will remain standup in your classrooms all day till dismissal. This is your punishment for the day! She asked them to make a line and asked union girls to take them to their respective classrooms. The girls silently lined up and started marching with the union girls. I saw a few girls from class one. They were innocent and did not know what is going on. They were having heavy backpacks on their backs. I was thinking about them that these girls were late but were not asked why they did they get late? What were their stories? Girls at this

age are very shy and if they are from poor families, they lose the remaining confidence to express their feelings.

After that I had a conversation with Ms. Ansa, who had been teaching for about 30 years. She said that this is a usual day for her. She complained about the changing behavior of girls, who have become impudent and disrespectful. She said that girls are not focused to their studies these days because of many reasons. Media has played a very important role to spoil the minds of your young generation. The girls are going away from our religion. They try to become like TV celebrities. There is another thing to mention which is the infusion of Indian culture into Pakistani culture through media. The Indian media has a political agenda to ruin the innocent minds of our youth. Another factor is the negligence from the parent side. Their parents do not give them religious education at home because they are themselves far away from the teachings of Islam. Our religion Islam is a way of life and we have totally forgotten it. That is the main reason that we all teachers decided to give mini Islamic lectures (*durs*) to girls during their free periods. If a teacher is covering the absent teacher's class, she tells girls good things from Quran and the true stories of our prophets and their companions. This how we can make them modest and pious women.

Government Girls High School, Hani Road

The Baloch School is one of the oldest schools in Balochistan. The clerical staff told me that it was built before partition. This school is one of the largest and is overcrowded perhaps because there is only one government girls' high school in the area, the inner eastern suburbs. It had 2699 in 2010, with nearly 800 of them being in the high school. Like the Shaheen Road school, Hani Road has also seen a decrease in the student body, although this is due to destruction of nearby slums.

It serves range of students with diverse ethnicities, social class, and religious groups/minorities, which has created many political issues for the school. The area is primarily Baloch, with a fair amount of people advocating for Baloch independence, including some girls in the school, who caused a huge disturbance in the school on Pakistani Independence Day by burning the Pakistani flag, wearing black fabric strips on their heads and singing Balochi national anthem. Based on the location, the local government has deployed Frontier Constabulary (FC) to keep peace, and the school is now a high security zone. The student population was 44% Balochi, 20% local Pashtuns, and 30% Punjabi immigrants. While much of the student body is poor or lower-middle-class, there are a fair number of students from middle-class backgrounds. I collected the school demographic from the clerical staff in school.

Assembly was conducted every day but not all of the students could attend it because there was no space large enough for all the students, so the lower classes had assigned days to attend school's assembly. The girls used to participate in extracurricular activities such inter-school speech/debate/quiz competition, funfair, flower exhibition, band competition, drama competition etc., That was certainly not the case in past two years due to political upheaval. The school had 90% result in recent Matriculation examinations. Though teachers had many concerns about open cheating in matric examinations. Rote learning and memorization were commonly observed in the classroom instruction.

School Structure

Discipline

Due to the huge student body, this school lacked discipline in many areas. There were fewer teachers to maintain discipline in corridors, playground and classrooms. Though, I heard good things about the principal as an administrator, she was often absent due to family issues.

However, there was a committee of senior teachers who kept attendance register of teachers and assign periods and duties to junior teachers. There were, however, some division between the teachers, particularly on ethnic lines. There were also issues with students and teachers being divided ethnically, which was especially an issue for Baloch girls and Punjabi teachers.

Cleanliness

Due to overcrowding, the school had issues with cleanliness despite having 9 cleaning staff. The school doesn't have enough place for playground. Female students were responsible for cleaning their classrooms. They swept, washed, cleaned and dusted. They told me that they pool money to buy cleaning items for their classrooms. The girls from middle section pick up garbage and clean the ground after recess time.

Effects of Local Violence and Threats

As previously mentioned, the school is located in densely Baloch populated area. Baloch girls are the majority in school, and many are actively involved in Baloch independence movement. Like the school on Shaheen Road, the school received threats about singing the Pakistani national anthem and raising the flag. This was the incident that led to the deployment of the FC — upon request of the principal — though the Baloch girls' activities in the school were not changed. They also received the threatening letters from the religious extremist group *Therek e Talibaan*.

Citizenship Education

In contrast to my other research sites, this school does not offer Civic Education as an elective subject. Upon my inquiry, the vice principal told me that due girls' lack of interest in the subject, the principal selected Home Economics instead of civic Education in Arts section. Pakistan Studies is taught because it is a compulsory subject to complete matriculation

certificate. She noted that the Baloch students' only interest in the topic was as a means to get their Matriculation certificate.

The hidden curricula of Hani Road was less obvious and centered around ethnic differences among staff and students. Baloch students were taught by family members issues around Baloch identity and brought that education into the school. Meanwhile Pashtun students tended to be very patriotic, although they have some reservations in relation to the political leaders and government's performance.

Government Girls Model High School, Fatima Jinnah Road

During my informal conversations with teachers in other two schools, I learned that government girls model school at Fatima Jinnah road is regarded the best school of the province in terms of its academic performance. This school is also is provided with extra administrative support from the Directorate of Education, which leads to better facilities. The school is located in the heart of Quetta city, and doesn't include a primary school. Therefore the 350 high school students represented about half of the total student body. Like the other schools, it has seen a severe reduction in students, mainly due to violence towards Punjabi ethnic groups. It serves range of ethnic groups with different social classes and religious minority groups especially Christians. Around 40% of the student body is Punjabi immigrants, with local Pashtuns around another 30%. Baloch students are 17% of the student body, and there is a significant Hazara minority of around 10%

The school principal was one of the few Baloch administrators in the area and belonged to influential Baloch family while the vice principal was Punjabi. The majority of staff was Punjabi and Urdu speaking but there were also Pashtun, Baloch and Hazara teachers in the school.

School Structure

Discipline

The school maintained strict discipline during classroom instruction, recess, game period, assembly, corridor, dismissal time etc. The principal herself went on round of the school two times a school day. During the period of my visit to school, I found her very punctual and active during a school day. There was a student group, which was highly active in maintaining discipline during school assembly. The school showed 90% results in recent matriculation examination.

Cleanliness

The school maintained high level of cleanliness. Same as other two schools, girl students were responsible for classroom cleanliness, while the school's playground, principal's office, staffroom, laboratories, library and clerical staffroom were cleaned by supers.

Effects of Local Violence and Threats

The local community was mixed, but the majority were Pashtun residents. Unlike the other two schools, it had not received either type of threats at the time of fielding.

Citizenship Education (Hidden Curriculum)

The school provides Pakistan Studies and Civic Education classroom instruction in higher classes.

School Assembly

Girls from all of the classes gathered at the playground at the assembly time. The daily assembly included the recitation of Holy Quran, admiration of prophet, and an explanation of golden words of Islamic scholars. A musical band of girl students of class 10th used to play the National Anthem at the end of the assembly once a week.

Bulletin Boards

The school has the same practices of bulletin board, Islamic lectures like other two schools.

My usual day in school – May 18, 2011

Today the school proceedings started after the bell rang at 8:30 am. I headed to teachers' staffroom right after assembly. The whole assembly proceedings took around 15 minutes. Then the zero period started, which was also called games period. The Physical teacher came outside in the main playground to guide girls. Everyday only selected classes were assigned to play different games in playground. Today girls were playing basketball. On the other hand, the rest of the classes were supervised by class monitors until the first period. The zero period was only for 30 minutes and the rest of the periods were 35 minutes long. The teachers sat in staffroom during zero period. There was an Arabic teacher, who did *Muallama* (Islamic female scholar) course, started *dars* (Islamic lecture) in staffroom. All teachers sat and listened it very quietly. Today her topic was unity. She took a verse for the holy Quran in relation to humanity and explained it. She read the following verse

Ayat (verse) from the holy Quran,

> *"O mankind! We created you from a single (pair) of a male and a female, and made you into nations and tribes, that ye may know each other (not that ye may despise (each other). Verily the most honored of you in the sight of Allah is (he who is) the most righteous of you. And Allah has full knowledge and is well acquainted (with all things)."* (Quran 49:13)

She then explained that despite differences in our DNAs and fingerprints, we all have a common origin. We should accept the differences of color, creed and class without any discriminating anyone. She further elaborated that every human as part of our extended family whether we are able to trace our bloodlines or not is in itself a powerful unifying idea, an idea

whose time has finally come in a world that is shrinking every day. She further explained the verse in relation to the hadiths of prophet Mohammad (PBUH). I truly understood the main reasoning behind the *dars* (Islamic lecture) with specific verse from the holy Quran to give everyone the message of oneness of humanity which is a powerful message for all those who still want to live in their own tribal, national and ethnic cocoons without any respect and regard for others. There were good ratio and mix of local teachers and non-local teachers in the school. It was an assertion that despite our ethnicities, we all are same and should be united. At the end of *dars* (Islamic lecture), all prayed to Allah altogether. As soon as the zero period ended, teachers started heading to their respective classes after the bell rang. While I was thinking my next step to start with the school observations of teachers' interview, one of the teachers came and sat next to me. She asked me about my research and offered her services if I had any questions regarding girls' rural schools, she would be more than happy to talk about it. On my inquiry, she told me that she is saraiki speaking and she has served her services as a teacher in different parts of rural Balochistan such as Kalat, Mastung, Awaran, Bolan, Kachhi,Sibi, etc. These are Baloch dominated districts. The literacy rate in these areas is higher than Pashtun regions here in Balochistan and most parts of rural Panjab. She told me that I served in those areas for 10 years and I found people there very kind and respectful. She said that people in these rural areas want to educate themselves. This is a propaganda or misconception that Baloch people don't want to get education or do not send their girls to schools. People in rural areas are more interested to get education and majority of them male and quite a number of females have finished their matriculation but only a few of them got access to higher education. It is due to the fact that majority rural areas lack colleges and universities and poor people cannot afford to send their children to cities for higher secondary education. People are highly motivated and keen to get

education. She told me that please do mention in your research about it and let the rest of the world know about this reality. Also, nonlocal teachers' lives are at stake in Baloch dominated areas and her suggestion was to hire more local people in those areas. In the meantime, the bell rang, and she excused me to take her class.

The I got a chance to talk with another teacher who was sitting on my right side. She did not say anything during my conversation with the first teacher but as soon as that teacher left, she started talking with me. She introduced herself to me and told me that this is her second year in this school, but she started her job years ago in some other schools in Quetta. She was Panjabi Shia and her husband was shot down in target killing three years ago. She shared her feeling with me that it is very hard to raise four daughters without husband in this society. She also got injured when her husband was shot dead. The government of Balochistan announced to give government job to her eldest daughter, who just finished her higher secondary education at that time. She told me that before her husband death she used to live in a Baloch dominated area of the city and Baloch people were very nice to her and her family.

After my observations in classrooms, one of the senior Pashtun teachers told me that about one and half years ago this school was a center point to visit by the male officials from directorate of schools and ministry of education. They used to come to school without any invitation or without any valid purpose. They liked to come here and sat with teachers to talk and kill their time. She said that I do not like it at all. We all are from respectable families and we are not here to entertain males. That is why I made a complaint to secretary of education and the chief secretary of that time to stop unnecessary visit of male officials here. As a result, all government girls' schools in Quetta received an order from ministry of education to stop the

visits of all male officials to girls' schools. Now they are not allowed to come to school without any reasons.

I also got the chance to talk with the girls Guide teacher at school, who told me that she has been affiliated with the **Girls' Guide** since the time of her schooling. She told me that girls' guide here is not very active because of the political unrest in the province for last three years. She said that principal of the school is not interested in girls' guide. That is why she cannot initiate girls guide activities in the school without principal permission.

The Researcher's Role and Identity

To begin with my identity, I am a female. I come from a predominantly Muslim, extremely patriarchal and a tribal society. In my society, nationalism and ethnic, religious and gender chauvinism, enjoy a premium position supported and nurtured by the state and Pakistani society alike (Durrani, 2007). At the same time, I come from an upper middle-class, predominantly technocrat-professional-urban-educated family. I perceive myself both as an insider and outsider to the field. Being a Pakistani, sharing the same language (Urdu) and other ethnic dialects of the participants (like Balochi, Brahvi and a little bit of Pashto), I bring to my role some qualities of an insider. However, I am an outsider, as I was seen as a student doing a PhD from a foreign university. My former capacity as college lecturer with institutional affiliations with the secondary education was helpful in encouraging the principals and teachers to have an open, relaxed attitude with me, as they did not view me as a potential supervisor. Other aspects of my social identity, such as my marital status, my Muslim religious identity, and my Baloch ethnicity also helped many participants feel comfortable working with me. My marital status and being a mother also matched the 'ideal' concept of womanhood held by the participants and assisted me in the fieldwork.

In short, the research would not have been easily possible without the many aspects of my identify and upbringing that made me an "insider". In some cases, aspects of my "outsider" status were also useful in the research, as they let people feel comfortable that I was not likely to cause them trouble within the education sector system. On the other hand, at various times I found that I was positioned in very uncomfortable ways, and that my status as "insider" or "outsider" was questioned and led to threats or concerns. I reflect on some of these experiences throughout the dissertation.

Data Collection

In order to understand the notion of young girls' citizenship and its relationship with their identity construction, I utilized four methods to collect my research data: document analysis, observations, interviews, and focus group discussions (Rossman & Rallis, 2003). In the following section I explain how that data were collected for each instrument and reflected upon the strengths and weaknesses of each approach.

Documentary Data

Documentary data is a significant source of information about past, present, and future activities of the research settings and participants (Glesne, 1998). Therefore, this tool helped me to triangulate the data that I generated through other tools.

The documentary data was attained from three main sources: education policy documents, national curriculum drafts, and officially mandated textbooks. These documents are all 'official. The first and the third data sources are 'open-published' documents accessible to all. On the other hand, the second, the curriculum drafts, are `restricted' documents and were obtained from the Curriculum Wing in Islamabad and the directorate of Education in Quetta. The document includes the National Curriculum 2002 in Pakistan Studies and Civics for grades 9th

and 10th. The curricular materials analyzed included textbooks in Pakistan Studies and Civics for class 9th and 10th. These textbooks were adopted and prepared by the Balochistan Textbook Board and reviewed and accepted by the federal ministry of education. They were used as the only official textbooks in all of the government schools in Balochistan.

The school knowledge is frequently constructed, selected, organized and presented according to the interests and values of dominant groups while ignoring the marginalized groups in society (Apple, 1990). This whole process reinforces and reproduces unequal power relations among social groups of the society (Apple, 1993; Banks, 1996).I utilized content analysis to analyze the documentary data to identify the "knowledge of the powerful "and the embedded hidden motives of official texts (Anyon, 1979). The official texts of policies, curriculum and textbooks serve ideological and pedagogical purposes in mobilizing citizens and shaping identities. Through the analysis of the texts, the researcher reveals whose knowledge is held or valued as normal and legitimate in mainstream, institutions (Yiting, 2017). I created the initial codes of four categories of content analysis. I borrowed the four categories such as social groups (women and ethnic groups), hierarchal events, themes (nationalism, religion, gender) and disciplines (Pakistan Studies and Civic education) from the Wade's study (1993).

Observations

Observation is considered a key tool for collecting data about people, processes, and cultures especially in qualitative research (Durrani, 2007). Observations help the researcher to describe existing situations using the five senses, providing a "written photograph" of the situation under study (Skipper, & Allen, 1993).School and classrooms' observations have been a significant tool of this ethnographic study to know the day today proceedings in different schools' settings. My role in the study was an "observer as participant". Participant observation

is regarded as the primary method used by anthropologists doing fieldwork (Demunck and sobo,1998). Participant observation is the process enabling researchers to learn about the activities of the people under study in the natural setting through observing and participating in those activities.

I spent 9 to 12 weeks in each school to ensure that I got the kind of thick description necessary for understanding the school climate, structure, curriculum, instruction, and above all girls' perception and experiences in relation to their identity formation as citizens. I started by conducting general observations, remaining in the school from the beginning till the end of the school day. I mainly observed the upper classes (9th and 10th) of each school in this systematic manner. I also made a not-so-thick description of the broader school context, such as the corridors, symbols, and signs on the notice board, playground, and assembly area when the assembly tOOK place, the teachers' staff room, on a daily basis. The majority of my time in each school was spent in 9^{th} and 10^{th} classroom observations. The main focus of observation in the classroom was on observing how knowledge was communicated and co-constructed through pedagogy and daily interactions.

Observations aimed at understanding the school experiences of girl students and instructional practices of teachers with regard to Citizenship Education. My classroom observations of class 9th and 10th particularly entailed the courses of Pakistan studies and Civic education. After a few weeks of general observations, I identified individual girl students to participate in the study and gained permission from their parents to participate in the research. I then focused in the classroom observations on these particular students, noting, for example, the types of interactions that they had with teachers and peers, the way they participated in the classrooms, their learning and understanding of the subject matter that was taught to them, their

absences and presences, etc. As I engaged in these systematic observations, I became increasingly aware of the ethnic patterns to the interactions that I was observing, and how much they differed across schools. This then became an area of additional focus for my observations and interviews.

I also observed the extracurricular and recreational activities that occurred in school during the research period (for example, the celebration of national days, religious days, sport day, fun fair and so on), and observed when these did not occur, as I report in later chapters.

While students were at the heart of my observations, their interactions with teachers, and teachers' own actions, were also a key focus. I observed teachers and their instructional practices in their classes (for example, their understanding of the subject, their instructional skills, their expertise over the subject matter, their interaction with the students, etc.) in order to better understand the teachers' capacity to teach the subject matter and what other knowledge they provided to students besides that in the textbooks in relation to social studies and civic education.

Interviews

Interview in qualitative research plays a pivotal role. It is the most widely employed method in qualitative research to describe and the meanings of central themes in the life world of the subjects. The main task in interviewing is to understand the meaning of what the interviewees say. (Kvale,1996)

The interviews I conducted were semi-structured and open-ended. In semi-structured interviews, the researcher prepares a set of same questions to be answered by all interviewees (Bogdan & Biklen, 1998). Also, additional questions might be asked during interviews to clarify and/or further expand certain issues.

In-depth interviewing is the best method to find the meaning that other people attached to

their life experiences (Kvale, 1996). To do this, I used open-ended questions, active listening which allowed the study participant to do most of the talking, requesting clarifications, asking for concrete details, asking for specific illustrative stories, and asking the study participant to reconstruct a series of events rather than remembering an outcome (Glaser & Strauss, 1967).

My interviews aimed at understanding how the girl students collectively and individually perceived themselves as citizens and constructed their identities. However, the interviews were not restricted to these questions, and I followed up the ideas, probed responses and asked for clarification and elaboration in different ways in each interview. The general areas of questioning also evolved over the course of the study.

I conducted in-depth interviews with girl students, teachers, and officials from the department of education at the district, provincial, and ministry of education federal level. I systematically drew 20 students who represented social class, ethnicity, and religious diversity, from class 9th and 10th from in the subjects of Civic education and Pakistan studies in each school. These girl students were the primary focus of my interviews and focus group discussions and also the classroom observations.

I also interviewed three teachers from class 9th and 10th who taught social studies and civics education, and one administrator in each school to understand the curriculum, instruction and policies with regard to citizenship education and its impact on girls' learning. I also interviewed six male and female government officials (textbook specialists and policy makers) at the provincial level (three) and federal level (three) to know the standards and criteria for designing citizenship education curriculum and educational policies in relation to high schools.

All of my study participants are the main stakeholders in the educational settings of Balochistan. The main purpose in interviewing my study participants is to give them a voice to

hear them out.

Focus Group Discussions

I conducted multiple focus group discussions with girls in each school. Focus group discussions aimed at understanding how the girl students collectively perceived themselves as citizens and constructed their identities. I also learned about their collective perceptions and experiences about their schools, classrooms, teachers and textbooks in relation to citizenship education. To ensure that participants were not influenced by group pressure, each group was told before the start of the discussion that I was not testing them, that we were having a chat; that there were no right or wrong answers and that I was interested in their views, and that it is all right to say they have no idea in case if they cannot answer. The questions for focus group discussion were designed to ask students to discuss the school in general terms (for example, whether they think that what they learn is related to the real world? What they think that they should learn in schools? What they think about how to improve their schools? etc) I then discussed with girls their textbooks of Pakistan studies and Civics education, teachers' approaches to help them to understand the concepts in the books and how their learning from textbooks and classroom instruction influenced their understanding of citizenship, what they learned about their responsibilities and duties, and how they conceptualized their identity as citizens. The group setting was a very effective mechanism to hear from students about shared experiences that deeply impacted their sense of citizenship (e.g., a fight at a particular school, a disruption of a holiday, etc.)

Comparison

This study is arranged as a comparative case study. The three schools, and the girls within each school, were selected in order to compare the ethnically and class-inflected

experiences of girls attending schools with different ethnic compositions. I selected ethnicity as the primary focus of comparison because of the ongoing Balochistan separatist movement. As I describe in the next chapter, Balochistan province is mostly consisted of people who identify themselves as Baloch and speak the Baloch language. However, there are very significant minority groups, including the Pashtun (who are seen as a group that is also from the area currently called Balochistan, however, from a different area of Balochistan), the Punjabis (who make up the majority of the Pakistani state and military apparatus and are viewed as settlers in Balochistan), and other minority groups including Urdu-speaking and Christians. While all of these people may have Pakistani citizenship, they are not all Baloch. Thus, the Baloch separatist movement offers a very particular context in which to examine issues of citizenship and gender, as the rationale for nationalist versus/and statist claims to citizenship are being debated as we speak. Thus, the research offers an opportunity to explore if and how girls understand the gendered nature of different claims to citizenship and to their own rights and responsibilities as citizens of these different groups—family, clan, ethnicity, nation, and state.

Limitations

This research is only limited to government secondary level girls' schools due to the researcher's gender, which was a constraining element and had become a barrier to executing research in boys' schools in Balochistan. With respect to data collection, the study only examines three government girls' high schools in urban settings. The other contrasting systems of schooling in Pakistan, private schools (where the majority of students come from lower and upper-middle classes), elite private schools (where students come from rich/elite families) and madrassas (where children come from poor families) remain outside the scope of this research. Moreover, the study, operating within the time frame of doctoral studies, remains limited to

exploring the construction of citizenship through government schools in an urban context, acknowledging that the exploration of the same in a rural context would have given comparative insights about the phenomenon.

A limitation regarding the sample is the students in government schools mostly belong to the lower and lower-middle class (though as I note later, the girls were of a higher class than I expected, as I learned that wealthier families were still sometimes sending their sons to private schools but their daughters to public schools); therefore, the findings will have more transferability to students from lower classes attending government schools. And lastly, as noted earlier, even as I engaged in prolonged engagement with the students in the school setting, I did not do so in the students' home and community (neighborhood) contexts, which could have provided a thicker description pertaining to these dimensions of the students' identity.

Significance of the Study

A study of Pakistani girls' perceptions of citizenship and identity is important because no such study has ever been conducted in Balochistan, Pakistan. Furthermore, accessing Balochistani girls' views of their citizenship and the role of their schools (curriculum, teaching practices) in shaping ideas about citizenship allows me to identify the range of possible suggestions that they consider the best way to prepare them to be democratic citizens for Pakistan as well as the world. It is vital that girls' perceptions are understood and considered for in-depth incorporation of any educational policy formulation to reduce gender disparities and gaps in the Pakistani educational system and society.

Chapter Three: Citizenship Education and the Construction of National Identity/Citizens

Knowledge just like education in all its forms is one of those things that have defined the human kind a homo sapient. Right from the dawn of thinking the great minds the world has come to respect have duly acknowledged this fact. Plato's epistemological view for example goes at length to underscore and explain the intellect as a human faculty which by its nature is disposed to learn. Every human faculty of the intellect has the capacity and potential to learn. More scientifically based research studies and experience attest to this fact.

The right to education is a fundamental human right set forth in all the universal legal instruments. The Universal Declaration of the Human Rights, the International Human Covenants, the many child-based statutes and charters have set forth education as a fundamental human right. Education occupies a very central place for it is the tool that drives human beings out of all situations that hold them bondage into sub human conditions. Nowadays, governments of nation-states thus make efforts to have young people identify closely with their nation and state through educational content and practices. Meanwhile, the modern education system facilitates the transmission of uniform information and knowledge. What is included in textbooks decides the ways in which students are encouraged to define and understand the nation. History learning is considered one of the most important processes in infusing students with an idea about their nation (Hashmi, 2014). The citizenship education such as Pakistan Studies and Civic education, contribute to build a common memory among students about the history of the nation. Governments decide what is taught in these textbooks; thus, citizenship textbooks reflect how governments define the nation and attempt to transmit the idea to the students (Hashmi, 2014).

In this chapter, I will examine how the Pakistani state presents itself in the citizenship

textbooks, and how students and teachers respond to these efforts. I show how the state attempts in the official curriculum to constitute a nation-state composed of Pakistani citizens (that is, the homogenous "citizen" that Pakistan Studies usually assumes), but in which Punjab ethnicity is the "silent norm" (much as male-hood is as well). While for some girls this conflation of statehood and ethnicity is not viewed as problematic, for others it is a very serious problem. More specifically, I find that students who are aware of and supportive of the Balochistan independence movement make sense of the curriculum and its claims of "appropriate" Pakistani citizenship in a very different way than other students. In Balochistan, all of the students' responses emphasize the ethnic nature of the textbooks' claims (either supporting or challenging), thus revealing the power and the limitations of the state's attempt to shape "official" knowledge about who is a "Pakistani citizen" through the textbook. However, while the student responses to ethnic norms reveals the ethnicized nature of the curriculum, they take for granted the religious norm underlying the entire curriculum (that is, that all Pakistanis are Muslim), and then largely do not question the gender norms that also constitute the hidden curriculum of the textbooks.

Curriculum Development

In Pakistan, federal government plays important role in designing and developing the curriculum. There seems to be a gap between politicians and policy makers (dominant group) - the people who formulate and guide educational policies and the people in the practical field of education. It looks like that there is a deep politics behind curricular choices, teaching and assessment in schools as results of accords and compromises which dominant group maneuvers to keep their dominance alive and pretend that they take into account the concerns of less

powerful[36]. This is something that truly happened in Pakistan. For instance, the Pakistan's education in late 70's and 80's under Zia's regime had a new wave of Islamization across the country and almost everything was twisted to fit into that. Not only subject knowledge-based books were changed to suit to the agenda of Islamization but even the school rituals and prayers were modified. The site of school was used in such an efficient way by the religious conservatives to achieve their political goals and it led to a domination of conservative tendencies over a democratic discourse in education. Presently, the overall curriculum in Pakistani educational system is significantly theoretical, academic and highly subjective. One of the foremost in this respect is the process of "inclusion and exclusion"[37]. For instance, the curriculum largely excludes all religious minorities from the meaning of 'citizen' and includes only Muslims as real Pakistani citizens. Likewise, women, linguistic minorities, etc., are regarded as *others* and also excluded from citizenship.

Citizenship Education – (Pakistan Studies and Civic education)

Pakistan studies and Civic education are the main subjects to be taught in schools under the realm of citizenship education. Initially in 1960, Social Studies was taught as a compulsory subject at elementary and secondary levels in 1960 in Pakistan. Afterwards the name "Social studies" was changed to "Pakistan Studies" for high classes (9-10), and the topics included were changed to put a particular emphasis on the ideological, historical, geographical, socio-economic and cultural aspects of the country (Hashmi, 2014). Pakistan Studies is a compulsory subject, which is taught at secondary, intermediate, bachelor's and master's levels in Pakistan. While Civic education is an elective subject in class 9th and 10th.

---

36 Apple, W. Michael. (2000)."Official Knowledge", 2nd edition. New York: Routledge

37 Popkewitz, T.S. (2008) Cosmopolitism and the age of school reform: science, education and making society by making the child, New York: Routledge

The Government of Pakistan Curriculum Wing of the Federal Ministry of Education drafts the main objectives of the curriculum of Pakistan Studies for class 9 and 10. Then it becomes the responsibility of the Ministry of Education and the Textbook Boardsof all four provinces of Pakistan to translate the objectives into designing and publishing the textbooks.

Balochistan Textbook Board

The Balochistan Textbook Board has a tremendous influence on the textbooks available to students and teachers. And in this regard, the Board's performance is below standard. Time is wasted in getting textbooks out to schools, and the overall quality of the textbooks are low. To save money, coordination meetings are not conducted among the writers, supervisors and coordinators. Further, the supervisors during proofreading are only allowed to amend the factual data of the textbook but not the matter of the content. No pilot testing is done of the textbooks before sending them out in the market. One of the official at Bureau of Curriculum, Quetta mentioned:

> The book writers in BTBB [Balochistan] follow the textbook boards of other provinces, especially Punjab. Those writers are not trained in any subjects. They copy the books of physics, chemistry, biology, mathematics and social/Pakistan studies from the Punjab Textbook Board. They copy the content of books with little bit of changings and send these books back to federal [level] for final approval for publication. Sometimes they send us books to review but they have never incorporated our suggestions, comments and feedback into books. It solely depends on BTBB and federal government to decide what to add and what to delete in textbooks.
>
> There is lack of coordination between all levels from top to bottom. Federal does not understand the issues we are facing here. Everything is done through proper channel. The whole process wastes lots of time. For example, when federal sends its textbooks to review, it takes more than two months to get those books on our table to review them. By the time the deadline either passes or a few days are remaining to finish the task. Then we receive strict orders from our head to review it in few days or sometime in few hours. Books' review cannot be done like that. We need time, background information and curriculum to get it done. Time is the biggest issue and then we do not have latest curriculum to begin with. Our heads do not care about the quality of work. They just want to get paperwork done to show it to the higher level.

Perhaps not surprising, given this process of textbook production, the content of the textbook only touches the first two levels of the Blooms taxonomy. No workshops are conducted for subject's experts and teachers after publishing the textbook. Above all, with respect to the national curriculum objectives, the content does not contain any information that can promote or at least assist in the achievement of the set curriculum objectives.

Role of Teachers

Most government school classrooms remain highly teacher-centered. Teachers thus play the main role in determining how textbooks will be used in classrooms, and how the material in the textbooks will be presented to students. While I will reflect on teachers in their interactions with students in the following chapters, in this chapter I talk about the methods I observed teachers using and the ways that teachers explained how they felt about the curriculum, the textbooks, and their own training on these.

First and foremost, all teachers said that they did not receive equal opportunities to participate in ongoing professional development or trainings. Instead, nepotism determined who would attend the limited trainings that were available for teachers, as the trainings were accompanied by per diems and travel. Teachers were upset first because they were not allowed to attend trainings, and second, because those who did attend did not share what they had learned after returning. The quotes below are each from a different teacher, indicating how widespread these feelings were:

> We long for teachers training or refresher instructional courses but again nepotism and favoritism play role. Teachers who have strong back and support avail such opportunities. Only the selected ones go every time and every year to attend such teachers' trainings and workshops. These trainings are paid with logistics and traveling. Those teachers when comeback they never share with us what they learn in those trainings. Then what is the benefit of such trainings and workshops?

> I never went on any teachers' training because principal sends only the senior teachers or her favorite ones to attend such trainings. After they come back from trainings, those teachers do not share anything with us. What are these trainings for? They just do it get paid extra or have some trip to another city or province to attend such workshops.
>
> I value teachers' trainings and workshops and truly agree how they are significant for us as a teacher. Unfortunately, I never had a chance to attend any. I still remember when I was doing B.Ed., our instructor asked us that why do we put charts on classrooms' wall? One of our course fellows replied that we do it to decorate the classroom. We all laughed. Then our instructor told us the instructional logic that we do it when students see these subject related charts on walls on regular basis, they don't forget and remember it. I want to do refresher courses but there are group of senior teachers who always go to such trainings.

While most teachers focused on the need for instructional support, some teachers also noted that the situations in which they were teaching (e.g., with regular threats against girls' schools from the Taliban) required that they have new kinds of training that they had not been offered in school:

> There should be subject related trainings for us. They should also provide us maps and train us how to read maps. We should also be trained in emergency related trainings such as first aid, earthquake safety, fire safety etc.

Teachers also noted that, beyond the broad issue of needing support to improve their knowledge and pedagogical skills, Pakistan Studies in particular was very sidelined in their schools. The subject was not prioritized by school management; it was often reserved for the last periods in the school day. Teachers also noted that, while all other compulsory subjects for grades 9 and 10 counted for 100 marks on final exams, Pakistan Studies only counted for 75 points. Lastly, the teachers noted that, even more so than for other subjects, students usually passed exams by simply memorizing content from the textbooks. In turn, the teachers spent most of the class periods that I observed teaching directly from the textbooks and encouraging students to simply memorize the material there because the exams are scored based on what is in the textbook, not on what is factually correct at the time that the students take the exam. Thus,

the reality is that the subject matter is kept constantly in the past, disconnected from students' daily life.

Citizenship Education: Textbooks

The Civics Education textbooks, and teacher provision of this curriculum, reflect the government and state narrative that a good Pakistani citizen cares for the Pakistani state and for their fellow citizens. Citizens are described as equal, regardless of ethnicity or gender, and are encouraged to care for one another as fellow Pakistanis. Despite this stance, the textbooks reflect a gendered notion of citizenship that quickly reveals itself to be inequitable in numerous ways. These include:

The model of good Pakistani citizenship embodied in the official curriculum is defined in religious terms, with a focus on Islamic norms.

Importantly, the curriculum does not directly discuss different ethnicities, except to note that all people of all ethnicities are united as Pakistani citizens through their religious and modernist identities. This model of citizenship does directly exclude non-Muslim girls—an issue that in Balochistan affected a small percentage of girls, and that led to a very different kind of civic experience for them than for all of the girls who are discussed here. While the different ethnic groups in Balochistan were, as I will show below, experiencing schooling and citizenship in very different ways, all of them felt they could lay claim to notions of citizenship, ethnicity, and gender in ways that non-Muslim girls did not experience. (footnote that they are not discussed here?)

Because of the particular constructions of Pakistan, Pakistani citizenship, and modernity presented in the textbooks, teachers and girls from different ethnicities in the schools in which I worked understood and responded to the textbooks and curricula in diverse ways. I discuss these

ethnically-differentiated responses below, but first discuss some of the importantly similar responses that girls (and often teachers) had to the textbooks and curricula.

Textbooks

The textbooks used in the public schools in which I conducted research were on average 15 years old, published in 2002 or 2003. Many of the teachers and students noted how outdated the textbooks were:

> The textbooks are old and outdated. The latest information we have till 2002. My mother read the same book when she was doing her matriculation. (Pakistan Studies student, class 10th)

> The books are boring! They are not updated and have old information. For examples, The Pakistan Studies book has the latest dates till 2003. It looks so awkward when you teach students that now our present prime minister is Nawaz Shareef, who was our prime minister in 1999 but in reality, our present minister is Yousuf Raza Gilani. The books should be revised with latest information. (Pakistan Studies student, class 10th)

> The books should update information in terms of governments, presidents and prime ministers' names with dates. We have a history section in books, but the latest information is 20 years old and it needs to be updated. There should be a critique of each past government's performance. (Pakistan Studies teacher)

> The textbooks have all old figures and heroes. We have new heroic figures in sports, education, politics and military etc. For instance, we see news of our military soldiers who got martyred. Their names should be included in textbooks to honor them. Though there are so many of them, but a few can be mentioned. (Pakistan Studies teacher)

While the level of out datedness was problematic in its own right, it was made more problematic by teachers' and students' sense that they could not deviate from or update the textbooks' materials because of the test-based system upon which the schools were based.

> Our emphasis is to teach them from the book because of many reasons. First, we are not allowed to share our political opinion with students. That's why we do not encourage our students to share their political views with us. Second, the examiners who read their paper are mostly junior teachers and they do not know much about the subject. In most cases they are not the subject specialists. They are given instruction from the board of examination to check the papers strictly according to the content of the books. That is why we encourage our students to memorize and write exactly the book version. (Pakistan Studies, teacher)

> The text of Civic is very boring. It is also difficult to understand and prepare for exams. The book is very descriptive with no hand on activity. (Civic Student, class 9th)

> Only textbooks' content is acceptable. We have to learn the lesson by heart and our teacher listen it every day. She wants us to learn everything word-by-word and line-by-line. I don't like it! (Pakistan Studies student, class 10th)

> During test, we cannot write anything out of textbooks. I want to include some current affairs information in my answers, but it is not allowed. Once in our civic test we had to write about the present form of government in Pakistan, I wrote it that is parliamentary and explain with some present examples of our political leaders. My teacher did not accept it and gave 4 out of 10. It was not fair! At least we are allowed to write things in our own words let alone the information we get from Internet or media. (Civic student, class 10th)

The restriction on updating materials was also felt by some teachers and students to be a restriction on their capacity to critically analyze the materials or to debate aspects of the materials that might warrant debate.

> In our school, creativity and critical thinking are never appreciated. Students are not encouraged to ask questions. (Civic student, class 10th)

> We see so many things in our society, which are against the teaching of our textbooks. For instance, our books say obey law, keep clean our city and country and be united. I do not see anything like that. People do not follow rules and regulation such as traffic laws. There is no mechanism to arrest the culprits who snatch, harass and kill innocent people. They never get caught. Where are police and other law enforcement agencies? We don't feel safe here. (Pakistan Studies Student, class 10th)

Lastly, students and teachers alike expressed a great concern for the vast and growing distance between the idealized social and political relations described in the textbooks and the reality of a daily school and household experience marked by extreme threats of sectarian violence and deep gender and class inequities that limited girls' capacities to enact the forms of citizenship described in the textbooks.

> The books should highlight the present political, economic and social situation of our country. Our girls should know about their rights and responsibilities and make better decision as productive citizen of Pakistan. (Civic, teacher)

> I don't see any relation of books with the current situation we are facing in Pakistan. Now people have become disunited unlike the books that tell us to be united. People are killing each other on the bases of ethnicity and sect. Target killing is very common. Our lives

> have become unsecured. I love my family, but our families are not safe here. It makes me terrified. (Pakistan Studies Student, class 10th)
>
> It is mentioned in books and our teachers have endorsed it that Pakistan is a beautiful country. I don't see her a beautiful country. Now a day due to bomb blasts, target killing, and corruption have made her very ugly. There is no law and order in here. (Civic student, class 9th)

Concerns about the impact of forms of corruption that were viewed as deeply undermining idealized notions of equality were also evident in teachers' discussions of civics teacher professional development and, increasingly, teachers' experiences with girls in their classrooms. In terms of professional development, teachers consistently noted that opportunities to learn about civics as a subject were inequitably distributed.

> We long for teachers training or refresher instructional courses but again nepotism and favoritism play role. Teachers who have strong back and support avail such opportunities. Only the selected ones go every time and every year to attend such teachers' trainings and workshops. These trainings are paid with logistics and traveling. Those teachers when come back, they never share with us what they learn in those trainings. Then what is the benefit of such trainings and workshops?
>
> There should be ongoing teachers' training sessions throughout the academic year.
>
> I never went on any teachers' training because principal sends only the senior teachers or her favorite ones to attend such trainings. After they come back from trainings, those teachers do not share anything with us. What are these trainings for? They just do it get paid extra or have some trip to another city or province to attend such workshops.
>
> I value teachers' trainings and workshops and truly agree how they are significant for us as a teacher. Unfortunately, I never had a chance to attend any. I still remember when I was doing B.Ed., our instructor asked us that why do we put charts on classrooms' wall? One of our course fellow replied that we do it to decorate the classroom. We all laughed. Then our instructor told us the instructional logic that we do it when students see these subject related charts on walls on regular basis, they don't forget and remember it. I want to do refresher courses but there are group of senior teachers who always go to such trainings.
>
> There should be subject related trainings for us. They should also provide us maps and train us how to read maps. We should also be trained in emergency related trainings such as first aid, earthquake safety, fire safety etc.

And, in relation to their experiences teaching civics in ethnically diverse classrooms, non-local teachers noted increasing strains.

> There is a big trend of local and no local. Most of the Baloch girls don't prefer to be taught by non-local teachers. For example, in our times when we were taught about our national heroes, we got fascinated by readying about their accomplishments and achievements. We were always more curious to know about them. Now when we teach them about our national heroes such as Jinnah, Iqbal, Liaqat Ali khan etc., students don't pay attention and show any interest. Especially Baloch students have these cunning smiles on their faces just to show that they are not interested to learn about them. We don't want to read and do whatever you can do! After seeing this I become sad because Pakistan is very special to me. Our ancestors achieved it after their intense struggles and unlimited sacrifices. We are the builders of our country and these children are the future builders of Pakistan.
>
> Right after Nawab Akbar Bugti killing, this whole Baloch nationalist movement caught fire and gained attention. Before Baloch girls here were not like that. This trend is not only specific to our school; this wave is everywhere! If you see other schools, colleges and universities, Baloch students don't want to study Pakistan Studies.
>
> When I teach them Pakistan Studies, the Baloch girls say that Jinnah was a bad person because he cheated us. We Beaoch people trusted him but he deceived us very badly by merging Balochistan forcibly into Pakistan in 1948. We did not want to be with Pakistan. We want to be an independent state. These girls do not know the history of Balochistan. Actually, there were orders by British Empire that every independent will be merged either with Pakistan or India and that's how their Baloch leaders decided to be with Pakistan. These Baloch girls just repeat whatever they hear from their elders. They think they are right. I told them that Balochistan had not merged into Pakistan, India would have attacked on you and your situation would have been the same. Either way you people would not have an independent state. Now you are better off because at least you are in a Muslim state Pakistan unlike India.

Ethnicity and Citizenship

Non local teachers noted their concerns about the ethnic tensions inflecting their classrooms on a daily basis—and the complex gender and class dynamics intersecting these tensions—but most of the non-local teachers talked about this. Non-local teachers felt that they were receiving less respect than before from Baloch students, and they perceived Baloch students as being "political" as a whole. In turn, being "political" meant supporting the independence movement in ways that went against the formal curriculum and norms of the government secondary school, and that teachers often seemed to feel personally offended by this behavior.

> Students do not respect us the way we used to give respect to our elders. There are many factors behind student's rude and careless behavior such as parents, media, cheating, political unrest and our society on the whole.
>
> Not all of the Baloch girls are rebellious but there are quite a number of them especially the ones who have string back and support from their families. These girls have made a political part in school and they meet during recess time. They are spoiling other girls in school as it is said that a rotten fish spoils the whole flock. They sit and make plans during recess. They prepare everything at home about how to disturb the school discipline and come with that mind set to school.
>
> If we say anything to Baloch girls, they bring their fathers and brothers to school. Their fathers and brothers don't have any respect to talk to female teachers. They intimidate principal and staff and ask them to call teachers so that they take her class. They threat teachers and principal of they don't teach their daughters the way they want to be taught.
>
> Our national anthem and flag are our pride! Before we were scared of singing national anthem and raising flag in morning assembly. But now FC soldiers have made it possible for us to sing national anthem and raise our flag in morning assembly. Despite that Baloch students do not sing national anthem and do not respect flag.
>
> We used to have big functions on Independence Day, Defense Day, Pakistan's Day and Iqbal day but we don't celebrate them any more due to the sensitivity of the matter. We don't celebrate or have function on any religious and national holidays here and students don't know the significance of these days.
>
> Now in school the fights between Baloch girls and Pashtun girls, disrespecting the flag and national anthem are very common. Now Nawab Bugti and other Nationalist Baloch leaders are the ideals of Baloch girls. We did not kill Nawab Bugti. Musharf and military killed him. He should not have killed. His killing was not justified! But this whole scenario has affected all of us. We love Balochistan. Our ancestors lived here and now we are serving our land with love and respect.
>
> We admit it that Baloch's rights have been violated and they are the deprived ones amongst all of us. We understand their deprivation and we stand by their demands of equal and fair rights and treatment. We are not responsible for the injustice with Baloch people then why are we paying the price? Our people have been targeted and killed. We are forced to migrate to another province. Our families are not safe here. That's why we have sent our children to Punjab due to security reasons. We are here because of our government jobs and we will be here till our retirements and then we will also leave if things remain the same in future.

Girls similarly reported experiencing their classrooms and schools as ethnically divisive spaces that also felt increasingly unsafe for all girls:

> The book should be Balochisan Studies rather Pakistan Studies. Why should we study about Pakistan when there are so many things to mention from Balochistan. Pakistan

> Studies only talk about Pakistan. This book at least has a specific chapter on Balochistan about its history, culture, population and people etc. The book should have a history about our ancestors, our heroes and their struggles and achievements. The book talks a lot about Jinnah but not a single thing about our ancestors and heroes. For example, there should be a topic about Baloch peoples' hospitality. We Baloch were the ones who weighed Jinnah with gold when he firs time visited Balochistan. (Baloch student, class 10th)

> Books say good things about our leaders and portray them as heroes. In reality they are ones who are responsible for all disturbances and terrorism. They have created the environment of terror everywhere. (Baloch student, class 10th)
> I do not like what is happening in our country especially in our province. People are fighting and killing each other on the bases of ethnicity. For examples, we Punjabis are getting threat to leave the province and to go back to Punjab. How can we leave this city like that? This place has the memories of our ancestors and our childhood. This place has our homes, our business, our relatives and friends. We cannot leave our homes and start living in another place like Punjab. Balochistan is our province and we owe this place too. Last year quite a number of our relatives and family friends left Quetta city after receiving threats from the Baloch separatist groups. They sold their big houses on cheap rates and migrated to Punjab. Some of them couldn't adjust there and came back and now are living in the same houses on rent as tenants." (Punjabi students, class 10th)

This brief analysis of some of the textbooks and their uses in grades 9 and 10 reveal the curriculum's casual assumption of Punjabi norms, heroes, and student ideals in the citizenship textbooks. It reveals teachers' relative comfort with this status quo, teachers' assumptions that the curriculum focuses only on Pakistani forms of (gendered) citizenship, and the sad reality that the system prioritizes studying for exams over other pedagogical approaches to learning.

Standing in sharp contrast to these assumptions are the realities of life in a multiethnic province in which an active independence movement, increased security concerns caused by the Taliban, and state-sponsored killings sit uncomfortably side by side in the classroom, even as they remain silent in the textbooks. Teachers and students alike therefore navigate the changing citizenship landscape—as the independence movement calls for new forms of national citizenship, as settlers attempt to find new forms of belonging predicated on shared Pakistani

citizenship, and as girls try to navigate the patriarchal structures that make accessing and staying in school an uncommon feat.

Chapter Four: Settler Identities and 'Modern' Pakistani Citizenship

Settlers in Balochistan

Balochistan is a multiethnic and multicultural province, with a population of Baloch, Pashtuns, Hazaras and many settlers. 'Settler' is a label used for ethnic Punjabi, Urdu (*Muhajirs*),[38] Sindhis, and Hindko-speaking people living in different parts of the province. According to the 2017 national census, the total population of Balochistan is 12 million people. The first language of 54.76 percent of the population in the province is Balochi, Pashto is 29.64 percent, Sindhi 5.58 percent, Seraki 2.42 percent, Punjabi 2.52 percent, and Urdu 1 percent.[39] Local certificates are issued to those who are a part of ancient Baloch and Pashtun tribes. Domiciles are issued to those who are not a part of these tribes, but who have been living in Balochistan for a long time and those are called the settlers. These certificates were introduced in 1951 to register Pakistani residents. These are required when applying for admission to public colleges, schools, universities, and for government jobs (Imtiaz, 2012).

Settlers as Powerful Outsiders

The settlers in Balochistan are seen at outsiders but they are powerful outsiders relatively because they are mainly Punjabis, who have been very central to Pakistani national politics and economy. Punjabis see themselves as the most influential and powerful ethnic group of Pakistan, rather than as part of Balochistan. To be a Punjabi is not to be a Balochistani in cultural or social terms; moreover, it is a sort of caste differentiation in the labor sense of that term: being Punjabi is expressed as being a professional, a labor professional, and a modern professional. They see themselves as a part of Pakistani modernity.

---

[38] North Indian Muslim immigrants, who migrated from India to Pakistan during partition to settle down in in the newly independent state Pakistan.

[39] Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, Government of Pakistan 2017

Historically, Punjabis wielded the strongest power of any ethnic group in Pakistan and until recently this was true in Balochistan as well, despite Punjabi status as a small minority of the population. The first group of Punjabis migrated to Quetta (the capital of Balochistan) in 1901.[40] A good number of them shifted out of Quetta and to different parts of Balochistan after the 1947 partition. The majority of the Punjabis are in business, and a good number of them are in the teaching and medical professions. Before 2006, more than 80 percent of barbers, dry cleaners and tailor masters in the province were of Punjabi ethnicity. There is, as noted above, a very strong association made between being Punjabi and having what is considered a modern profession. This is a point of great pride with families, and though it is especially true for men, it is also true for Punjabi women, especially if their work supports the natal family by providing skilled labor for a family business, or by bringing in a wage through a profession like teacher.

An overwhelming majority of Punjabi settlers migrated to Quetta after the creation of the West Pakistan One Unit. A lot of Baloch leaders believe that this migration was a concerted effort by the new government to weaken the identity of tribes and to colonize the smaller provinces, especially Balochistan, to reinforce federal government control of the natural resources of the province and coastline. It created a sense of anger and deprivation among the Baloch, especially the youth. There is a very common phrase used by Balochs in Balochistan that "though we are living in the post-colonial era, but we are still colonized by the Punjabi

[40] From the excerpts of an interview of senior Baloch leader senator Hasil Bizenjo.

establishment".[41]

According to Haqaani (2017), 54 % of Pakistanis are ethnic Punjabis. The Pakistani military consists of 72 % of Punjabis, and 54% of the Pakistan civil bureaucracy is Punjabi. What does that mean? Other ethnic groups are not equal participants in the governance of Pakistan. In my experience, Punjabis think of themselves as the biggest and strongest group, due to their large presence in the military and the government establishment. There is a perception that they believe they have a right to dominate.

Punjabis value education and view it as a critical path to economic strength and stability. One of the ways that they establish their Pakistani identity is through particular professional identities. They want to show their Pakistani identity and modernity in Balochistan. They see themselves as ethnically connected to their "native" home of Punjab, but have settled in Balochistan, where they see more professional opportunities than in Punjab due to its big population.

They see themselves as part of a modern nation/community, which they display in part by getting education, and the jobs they do afterwards as professionals. Punjbis in Balochistan prove their identity as Punjabis in relation to the notion of this modem Pakistani identity, and that claim of educated, professional modernity is also the way to distinguish themselves from the locals of Balochistan. Central to the idea of being Punjabi in Balochistan is being a professional of a certain kind.

Historically in the context of Balochistan, Punjabis have been prominent in the education

---

[41] The Establishment's sphere mainly consists of the country's high-ranking civil servants and military officers. Others included are senior members of the Judiciary, the most important financiers and industrialists and the media moguls. The Establishment in Pakistan considers the key and elite decision makers in country's public policy, ranging from the use of the intelligence services, national security, foreign and domestic policies. The idea of Establishment is no different from "The Establishment" in the United Kingdom. In Pakistan Punjabis are dominant in establishment. That's why it is called Punjabi Establishment (Haqqani, 2005).

and health professions since the inception of Pakistan. For example, during my father's time back in the 1950s and 1960s, most of the teachers were Punjabis and Urdu speaking people. They [self-identified] distinguished themselves as civilized and sophisticated while stereotyping the locals. My father, being a Baloch, during his schooling had many bad experiences with his Punjabi teachers. They were mean to locals and used to call them savages. They used to say things such as, "You locals (Baloch and Pashtuns) will not achieve anything. You have no manners and no sense of dressing. Your parents just give birth to you and leave you naked to feed on gutters".

Of course, in the course of our lifetime the discrimination against locals has lessened, at least in part because the Baloch separatist movement has made it more dangerous for teachers to say such things, but also because Punjabis and Urdu speakers no longer predominate in these professional classes to the extent that they used to. For instance in my time when I was a student in the 1990s, we had Punjabi and a few Pashtun and Balochi teachers, but, in the present time when I did research with girls there were quite a number of local teachers, both female Pashtun and Baloch, working in government schools. Nonetheless, despite this shift, it is important to recognize that state schooling and health service models were "brought in" by the Punjabi-dominated Pakistani state, and these services were and continue to be dominated and led by settler groups in Balochistan. This creates particular dynamics and tensions, which are further fueled by this moment of rising Baloch independence movement strength.

Baloch and Non-Local/Settler Relations

As mentioned in the curriculum chapter, the curriculum is about producing Pakistani citizens, and Pakistani citizenship is constructed primarily around religious differentiation from India. An ideological paradigm of religion has been used to gain, regain, and maintain state

power—and state power, in turn, in overwhelmingly constituted through a Punjabi socio-cultural and political economic ideal. In this sense, curricula and schools serve as sites where those in power (Punjabis) attempt to constitute student subjectivities in ways that serve the interests of the dominant groups in Pakistan. Islamic ideology has been used to perpetuate the ethnic domination of Punjabis over others rather than pursuing a federation of all ethnic groups in the major decision making of Pakistan.

Baloch media (print, electronic, and social) claims that there is a sense among the Baloch population that Punjabi settlers remain apolitical when it comes to the problems of Balochistan, especially regarding the disappearances and killings of Baloch people by the military. They do not care about or take responsibility for the political situation and issues of Balochistan. This angers the locals. They often consider the Punjabi settlers as collaborators or spies of the federal government and military.

In the wake of the Bugti killing , Baloch militant/nationalist organizations began to paint slogans such as “down with Punjabis”, and started targeting settlers for death, especially Punjabis, Urdu-speaking people, and Hindko-speaking[42] settlers. A vast majority of settlers killed in the beginning were service providers from Punjab running barbershops, laundries, and tailoring shops. Later, the militants also began to target teachers, doctors, lawyers and other professionals. According to the Human Rights Commission of Pakistan (2013), “the settlers have been hounded out of Baloch-majority areas by threats and violence by insurgents and at times also by opportunistic property dealers keen to capture the settler’s property at a cheap price”. The remaining ones who cannot go anywhere else and say they have roots here and nowhere else to go have not moved away.

[42] Local from the Hazara division of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan

The Non-Local/Settler Girls

Punjabis/Urdu speaking settlers value education and view it as a critical path to economic strength and stability, as well as to the development of expected professional paths. Insights into what schooling as an empowerment process leading to professional opportunities looks like in the lives and experiences of Punjabi settler girls requires an in-depth understanding of their life worlds. In this chapter I examine the behavior, values, and aspirations of settler girls in schools, exploring the girls' own perceptions of their socio-cultural contexts and realities. I use the self-articulated educational experiences of girls to help contextualize the dimensions of instrumental empowerment the girls may gain through their experiences at school. Here instrumental empowerment means how girls get monetary and social benefits from their education for themselves and their families.

Punjabi Girls and Families as the 'Normal' Culture of (Modern) Pakistan

The modern Pakistani notion comes from the idea of being independent, and particularly the claim that Pakistan was to be a modern Muslim state with democratic and Islamic values. The independence leaders such as Sir Syed Ahmed Khan, Maulvi Chiragh Ali, Nazir Ahmed — brave men with a clear vision for South Asian Muslims—had fought the decrepit ignorance that kept Muslims submerged in old ways in the name of tradition; they believed in the necessity of making inroads with modern education and scientific knowledge (Zakariya, 2012). They envisioned the modern with great accuracy as the repository of free minds that would engage the novel and promote the revolutionary (Zakariya, 2012). The same notion has been taught in the Pakistani textbooks in relation to education, which is presented as the answer that allowed the independence movement to successfully fight with the British Empire and Hindu leaders. The settler girls adopt the same notion of modernity.

The snapshots presented below of the settler girl students and their families at three different governments girls' schools give a clear sense of the diversity in class, family background, and experiences of these girls. I use these snapshots to make two key arguments:

1) Settler girls and their families utilize girls' schooling to get education, which is in turn leveraged to get work that requires education (e.g., teaching, health worker, accountant). Work is undertaken by women to increase the economic stability of their families. Because women's professional work is viewed as very valuable by families, girls' education is prized for its ability to provide these opportunities.

2) Settler girls have internalized their role as financial helpers to their families after education. They even do not question about the gendered priorities of their parents to educate them and their brothers differently. In this sense, girls' education is not pursued to support girls' own empowerment, nor is it undertaken in a way that is viewed by settler families as disrupting gender norms, as girls' schooling is in service of them later laboring for the family. As a sign of this, families faced no compunctions about providing their daughters and sons with different quality education.

Sara (Urdu speaking)

Sara was a 15-year-old girl. She studied in the Science section of class 10 in Satellite Town School. She was one of five siblings. She had two younger brothers and two elder sisters. Her elder sisters were in college and finishing their bachelor's in science. Her younger brothers were studying in an English medium school. Both of her parents were educated with college-level credentials. She told me that her father divorced her mom and since then her mother was taking care of them with no child support from him. Her mother was a tutor who gave tuition to fifteen girls and boys at her home. Also, her

mother was getting constant financial support from her sister and brother, who lived in London, since the divorce happened years ago. Her mother was also learning the Quranic exegesis (*tafsir)*[43] of Quran from Al- Huda International.[44] After completing the course, her mother wanted to teach *Quran* and *tafsir* to girls at her home. In Sara's household, then, both parents were highly-educated, and her mother was able to leverage her previous education and continue her education in order to find ways to support the family after her father's departure. Her mother's highly-educated siblings also played a key role in the family's household survival. Thus, education was viewed as very much able to result in productive opportunities, even if these were not formal employment opportunities.

Sara completed her primary level schooling at one of the private English-medium schools in the neighborhood area. Her mother had to take her out after 5th class because she couldn't afford her fees and transferred her to a public school. Her two younger brothers were also studying in the same school, but her mother did not take them out. Her mother thought that girls can study anywhere but boys need special attention to be taught. Her mother was quite hopeful that her sons would get admission in medical school easily after doing their matriculation from an English-medium school.

Sara didn't want to study at the government school. She wanted to go to the English-medium school and wanted to speak English like her cousins who attended the elite English-medium school in town. When she found that she could not go to the English-medium school, Sara joined one of the local English language institutes to learn

[43] A Quranic tafsir attempts at providing elucidation, explanation, interpretation, or commentary for clear understanding and conviction of God's will.

[44] Al-Huda International Welfare Foundation was founded in 1994 in Pakistan. It is striving to enlighten people with the knowledge of the Qur'an and Sunnah of the Prophet (saw) while serving the people through diverse social welfare programs.

English. She was the only respondent who asked me to take her interview in English. She was quite fluent in English.

Even though she had to transfer to the public school, the family had enough money that she could commute to school through a private van. Sara felt this was important because she didn't like to be harassed by men on streets and near the school's gates.

Sara was an active student academically. She was also the president of the "*Bazm e Adab*".[45] She was an excellent debater and a *Naat khawan.*[46] Sara told me about her future career plans as follows:

> My mother wants me to become a doctor so that I help my family and serve the poor people. But I want to become a lawyer. I want to give awareness to people about divorce especially about how do children feel when their fathers leave them alone and don't support them at all. I want to fight for the rights of those women who are left alone with their kids after divorce. I want to help them out because I feel their pain.

Sara's narrative about where she wants to go to school, why, and what outcomes she wants and expects to be able to achieve after going to school (i.e., a professional career) were common among the settler girls, but were not common among the other girls whose educational experiences I outline in the other chapters. They are marked by particular assumptions about what schooling can accomplish for girls and boys alike, about girls' ability to work outside the home in professional positions, and more broadly, about how schooling impacts life trajectories, making both physical movement (e.g., migration to London or to Balochistan) and having an

[45] Bazm-e-Adab is a regular and comprehensive mode of activity in govt schools. The basic purpose of this activity is to promote the moral, intellectual and leadership quality in students by organizing events related to significant Islamic and national incidents such as morning assemblies, Mehfil e Milaad (celebration of prophet Mohammad (PBUH)'s birthday), Independence Day celebrations, debate & quiz competition or dramas etc. Teachers and senior students guide and prepare students to perform on events. In this way they get an environment for developing an attitude to think good and finally do best for the promotion of their country and glory of Islam.

[46] Naat refers to poetry in praising prophet Mohammad (PBUH). A person who recites Naat is called Naat khawan.

impact on the world (e.g. helping children whose parents have gotten divorced) things that girls can imagine. Again, this contrasts with the Pashtun and Baloch girls' narratives about schooling.

Modern' Settler Girls and Professional Futures

Unlike all of the other groups of girls with whom I worked, settler girls' childhoods and education were understood to be in preparation for futures in which they would be able to bring economic value to their families through their labor for the family business or in a professional career where they earned a regular salary. The aspiration and expectation that they will work after school set them apart from the other ethnic groups in Balochistan, and it has set settler families as a whole apart since they came to Balochistan. These expectations for girls, and the comparative freedoms to pursue school that it allows them, had historical roots, generational histories, the backing of family capital and prestige behind them, and were viewed as socio-culturally valued forms of being a girl and a woman by their families. While their earning capacity was not expected or likely to be equal to their brothers' (as wage differentials exist as much in Balochistan as in, for example, the U.S.), and their educational careers were therefore also often valued less than their brothers' (e.g., Sara's mother's decision to keep both brothers, but not Sara, in the English-medium school), they were valued in their own right as a step down an instrumental path to formal employment in support of their family and community.

The girls with whom I spoke had fully embodied these assumptions in the ways they understood and talked about schooling. They felt their families supported their education, that they would be able to get employment after school, and that they could expect to become professionals in their post-school careers. Each of the quotes below is from a different girl:

> I want to help my father after getting my education. I will start teaching after passing my intermediate.
>
> I want to become a doctor and I can only do it by educating myself.

> I want to become a teacher because my father wants me to study. He has been a backbone to support my education despite his limited income. I love him so much!
>
> Schools provide us education so that we do not remain uneducated. We get jobs and live good life after getting education from schools.

The settler girls and families with whom I spoke recognized, valorized, and in many ways embodied what the development education literature would call the rates of return to girls' education (that is, wage labor returns, as well as returns to future family strength and wellbeing). However, as the differences in valuing girls' and boys' education that were also common indicate, girls did not believe that they would become rational economic actors operating on an equal playing field with men. Instead, their views on schooling, future careers, and future gendered social roles were shaped by their identity as modern Muslim women in the making. This meant there were limits on where they would work, how they would work, how much they would make, and how work and their roles as wife and mother were expected to interact. They understood the structural constraints that they faced, for example, that girls always found it hard to get formal employment because of purdah and restricted mobility (cultural and political unrest), and so girls also talked and thought about finding other ways to get employment that were invisible in the public, but that gained them money and social status. Sara's mother's work as a tutor is a good example of such a process. Her mother's work occurs in private spaces, not public ones, but it is empowering in that it allows her to maintain and support her children, she is known in the community as a good teacher and is respected for her tutoring work, and so forth.

Ayesha (Punjabi)

> Ayesha was 15 years old. She was in class 10 in Arts section. Her father was a peon in the Water And Power Development Authority (WAPDA). Her father had college level education but her mother just stitched cloths for the women in the neighborhood and

got compensation in return. Ayesha had 3 siblings, one elder brother and a younger sister and brother. Her younger sister was in grade 7 in the same school and her youngest brother was in class 5 in a government boys' school. Her elder brother was also helping her father by working at an auto shop. He was planning to appear for the exam for the bachelor's degree as a private candidate. He was not able to resume his education after his intermediate studies because he had to start work to support his family financially.

Ayesha lived in a paved house, which was located 15 minutes' drive away from the school. That's why she had to take private van to commute school on a regular basis. She used to walk with her friend till grade 6 but then her brother hired a school van for her to commute because he didn't like her to be teased and harassed by stray boys on streets. Her mother used to pay for her school van's fees from the money of her stitching till class 9, then Ayesha started home tutoring to bear the expenses of her school van and school supplies. She also tutored her younger siblings and helped them in buying their school supplies. She told me that:

> I feel really good when I pay the fees of my school van through my own earnings. I want to help my family rather becoming burden on them. My parents and brother have done a lot.

Ayesha was an average student. I observed her in classroom and during other school activities. Though she was a quiet girl, she held her point of view very clearly. She approached me herself to get interviewed. Ayesha wanted to become a teacher with two purposes. First of all she wanted to help her family financially. Second, she wanted to set an example of a good teacher by teaching girls humbly and politely.

Many girls and their mothers made efforts to find ways to earn a living and gain social status in the purdah-imposed "privacy" of the home. By Western definitions of empowerment,

these behaviors would be considered relatively disempowered because they occur only in the private realm and are therefore assumed to be part of the broader disempowering system of purdah. Some might even assume that the funds they generate are not their own, or that social status gained in this way is too limited to be taken seriously. Certainly, working within the constraints of purdah meant that there were many futures and uses of their education that girls could not imagine. At the same time, it is important to take seriously the agency represented in these actions, and the ways in which educated girls and women were pushing the boundaries—empowering themselves, if you will—through their work to expand the realm of the "private sphere" and the economic and social activities and resources that could be generated there. In this sense, education can be viewed as quite empowering for these girls and women, and moreover, their move to provide private services (e.g., tutoring) should be taken seriously as economically and socially productive and remunerative activities, even if they also show the imposed gendered limits on their lives and their uses of education.

Not surprisingly, given this positioning of girls and their expected educational and labor outcomes, many of the girls spoke about schooling as being in the service of their families, whether their work would eventually take them out of the house or not. Unlike the narratives of the other girls, who generally expressed deep frustration that they would not be allowed to use their education for any purpose other than in their own mothering activities, settler girls generally expressed happiness with the roles they were allowed to play, and ways they expected to be "empowered" to use their education by their families. But as noted previously, these uses were almost always viewed as immediately functional, and they were in the service of the family, not the girl herself:

> My elder sister and I tutor neighbors' kids. We have around 10 students to tutor in evening. Most of them are from local families. My sister gives her earnings to my father

and I equally distribute mine with my siblings for their educational or other needs. I feel good!

My mother and I teach Quran to my neighbor's' children. My mother left her school in primary school but now she regrets about it. She wants me to study and do no household chores except laundry that I do for all family members on Sunday. I help her in teaching Quran to kids. That is how she bears our educational needs.

My father is a lineman in railway. I respect my father a lot because he is feeding our family alone and is helping us to come to school. I understand his situation and don't want be a burden on him. That is why I started teaching our neighbor's children since last year. I teach them after my school in evening. I also help my mother making samosa for local bakery. I give my earnings to my father. I like it the way our education helps us to make money.

My father is a cleaner and my mother is a domestic worker. They both work hard to feed us. I want to work but I know that I am only 15 years old. It is not safe to go outside in afternoon to work. That is why I tutor my neighbors and friends' siblings at home to help my parents out.

Modern' Settler Girls and 'Traditional' Family Dynamics

One of the other important functions of school was to generate and reflect the modern Pakistani woman. Education made and marked settler girls as modern. Lack of education was associated with the other ethnicities and not being educated when one had the chance to be so was described as "backwards" or "savage" by a number of interviewees. But what is this idea of modernity, particularly for settler girls, and how is education related to it?

Most of the settler girls with whom I spoke were in public schools, which are low-resourced schools. In the same family environment and in most scenarios, their brothers go to private schools. So how is it that in the face of these obvious gendered dynamics, settler girls still express that they are modern? On a global scale, the kinds of gendered dynamics visible in families and schools in Balochistan are not considered very modern; in fact, the gender differences in educational levels and outcomes are viewed as anti-modern often. Then how do settler girls make sense of this apparent contradiction?

In modern notions of schooling, individual returns that are the basis of certain arguments for girls' education, for example George Psacharopoulos' World Bank calculations, continue to assume that, although the returns for schooling vary for girls and boys (because of the differential impact of their education on the health and wellbeing of their children), schooling itself is not analyzed as a gendered process, nor is it commonly linked carefully to gendered labor markets and their consequences. And rates of return continue to be calculated for individuals—I as an individual will eventually earn x or y amount because of my additional investment in school (e.g., Hanushek et al., 2017; Psacharopoulos and Patrinos, 2018).

This framework for understanding how to measure schooling, its impacts, and its returns is not how settler girls are calculating here. Their calculations of investment and returns are always for the family as a unit, not for them as individuals. Because of this, their comparatively lower opportunities and earnings are not of direct concern to them as individuals. So families see letting the girls go to school as a familial investment. Girls return that investment through enacting the role of good daughters who become professionals (in or outside of the home) and are able to help/support the family. But at the same time, given the local culture, girls will exit the family at the time of marriage, and girls themselves know and understand this reality. So in that context of family logics, the intergenerational contract ends much earlier for girls than it does for boys. The girls, fully aware of and comfortable with adopting the logics of familial investment and of patrilineal forms of marriage, therefore feel it is justified in terms of why boys are being invested in more by parents sending them to more expensive schools: it is the men who are expected to care for these parents in their old age, while girls will move into their husband's home; and it is the men who are more likely to be able to have well-paying professional careers in the future, given women's more limited earning opportunities. As one student described it:

Girl: My eldest sister is doing FA (Faculty of Arts – class 12) for the Government Girls' College next to our school. My elder brother is in class 11th and goes to private college in cantonment area.
Me: Why is he in private college?
Girl: He is our only brother. He is very intelligent. My father wants him to become a doctor. That is why he has completed his matriculation from the Iqra Army public school and now finishing his FSC (Faculty of Science) from the Iqra Army public College.
Me: Why didn't your father send you and your sisters to a private school?
Girl: I really wanted to go to English medium school, but my father can only afford our brother's expenses in private school. My father told me that he wanted us (girls) to attend private school but he cannot afford it because of his limited income. He sees my brother the hope of his old age.
Me: How do you feel about it?
Girl: I don't feel bad rather I understand my father's financial situation. I want to help him since he is the only breadwinner of the house. I pray for my brother that he becomes doctor one day and makes my father happy and proud.

Settler Girls as Good Students and Good Muslims

In the other chapters, a key issue that arises with girls' schooling is a concern that schooling will make girls have ideas and practices that are not aligned with being good Muslims. The Taliban stance on girls' education is the extreme of this position, but there is distrust of schooling as a Western intervention, or as an institution that might make girls less willing or able to fulfil their appropriate gender roles by a wide range of families. For settler girls and their families, this tension is not so apparent, perhaps in part because the norms of being a good Muslim, Pakistani citizen, and woman are aligned with Punjabi society and culture in the curriculum. This lack of tension is evident in Rafia's description of how these different identities or forms of belonging come together in school.

Rafia (Punjabi)

Rafia was greatly influenced by her paternal grandfather, who told her to quit her formal education after class 5 and to start with Islamic education. He also instructed her to complete her Matriculation from a government school and to apply for a government

teaching job. He was of the opinion that government jobs are more reliable, secure, and have more benefits than private jobs. She finished her class 8 from Dar e Arqam School while teaching Quran to girls at the same time there. She joined the government school from class 9. Initially she had lots of problems in learning English and Mathematics, but then she took extra tuition to read and write English and Mathematics. Rafia was one of the three monitors in her class. She was a hardworking student. She regarded formal education as very important for her future career trajectory as a teacher. That is why she taught Quran to 15 girls who came to her home in evening every day. It also helped her to revise her Quran at the same time, otherwise she would forget it. Rafia was very happy that she was able to resume her formal schooling. She told me that:

> People respect me for my religious qualification and achievements as a *Hafiza*[47] but for me it is very important for a girl to get formal education in present era/society. I quit my formal education before for a cause, which was to memorize the holy Quran, but I have always felt the lack in my life of not getting the formal schooling. For me both formal education and religious education are crucial to be successful in life. We just need to keep both of them in equilibrium.

In the Balochistan context, the idea of being a professional member and earning for the family is still seen as Punjabi/Urdu speaking rather than Balochisani, though it is changing. And in turn, being Punjabi/Urdu speaking is seen as a way of being more connected to Pakistan and the modern world than to "primitive" Balochistan.

In Muslim countries and global south, wherever family is important, you can hear this logic, where calculations are never at the individual level but rather at the level of a family. Gender dynamics therefore have to be understood in this context. Within the level of a family, these gender dynamics work, and they make sense because you are calculating at the level of a family. And that sense of being part of a family is also linked to religion as well. For instance, in

[47] The female who memorizes the whole Quran is called Hafiza and male is called *Hafiz.*

Islam, there are Quranic verses and Hadiths that endorse the responsibilities of children to take care of their families irrespective of gender. So, girls are happy that they can play this role, which they view and they think their parents view as important to the family. So, they don't even question about it. For example, almost all of my girl respondents say that they want to do something for their families, especially for their parents, because then they will get blessings from Allah and will be successful in life. They also acknowledge the struggles, love, and care of their parents and families. So, they wanted to do something in return.

> I know it for sure that my family will make me married at some point but it doesn't mean that I will forget my parents. Whenever they need me, I will always be there for them. This is my Islamic duty to take a good care of my family. I don't mind of doing household chores for my family especially in helping out my mother. I know by doing this Allah will be happy with me.

> It is in Quran that you give respect to your parents. I love my parents and I want to serve them throughout my life. I help my mother and elder sister in household chores. I do calligraphy art and sell them to my friends in my neighborhood. I give that money to my father because he is doing a lot for us.

Gendered Investment Rationale for Marriage and Work

Marriage norms remain as a central component in Punjabi intergenerational contracts: parents (fathers) are responsible for marrying girls off. This is similar across all of the girls with whom I spoke, but in the case of the Punjabi girls, they generally expressed less concern about their fathers' and brothers' control over their marriage choices. However, marriage was a difficult moment, in that girls knew it meant their role vis a vis their parents was traditionally supposed to shift (sons, not daughters, would traditionally be responsible for caring for parents in old age). Many of the girls expressed their desire to buck this component of the intergenerational contract: they talked about not getting married so that they could continue to help their parents, or getting married and continuing to help them regardless of traditional assumptions that they would not:

I love my family especially my parents. They have done so much for us. I will never get married and will always take care of them.

> My family is everything for me. I want to become a pride of my family by taking care of them throughout of my life.

> My parents have done so much for us. I am blessed to have parents like them. I am under the debts of their love and care. If I serve them physically and help them financially throughout my life, I would feel of doing nothing for them.

They also very often talked about their brothers, and how they took many steps to also support the family in supporting their brothers, so that their brothers' improved outcomes would in turn help the whole family. In these narratives, they expressed happiness in their ability to support the men in the family through their work, and did not usually express dissatisfaction with being in the service of the men of their family, as did more of the Pashtun and Baloch girls:

My brothers are our pride. I want them to become successful in their lives.

> I always pray for the long life of my parents and siblings, especially my father and brothers. My father is a policeman and has very limited income to support all of us. His greatest desire is to see my elder brother becoming a banker. My brother is studying accounting. His studies are partially funded by scholarship. My father has to pay his fees and we all are helping him out to pay my brother's fees. Things will change after my brother gets a job in bank.

It was evident in these narratives that settler girls very often viewed care for parents and work for the family as interconnected aspects of appropriate femininity. This approach subsumed their own outcomes to those of the family but rested comfortably with their general sense that their education and careers and earning activities and care-work were central to the family, even if not valued in the same way as their brothers'. Again, this contrasted in important ways with the words of some of the Pashtun and Baloch girls, who were more likely to feel that their work, their brains, their education, and their care were not valued or were taken for granted by male

family members, who would force them away from the activities they wanted to pursue, and in particular, force them to marry people they would not choose themselves.

Ethnic Identities and Schooled Punjabi girlhood

For settler girls, the intergenerational contract is always calculated at the unit of the family, never at the level of an individual. Also, there are these particular gender dynamics in the intergenerational contract, but those gender dynamics are acceptable and make sense because they are always calculated at the level of family. This idea works for the settler girls because in most settings, the Punjabi and Urdu speaking communities are the only ones where girls are sent to work after educating themselves. These calculations are specific to the settler girls. In fact it is also a cultural practice too beside an economic idea. This economic logic is also a cultural artifact and cultural identity. For instance, the mindset that the settlers educate themselves and that is why they get high designations and positions in society, unlike non-settlers, is essential to the cultural identity of the settler communities. That's why education is so important for them—it is essential to economic strength, but also to the cultural and social claims of modernity and superiority that underlie settler communities in Balochistan.

But education is also, in the context of Baloch nationalism, a space of contesting identities now. Now things are changing politically, and Punjabis are being forced to leave, so the calculations of professional identities may change. Although Punjabi professional hegemony is being dismantled as more non-settlers become educated and begin to claim greater rights to professional positions and resources, the older idea and the sense that settlers are better off and more educated still persists. In changing contexts of political instability, forced migration and killing, the settler girls still have trust in education now as the way of keeping them secure, but this may change as the value and valence of education itself changes.

Settler Girls' Interactions with Other Students in School

Settler girls talked about their interactions with other students in schools in ways that directly reflected the ethnic tensions arising in the schools, and that also reflected their sense of the benefits of schooling for them, and for all girls (that is, it would make all girls more modern), and their general positive response to schooling because of this. For some girls, most of whom attended the schools that were not primarily Baloch, this liking of school reflected ethnic awareness, but was simply positive:

> I like to come to school. I have good Panjabi and Pashtun friends here and I enjoy my school time with them.

But for more girls, and particularly those attending the primarily Baloch school, their narratives of their relations in schools also reflected the particular, growing, claims that they did not belong in Balochistan, that is, that their settlement in Balochistan itself was up for question. They vociferously denied this, and instead drew on the notion of a shared nationality (Pakistan), based on a shared religion. In other words, their narratives about citizenship reflected the central government's narratives very closely, which we should expect because these central narratives primarily reflect Punjabi positions of power across the government. But these narratives were directly challenged by Baloch independence, and the girls were very aware of this and actively narrating against it:

> We should not fight with each other like we have divided ourselves in Balochs, Pashtuns, Punjabis and sindhis. We should not be divided. We should live like one nation. Pakistan was made on the basis on Islam. Then why are we fighting over qaumiat (nationality), ethnicities? We all are Muslims. We should live together with unity. It is not right that if you are not Baloch, you don't belong here and leave this land.

> We all are human beings. We all look same, but Baloch girls think that they are superior, and they treat us like nobody. It is not like they are very intelligent and genius. They just do it and show us that we are Baloch and this is our land. You go back to Panjab. They talk in each other ears and laugh. It does not look nice when we know they are making fun of us.

> Saeeda is a Baloch girl. She came in this school in class 8 and she has destroyed the peace of school. She is very arrogant, and picks fight with us. She gets violent and physical too.
>
> Last year, Saeeda had fight with one of our classmates Ayesha. Both of them fought verbally and physically. Our teachers could not sort this out properly because local teachers were taking Saeeda's side and non-local teachers were taking Ayesha's side. Principal was confused herself. Next day Saeeda brought her family to school. Her elder sister came to our class and threatened all Panjabi girls. It was a fight between Saeeda and Ayesha. Then why did her family bring all Panjabi girls into this matter? This is not fair! Principal got under pressured and she transferred Ayesha to another section. There was another Panjabi girl who fought with Saeeda and her group before and eventually she left the school about a year ago.
>
> Our concern is that we have studies here and this is our last year in school. But girls from the lower classes will follow the same thing. Balcoh girls will get more backing and will throw all Punjabi girls out of the school.
>
> People are fighting and killing each other on the basis of ethnicity. For examples, we Punjabis are getting threat to leave the province and to go back to Punjab. We hear the same thing from Baloch girls here in school. How can we leave this city like that? This place has the memories of our ancestors and our childhood. This place has our homes, our business, our relatives and friends. We cannot leave our homes and start living in another place like Punjab. Balochistan is our province and we owe this place too. Last year quite a number of our relatives and family friends left Quetta city after receiving threats from the Baloch separatist groups. They sold their big houses on cheap rates and migrated to Punjab. Some of them couldn't adjust there and came back and now are living in the same houses on rent as tenants.

Punjabi girls' narratives about their connections to Balochistan and their right and desire to be there, as well as their responses to the independence movement (which generally were indignant or even angry) were mirrored in the settler teachers' interviews as well but are not reflected in the national curriculum. The ways in which these narratives are developing, and the fragmentation we see particularly at the primarily Baloch school, point to the dangerous and bloody directions in which the independence movement could go. The settler state's responses to this movement (as opposed to the "local" settlers' responses) again in important ways mirror

longstanding understandings about settler colonialism and the steps that settler states will take to secure territory (Joronen, 2017; Pasternak and Dafnos, 2018; Povinelli, 2011).

It is important to note that by scaring or forcing local settlers out of Balochistan, it appears from girls' narratives that more land and other resources may be shifting back into the hands of Baloch people. This will be viewed as very dangerous by the settler state, and past history would not be surprised that therefore military and paramilitary forces supporting the state might be called in, increasing the violence and the dangers that all girls face in attending school. Moreover, there are particular dangers that settler girls face in this moment, as the logic of why they go to school and how they can benefit their families by doing so may change in this time of violence and more limited opportunities.

Chapter Five: Pashtun Girls: Education for Motherhood

In international development discourse, educating girls is seen as one of the most effective social vaccines and drivers of individual and national development (Rihani, 2006). In order to educate the next generation, development organizations argue, you must educate girls. The common saying "If you educate a girl, you educate a family" embodies this idea. Education is correlated with two types of effects according to this discourse: girls themselves become educated and therefore more productive, healthier, and less fertile. And their children are also directly impacted: they are more likely to be better educated, more likely to survive and be well-nourished, and more likely to be healthy (Morris and Hughes, 2015).

To the extent that countries and families agree with the notion that children are healthier and better-off if they have an educated mother, then girls' schooling can be seen by a family as a socially-acceptable sacrifice (of the girls' time, of the expenses of her education, and of the potential threat to familial honor of having her attend school) in order to reach the next generation. They might choose to educate a daughter so that her children and the family and the country are healthier, or they might choose to educate her because she will be more appealing to other educated families and therefore have better opportunities for marriage. Either way, it is important to note that these international discourses are not discourses of girls' empowerment: they are functionalist narratives in which girls channel development outcomes to the next generation via their own development of "maternal capital" (Basu and Stephenson, 2005).

In some interesting ways, this understanding of girls' education has impacted Pashtun families and their daughters, even while, as the chapter shows, Jamal's (2015) note that "Pashtun society is patriarchal: Men have the power to construct obstacles to girls' education, and to remove them" (p. 273) remains key to understanding girls' experiences in school.

Women in Pashtun Tribes

Women face significant oppression in the Pashtun community due to so-called strict socio-cultural and religious laws and limitations. In most cases, especially in rural Pashtun areas, the treatment of women is extremely dehumanizing. Pashtun identities are defined and shaped by Pashtunwali. Pashtunwali is an unwritten law, a sociopolitical culture, and an ideology inherited from ancestors and carried on from generation to generation. It is considered the dominant force of Pashtun culture (Jamal, 2016). Anthropologists have described Pashtunwali as an ideal-type code based on such principles as *badal* (revenge), *melmastia* (hospitality), *nanawatee* (refuge), *tor* (female honor), and *tarburwali* (agnatic rivalry) (Ahmed, 1980; Grima, 1998; Lindholm, 1982; Singer, 1982).

The role of women in Pashtunwali is little studied and even less understood. Much has been written about the oppression of women in Pashtun communities, and it is often attributed to Pashtun ethnic practices, such as male elders having a say over marriages of young women; high bride prices, *walwar*, given to the father of the bride and suggesting the sale of women into marriages; and honor killings of women for sexual misconduct. Women are constrained by the Pashtunwali code in so many ways that it is difficult to understand why they participate in this system, or why, when women's rights reforms are discussed, they often resist them, even those associated with health care and education (Kakar, 2003). In most rural areas, the Pashtunwali code of a woman's place is "either *kor* (home) or *gor* (grave)" (Jamal, 2016). The intensity of Pashtunwali is lesser in the urban Pashtun communities.

Women in the Pashtun culture are regarded as a symbol of honor that embodies the honor of the family. The physical mobility of women in Pashtun culture is therefore almost prohibited

to assure that she does not damage the honor of the family, and she is responsible for conducting household activities within the boundaries of her home. The word woman is even synonymous with obedience (Jamal 2016). Due to continued wars, especially the Soviet-Afghan war and conflict in the region, an extremist and violent version of Islam was introduced and has flourished among Pashtuns. In this form of Islam, women's status, roles, and responsibilities are defined and restricted according to radically conservative religious interpretation. Women in this culture always face challenges when it comes to education, participation in politics, and management of economic resources due to the fact that men control all the economic resources and manage women's socio-cultural environments (Telesetsky, 1998).

Girls' Education

In Pashtun society, both historically and in contemporary "traditional" families and clans, education is often viewed as a "western conspiracy" – as Karlsson and Mansory (2007) note, rural populations, in particular, saw formal schooling as corrupting students in terms of secularism, individualism and consumerism. For some, female education is a civilizing force; for most, however, it is a means of introducing vulgarity in the society (Human Rights Watch, 2018; Manzoor, 2008). The public education system is considered as a means of misguiding local women by introducing and inculcating 'Western values' and models in their communities. For example, in some rural areas, there were incidents where the religious heads of mosques (*Imams*) issued religious verdicts to restrict girls' education (Jamal, 2016).

Not surprisingly, then, historically there has been an extremely wide gender gap between Pashtun male and female enrollment, retention, and completion rates at the primary, secondary, and tertiary levels. In 2004, the largest gender gap in Pakistan existed in Pashtun families;

Pashtun girls in rural Balochistan were estimated to have only a 3% literacy rate (Jamal, 2016). The main reasons for them having the lowest female literacy rate were lack of investment in girls' schools, high cost of education, poor quality of education, poverty, strict traditional and cultural practices against women/girls, insecurity, and targeted attacks on schools (Human Right Watch, 2018; Khan, 2016, Jamal, 2016, Manzoor, 2008).

Despite all of these constraints, these strict views of Pashtun communities towards female education are changing, especially in urban areas. Living in urban areas itself changes people's ideas about what skills children need to survive and thrive, and it also changes the role of education in marriage decisions and the value of girls in the marriage market. Moreover, due to increased population and reduced agrarian land in the Pashtun region, historical rules dictating that only men can work outside the home are not working (Jamal, 2016). Many men cannot feed the family and cover other living expenses alone. As a result, there is a loosening of historical practices and if needed, the wife may share financial responsibility with her husband, including by working outside the home (Jamal, 2016). This in turn can bring a new meaning to girls' education, as it can position them to be wives who are better prepared to financially support her husband's family. In this sense, some of the reasons for schooling that are evident in the Baloch and Punjabi girls' chapters are a bit more visible in Pashtun families than was the case in previous generations.

Marriage in Balochistan

Despite some of the changes described above, Pashtun girls' educational opportunities and outcomes continue to be almost entirely dictated in relation to notions of marriage and motherhood. And, in order to understand Pashtun girls' education and its relationship to the

experience of marriage and motherhood, it is necessary to understand marriage practices. Marriage practices—when they happen, how they happen, what they cost, and how they work—play a determining role in if, for how long, and/or why a girl might be sent to school, allowed to continue in school, or withdrawn from school.

In most parts of Balochistan, girls (be they Baloch, Pashtun, Punjabi, or Urdu-speaking) have no say in choosing their partners, especially in more rural areas. Selecting mates is a task done fully at the disposal of the family male elder members. In this setup there is a little space for young men, who in some situations can resist the girl chosen for them and may inform their family about their choice for selecting a partner for marriage. Girls, on the other hand, have no options resisting the decision of the family elders regarding their marriage and choosing partners. If any girl rejects/opposes the decision, then she faces two consequences: first her family elders may force her to get married without her consent (as happened to me); or second, she remains single and dependent on her father and brothers for the rest of her life.

First cousin marriages and marriage within the same community are more preferred, as such girls are expected to be well-aware of cultural norms and values. Further, families of both girls and boys are expected to have the same understanding of cultural values. In the case of first cousin marriages, neither male nor female could resist or reject the decision of the elders, because in this case, family relations are involved. Boys and girls both are strictly bound to stay with the decision of the family elders. In cousin marriages, girls have the advantages of fewer family restrictions after marriage; for example, in relation to *Purdah,* she does not have to hide her face from other members of the family, and she can more openly talk and sit with the family members, as they are also her natal family.

In some of the regions in Balochistan, the tradition of *walwar* (bride price) is practiced; though the Pashtuns practice it the most. The justification of having this tradition is that it is helpful for the bride's father, hence allowing for the marriage to occur quickly and smoothly with no financial burden on him. On the other hand, Baloch tribes do not ask for *walwar;* rather, the boy and his family are responsible for all of the expenses of marriage. They also take care of the guests in the girls' family, such as their food and lodgings. These costs are said to be the main reason that both Baloch and Pashtun families get their girls married at an early age. In contrast, Panjabi and Urdu-speaking parents (both bride and groom) divide the expenses of marriage. However, the girl's family is the worse off because they have to give dowry to their daughter and fulfill the last-minute demands of the boy's family. That is why early marriages are not so common in these groups, because the girl and her family save money for years to bear the marriage expenses.

Changing Ideas of Good Pashtun Motherhood – the Role of Education

Discussions about Pashtun girls' education are connected to discussions about marriage and motherhood, which continue to be viewed as women's primary roles and responsibilities in Pashtun society. Education for Pashtun boys is a signifier of distinction or it is a symbol of cultural capital (Bourdieu, 1984); wealthier families educate their boys, and education is expected to lead to stable and well-paid employment outside the home, which will allow boys to support their families. But many families do not see either of these as a necessity for girls. Pashtun girls do not generally receive direct or indirect messages from their natal family that they have to work to support the family financially; just the opposite in most rural areas and in many urban families, where girls are clearly told they will not be allowed to work outside the home, or that their husbands will have complete control over deciding whether they will work

outside the home. For many rural Pashtun girls, schooling also will not change their marriage prospects, as they are likely to marry a cousin or other family member in a marriage that has sometimes even been arranged before their birth by their elder relatives. As will be discussed below, this is changing a bit in urban areas, where the marriage market places more value on girls' education. Lastly, attending school and being outside of the home poses its own perceived cultural and physical dangers, especially in the era of Taliban threats and attacks on girls' schools in Balochistan and in Quetta. Instead, when Pashtun girls are sent to school, it is most often because their families see it as helping them become better mothers (and therefore better wives), who are better able to transmit the Pashtun culture to the next generation and have healthier, better-educated children themselves.

It is important to note that in Pashtun and Baloch areas in Pakistan, formal education is always seen and considered as potentially dangerous, because it can take the children away from their culture. This concern is stronger for girls, who are viewed as the repositories of culture, responsible for passing it on to their children (Ahmad, 2012). Girls are closely watched, as are schools, and girls are allowed to attend school only if their fathers feel that their education can be utilized to make them good wives and educated mothers to train the future generation.

Given family concerns about education, it is interesting to note that some education for girls is now seen as a marker of good motherhood by many families. In the past, the dangers of education making girls separate from culture and therefore bad mothers were viewed as greater than the benefits. But these days, some education (enough for basic literacy and numeracy, and in some families even beyond), in a tightly controlled educational environment (particularly in urban areas), is now viewed as a positive marker of motherhood—an educated mother is

considered to be a better mother, as long as she uses her education to improve her children's health and development as members of the family and community.

Then, in some cases, girls are also allowed to choose a feminized form of employment by their fathers, brothers or future husbands, if they show that they can also fully manage their role as daughter, sisters, wives or mothers first and then as working women. Only if they are able to add to both the cultural and financial capital of the family, the clan, and the Pashtun community are they allowed to work outside the home, and then only when such work is not viewed as a threat to family honor, created by the woman's movement outside the home.

Below, I describe these two central logics surrounding Pashtun girls' education: being better mothers (and therefore being more valued on the urban marriage market, where all of the schools I studied were located), and in a very limited number of cases, being able to do appropriate women's work outside the home.

Education for Improved Marriage Prospects

I conducted research in three urban girls' schools in Quetta. The girls with whom I spoke are the smallest of minorities of Pashtun girls. They are living in the city and they are going to school. In this particular subpopulation, girls and family members spoke about how difficult it was for girls who are born and raised in the cities to adjust to remote rural areas. It was not just the girls who were viewed as being different because of their urban status. Having chosen to live in an urban area, these girls' families often wanted to maintain and grow their social status in town. Pashtun parents and their daughters viewed secondary education as essential for finding a good, urban husband for their daughters. Such husbands expected their wives to be educated, and in some cases might allow the girl to work outside the home, for the betterment of the family.

In the urban areas (unlike in rural areas), girls' education was valued on the marriage market: a secondary school degree generally improved the prospects for a girl to marry a boy who lived in the urban areas and was himself well-educated and likely to get a white-collar job. Girls' education and its concomitant better marriage prospects also brought prestige to the girl's family.

Education to Support Family

Within the framework of marriage and motherhood, which all girls expressed as being the central organizing concept in their educational lives, girls went to school with a range of goals, but almost all of them felt confident that they would be able to help their families by teaching and coaching their younger siblings before marriage, and their own children after marriage. In this way, they made sense of their education within the constraints of Pashtun marriage practices.

The Pashtun girls—every single one—were unsure of their occupational future, because they did not have control over following any particular career path. They felt confident, however, that they could benefit from their education and that education would make them better teachers for their siblings and future kids. This is the only value of schooling that aligns well with the Pashtun understanding of women's roles in society and family. If women are centrally supposed to be good mothers, then schooling can become sensible to families when schooling gains value in notions of motherhood. Education has brought a new understanding of what good mothers do to help their families, and it is an understanding that was widespread among the families of these urban girls: limited girls' education supported improved motherhood by giving girls basic skills (literacy, numeracy) that supported improved motherhood (e.g., being able to read directions for medications, being able to tutor their own children at home) and by teaching them values that

men saw as highly aligned with "civilized" (that is, urbanized) Pashtun culture. Many of the girls expressed the sentiment that education was necessary to be "civilized"[48] and that being civilized meant being good people and good mothers. They expressed confidence and happiness that their education would directly serve their own children and families:

> We get education so that we get all of the information about life. Through education we get to know what is going on in the present world. We know what should we do as Muslim women to serve our community or country. It is very important for us. We know very well that we will get married at some point in future and our education will help to properly raise our future children. We will be able to train them as better human beings. Our children will benefit from us. They will not be sent out for tutoring. We will be able to teach them.

> We want to get education. Through education we can make our future generation and ourselves respectable and honorable. We like to be called educated! We do not like it when our fathers and elder brothers say *jahil* (illiterate) to our mothers because of their lack of education. Our males do not ask about the opinions of our female elders in decision making because they think they are brainless.

This understanding of schooling for good motherhood meant that most girls saw a limited educational future for themselves: formal schooling would always eventually conflict with good motherhood, either by supporting girls in adopting Western values, or in keeping girls away from marriage and motherhood to pursue more schooling, or in pushing girls away from being good wives and mothers as they pursued careers outside the home. Not surprisingly, then, almost all girls said that they did not think their fathers would let them continue past secondary school. Each quote below is from a different girl:

> What future? I know I will never be allowed to work no matter I finish my master level education. Though my father will not stop me to study more but I can predict my future as a married woman with kids and in laws to take care of. I can see the only purpose of my education to get educated for myself and will get good marriage proposal and to teach

[48] As discussed in the conclusion, this idea of "civilization" may not always have been viewed by girls as completely aligned with Pashtun values; instead, it was what schooling offered that "traditional" educational practices did not.

> my future kids afterwards. My sister did her bachelor's in psychology. She didn't get the permission to work even in a girls' school. My father made her married right after her graduation. Now she has three kids, a husband and in-laws to take care of.
>
> I know for sure that my father and elder brothers are not interested in my education. First, they just want to show the community that their women are educated so that they get good proposals for us from our community. We Pashtuns generally do not do cross cultural marriages. Second, they ask us to teach our younger siblings at home after schools. So, they are benefiting from us in many ways.
>
> My father wants me to study because he values education. All my sisters and brothers are studying, and our family is regarded very respectable in our community because of our education. I may be able to study further after my matriculation, but it all depends on marriage proposal.

Pashtun girls were very well-aware of the limited control that they had in determining how far they could go in their schooling and how they would be allowed to use their schooling after graduation. Many of them expressed what sounded like complex decision trees that they used to think through what they would do if and as different educational and post-educational opportunities were closed off to them. These often included work or educational endeavors inside the home—the one space in which they felt confident they would have some ability to use their educational skills:

> First of all, I come to school to get education. For me education is essential to become a civilized and good person. Then people respect us and see us as important beings. Second, if I allow continuing with my education, I want to become a doctor. I want to help people especially women and I will treat them free. Third, if I don't get permission to continue my studies after matriculation, still it will help me in many ways. I teach my siblings in evening because my mother is uneducated, and she does not understand their educational problems. If my younger siblings have problems in school, I advise and guide them and sometimes I go and talk to their teachers if needed. An educated mother and sister can understand children's problems and their educational needs better than uneducated.

While some girls expressed that their families valued education, they usually talked about their fathers valuing their brothers' education, while tolerating girls' education. Many girls articulated the limits of their families' support for their schooling, noting that they received no

active family support to continue and that at some point, they knew they would be actively forced to stop. Nonetheless, they felt inspired by extended family members who did continue in their schooling, and they were inspired by what they viewed as their own improvement through schooling. They also broadly expressed the feeling that school needed to be useful, and they felt confident that, even if only through their maternal roles, they would be able to use their education:

> Though our tribe people from my family in our native town always say to my father that stop sending your daughters to school but my father and dadi (father's mother) want us to come to school. They think I should finish matriculation. I admire my cousins from my father side. Some of my elder cousins are studying in colleges. They are the true inspiration for me. I am in school just because of the inspiration I get from my cousins. Otherwise, my family does not care whether I study or not. I can quit it right now and no one would ask why. But I come here because I want to study to become a civilized person. I do all my household chores in the morning to spare time for my school. Though my father has allowed me to study, but he does not push me continue. It is solely my desire to educate myself. I know I will not be allowed to continue after matric, but I will continue teaching my siblings.

A smaller, but certainly significant, number of girls expressed sadness and frustration that girls' education was not taken seriously in their families, and they provided trenchant critiques of these gender-inequitable patterns and their roots in the patrilineal and patriarchal system in which they lived:

> Though I feel myself blessed to have all the facilities of life, but I feel really low when I see my father paying more attention to my brothers' education. My father says that I will make you get married as soon as I get good proposal for you and for your younger sister. You girls have to leave and get married, but my son will be with me forever. They are my pride and they will raise my status in my community by getting higher designation in the society.

Girls' frustration and feeling of gender inequality in family support for their schooling reflects how families aligned girls' schooling with Pashtun cultural practices—schooling always operated within the framework of men's control over girls' educational practices and outcomes. Schooling for girls needed to add (as opposed to create tensions with) broader cultural practices and gender norms. Girls' education was viewed more positively in urban areas than in rural areas because it had more social value and was marking the family (and the larger Pashtun community) as culturally better, more "civilized", but in ways that continued to enforce these gender differentiations and continued to enforce fathers' and then husbands' control:

> My father has a good name in our Pashtun community. Everybody respects him because he is educated. Our community respects and feels proud on educated people especially their males. For us, matric is enough to get good proposals. After that it all depends on future husband whether he allows us for further education or not.

If the ideal Pashtun female is the good mother/cultural transmitter, then girls who fight to stay in school and to rationalize schooling for improved motherhood are creating a new narrative about what constitutes good motherhood. They attempt to bring together "traditional" maternal ideals with those that they view as being fostered in school—namely, learning how to be "civilized" or "good" people. In describing the new role, they see for education in Pashtun motherhood, girls commonly said things like:

> My mother is uneducated, but she has done a great job of giving us (all siblings) our Pashtun cultural norms. I think I will do the same but in a better way because of my education. I will not only make my children the proud Pashtuns of our community but also make them kind human beings.
>
> I want to study more. Education makes us sophisticated and cultured. It gives us the sense to differentiate between right and wrong. I may not be able to work but I will utilize my education to teach my siblings and raise my future kids to become good human beings in our society.

Gendered Employment Returns for Pashtun girls

The Pashtun girls with whom I spoke were not going to school primarily in hopes of having a career. Most of them wanted to have a career, but they did not put too much hope into this outcome, because they knew that having a career would depend on whether their fathers, brothers, and then husbands let them—and if they let them, what kinds of careers they let them pursue. Those girls who did hope that they may be able to continue their education in the future if they are allowed declared their career goals to include doctor, teacher, lecturer or Islamic scholar. Many said they wanted to work specifically with and for women, such as the girl above who declared that she would treat women for free as a doctor. They know that if their family allows them to work, these are often the only occupational fields that are acceptable for them to pursue as a career:

> I want to be an architect, but my family will not allow me to work outside with males. I will then become a teacher, if they allow me to study after matriculation. Otherwise, I will utilize my education to teach my siblings after my matriculation. I will certainly make use of it!
>
> I wanted to become a computer engineer. I know my family will not allow me to work with males. So, don't know what will happen?
>
> I want to become a teacher because I know my family will not have any objection to work in girls' schools.
>
> If I get a chance, I will become a teacher. Education is my passion! I have been an excellent student throughout my schooling. I will request my father to allow me to continue my education as a private candidate after my matriculation.

In the only case in which a girl talked about an alternate career path that was not common for girls, she noted that the girl was referred to as a boy and that she was valued for her work for the family:

> I want to be like my elder sister. My father calls her his betta (son). She is very intelligent. She is in college and is finishing class 12 in Science subjects. She helps father in his business and family related problems.

There was recognition in the community of the need for some educated women who could provide specific services to girls, when men are not allowed to provide them. For example, girls' education was seen as essential for bringing female doctors to the community. There was agreement that Pashtun communities badly need women in the health professions generally; the shortage of female doctors is especially severe and consequential because many families will not allow girls and women to be seen by male doctors. But, although girls and their families were very aware of this need, they also often expressed the belief that they would not be the ones to fulfil this need, even when they hoped to, because their fathers would not allow them to continue their education long enough to become a doctor, and the decision was their fathers' and brothers' and then their husbands' if they would be allowed to practice:

> I want to become a doctor, but I may end up becoming a teacher. Whatever my father and brother will decide, I will do that.

What these girls' voices reveal is that Pashtun girls—like most girls in Balochistan—have no control over their educational or career path. They are dependent on the beliefs and edicts of their father and brothers, and then of their husbands and their families. As the quotes above show, many girls expressed some level of comfort with this situation—or if not comfort, at least recognition that there are no other options but to work within this system. They talked about ways they would try to convince their fathers to let them continue their education, or becoming comfortable with the idea that even if they cannot use their education outside of the home, they can use it within the home for their younger siblings and their own children:

> Our Pashtun community prefers to give better education to their sons because they see them as their pride. They send us to school as long as we want to study till our marriages.

> For them if we know how to read and write is enough but I see the importance of my education. At least I will do a better job in raising and training my children due to my education. They will get guidance from me about their problems.

A smaller number of girls expressed deep anger with the situation, and discussed girls' education as both a key mechanism for challenging their families' mistrust and inequitable (and, some claimed, un-Muslim) treatment, and a tool with which they could change gender norms in the long term, were they allowed to pursue their educational and professional goals:

> You know in our society we women are not given the right to make decision of our lives. I just hate it! I cannot do anything about it. My father and elder brother make decisions on behalf of everyone in the family and we have to follow them.

> In my family, girls are allowed to study and get education. But as soon as a girl reaches to the puberty age, her parents start thinking about to marry her. The moment her parents receive any good proposal, they make her get married. This is something a widely prevailing norm in our Qaum (specific community or tribe). I have seen Pashtun families who send their daughters to co-ed schools but then they send their daughters to government girls' schools after class 5. We belong to a tribal society, which is very narrow-minded and conservative.

> My mother is unschooled. She can read only the holy Quran. She has never understood our educational needs, but she has never insisted us to quit our education because she wants us to study. I value my education because it has given me awareness about what is wrong and what is right. I know that I will not be allowed to continue my education after matriculation. Otherwise, I wanted to become a lawyer. I want to fight for women because they are not treated with respect. Men are allowed to do anything in our society. My family and people from our tribe say that women should not be educated for longer time because they get married eventually and go to another family. But our sons are the ones who stay with us and take care us in our old age. They are our pride and future! I hear this all the time and I don't like it.

> I want to become somebody. I want to give this perception to our community and society that we (girls/women) can do amazing things. They should stop degrading and disrespecting us. This is our right to get education.

> I want somewhat freedom for girls. They should have right to educate themselves as long as they want. Our families should not make decision about when to stop sending us schools or when to make us married.

> There is a trust issue! Our families think that if they let us to be in schools for longer period, we will get involved in boys' sort of things. I have seen families who stopped their daughters to school because they thought their daughters will get morally corrupted here due to the exposure of the outside of world. Let me tell you, if you are bad, you will do bad things even while sitting home. Our males should trust us that wherever we go we will not let the honor of our families down. This is not the case with boys. They are not being asked for anything. Even if they do bad things, they will not be blamed to spoil the name of the family.
>
> Women's rights have always been violated. Our men have all types of rights. They can do everything freely. They don't need permission from elders, family or anyone unlike women who have to take lots of permission from every elders of the family. Though women are strong too but they are confined to only houses. They are struck with the limitations imposed by family members. Family should trust in women the way they do in men.
>
> Men and women should be equal. Our Islam says the same thing, but the restriction is *purdha* (veil). It is said in Pashtun culture/society that woman is the other name of purdah and piety. She should be kept in it all the time. This is the main problem and that is why they don't allow us to go out freely. On the other hand, there are incidents of girls when they get freedom, they misused it which stops other girls' opportunity. Everything should be balanced.
>
> Our ancestors were not schooled. They were uneducated. Today, still girls are not important, and more preferences have been given to boys. Girls in our community face derogatory remarks and are treated as something with no value. They are always regarded inferior as compared to boys. Not all families give equal rights and preferences to both genders. Pashtuns always feel pride of their boys. Women and girls are treated like animals and always are kept in houses with strict surveillance. They should be treated equally with respect and love.

These girls expressed clearly how unfair they felt it was for men to have control over girls' educational, marital, physical mobility, and life choices. They often used the language of rights—a language drawn both from national and international discourses and from the Quran—to protest what they felt was unfair about current gender relations and their own control over their educational and career futures. They also often talked about trust, and the fact that girls were not trusted by the men in their families to behave themselves if they were sent to school.

By tying schooling to learning to be "good", and girls' bad behavior outside the home as "inborn" (and not something created by schooling), these girls attempted to reframe the gendered narrative that educating girls would lead them to do "bad" things or to misbehave out of the view of their families. At the same time, however, their narratives recognized that claiming a right to schooling (and, potentially, the career opportunities that might come after it) was in a fundamental way radical. The language of "civilizing" schooling here can be seen to be in potentially more direct conflict with a "Pashtun culture" in which women's lack of rights is viewed as central. The language of trust attempts to bridge this difference in new ways that speak to potentially new tactics for claiming socio-cultural space for girls' and women's desires and goals, without directly pushing against "culture" (which is viewed as useless to try to argue against). Here, girls' narratives may also point to the "silent revolution" that they will be able to undertake—educating their own children, perhaps pushing for their daughters to gain more education than they had, just as their mothers did for them.

Schooling and Citizenship

Pashtun girls' narratives about schooling reflect a tight focus on their roles as mothers and members of Pashtun families. And they reflect a sense of women's absolute reliance on men to gain access to schooling and to careers. The only thing that girls feel they can definitely control is how they educate their children at home, and it is here that most girls said they saw a purpose for schooling that would exist no matter what men allowed them to do or not to do. However, because of men's control of girls' uses of schooling outside of motherhood, current public educational practices were reproducing the focus on girls as wives and mothers, reinforcing practices of purdah in which girls' schooling was expected to be single-sex (and, therefore, if a single-sex school was not available, girls could not access schooling), and

allowing for close familial regulation of schooling (that is, if there were any signs that schooling (or, later, career) might not strengthen a girls' mothering skills as a Pashtun mother, then family could end the girl's schooling with no constraint).

For parents, girls' schooling in Quetta offered the possibility for better marriage prospects, as urban boys' families were valuing girls with a secondary education, as in Quetta they were expected to be better mothers and able to support their own children's education more effectively. For boys and their families, marrying an educated girl was a status symbol of a girl who could enact "civilized", improved motherhood. It was not usually expected or desired that the girls would work outside of the household after marriage. Indeed, in some cases, it would be viewed as a sign of social distress if the family allows the woman to work.

In this sense, many components of the national curriculum and officially gender-neutral vision of human capital development through girls' education is not mirrored in how Pashtun girls and families understood the purposes of schooling—much of the "investment" in girls' education imagined by educational economists and international development models is lost when girls cannot work, though the multigenerational benefits of education might remain. However, as we saw in the curriculum chapter, in practice the civics curriculum and school system itself is deeply gendered, and the Pashtun norms and values that are reflected in fathers' understandings of girls' schooling, and girls' schooling patterns and outcomes, are very compatible with the broad norms of gender inequity visible in the formal and enacted curriculum.

Yet, as has so often been noted in thinking about gender and education, even in cases where schooling is designed to be gender inequitable and is viewed by men as keeping girls in

their (mothering) places, girls' comments about schooling also showed potential lines of empowerment that might grow through schooling. In the quotes above, girls noted that schooling made them "civilized" or "good" and contrasted this with Pashtun norms and values. Some girls spoke about the ways in which their mothers and they imagined that schooling could serve as an engine for girls' empowerment, and the sacrifices that their mothers made to support their schooling:

> My mother is uneducated. She wants me to get education. She pushes me to come to school. I help my mother in household chores but during my examination time, she does not let me to do anything, though she is diabetic. She says that she values education because all of her life she was totally dependent on my father financially and now she wants us to get education. She knows it that she will not have any control if my father gets me or my sisters married early but she knows for sure that with good education we will get good proposals from educated Pashtun families and we will not be like her. Our future educated husbands and their families will treat us with respect and dignity.
>
> My mother acknowledges the importance of education. She told me once that she wanted to get education, but her father made her married at a very young age right after her puberty. Though I have to do household chores, but my mother always helps me when I have lots of school's homework to do.

Here, the girls reflect on their (uneducated) mothers' own belief that education can empower girls directly and indirectly—through the people they can marry, the norms they can adopt of "civilized" motherhood, and so forth. And some girls spoke directly about fighting for girls' education—which was itself directly linked to girls' empowerment through schooling, through career opportunities, and through the enactment of their rights:

> I want to do something for girls/women. I want to empower them. There is still a strong belief in our *quom* (community) that there is no benefit of educating girls. They think that it will be their insult if their daughters go to schools because for them it is a taboo! Only men can educate and can do jobs and their women's job is to take care of house and do child bearing and rearing. But now in my family people, after seeing us getting education, have started changing their mindset towards girls' education. Our education is opening doors for other girls to educate themselves. I am so proud of it!

Here we see a different, multigenerational consequence for girls' education: supported by their own mothers to imagine a (slightly) different mothering future, some girls in turn spoke about broader social changes to norms and expectations that would occur as they pushed these boundaries even further.

If we think of citizenship in the broad sense of the term suggested by Yuval-Davis and other feminist colleagues, girls' education in the Pashtun community appears to be one important tool in gently but firmly expanding and pushing against some of the notions of familial and clan citizenship that have historically predominated in the Pashtun communities. Moreover, girls sometimes used the national language of a right to education (as citizens of Pakistan) to provide some opportunity to argue for their continued education within their families and communities. In these senses, girls' education appears to be slightly expanding girls' claims to citizenship at various levels, and their claims to different kinds of belonging and being.

On the other hand, we also see the inherent tension that exists in girls' schooling, particularly as it is expressed in the notion of schooling making girls more "civilized" or "good". These are urban girls and families who, in some ways, push back against rural Pashtun cultural norms through schooling. The notion of "civilized" is not contrasted exactly with Pashtun culture, but instead with rural Pashtun culture. In so doing, however, it holds the potential danger of "Westernizing" girls in unwanted ways. Thus, making the claim that schooling would make them "civilized" or "good" also always meant that girls had to carefully rationalize what these improvements would mean in relation to "traditional" Pashtun culture, which girls were still expected to maintain and uphold.

Pashtun Girls' Experience with Other Girls

If we think about citizenship as an individual identity, we see one aspect of what girls' schooling might be doing in Pashtun families. On the other side, we can also examine what kinds of experiences Pashtun girls have when they come to school and interact with many other girls. Pashtun girls said that they come to school because they enjoy schooling itself, and value the opportunities it provides for them to be able to educate others in the future, and perhaps even to work outside the home. Girls described their experiences in classrooms in ways that reflect this broad enjoyment of school and goal of staying in school for as long as possible:

> I like school because I forget my problems while being school. I don't have to work and worried about anything when I am with my friends here.
>
> I feel good when I come to school. I am very punctual, and I like to study. I have good friends here. We sit together during recess time and share our food with each other. Sometimes we pool money together and ask our school peon to bring samosas for us during recess. I don't like fights. I like when we all sit together and have fun.
>
> One of the reasons that I come to school is that I have good friends here. I like to spend time with them. I don't like fights because there are girls who think they are superior to all of us. Sometimes I want to tell them that Allah does not like pride but then I control myself because I don't want to get into a fight. My family sends me here to get education. If they know that I come here and fight with other girls, they will stop my school.
>
> I like to come to school. Though teachers are strict here, but it is way better to sit home and work all day long. If we have any problems, we do not share with our family because then they will not allow us to school.

Their quotes speak to the goal of being in school instead of at home, of the joys of being with friends, of sharing food and chatting, and of having time and space in which they can behave differently than at home. In this regard, Pashtun girls' experiences sound like the experiences of girls around the world whose lives are constrained at home and who view schooling as an opportunity to have a bit more freedom and to have time with friends (e.g., Kendall and Silver, 2016; Thangaraj, 2018). They dream of schooling as a path to a truly

different life (e.g., being a doctor), but they know the chances of achieving this other life are slim and they take joy in the experience of school itself, and in the potential changes that being educated might create for themselves, their siblings and children, and perhaps even the community as a whole, even if they are not able to proceed further.

For the most part, given their focus on school as a space outside of the home where they can spend time with friends, the Pashtun girls did not speak very much about their classroom experiences or about the learning materials or activities. However, as did the Punjabi girls, the Pashtun girls expressed some concerns about their interactions with Baloch girls. They felt that the Baloch girls tried to fight with others. They said that the Punjabi girls were the first targets of the Baloch girls, but the Pashtun girls were also targeted: There is a Baloch girl who always says bad things about Pakistan. She says that Balochistan is our country. I remember we wrote Pakistan zindabad (long love Pakistan) on blackboard a day before March 21 and she started fighting with us. She wiped the word Pakistan off and wrote Balochistan instead.

> Baloch girls feel they are superior, and they are the main locals of Balochistan. They fight with other girls on small things. For instance, if a girl writes or says, “Pakistan Zinda Bad (Long live Pakistan)”, they rant on her. If any teacher says that those girls (Punjabi or Pashtun) are hardworking, the Baloch girls start arguing with the teacher. Last year there was a brawl between a Punjabi and a Baloch girl. The Baloch girl’s family came to school and threatened the principal for not sorting the matter out properly. The whole matter took around a month to cool down. The news went into local media where Baloch girl was shown as victim and the Punjabi girl as perpetrator.
>
> I like to be in school, but I don’t like the way a few local girls (Baloch) discriminate on the basis of ethnicity. Those are just young girls. Of course, they learn these things from their families. We often have fights with them because they say that we are Baloch, and this is our land and we are superior.

Pashtun girls’ responses to Baloch girls (and to the underlying boiling tension over claims for nationalist independence) were predicated on the joys they got from school (which

were deeply fed by being able to "forget problems" and all girls "being together") and the limited support they received from their families. In order to maintain access to school, they knew that they could not be involved in disputes. Their schooling is contingent on their good behavior in schools. They are expected to behave modestly and not indulge in any fights with other girls. These girls know very well that if they get into any problem in school, their family, especially male members, will not come to defend them as the Baloch girls' families do; rather, they will pull them out from the school. Though they do not like the way some of the Baloch students behave with them and do discrimination on the basis of ethnicity, they avoid confrontation because they value their schooling and don't want to lose it:

> We don't like fights at all. First of all, fights should not happen on the basis of ethnicity or anything that degrades anyone. Second, families should not be involved. The Baloch girl's family (her parents, 2 brothers and sister) came to school and intimidated the principal and staff. Third, the Baloch girls always say bad things to us (Pashtuns) and threat us that after Punjabis, we will make you to leave Balochistan. In return, we don't say anything to them. It doesn't mean we don't feel anything. We can fight back but this is not the reason we are here in school. We cannot ask our males or family members to come to school and resolve our problems here. First of all they will not come because they don't have time for us. Second of all they would ask that do we come to school to fight or study?
>
> Our families don't get involved in such matters. They don't bring politics everywhere as compare to Baloch girls and their families. They have other business to take care of. If they hear about our fights in schools, they will not allow us to come to school.

The Pashtun girls who come to school know that their families will easily pull them from school. Pashtun girls' discussions about school show how they balance their own goals in schools, which often include the dream of non-feminized careers and work outside the home, as well as the daily joy of time with friends out of the home, with the realities of very limited male family support for their schooling, and the consequences of Pashtunwali. They gain access to schooling because it is viewed as supportive of improved, "civilized", but still fully "Pashtun",

modes of marriage and motherhood; but this means that the end of schooling will always be heralded by these constraints. They are uninterested in the Baloch independence movement, and they do not bear the brunt of this battle—as, they say, the Punjabi girls do. They are not fighting nationalist battles, but instead gendered battles over women's rights to basic freedoms—freedom to marry who they want, to move outside of the household, to have careers. It is here that they both attempt to utilize schooling to further their goals, but also recognize their own inability to transform these socio-cultural systems, and the limited ability of schooling (as an institution) to foment such change. Indeed, it is the fact that schooling can be viewed by male family members as reinforcing these norms that allows them access in the first place.

Chapter Six: Baloch Girls: Education for Independence

This chapter describes Baloch girls' understandings of citizenship and responses to their daily educational experiences and the national Pakistan Studies curriculum, in a moment in which there were heightened tensions between Balochs and the Pakistani state: Baloch men were disappeared and killed, girls were actively surveilled in and out of school, and attacks by non-state actors (e.g., Taliban) increased with no effective state response. Many Baloch students and teachers understood the current political situation as an extended human rights violation by the Pakistani state and those who held power in it—particularly Punjabis. As one Baloch girl described the current situation: "We are deprived of our own rights. We have not been treated fairly."

In this environment, Baloch girls described their experiences at school, their relationships with non-Baloch teachers and peers, and their feelings about the civics curriculum in terms that did not map onto the formal terms of citizenship, state belonging, and school goals held by the Pakistani state and at least some of its non-Baloch teachers. This chapter describes the ethnically-charged—and increasingly ethnically-divided—environment in which Baloch girls felt they attended state schools. At the same time, it also describes the reasons why girls' schooling appeared to be viewed as more, not less, important by many Baloch families at this moment of separatist tension. I begin by providing a brief overview of the role of Baloch women in Balochistan region.

Women in Baloch Society

Balochistan has never set a good example in eliminating gender disparities from its cultural and patriarchal social fabric. Balochistan tops the rankings in Pakistan in terms of maternal mortality, female illiteracy, unemployment, and gender disparities. Conditions are even

worse for Balochistan's women in rural areas. According to the Pakistan Economic Survey (2016, 2017), the literacy rate in Balochistan has dropped to 41% in 2016 as compared to 44% in 2015, and the province has the lowest literacy rate in the country. In addition to this, the province has an overall 24% female and 56% male literacy rate. The figure is 15% for females and 48% for males in rural areas, while in the urban areas, it is 44% and 76% for females and males respectively.

The poor condition of women in Balochistan is normally attributed to the rigid code of conduct called *Balochi Rasam-o-Riwaj,* or customs of society, as the majority of people in Balochistan identify as Baloch. This code has contributed to discrimination against women in different grounds by the state (Baloch, 2012). Baloch women as compared to Baloch men have less access to services such as education and healthcare, and a lesser share in property. In most cases, the cultural values and norms that restrict women from being able to seek help also restrict their mobility (Rai, Shah and Avaz, 2007). Gender discrimination is generated because of popular misunderstandings of biological differences and the ways that particular ideas about Islam mix with Baloch traditions. Women are expected to stay home except to attend school or visit relatives. Even then, they can only do so if they are accompanied by a male relative who may be as young as a child of 10 (Paterson, 2008). In such an adverse social environment, women are constantly positioned as, and become, the weaker segment of society. They are forced to stay in close and not encouraged to compete with men in the outside world (Kakar et al., 2016).

Historically, Pakistani women, especially Baloch women in Balochistan, have been deprived of their rights in all spheres of life (Awan, 2012). They are subjected to assault, discrimination, and murder in the name of "honor" due to numerous complexes yet inter-

connected institutionalized social and cultural factors that have kept women particularly vulnerable to the violence directed at them (Umer et al., 2016). Baloch men have total authority to subordinate Baloch women in the name of religion and cultural values. Furthermore, women are given or acquired through arranged marriages to spend their lives in the service of a male-dominated home and social system. Strict family, tribal and traditional Islamic values permeate the society, which views women as the personal property of male family members, owned by father or brothers before marriage and the husband after marriage (Umer et al., 2016).

Despite the aforementioned background, I saw an emerging pattern of interest by Baloch families in allowing and sending their daughters to pursue and continue with their education. For example, one of my non-local teacher respondents, who was first appointed in Baloch rural areas, specifically told me:

> Baloch people want to educate their girls and want to send them to schools. The real problem is not the rigid customs and tribal laws against girls' education in rural Balochistan. In reality, it is the access of schools that is the biggest obstacle.

Many local and non-local teachers, who were once appointed to rural Balochistan as part of their government job, endorsed the same notion. One of the Baloch teachers told me:

> Once I was appointed as a supervisor to visit the rural schools in Baloch areas. I decided to visit the schools unannounced. I was totally surprised to see the determination and dedication of both teachers and girls towards education. First, there were more boys' schools than the girls' schools. Second, the girls' schools lacked the basic structure and facilities such as cemented/bricked building, furniture, latrines, electricity, gas and water. The girls' schools were sparsely located, and girls and female teachers had to walk for miles to come to school. There was a scarcity of water due to drought and extreme hot weather, but I found teachers teaching the girls.

This narrative of families' interest in girls' schooling aligns well with Baloch girls' and parents' own accounts of the changing value of girls' schooling in response to the independent

Balochistan ideology, in which women/girls are allowed to get education so that they better serve a newly independent Balochistan in the future. At the same time that I recognize the new interest in girls' schooling among Baloch families, it is essential to recognize how the negligence of the Pakistani state towards the people of Balochistan both influenced and continues to influence parents' willingness, and girls' ability, to attend a safe school within a reasonable walking distance from home. I am a product of Pakistani government schools. My entire secondary education was done in rural Balochistan. I have witnessed myself the willingness of local people to educate their children but also have witnessed the poor infrastructure and scarcity of resources given to government girls' schools. The government of Pakistan has always blamed the locals in the rural areas for the poor enrollment and performance of the schools, which is certainly not the case. The local people, both Baloch and Pashtun, should not be totally blamed for the lowest educational facts and figures in Balochistan. The Pakistani state should understand her responsibility to treat all people of Pakistan fairly and impartially.

Another local teacher told me that:

> The government of Pakistan and the international organizations have portrayed the people of Balochistan, especially in rural areas, as wild and savages who are against of girls' education. That is why the literacy rate in Balochistan is so low as compare to other provinces. It is certainly a false propaganda! They want to keep us backward forever. I want to tell them that give us easy access to girls' and boys' schools, we will show you the increase in enrollment in both schools.

This idea of making Baloch rural people "backwards" and the "problem" standing in the way of girls' education allows the Pakistani state to blame the people themselves for the government's lack of investment in Balochistan education infrastructure and staffing. This dynamic is similar to Escobar's (1995) analysis of the making of Third World women, and the

ways they are used as the foil for arguments about modernization, a singular path to development, and progress that their communities and countries fail to achieve.

Ethnic Divides: Baloch-Pakistani Relations

Baloch claims to independence arise from the very first days of the founding of Pakistan, as described previously in Chapter three. The roots of Baloch claims to independence are old. As one girl explained:

> We don't consider Pakistan our country. Balochistan got its independence on August 11, 1947. Pakistan came into being after three days of our independence, but unfortunately Jinnah with British political leaders threatened us to merge into Pakistan after one year in 1948.

Balochistan is rich in natural resources and holds immense geographical importance in the region. The strategic location of the province makes it important to the Pakistani state in terms of transitional trade, especially in energy, gas and oil. Yet the state's response has been to extract resources and deny development in the region. Few disputes that over the last six decades Balochistan has not been given its due share in terms of the national budget allocation in development projects, road and rail infrastructure, education and health facilities.

As is the case in many resource-rich provinces where central governments are viewed as forcefully extractive and deliberately involved in under-developing the regions from which minerals come (e.g., oil-rich areas in Nigeria), this has created a sense of deprivation among the people and an increasing anger over what is viewed as the historically unfair colonization of the region by the Pakistani state, and particularly Punjabi and Urdu-speaking people.

Since the forced merging, tensions around Balochistan's independence have waxed and waned, but they grew steadily over the last decade, particularly following the state-sponsored killing of a well-respected Baloch leader, sardar Akbar Bugti, in 2006 (discussed below). This

incident brought a fundamental change in many Baloch people's thinking and understanding towards non-locals. They started blaming them for the unjustified killing of Bugti. Because the federal political establishment and military have more Punjabis than other ethnicities, Punjabis were particularly targeted. Balochs started threatening non-locals to leave Balochistan. In some extreme cases, they started target killing Punjabi people. As a result, the non-locals who could afford to do so often sold their properties and started migrating to Punjab. Non-local government employees started trying to transfer their jobs from Balochistan to Punjab. The migration of non-locals out of Balochistan had adverse effects on schools, both government and private. Quite a number of teachers in public and private schools are Punjabi and Urdu-speaking and their migration affected the quality of instruction in schools. The private sector was affected more than the government schools because the private schools do not give retirement or pension benefits and it was easier for teachers to leave private jobs than to leave their government jobs and accompanying benefits.

Balochistan's anger over what is perceived as unfair treatment at the hands of the state, unfair opportunities for thriving and success, and anger at non-Balochs over what is perceived as their denigration of Baloch culture and history, has grown. These feelings were visible in many interviews with girls, and were often framed in the language of universal human rights; each quote below is from a different interview:

> Our main demand is to have equal and fair ownership on our mineral and gas resources in Balochistan. This is our right to be treated fairly and equally if it comes to federal and Punjab.
>
> Our right is to get our minerals, oil and gas resources back from government. Our people are getting education but there is no job for them. Our Baloch areas do not have proper roads, electricity and Sui gas[49]. As a matter of fact, government is giving Sui gas to rest

[49] Sui gas field is the biggest natural gas field in Pakistan. It is located near Sui village in Balochistan Province, in southwestern Pakistan.

> of the country but the people of Balochistan do not have it in many parts of Balochistan. Is this fair?
>
> Our right is to have more employment opportunity. Women should be told about their rights. UNICEF should tell us about our rights. Government runs by military and they will not give us our rights.

Other students questioned the legitimacy of the Pakistani state, both in its form and its inability to develop and provide security for the Baloch region. One participant declared:

> In Balochistan, the so-called government does not do anything. There is load shedding, unemployment, high inflation and Sui gas problems everywhere. We still don't have paved roads to connect to rural Balochistan. People have degrees but there is no job for them. Only if you have money or you know someone, you can get your things done.

As a result, a number of students spoke openly about Balochistan's need for independence:

> Our rights have been badly violated but we will take our rights back, one day, eventually. Our struggle will go on until we get freedom.

Given the history of India and Pakistan's separation, it is important to note that almost all students identified themselves as Muslims in a manner that was consistent with the official religious doctrine of the state and of the official civics' curriculum. The Muslim nature of the Pakistani state was, of course, presented in the curriculum and in national iconography as its founding rationale and doctrine—the reason for the partition. Yet religion was not identified as a shared root for Pakistani citizenship by Baloch girl students. Almost no Baloch girls identified themselves as proudly Pakistani, though almost all identified themselves as proudly Muslim.[50]

---

[50] There were a small number of Christian girls in the schools in which I worked; I do not discuss them at length in this dissertation because my primary interest in this manuscript is to explore the citizenship tensions arising in response to the Baloch independence movement. The Christian girls are never, in fact, considered "real" citizens of

Instead, girls commonly described a nationalist ethnic identity as central to their understanding of themselves and their families. As one student described this:

> We prioritize our Baloch identity first. This is our pride and prestige. Then we see ourselves Muslim because our creeds and beliefs can be changed but blood remains the same.

The emphasis on ethnic identity allowed a new independence narrative to emerge—one which seemed to deliberately parallel Pakistan's independence story from India. For example, when describing the Pakistan Studies curriculum, which was generally distrusted and disliked by Baloch students, one student said that she did approve of the explanations given about the "two nations" theory of how the Pakistani state came to be created:

> I like the idea of two nations' theory in my books. The theory was the main basis to get Pakistan. The theory was about that Hindus and Muslims, who are two completely different nations. Their culture, religion and living styles are completely different to each other. They should live in separate lands.

Students directly linked this creation story about the Pakistani state to their own explanations of why Balochistan should be independent. They emphasized that ethno-cultural groups should all have independence from one another, just as Pakistan first did from India. This rationale for separation and independence thus built on Pakistan's creation mythology to argue for the power of division:

> I like Sir Syed Ahmed Khan because he presented the idea of two nations' theory. He said that if multiple ethnic or religious groups live together and they face problems and opinion of conflicts, they should be divided. I think we Baloch are also different culturally as compared to other ethnicities here in Balochistan. We all should have right to live independently in our land.

Pakistan or of Balochistan, by other students or teachers with whom I talked. They stood outside the circle of full citizenship in every way that I explored, and therefore represent religious minority.

But the rationalization of separatism was not only based on notions of cultural difference; it also built on a strongly-worded and common argument that the Pakistani state and its representatives—very often including Punjabis in particular or non-Balochs (often referred to as "non-locals" or "settlers") in general—were treating Balochistan and its people unfairly and were a drain on the area:

> These Punjabis have come here and have snatched our jobs from us. They work here but send money back to Punjab. They are making our Balochistan hollow. They come here freely and get admission in our educational institution but do not welcome us to get admission in universities allow us to study in Punjab.

Girls' Schooling and the Separatist Movement

The meaning of schooling for Baloch girls appeared to be to some extent shifting in response to the strengthening separatist movement and sense of unfair historical and current treatment by Balochs at the hands of Punjabis and the Pakistani state. Historically, girls' education was often viewed as relatively unimportant by many Baloch families. As described for Pashtun girls, Baloch girls' education levels were low and often restricted by male relatives, commonly in response to concerns about their movement outside the home and about suitability for marriage. Girls' schooling was always in tension with other familial norms. Some girls' accounts of their hopes for education mirrored these older, still common, narratives, and therefore often focused on the initial question of whether girls' male relatives would allow her to attend school:

> I have no idea about future, but I know for sure that I will keep on studying until my father allows me to do. I don't like our strict culture that only puts restriction on females. Girls in Baloch and Pashtun communities get married earlier and without their permission. In fact, our Islam gives us right to say 'yes' or 'no' on our marriage proposal. It is in hadith that it is imperative to get girl's permission first regarding her marriage, but our males don't do this!

Girls from poorer families were more likely to talk about the relationship between schooling and marriage, or to describe how their education could support their families' wellbeing:

> I want to become a teacher. I want to help my father financially. I will get permission to work outside the home but only with females.

These descriptions of the earning potential and marriage potential purposes and tensions of women's education in women's and their families' lives were evident in many girls' interviews and were closely aligned with the narratives of Pashtun girls. They were more common in interviews with girls from less wealthy families, who said they did not have the family protection to be overtly political or supportive of political movements in the way that girls from wealthier families felt comfortable being.

Other girls, particularly wealthier girls, spoke about new purposes for Baloch girls' education. Some Baloch families increasingly viewed girls' schooling as essential to the independence effort. These families tended to be wealthier, and their daughters reflected an understanding of girls' education as holding the potential of supporting the independence movement and the imagined future Baloch state. As the quote below indicates, though, there continued to be important tensions between ideas about girls' education as culturally questionable, and girls' education as liberatory to Balochs:

> I want to become a lawyer. My cousins are lawyers and when I see them, I get inspiration. I told my family about my future plans, but I am not sure whether they will allow me to be a lawyer or not. The reason is that my family has pressure from our tribe community, who are against of higher education. My father is a non-political Baloch but his brother is involved in nationalist movement. That is why he has allowed his children to pursue higher education regardless of tribal restriction.

For these families, who were supportive of and active in the independence movement, girls' schooling was increasingly described as essential to strengthening the region's labor force in order to power a future independent Balochistan. As one student explained, "We are here to get education so that we serve our future country Balochistan". Others echoed this sense of the importance of schooling in the long-term independence of the Baloch state:

> As soon as we get freedom, we will utilize our mineral wealth and natural oil by hiring international trained professionals and technicians from across the world to run our new Balochistan just like Saudi Arabia and other Arab countries do. We will work in our country and will make it successful. We have everything and we will survive inshaAllah!

It appeared that the independence movement was opening up a new discursive space for girls' education in Balochistan that had not existed before, and that was not expanding evenly across Baloch families or into the families of other groups, such as Pashtun families, who continued to maintain only the discursive space of girls' education for marriage and motherhood.

Baloch Girls' "Political" Education and Surveillance

For girls who adopted this understanding of the purposes of Baloch girls' education in a moment of a movement for independence, schools were complex institutions in which to develop themselves as future leaders in an independent Balochistan. As described in Chapter 4, the curriculum is tightly controlled by the Pakistani government, as are official school policies. Many teachers and school leaders and administrators were not Baloch; they were federal government civil servants from around the country. And the schools, by and large, were described by Baloch students as being sites of inequitable treatment for Baloch students, and of active surveillance by teachers, the government, and military forces. Heightened surveillance by these actors was viewed as a direct response to Baloch students' demands that they be treated

fairly, their protests of abuse of Baloch citizens, and their increasingly visible refusal to honor Pakistan's heroes and national symbols.

These tensions were heightened by the government killing of Nawab Akbar Bugti, who was one of the renowned and influential Baloch tribal leaders of Balochistan. He was the tumandar (head) of the Bugti tribe of Baloch people. He served as the chief minister (1989-1990) and the governor of Balochistan (1973-1974). The Balochs believe that the killing of Nawab Akbar Bugti was an act of injustice by the government that aimed to further weaken and colonize Balochistan. For them, Nawab Bugti was a hero who fought and died for their rights. As one girl described the genesis of this heightened surveillance at the primarily Baloch school:

> We like our school. Everything was ok here but when we protested against sardar Akbar Bugti killing, things started going bad. School's principal and teachers did not like it.

And it was not just the school staff. State force was in direct evidence at the primarily-Baloch school, where a paramilitary force was called in by the government to directly surveil schoolgirls (these men were actually stationed on the school walls, looking down into a gender-segregated space that men were not usually allowed to see). This heightened surveillance was again described as occurring in response to acts that were perceived by the government and its representatives as resistant or nationalist. While the girl in the previous comment speaks about an act of open protest conducted by Baloch schoolgirls after the death of Bugti, other girls spoke about the government response to the girls organizing themselves:

> Why are FC soldiers in a girls' school? We want FC out of our school. They are here since 2008. We know they are here because of our [Baloch student] group.

In the sections below, I explore the relationships that teachers and students described as existing between Baloch and non-local teachers and Baloch girls. These descriptions provide

insights into Baloch girls' senses of citizenship, belonging, and identity, as well as their actions in support of the nationalist movement. They also provide important insights into the ways that Baloch students (and teachers) felt they were positioned by non-Baloch teachers and school leaders, and the complex question of what it means to attempt to use an institution that might be viewed as colonizing or violent to achieve particular kinds of future liberation (e.g., the liberation that would come from staffing Baloch schools only with Baloch teachers). The "double-edged sword" nature of schools that are also colonial projects (whether imperial forms of colonization or settler colonial forms) has long been discussed (Pennycook, 1996; Woeber, 2000) CITES); as has the question of whether mainstream (as opposed to liberatory) models of education can serve emancipatory goals for non-elites (e.g., Charkravarty, 2012). These questions are mirrored in the quotes below.

Teachers' Relationships with Baloch Girls

Most of the female teachers in the public schools in Balochistan are non-local, as the number of educated Baloch and Pashtun women who could become teachers has historically been quite low. In this environment, with very heightened ethnic/nationalist tensions, many of these non-local teachers were viewed as actively hostile towards Baloch students and the independence movement, and in some cases, as potential spies for the state. Non-local teachers (as both Baloch and non-Baloch commonly referred to non-Baloch teachers) were well-aware of these sentiments and expressed diverse levels of agreement with both the idea that Baloch students and people faced discrimination, and with the Baloch "political" response that they saw their students adopting (both Baloch and non-Baloch actors described those who actively supported the independence movement as "political").

The small minority of non-local teachers who agreed that Baloch students and people faced discrimination and had the right to protest it often described their interactions with students in manners such as the following:

> We admit it that Baloch's rights have been violated and they are the deprived ones amongst all of us. We understand their deprivation and we stand by their demands of equal and fair rights and treatment. We are not responsible for the injustice with Baloch people then why are we paying the price? Our people have been targeted and killed. We are forced to migrate to another province. Our families are not safe here. That's why we have sent our children to Punjab due to security reasons. We are here because of our government jobs and we will be here till our retirements and then we will also leave if things remain the same in future.

These teachers, like all non-local teachers, were in part concerned about their own safety and belonging in Balochistan. They describe an increasingly unsafe environment for themselves and other non-locals, even as their own jobs required that they stay in the area. And, indeed, if all of the non-local teachers left the area, it would be extremely difficult to staff girls' schools. These non-local teachers were mostly interested in claiming that, despite a history that they agreed was full of mistreatment of Baloch people at the hands of non-locals, they were here as fellow Pakistani citizens, and they were not the ones at fault for the mistreatment of some Baloch people. They called on girls and their families to recognize this and to recognize their status as fellow citizens—part of a national public employment system, and people who themselves had long roots in and loved Balochistan.

> Now in school the fights between Baloch girls and Pashtun girls, disrespecting the flag and national anthem are very common. Now Nawab Bugti and other Nationalist Baloch leaders are the ideals of Baloch girls. We did not kill Nawab Bugti. Musharf and military killed him. He should not have been killed. His killing was not justified! But this whole scenario has affected all of us. We love Balochistan. Our ancestors lived here and now we are serving our land with love and respect.

Most of the non-local teachers, however, were less sympathetic towards Baloch students' claims of unfair treatment, and much more focused on what they viewed as the inappropriate responses and behaviors of girls and their families to the Pakistani state, to non-Balochs living in the area, and to the symbols of the Pakistani state and the subject of Pakistan Studies. Anger over Baloch students not being appropriately patriotic was common:

> There is a big trend of local and non-local [differentiation]. Most of the Baloch girls don't prefer to be taught by non-local teachers. For example, in our times when we were taught about our national heroes, we got fascinated by reading about their accomplishments and achievements. We were always more curious to know about them. Now when we teach them about our national heroes such as Jinnah, Iqbal, Liaqat Ali Khan etc., students don't pay attention and show any interest. Especially Baloch students have these cunning smiles on their faces just to show that they are not interested to learn about them. We don't want to read and do whatever you can do! After seeing this I become sad because Pakistan is very special to me. Our ancestors achieved it after their intense struggles and unlimited sacrifices. We are the builders of our country and these children are the future builders of Pakistan.

As in many other conversations (and as noted above), non-local teachers commonly mentioned the increase in anti-Pakistani sentiment following the state killing of Bugti:

> Right after Nawab Akbar Bugti killing, this whole Baloch nationalist movement caught fire and gained attention. Before Baloch girls here were not like that. This trend is not only specific to our school; this wave is everywhere! If you see other schools, colleges and universities, Baloch students don't want to study Pakistan Studies.

And only non-local teachers expressed disappointment that girls did not understand or support the Pakistani state and its symbols:

> We used to have big functions on Independence Day, Defense Day, Pakistan's Day and Iqbal day but we don't celebrate them any more due to the sensitivity of the matter. We don't celebrate or have function on any religious and national holidays here and students don't know the significance of these events anymore.

They also reported attempting to debate with girls about the narratives they told about Baloch history, Pakistani history, and the history of settlers in the area:

> When I teach them Pakistan Studies, the Baloch girls say that Jinnah was a bad person. We Baloch people trusted him, but he deceived us very badly by merging Balochistan forcibly into Pakistan in 1948. We did not want to be with Pakistan. We want to be an independent state. These girls do not know the history of Balochistan. Actually, there were orders by British Empire that every independent will be merged either with Pakistan or India and that's how their Baloch leaders decided to be with Pakistan. These Baloch girls just repeat whatever they hear from their elders. They think they are right. I told them that Balochistan had not merged into Pakistan, India would have attacked on you and your situation would have been the same. Either way you people would not have an independent state. Now you are better off because at least you are in a Muslim state— Pakistan— unlike India.

In these quotes, we can see the effort by non-local teachers to again claim shared citizenship on the basis of religion, as the curriculum also claims in relation to the Two Nation policy.

Other conversations with non-Baloch teachers focused less on girls and instead emphasized the important role that students' families played in fomenting girls' "political" activities, and in threatening teachers who tried to enforce pro-Pakistani activities and curricula in the school. Some of these quotes reveal a high level of distrust and anger towards Baloch students who showed "political" inclinations. Teachers were particularly infuriated by girls' behaviors in class, their protests of Pakistan Studies, and the formation of pro-independence activist groups that met at school:

> Not all of the Baloch girls are rebellious but there are quite a number of them especially the ones who have strong back and support from their families. These girls have made a political party in the school and they meet during recess time. They are spoiling other girls in school as it is said that a rotten fish spoils the whole flock. They sit and make plans during recess. They prepare everything at home about how to disturb the school discipline and come with that mind set to school.

> If we say anything to Baloch girls, they bring their fathers and brothers to school. Their fathers and brothers don't have any respect to talk to female teachers. They intimidate principal and staff and ask them to call teachers so that they take her class. They threaten teachers and principal if they don't teach their daughters the way they want to be taught.

This behavior was class-based in my observations; it was wealthier girls whose families would come to school, and it was generally wealthier families who felt that they had the energy and safety and resources to be openly political.

While non-local teachers generally described their relationship with Baloch students in tense terms, Baloch teachers generally described themselves as "non-political" but sympathetic to Baloch girls' sense that they were not treated fairly in or out of school. A minority of teachers refused to categorize themselves or their students by tribe and described the school as a space where everyone is deliberately undifferentiated: "I tell my students that everyone here is equal. We have uniform that shows uniformity and unity. It means we all are equal with no differences."

Most teachers, however, supported girls' claims about Baloch students' and teachers' inequitable treatment at the hand of non-local teachers, and expressed their own concerns about the consequences of these inequalities. Each quote below is a different teacher:

> The Baloch girls listen to every teacher. They just want to be treated with respect and kindness. I know the non-local teachers here discriminate.

> I teach local and non-local students with no difference. For me all of my students are equal. I am a very neutral person and don't like politics at all, but I have some reservation on the way Baloch girls are treated unfairly in this school. I teach the Pakistan Studies class, which has the group of bold Baloch girls. I have been teaching them for a while and they listen to me. They should not be blamed for everything. Non-local girls are also equally at fault, but Baloch girls are always to be blamed for disturbances in school. Despite all, I called Saeeda [a student] and told her that I will not say what to do and what not to do but one piece of advice I want to give you is to just put politics aside for now.

> This is the time to pay full concentration to your studies and do politics later on. You will need education for your politics in the future. Then do whatever you want to do!
>
> I am Baloch myself and my father has served department of education as a bureaucrat. My family is very apolitical but our extended family members have nationalist views. I am a neutral person and see both sides of the picture. I agree that Baloch people have been deprived of their basic rights for ages now. Baloch are also victims of target killing and enforced disappearance and kidnapping by agencies. But on the other hand, what have our sardars (tribal leaders) been doing for our province? Nothing. They have been chief ministers, members of national assembly, provincial assembly and senate for years now but I do not see any significant development made by them. I give you the examples of other provinces that have far better infrastructures than Balochistan. No doubt federal has always been partial towards [that is, biased against] Balochistan but our local leaders have not done anything significant for the province either.

Some Baloch teachers who shared a similar mix of views as those above also noted that non-local teachers' behaviors had changed for the better since the Baloch movement had become stronger and non-local teachers had become more fearful:

> We are peaceful people. We had very good relationships with non-local teachers. I am originally from Noshki, which comes in Baloch region. I remember when I was in high school in 70s; there were many non-local female teachers who came from Quetta to serve their duties in our government school. Our people used to respect them and help them with everything. We used to see them as our respected guests. Those non-local teachers used to live in a female teacher's hostel. Our own sardar (tribal leader) used to guard them at nighttime to protect them like his family. We are the ones who embraced them with love and care. I am a very apolitical person, but I have some limits too. In return of our love, these non-local teachers taunt us and tell us that we are jahil (backward) and jangli (savage). They take the credit that they have taught us manners of how to behave, how to eat, how to dress up, and how to live a sophisticated life, etc. They used to say bad things to us loudly in staffrooms but now they have stopped doing it due to the political situation.

Baloch teachers' accounts therefore largely reflected a refusal to identify as "political", but they supported at least some of students' claims of inequality in and outside of the school, and they were more sympathetic towards students' "political" responses to these inequalities than were non-local teachers. Their narratives also reflect no concern about their own sense of

belonging; the independence movement in no way challenged their own sense of citizenship in Balochistan or Pakistan.

Baloch Students' Relationships with Teachers and Peers

Baloch students gave a broad range of responses to questions about their relationships with teachers and other students at school. Most students described the school as being a negative environment in which they did not feel respected or cared for. The ways that the environment was described as negative varied, however. For example, one student described what she felt was a generally negative school environment and teacher-student relationships in non-ethnic terms: "Teachers here are very strict and have no mercy. If we don't do homework or don't learn our lesson by heart, they hit us on head with books. I feel very embarrassed." Another noted: "Teachers treat us very badly. They say bad things to us and we don't know how to respond to them." While both students felt that teacher-student relationships were generally negative, they did not ascribe ethnic tensions as a reason for this negativity. But, these girls' responses were in the minority. Few students described teacher-student and student-student relationships—positive or negative—in non-ethnic terms.

Most students identified ethnic and nationalist tensions as fundamentally shaping their relations with each other. More specifically, the "political" issue of independence lay at the heart of many girls' explanations of why they did or did not behave in school in certain ways. One small number of girls actively rejected the "political" nationalist stance and the effects they felt it had on their studies. For some, this rejection was simply an issue of time and energy and feeling that they had to be fully focused on their academic goals:

I don't like politics. I am here to study. I don't want to waste my time in politics. I want to become a doctor and I have long way to go!

For others, the nationalist stance meant a rejection of others and a fighting stance that they rejected in favor of a desire to have school be a place where they could be friends with everyone and be peaceful:

> I don't like fights. I like to be with everyone. I have Pashtun and Punjabi friends. I want peace and harmony in school. Rubina is a nationalist and she gets angry if I sit with other non-local girls. She does not like non-local girls.

And for still others, nationalism and being "political" was a stance that only wealthy girls and families could afford:

> I don't like when some nationalist Baloch girls play politics here. They want to have separate Balochistan. They are rich and have strong back and support from their elders. If they fight with teachers and other girls, their fathers and brothers come to take their side, unlike me. If I do this thing, my father would ask me to sit home. We are poor people and do not have any approach like these people have.

Another noted the negative impact of both teacher bias and some girls' "political" actions on all Baloch girls' education: "Teachers think that we Baloch girls are not serious to studies and we are just wasting our time here in politics instead of studying."

More common were positive comments about Baloch teachers and students, and negative comments about non-Baloch teachers and students. For example, one student said of a Baloch teacher:

> We like our Baloch teachers who are very polite. They treat us with respect. We love them and obey them all the time. If teachers give you respect, we respect them in return. Otherwise, we cannot tolerate injustice!

Negative comments about teachers were consistently ascribed to deeply inequitable treatment by non-Baloch teachers towards their Baloch students. As one student explained about the non-Baloch teachers at her school:

> Almost all of the teachers here do "*taasub*" (discrimination). They are biased towards us. They are mean. They have this understanding that we Baloch are *jahil* (illiterate) and problem makers. We did not feel it before. It started a few years ago.

This sense of ethnically-ascribed injustice on the part of teachers was reinforced by multiple girls. Another said:

> We respect our teachers and we are here to study. Actually a few non-local teachers have made this impression on other teachers that Baloch girls are disobedient. They don't listen. They don't study. They just do politics. Now everyone thinks like that. They all think that we are the bad girls and impudent. It is said that a bad name is worse than a bad deed. So the same situation is with us.

The sense that non-local teachers treated Baloch girls unfairly, viewed them as troublemakers, and politicized their interactions ran throughout many discussions I had with girls. One often-recounted story of a fight between a Baloch girl and a Punjabi girl—held in a classroom with a Punjabi teacher—was often recounted as follows:

> Teachers think that we initiate fights with other girls. They think we are the troublemakers. In many cases we actually did not pick the fights but at the end we are held responsible for it. Last year there was a big fight between me and another Punjabi girl. She was the one who initiated it and slapped me first. In return I pushed her and slapped her as well. Then our class teacher and other teachers came in and they made me responsible for it. They took both of us to principal office and made me to say "Pakistan zinda bad" [long live Pakistan] which I did not say. The fight was totally personal and was not based on any ethnicity-related issue but the teachers made it political.

Another girl described the same fight as follows:

> The teacher took Punjabi girl's side and made our friend (Saeeda) responsible for the fight. Though the Punjabi girl started the fight and slapped her first. This matter should have been treated fairly with no biases. How could we tolerate it happening with our

> friend? When nobody listened to us, then we called our families to step in. Saeeda's brother and sister along with our brothers went to the principal's office to tell her our side of story. This whole thing went on media too.
>
> Teachers here don't know how to handle the situation peacefully. They always treat us with some doubts. They just do blame game and put all blames on us. They should deal with us politely and peacefully with no biases.

In response to events such as the one noted above, girls described the increasing involvement of their families and of local media in negotiating what were viewed as school biases:

> My brother told me that if teachers continue picking on us and labeling us as perpetrators or rogue, he would bring this news into newspaper. He will write that in our school Baloch girls are facing discrimination by non-local teachers. This is the best way to teach them a lesson. That's how we control them! Last time we did the same thing and they got frightened and stopped saying things to us.

However, as reflected in the students' comment above about who has the time, energy, and resources to adopt an overtly "political" stance, these responses were deeply classed. As one student described of a less-wealthy student who had previously attended their school:

> There is a non-local teacher, whose husband got killed last year but she blames us for it. She hates Balochs and says that if she were allowed, she would kill all Baloch people. She mentally and physically tortured one of our poor Baloch friends in her class. Our friend got so disappointed that she left the school. Her family did not take any action against that teacher because they are extremely poor and uneducated.

Teachers, students, and families ascribed a political lens in most cases of explaining both their relationships with one another and the goings-on at school. This political lens had different impacts on different girls and teachers, depending on their own ethnic identity, their class, their family's support for girls' education/work, and their own orientation towards the Baloch independence movement. The important point here is that this political lens was central to understanding the ways that people could make sense of each others' behaviors, and it

increasingly shaped who supported girls' education and for what purposes. For some Baloch girls (particularly wealthy girls), this strengthened the support they received to be in school. For many others, it weakened it because their families were not willing to have girls involved in what were viewed as risky or bad situations that were politicized by the movement.

Flashpoints

As is evident in the example of the students' fight above, at each of the schools, there were flashpoints that deepened divisions or that increased Baloch girls' "political" responses to their non-local teachers and peers. While at each of the three schools there were events that occurred among teachers and pupils that served as flashpoints (like the fight described above), the Pakistan Studies curriculum and the Pakistani national anthem and flag were also important flashpoints. Below, I describe each of these flashpoints, and then describe how the mostly-Baloch school became a flashpoint itself, resulting in a school that had a paramilitary force patrolling the walls, and girls' fathers and brothers threatening teachers.

Pakistan Studies

How did the state's official civics curriculum play out in school classrooms, given the politics of Baloch independence and the tribally-charged interactions that predominated in schools?

Beyond the issues that all school subjects faced with being out of date and boring to read, Pakistan Studies was an exceptionally hotly disputed topic. Given the political tensions described above, it should not be surprising that most Baloch students felt very strongly that the state's civics curriculum—Pakistan Studies—was inappropriate and, in some ways, denigrative of Balochistan. They argued that this was the case because of its lack of attention to Balochistan's natural resources and history—including its history of initially supporting the new Pakistani

state—and because of its triumphalist narrative about non-Baloch Pakistani heroes. This theme was found in interviews with many different students; each quote below is from a different student:

> The book should be Balochisan Studies rather Pakistan Studies. Why should we study about Pakistan when there are so many things to mention from Balochistan? Pakistan Studies only talk about Pakistan. This book at least should have a specific chapter on Balochistan about its history, culture, population and people etc. The book should have a history about our ancestors, our heroes and their struggles and achievements. The book talks a lot about Jinnah but not a single thing about our ancestors and heroes. For example, there should be a topic about Baloch peoples' hospitality. We Baloch were the ones who weighed Jinnah with gold when he first time visited Balochistan.
>
> Why did Nawab Akbar Bugti get killed? Our next generation should know about him. The book should have a section about Sardar Bugti and his story so that our generation will not forget him ever. Also, Baloch leaders who were part of independence movement should be included.
>
> We have the one of the oldest archeological remainings like Harapa in Sunny Shoran area in Balochistan. It should be included in books. Another example is Sibi mela, which is the century-old fair but still no mentioning of it. The centuries old fort of our renowned tribal leader sardar Chakar Khan Rind should be included into our books.
>
> We want our Baloch national anthem on the back of our textbooks just like we see Pakistani national anthem on the back of our textbooks. Our Baloch national anthem should be regarded with respect.

Students were also upset about the Pakistani state's representation of itself:

> Books say good things about our [Pakistani] leaders and portray them as heroes. In reality they are ones who are responsible for all disturbances and terrorism. They have created the environment of terror everywhere.
>
> Pakistan Studies is about history, but it does not say a lot about history of Mughal emperors. They were excellent rulers. My favorite Mughal emperor is Babar who had a big bell in front of his palace. His people regardless of background would come and ring the bell with their requests and problems. Babar was a just ruler and he has left remarkable examples of prejudice free justice. On the contrary, nowadays we have extreme examples of injustice in our society. For example, target killing of innocent people, Balochs' forced disappearance, corruption, exploitation of our rights are the

> worse examples of the prevailing injustice in our society. Nobody, I literally mean no one, is listening to us. We are hopeless!

More generally, and as described in Chapter 4, the tensions that exist in citizenship education textbooks such as Pakistan Studies and Civic are created by what is *not* visible as tensions in the books themselves. In Pakistan Studies, people's identity is consistently represented only as a Muslim and as a Pakistani citizen. There is very little attention given to ethnic or cultural differences in the civics curriculum—in fact, they are mostly absent. The silence of the civics curriculum on this topic, other than to say that all citizens are equal, did not mean that all groups in the Pakistani border were equally represented. In fact, the curriculum was largely focused on Punjabi actors, norms, and history, and it was this silence, this assumption that the Punjabi majority was, in fact, the same as Pakistan, that so incensed the Baloch students.

Classroom interactions during civics lessons reflected girls' negative responses to the curricular materials and the messages of the subject. In my observations, Baloch girls (even those who said they were not political) did not show any interest in Pakistan Studies and the civics education books and classes. They did not argue with their teachers openly during the class time, but their physical gestures were enough to tease their teachers. For example, at one school the Pakistan Studies teachers told me that when they talked about Jinnah and other leaders who fought for Pakistan during the time of partition, the girls in class would not pay attention to their teachers. Instead, they started smiling and smirking while looking at each other to show teachers that they didn't care.

Baloch and Pashtun girls also had tussles and small fights in class. These were very evident on a regular basis during my observations. They were particularly strong in Baloch and Pashtun dominated schools. The Pashtun girls bragged about their political leaders and told

Baloch girls that they were better than them. They said provocative things like “Pashtuns are more developed than Baloch people in many ways”, “we Pashtuns are excelling in business and education. We are a peaceful nation unlike Baloch. Our overall literacy rate is higher than Baloch. We have a bigger population than Baloch people”. They would also write their political leaders’ name on the blackboard, writing things like “long live Mahmood Khan Achakzai”.

On the other hand, Baloch girls argued that they were the main owners of Balochistan. They said that the Baloch areas are very rich and have way more mineral wealth, oil and gas than the Pashtun areas. They said they have the sea and beautiful seashores like Gwader, Pasni and Ormara. They said, “we are way better than Pashtun people”. They wrote “long live independent Balochistan” on the blackboard. Thus, in ways larger and smaller, political tensions within and between settlers and locals were played out in the Pakistan Studies classrooms.

Over the course of my research, the independence movement heated up further, and students across Balochistan began to take stronger direct actions in school. Taking the lead from Baloch activists at schools in other areas of Balochistan, some students in the mostly-Baloch school in which I worked began to call for student actions directly targeting Pakistan Studies as an active problem:

> I don’t like Pakistan Studies. It is not about us. It is only about Pakistan. I attend the Pakistan Studies class because I cannot go outside of the class or sit outside. Otherwise, I do not have any interest in reading the stories of Pakistani leaders. I totally agree with Baloch people in Khuzdar, Turbat and Panjgur where they have boycotted to study and teach Pakistan Studies in schools. I wish we had the same thing here!

And, then, on June 18, 2010, the Baloch Students Organization (BSO-Azad) burnt hundreds of Pakistan Studies textbooks in different parts of Balochistan and called for Baloch teachers to silently support the boycott by refusing to teach Pakistan Studies. The subject thus became a flashpoint for teacher and student interactions—one which was accompanied by a

significant increase in tension and conflict at the primarily Baloch school. Below, I describe what occurred in the schools after this event. I discuss first what happened in the primarily Baloch school, and then in the two other schools, as the consequences of this differed dramatically between these two groups of schools.

Baloch Girls' Political Activities in Schools

Primarily Baloch school: Government girls' high school, Hani road

Secret Meetings and the Baloch National Anthem

Saeeda was the alleged leader of the Baloch girls' political party in the mostly Baloch school. Saeeda was 16 years old and a fearless girl, who had regular fights with non-local and Pashtun girls. Teachers did not like her or her group (of seven other Baloch girls) and labeled them as perpetrators or troublemakers. Saeeda arranged and supervised secret group meetings during recess time because that was the time that all girls had free time to gather. She described how she was actively responding to teachers' perceived biases and efforts to disempower them.

> The teachers want us to get separated but we will not let it happen at any cost. Otherwise, we will bring our Baloch Student Organization in to sort this matter out.

According to non-local teachers, this group always had an agenda to tease teachers and fellow students. The group planned this agenda at home and would come school with full energy to execute it. For example, they all sat together during recess time and sang the Baloch national anthem, which was written by a Baloch poet from Turbat. It is a patriotic song that all Baloch freedom fighters sing to show unity and to honor their struggles for their homeland. Once, the group was singing the Baloch national anthem out loud in one of the empty classrooms during recess time, and one of the teachers caught them red-handed and took them to the principal's office. The principal warned them not to do it again, but it did not stop them at all. They

continued doing it and eventually the principal limited their mobility to the high school section of the school during recess time. (The school was divided into three sections; primary, middle and high school sections. Usually girls from high school section spent their recess time in the middle section, as it had the main big ground and more classrooms).

Then, on 21 March, which is the day when the resolution of Pakistan was passed, the group distributed handouts of the Baloch national anthem to other girls in the school and asked them to sing. The anthem is as follows:

ما چُکّ ایں بلوچانی

اُستاد عبدالمجید گوادری

چُکّ ایں بلوچانی، ما چُکّ ایں بلوچانی
ما چُکّ ایں بلوچانی، ما چُکّ ایں بلوچانی

مئے ءُرس ءِ زمین لرزیت مئے سیم ءِ کلات جکس اَنت
ما کوہی مزار چُکّ ایں ما گُلُّو ایں شیرانی

چُکّ ایں بلوچانی، ما چُکّ ایں بلوچانی
ما چُکّ ایں بلوچانی، ما چُکّ ایں بلوچانی

ما کوپک ایں پسّانی ما جاگ ایں ماسانی
ما ءِ جُگ ایں بُراتانی ما لُچ ایں گُوہارانی

چُکّ ایں بلوچانی، ما چُکّ ایں بلوچانی
ما چُکّ ایں بلوچانی، ما چُکّ ایں بلوچانی

مانان دے ءِ دادبکش ایں، ماسر دے ءِ نام کش ایں
ما ہونی میار جلی ایں، ما دیما رویں ہیرانی

چُکّ ایں بلوچانی، ما چُکّ ایں بلوچانی
ما چُکّ ایں بلوچانی، ما چُکّ ایں بلوچانی

ما غیرت ءِ شیر ءِ ہکہ ماں ساہگ ءِ زہمانی
ہون پُشت چہ مئے چتاں، ما قوم ایں شہیدانی

چُکّ ایں بلوچانی، ما چُکّ ایں بلوچانی
ما چُکّ ایں بلوچانی، ما چُکّ ایں بلوچانی

مئے ہون زلور کار ءِ کلیت یک روچے مئے قوم ءِ
تاوان نہ بنت ہچیر نازیک مئے ماتانی

چُکّ ایں بلوچانی، ما چُکّ ایں بلوچانی
ما چُکّ ایں بلوچانی، ما چُکّ ایں بلوچانی

ما پُشت ایں یتیمانی، لاچاریں غریبانی
ظلم ءِ حصار ءِ پُروش ایں، دَور غیبت پدا ظلمانی

چُکّ ایں بلوچانی، ما چُکّ ایں بلوچانی
ما چُکّ ایں بلوچانی، ما چُکّ ایں بلوچانی

بارگیگ مئے کلیت اِنت بُراتاں گُلیں باندات ءِ
جنگ ءِ پوء مان داتہ ما گُلُّواں شیرانی

چُکّ ایں بلوچانی، ما چُکّ ایں بلوچانی
ما چُکّ ایں بلوچانی، ما چُکّ ایں بلوچانی

چکاس ایں ہزار رندء تیراں وتی دلبندء
قول اِنت تئ فرزنداں کوں کوہڈلاں تیرانی

چُکّ ایں بلوچانی، ما چُکّ ایں بلوچانی
ما چُکّ ایں بلوچانی، ما چُکّ ایں بلوچانی

چروک اِنت بلوچستان نامداریں بلوچانی
درگاہ اِنت شہیدانی، شہموکیں سگارانی

چُکّ ایں بلوچانی، ما چُکّ ایں بلوچانی
ما چُکّ ایں بلوچانی، ما چُکّ ایں بلوچانی

☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆

(Baloch National Anthem)

English translation

We are the sons of Baloch.
We are the sons of Baloch.
The earth quivers by our fear and the castles shake by our horror.
We live like cubs in the mountains.
We are the shoulders of fathers and the veils of mothers.
We are the honors of sisters and fists of brothers.
We possess the art of sharing.
We are like daredevils!
We take the revenge of blood by proceeding to kill.
We have been breastfed the milk of honor under the very nose of swords.
Blood pour from our eyes in that we are the nation of martyrs.
Our blood will surely come in need of our nation one day.
Our mothers' appreciations will not go in vain.
We are the back of orphans, hapless and poor.
We break the siege of repression so its season does not come again.
Meanwhile, the Baloch motherland, Balochistan, is the sight of the eyes of the great Balochs.
It is the land of glittering swords and martyrs.
We shall examine the bullets to penetrate our chests thousand times.
This is the ultimate oath of your offspring dear motherland.
This is the ultimate oath of your offspring dear motherland.

When teachers heard about it, they apprehended the group and took them to the principal's office once again. The principal (who was Punjabi) called their families to come to the school. Their fathers and brothers came and met with the principal and teachers. But they did not say anything to their daughters; instead, they warned the principal and her staff to not get involved in this matter; otherwise, they would see the serious consequences. The fathers and brothers said that it was their right to raise their voices for independence, and they will achieve their objectives one day. The principal was terrified and did not say anything to the Baloch girls at the time.

After that, the principal and staff received anonymous threat letters, which were accompanied by a long white piece of cloth, which is called a Kaffan and is used to wrap dead bodies to perform funeral rituals. The letter had threats of the bad consequences that would occur if the Baloch girls were disturbed while in school. In response, the principal called an urgent meeting with her senior teachers and got their suggestion on this matter because their fear was that these types of bold acts by the Baloch girls would stimulate the other Baloch girls in the primary and middle classes and this whole thing would become uncontrollable. They decided to contact the director of schools to tell him what had happened. He then brought Frontier Corps (FC) in to the school to supervise and control girls' activities in the school. The FC is a paramilitary force used to maintain law and order in politically-disturbed areas in Balochistan. The school administration first told the parents of all girls that the FC was there for security reasons to protect girls from any mishap and invasion by religious extremist groups, because during the same time of these events, anonymous letters were sent to many government girls' schools in Quetta by Therek e Talibaan. Some of the letters threatened that if purdah was not observed in schools and teachers did not stop girls from using cellphones, then teachers and administrative heads would have to bear the consequences. The letters warned the school management of the presence of informants among the students and the staffers and threatened severe consequences in case of non-compliance. Thus, the FC's new presence was explained to all school stakeholders as an effort to protect girls and teachers from the Taliban and their threats.

But despite this argument, the presence of the FC was increasingly viewed as a hostile presence by "political" Baloch girls and their families. The FC were not present in the schools that were not primarily Baloch girls. And the FC's roles in surveilling girls' political activities

(not assuring their safety from "outside" forces) was made very clear on Pakistan's Independence Day. For the celebration of August 14, which is the Independence Day of Pakistan, the school was decorated with materials like mini green and white paper flag banners, lights, and big flags. Saeeda and her gang decided to spoil the decoration. They all went outside together during recess time and started tearing the mini paper flags. All of them were wearing black ribbon on their heads and right hands to show their mourning instead of joy and happiness. There was a big blackboard in the main hallway of the school. The blackboard was there for announcement purposes. One of the teachers was responsible for updating it with the date and school attendance every day. On August 14, she wrote jashan e azadi Mubarak (happy Independence Day) and Pakistan zinda bad (long live Pakistan). Saeeda and her gang decided to wipe the whole blackboard with a wet cloth and write "long live Balochistan" secretly so that no one would see them. Saeeda went quickly to wipe the word Pakistan and write Balochistan instead and asked her friends to keep their eyes on anyone coming their way. But while Saeeda was wiping the board, an FC soldier saw her, and he ran after her with his gun. Saeeda ran, and the soldier just managed to grab her *duppata* and pull it off of her. He shouted at her "I will shoot you if you ever write this again".

After this incidence, the FC soldiers started monitoring the Baloch girls even more closely. Baloch girls were not allowed to sit together during recess time in the school area, so they decided to hold their meetings near the female washroom area where the FC could not watch them. They attended the school morning assembly every day but did not sing the Pakistani national anthem at the end of the assembly. FC soldiers noted this and started monitoring the morning assembly as well, ordering Baloch girls to sing the Pakistan national anthem and say Pakistan Zinda Baad (long live Pakistan). But the girls refused.

Non-local teachers celebrated the effects of the FC's presence on all but this die-hard group of girls, and in so doing, revealed the role that the FC were playing in practice: a role of surveillance of Baloch independence activities, which aligns well with the stories I heard from multiple actors about the FC being called in after Saeeda's fight and the families' threats to the principal afterwards:

> Our national anthem and flag are our pride! Before we were scared of singing national anthem and raising flag in morning assembly. But now FC soldiers have made it possible for us to sing national anthem and raise our flag in morning assembly. Despite that, Baloch students do not sing national anthem and do not respect flag.

By the end of the time of my research, the primarily Baloch school was under full surveillance by a paramilitary force brought in to the school by the Provincial government, according to most people, in response to Baloch family members threatening the non-Baloch principal and teachers at the school. All of the Baloch girls were facing a increasingly tense learning environment, in which their actions were always interrogated as being potentially political, and increased repression at the hands of male paramilitary forces.

Mix ethnic schools – Government girls' high school, Shaheen road and government model girls high school, Fatima Jinnah road

Political activity in the non-Baloch schools was generally much lower than in the Baloch schools. Saeeda was mobilizing her peers to actively and visibly protest the curriculum and the Pakistani symbols and celebrations at her school. In part because of her mobilization, the school hosted a paramilitary force who spent most of their time focused on surveilling Baloch girls. Below, I describe Rubina's political activism at one of the schools where most students were not Baloch. Rubina's activism contrasts with Saeeda's in its form, its location, and its impact.

Rubina was another Baloch girl activist. She was studying in class 10 in the school that had mostly Pashtun students with a mix of Punjabi and Urdu-speaking students. She had very strong views in support of independent Balochistan. She was an active political worker for the nationalist movement. She used to go to Baloch-led processions and hunger strikes for missing and disappeared Baloch people. She told other Baloch students "You just come here and do nothing. Rather, you should raise your voice and give meaning to your schooling". She told them not to sit with other girls who are not Baloch. She told me in her interview:

> I will continue my education as long as I can. I know through education I can help my Baloch people. I go to our Baloch processions and attend human rights conferences and seminars to give awareness to my Baloch people about their rights. There is a false understanding or propaganda against Baloch people that they don't study, rather they do politics and promote terrorism in Balochistan. I want to prove that we Baloch study, get degrees and do something significant for the betterment of our Balochistan. I want to be a proud of our Baloch community.

While Rubina attempted to mobilize other Baloch girls in her school, she mostly attempted to mobilize them to take part in political activities occurring outside of the school. The schools that were primarily non-Baloch had a very different political environment than the primarily Baloch school, and there was both less student political activity inside the school, and less peer and teacher support for such activities. Note also that Rubina, unlike Saeeda, spoke much more about trying to engage non-Baloch actors and "prove" to them the value of the Baloch people and community. Saeeda was not interested in such engagement, calling instead for a separatist movement that did not attempt to engage non-Baloch people and certainly did not try to prove Baloch worth to them. These are very different styles and forms of engagement, and at least in part seemed to reflect the demographics of the schools and the difference between being a minority versus a majority of school actors. Thus, the roles and size of settler colonial presence is revealed as a key issue related to types of protest and mobilization that can be undertaken; and

the particular role of school leadership and school administration in surveilling and controlling such movements is also made clearer.

Safety

It is important to recognize that the process of separatist/nationalist political action was taking place in communities, on streets, and in schools that were wracked by everyday violence, at least some of which was organized by the state against Baloch citizens. Concerns about basic safety and the role of the state in destabilizing the region were widespread. Many Baloch students felt that there was nowhere safe for Baloch people, including schools, which had been targeted by both the state and the Taliban. Men were particularly targeted with violence and disappearances, which were viewed as being supported by the state—either because the state was involved in the disappearances, or because the state did nothing to respond to them:

> We don't feel safe even in our own country Balochistan. Our males have been targeted. They have been kidnapped by agencies and have gone missing for years. There are no signs of returning them. When our males go outside, we do not have any surety whether they would come back home in evening or not. Government and authorities are not doing anything rather they are adding fuel to fire.

Another girl explained:

> Every day we hear about killing and the forced disappearance of our innocent Baloch people. We condemn all the injustice that Baloch people are facing for ages now.

At the same time that people faced violence from the state, the schools, roads, and everyday life in Quetta were also under direct attack by external forces (e.g., Taliban) that the state was unable to control and that threatened all students and teachers, regardless of ethnicity. Thus, while Baloch girls and their families often saw schools as an essential location through which to access certain kinds of knowledge needed for state-building, schools were also contested and dangerous spaces in which Baloch girls often found themselves fighting to

preserve their own sense of belonging and their own purposes for schooling, and terrified of the physical danger in which they placed themselves by attending school.

It is important to recognize that this fear of both the state and of forces like the Taliban shaped girls' and their families' responses to the schools, the state, and the Baloch independence movement, not to mention girls' physical mobility and surveillance by families, and the gender roles they were expected to occupy.

Gender Roles and Separatist Movements

Historically, men were expected to take charge in information provision, physical mobility, and engagement with the state in Baloch culture. These assumed gender roles remained stable in some girls' accounts of their lives, their schooling, and even of their political actions:

> We get variety of information from brothers and fathers. They tell us the reality of non-locals and their politics behind our deprivation. We listen to them and they always tell us the real truth.

In other girls' accounts, the sense of being consistently and unfairly targeted by the state—in and outside of the school—created a new discursive space for girls to claim a warrior stance that was described as very similar to the one adopted by Baloch men. The increasingly violent battle for independence both called on and provided a socially-approved opportunity for women to assume public roles and characteristics that had historically been viewed as "masculine":

> If they think by killing and kidnapping our males, they will outnumber us or make us weak, so we want to let them know that we girls are same as our brothers and fathers. We will not forget it! We will take our revenge.

Some girls described striking fear in the hearts of non-Balochs with this new militarism:

> Our saramchar (freedom fighters) are fighting for us in mountains. They have told us to fight for our country till our last breaths. About three years ago no one was scared of us. Everyone took us for granted and used us but now everyone is scared of us because we are fighting for our rights and our country. We have tolerated enough, and this is our limit!

And their increased willingness to take up arms against those who denied Balochistan's claims to independence: "We want independent Balochistan and we will fight for it until we die or achieve it".

A similar shift in gender roles and expectations has been described in a diverse range of independence battles, from 1960 to 1980, including, for example, in Zimbabwe, where women played key leadership roles in the independence militias, and gained new sorts of freedoms and social roles through their engagement in the battle that united all Zimbabweans against the Rhodesian forces (Lyons, 2004; Alexander and McGregor, 2013).[51]

The move towards an all-out declaration of an open, armed independence movement did not occur during my fieldwork. However, the situation was increasingly tense. Some Baloch girls—particularly less wealthy girls—either did not participate or actively disapproved of the separatist movement. Many of these girls also disapproved, as some quotes above indicated, of the dislike that separatist students expressed towards non-Baloch peers and teachers. In the two schools that were not primarily Baloch, these girls were more the majority.

[51] Note that in these accounts, the discussions of post-war periods often describe strong efforts to reinstate women's roles as being only in the private sphere, much as is also noted for the post-World War II period in the U.S. and Europe. Thus, even if the independence movement offers new educational opportunities and career opportunities for Baloch girls, the window in which they are allowed to play new gender roles may be brief indeed.

But some girls and their fathers and families (mostly wealthier) became more openly activist and disruptive of Pakistani national events and symbols (e.g., Pakistan Studies, the national anthem). These girls formed new groups, carried out activist events, and put pressure on their Baloch teachers and peers to support separatist politics. Baloch teachers consistently refused to do this publicly, though some expressed sympathy with girls' demands. Girls themselves were more divided in their responses. Some girls, like Saeeda, viewed the school as a new training ground for the Baloch independence movement. She demanded that other girls participate in political protest and she was actively hostile to non-Baloch peers and teachers. In response to her group's actions, as described above, the principal called in a paramilitary force that actively surveilled all Baloch girls at the school.

In my own interactions, I experienced these girls' ways of thinking about who would be a "true" Baloch and who might belong in a future independent Balochistan. I end this chapter with a brief description of my own experience navigating the growing divides in these schools. I believe that this account points to the dangers of an ever-expanding argument about how to measure and organize around the idea of Baloch "purity".

The Politics of Names and Belongings

When I was doing my interviews of Baloch girls and teachers, most of the time I was asked about my full name. I was not surprised because I knew they were trying to learn about my tribe or confirm whether I am a "pure Baloch" or not. There is an understanding among the most extreme Baloch families that a pure Baloch is the one who has both parents with Baloch lineage. Then they go by the hierarchy of tribes within the Baloch community to determine social position. When I told my participants my full name, they first responded that I do not look like a Baloch. Most of the time they thought that I was a Pashtun because of my looks. They also asked

questions about the ethnicity of my mother because in our culture our last names are either our father's name or tribes' name. My father is Baloch, but my mother is Urdu-speaking, from Karachi city. My paternal grandfather was Baloch, but my paternal grandmother was Pashtun. So, by the definition made by some of the extreme Baloch families, I am not a pure Baloch because my mother is not Baloch.

There was another time that one of the Baloch girls asked me what language I speak at home. I knew her motive of asking this question because she was trying to confirm whether I am a pure Baloch or not. I told her that I speak human language. She and other students laughed but kept on insisting that I tell them about my language. I told her that I speak Urdu, English, and little bit of Bravi and Balochi. She told me that she does not consider Urdu to be a proper language because it is a mixture of many languages.

These encounters provide some insight into the deeper concerns that were beginning to create waves in the schools in which I worked. The independence movement poses the potential of creating deep rifts among Baloch tribes, as well as among ethnic groups, and increasing violence towards those who are identified as "not pure" enough. It may also spark other independence and separatist movements, for example by Pashtuns in the area, who also have claim to some of the lands and who will not be given a comfortable place to belong in an independent Balochistan that is constantly judging the purity of who belongs. In this sense, major potential rifts in society are being played out in the ways that girls and teachers make sense of each other. And the class divisions that are visible in their responses are important analytic events for us to consider in terms of the forms of citizenship that are being offered by the state, by Baloch and non-Baloch teachers, and by Baloch, non-Baloch, and partly-Baloch girls from different family backgrounds.

This chapter points to the very different narratives of citizenship and of belonging that were developing over the course of my fieldwork. The Baloch Independence movement was having very significant effects on teachers' and pupils' sense of citizenship and belonging—both in the Pakistani state and in the potential nation of Balochistan. The terms of belonging in each of these entities was being fiercely debated, and not surprisingly, ethnicity and class positions resulted in quite different responses to the movement by different teachers and students. Overall, however, observing the schools through the eyes of Baloch girls reveals the extent to which the Pakistan civics curriculum's attempts to claim shared religion as the basis of belonging in Pakistan were failing to hold in Balochistan. It also reveals the ways in which struggles over claims of identity, belonging, and nation-building can provide new, if perhaps narrow and short-lived, opportunities for some girls to claim new forms of citizenship in the resistance movement and in the imagined future nation-state.

Chapter Seven: Conclusion

An Ethic of Care

Schooling decisions are largely argued in rational-economic terms in international development and education programs and literatures. If girls go to school, they will benefit in terms of higher earnings, thus benefitting their families and country. And if employment opportunities are limited, schooling is still seen to benefit girls in terms of empowerment: as a means of giving girls the capacity to make decisions about who to vote for, when to marry, how many children to have, and so on; and to benefit countries through the decreased fertility and increased child health that these educated girls pass on to their own children.

Rarely is girls' education written about with respect to an ethic of care that is linked to both the moral claims associated with the notion of feminized care, and to the realities of care work in which girls' lives and educational futures are so deeply entwined in Balochistan. For most of the girls in my study, schooling choices are largely made in terms of how schooling can help girls to care for their parents, their siblings, their (future) children, and even their nation. Girls want to go to school in order to be better daughters, better sisters, better mothers, including better mothers of the (Baloch) nation.

Schooling and its purposes are intelligible to girls, whether Pashtun, Punjabi or Baloch, in terms of essentially care roles and relations. Punjabi girls want to support their parents by providing for them in the future, by taking up jobs that are culturally available and accessible to them. Pashtun girls, with fewer opportunities of employment after school, still want to stay in school in order to be able to support their siblings and (potential) children by caring for them in more educated ways. For Baloch girls, schooling exemplifies how political the personal is, and

vice versa: they want to bear and bring up a new generation of children who embody a strong Baloch nation, whose strength is also reflected in their educational levels in comparison to Punjabi and Pashtun groups; even as they also nurture new aspirations to have careers that will help birth a new nation staffed by Baloch professionals.

Thus, girls and their families, across the three ethnic groups, see girls' education as effective preparation for and socialization into a life of caregiving, embedded in relations of family and community, rather than as an investment by self-sufficient individuals pursuing their own interests. Imperatives to pursue their education reflect a gendered imperative of care.

In many ways, such an ethic of care reflects and reinforces gendered cultural and religious norms and expectations. Being good mothers, daughters and sisters by dutifully providing for and nurturing family and community are values that are in line with religious expectations of being good Muslim girls. On the other hand, such a view also reflects how norms about girls' education have changed dramatically in Balochistan. They demonstrate that neither Muslim communities nor Islamic religious norms are inherently opposed to formal school education for girls; but that cultural-religious norms of gender and education are, in Balochistan, recalibrated and reconstituted in terms of schooling as caring labor in the present, but especially as caring labor for the future.

The spread of schooling has made it possible for girls in Quetta to argue for education in the (caring) terms that Islam promotes and that cultural gender norms reflect. This is an important social transformation in Balochistan that needs to be recorded and researched further. Equally, global models of girls' education as empowerment need to make room for alternative conceptions that recognize that frameworks of caring may interact with frameworks of justice

and parity in unexpected ways, and ways that do not always allow for an easy translation of increased girls' schooling opportunities and outcomes into common measures of empowerment. At the same time, this research reveals the ways in which a gendered ethic of caring can both suffocate girls' desires to parlay their education into opportunities to play different roles in society, economy, and family; and can create new fissures and opportunities for girls to both imagine and prepare for changes in the gendered notions of care through education. For example, Balochi girls, but not Pashtun girls, experience the independence movement as an opportunity to use their education to take on new professional roles that were previously closed to them, even as they are able to take on these professional roles because they have been reconceived as appropriate opportunities for girls to care for and nurture the new nation.

These approaches to thinking about care and caregiving differ quite a bit from many of the current approaches to thinking about care and education (e.g., Noddings 2015). Research that explores notions of gender, care, and education more carefully could yield new theoretical insights into when, how, and in what ways the notion of care can transform girls' educational and post-educational lives.

Citizenship Education a Site of Contestation

While caring logics are central to the way girls understand the purposes and benefits of school, that isn't to suggest education is depoliticized by any measure. In fact, in a political context overshadowed by the Baloch nationalist movement, citizenship education in schools has become a key site of contestation.

As the Pakistani state's effort to make good citizens is increasingly in tension with Baloch nationalist sentiments, all three schools were caught up in this tension. Mundane school

practices like singing the national anthem over the loudspeaker or raising the Pakistani flag were regularly contested. From peer interactions, to interactions with teachers, to citizenship education classes, to lunch period, all aspects of daily school life were perceived and experienced in deeply politicized terms. The separatist movement affected everyone in all of the schools. It transformed the way students and teachers and parents thought about the importance of civic education. And it differentially positioned girls and teachers in classrooms on the basis of their ethnicity.

Citizenship education, whether in Pakistan or around the world, attempts to construct a framework and vision for inclusion through the nation-state. Modernist in orientation, citizenship education presents the nation-state as the appropriate unit of belonging – not the tribe, or ethnic groups, or clans and kinship communities. It assumes and encourages a nationalist desire to belong to the Pakistani nation-state; it insists and educates that everyone across the territory wants to be identified and included as Pakistani. In the current moment in Balochistan, however, to teach about state-building or national belonging in school creates a space to consider alternative and dissident narratives of belonging.

If citizenship education is a means to nurture political participation, then citizenship education is successful beyond measure in Balochistan, empowering girls to see themselves as political agents in their own right. On the other hand, if citizenship education is a space to practice and encourage belonging to a state, then in Balochistan, it is also a space to perform other kinds of political belonging that reinforces separatist identities. Across the three schools I studied in Balochistan, citizenship education reminded girls that citizenship is not a settled issue in Pakistan, but one still being questioned and contested across territories.

In international development and education discourses, citizenship education continues to be perceived in terms of modern trajectories: making immigrants into Americans, turning peasants into Frenchmen, or – in Pakistan – producing a good Pakistani citizen whose primary allegiance is to the Pakistani nation-state. Girls in Balochistan schools remind us that citizen-making processes may refuse such modern teleology. The weight of (settler) colonial histories and the strength of "traditional" belongings to tribe, ethnicity, clan or kinship groups are not readily written over just because the written curricula would have it so.

Citizenship education, in international development education discourses, is assumed to promote a certain kind of civic participation as measured by studies like the International Civic and Citizenship education Study (ICCS). Citizenship, in these measurements, assumes a liberal and cosmopolitan model of civic competence, with the emphasis on learning to maintain democratic processes and institutions. This assumption does not hold in Balochistan, where a more ethnic rather than civic concept of citizenship is taking dissident shape, including in girls' schools and especially in citizenship classes.

Girls in Balochistan schools also point to the inadequacy of empowerment discourses in international development and education, which primarily focus on economic empowerment (employment) and modern reproductive rights (to contraception, sexual health information, etc.). As arenas of ethnic conflict and displacement emerge and widen across regions in the world, we need to pay more attention to girls' empowerment in the political terms of ethnic nationalism/separatism. The movement for Baloch independence has created a space for Baloch girls – and Punjabi girls, in response – to reframe their education as primarily political acts that serve separatist or Pakistani state ideologies. Not only is education a political act, girls are also politically active in schools, turning mundane school spaces (such as girls' toilets and public

chalkboards) into political arenas. Schools are spaces where girls increasingly see themselves as politically efficacious.

In the context of the Baloch nationalist movement, girls' political efficacy is also increasingly socially recognized and accepted, even encouraged – a remarkable social transformation in a region where girls and women have largely been required to observe purdah in masculine political arenas. It remains to be seen if this opening for girls' political practices persist and survive beyond the (success or failure of the) Baloch nationalist movement.

Schools Transform and Reinforce the Gender Roles, Rights and Responsibilities

Between caring logics and political efficacy, schooling both reinforces and transforms the kind of roles, rights and responsibilities that the girls can claim. For example, Baloch girls, as we saw in a previous chapter, claimed new political roles in and through school. Their aims to become a doctor or a lawyer, roles that they did not play in the past, became potentially available to them, and socially acceptable, as political acts against a Punjabi-dominated state.

For Pashtun girls, if cultural norms proscribed employment and education for employment, they still found ways to utilize their schooling by teaching and training their younger siblings and future children. While Pashtun girls largely understood these school-mediated roles within culturally sanctioned caring logics, for some of them, school also served to make cracks in these cultural norms. Thus, some Pashtun girls were angry about their restricted opportunities to pursue higher education and employment. They felt they were being denied their rights. They were able to draw on trans-local narratives provided by the state (such as the constitutional right for women to choose their own husbands and to go to school) to try to claim new spaces, however, small, in their own educational trajectories. This way of thinking and

talking about their roles reflects how schools offer a new language to make these new claims, even as claiming these languages can itself endanger girls' schooling because the state does not "back up" these claims, and the school can become perceived as not supporting community values, and therefore morally dangerous to girls.

For Punjabi girls, like Pashtun girls, schooling reinforced existing gender roles and norms of caring. Whether by doing home tutoring or finding formal employment in feminized professions, they balanced narratives of caring, of modesty and purdah – but also of human capital returns to education. That is, girls negotiated gendered responsibilities and roles by drawing on their education, pushing against cultural norms without entirely overturning them. In rural Pakistani (and Baloch) society, where women are required to stay home and do child rearing and bearing while men are responsible for the finances of the family, the Punjabi girls I studied are increasingly a role model for other girls in the area. Girls' economic activity, especially in the feminized contexts of the home (as tutors) and of caring professions like nursing and teaching, are increasingly becoming socially acceptable educational outcomes. While girls remain largely within caring sectors, they are also breaking norms by their economic agency and financial contributions to their families from a relatively young age. And even as Punjabi trajectories came to be increasingly despised as settler colonial trajectories, Pashtun and Baloch girls picked up aspects of Punjabi discourse (such as the claim of being civilized through education) and Punjabi labor norms (such as girls' ability to work more freely outside of the house as professionals whose aim was to serve the female public) in their own efforts to expand their educational rights and outcomes.

Learning to be a Good Muslim in School

My research began by studying curricula in public schools in the Pakistani province of Balochistan, to consider how formal and hidden curricula speak to idealizations of the good citizen. In particular, I wanted to study the tensions between education as a modern(izing) institution (that brought students into citizen-state relations and rights) and education as a means of creating a national community. How did girls, in particular, feel and respond as they were caught up in international education and development discourses of gender while also performing a Muslim identity that, in national curricula, was a way of belonging to the *Islamic* Republic of Pakistan; and the familial identities that determined their day-to-day access to education?

What I found was that girls expressed very little dissonance: education, while a modern institution, did not conflict with the apparently 'traditional' values of Islam or of cultural or tribal groups. None of the girl debated if and how modern education conflicted with notions of being a good Muslim, or a good Baloch/Pashtun/Pubjab girl. Everyone (parents and teachers and girls) seemed to agree that the education they received was teaching them to be good Muslims and good wives and mothers as well.

Existing international education and development literatures tend to frame a study like mine on girls' education in Balochistan primarily in terms of how cultural-religious norms of gender serve as challenges to education and empowerment. On the other hand, I show how girls in Balochistan negotiate gender relations, educational opportunities and economic participation primarily in terms of ethnic-nationalism, political belonging, and familial caregiving. Gender relations in Balochistan are being reconstructed in schools as an ethnic-political project rather

than primarily as the cultural/religious politics of gender. And finally, to reiterate, narratives of being good Muslims extend educational aspirations and opportunities by reframing education as an ethical project of care. The caring ethic looks different for Baloch, Punjabi and Pashtun girls, but in each case, it forms a moral framework that justifies schooling decisions.

Research Implications

This study reveals a number of areas that would benefit from further research. Here, I highlight three of them that hold particular promise to expand both our applied and theoretical understandings of girls' education in Balochistan. First, there is some literature around the world about women's rights movements, women's political rights and leadership, and women's empowerment (e.g., Tripp, 2012). As noted earlier, there is also a literature on women's involvement in political independence movements, and on if, how, and when women are able to maintain some of the freedoms gained during these movements. This research focuses almost entirely on women and on formal measures of political power. This research points to the importance of conducting research on changes in girl students' political, social, economic, and familial power and relations during the independence movement and after it; and, potentially, the need for action research to support the continuation and expansion of the rights and opportunities that Baloch girls appear to be gaining during this time.

This research also indicates the need for more research on the particular ways that schools can foment political divisions and/or unities. Literatures on peace education, for example, might inform research to explore why the political tensions that existed in each school differed as they did, and to explore potential policies, curricula, and school cultures that could support unity or peaceability in the face of increasingly tense debates about political belonging in

the region. Such research might explore question such as: How do school officials help try to shape conversations about who belongs and who doesn't and why? What kinds of curricular materials, instructional practices, leadership practices or state practices might support a more expansive notion of belonging, or at least tolerating? Schools represent the tense space where the state and the nationalist movement are playing out. Schools are state representatives, and so citizenship education serves as a key site of contestation. How might this site expand and enrich peaceable approaches to conceptualizing shared and differing citizenships, and what new pedagogical forms (e.g., Hess and McAvoy, 2014) might be needed to support such approaches?

Lastly, the research raises important questions about how theories of settler colonialism might help reimagine the processes, consequences, and futures of people in Balochistan. The growing literature on settler colonialism from around the world (e.g., Byrd, 2011; Arvin, Tuck, & Morrill, 2013; Povinelli, 2011) may offer new frameworks for understanding what is happening in Balochistan and for imagining alternative futures for girls, their education, and their lives.

References

Abbas, M. (1994). *Textbook development in Pakistan and United Kingdom*. Lahore: Sang-e-Meel.

Abu-Lughod, L. (2016). *Veiled sentiments: Honor and poetry in a Bedouin society*. University of California Press.

Acker, J., Barry, K., & Esseveld, J. (1983). Objectivity and truth: Problems in doing feminist research. *Women's Studies International Forum*, *6*(4), 423–435.

Adeel, U., & Naqvi, M. (1997). *Pakistani women in development: A statistical mirror.* Academy Town Peshawar: Pakistan Academy for Rural Development.

Adler, P. A., & Adler, P. (1994). Observational techniques. In N. K. Denzin & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), *Handbook of qualitative research* (pp. 377-392). Thousand Oaks, CA, US: Sage Publications, Inc.

Ahmad, I (2004). Islam, democracy and citizenship education: An examination of the social studies curriculum in Pakistan. *Current Issues in Comparative Education*, *7*(l),39-49.

Ahmed, A. S. (1976). *Millenium and Charisma among Pathans: A Critical Essay in Social Anthropology*. London: Routledge & K. Paul.

Ahmed, A. S. (1980). *Pukhtun economy and society: Traditional structure and economic development in a tribal society.* London: Routledge.

Ahmed. A. S. (1991). *Resistance and control in Pakistan*. London: Routledge.

Ahmed, A. S. (1997a). *Jinnah, Pakistan and Islamic identity: The search for Saladin.* London: Routledge.

Ahmed, A. S. (1997b). *Pakistan society: Islam, ethnicity and leadership in South Asia.* Karachi: Oxford University Press.

Ahmed, F. (2002). Ethnicity, state and national integration. In S. M. Naseern and K. Nadvi (Eds.), *The post-colonial state and social transformation in India and Pakistan.* Karachi: Oxford University Press.

Ahmed, I. (1996). *State, Nation and Ethnicity in Contemporary South Asia*. London: Pinter.

Ahonen, S. (2001). Politics of identity through history curriculum: Narratives of the past for social exclusion-or inclusion?, *Journal of Curriculum Studie, 33*(2), 179-194.

Alavi, H. (1983). State and class in Pakistan. In H. Gardezi & J. Rashid (Eds.), *Pakistan, the roots of dictatorship: The political economy of a praetorian state.* London: Zed Press.

Alavi, H. (1972). The state in post-colonial societies: Pakistan and Bangladesh. *New .Left Review*, *74*, 59-81.

Alavi, H. (1986). Ethnicity, Muslim society and the Pakistani ideology. In A. Weiss (Eds.), *Islamic reassertion in Pakistan: The application of Islamic laws in a modern state.* Syracuse: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Alavi, H. (1990). Authoritarianism and legitimation of state power in Pakistan. In S. K. Mitra (Ed.), *The post-colonial state in Asia: Dialectics of politics and culture*. New York, London: Harvester/Wheatshef.

Aldrich, R. (1996). *Education for the Nation*. London: Cassell.

Ali, T. (2003). The colour khaki, *New Left Review*, *19*(5),28.

Allard, A. C. (2006). `A bit of a chameleon act': A case study of one teacher's understandings of diversity. *European Journal of Teacher Education*, *29*(3), 319-340.

Althusser, L. (1972). Ideology and ideological state apparatuses. In B. R. Cosin (Eds.) *Education, Structure and Society.* Harmondsworth: Penguin Books.

Alexander, J., & McGregor, J. (2013) Introduction: Politics, patronage and violence in Zimbabwe. *Journal of Southern African Studies*, *39*(4), 749-763.

Anderson, B. (1991). *Imagined communities: Reflections on the origins and spread of nationalism*. London: Verso.

Andrabi, T., J. Das, Khwaja, A. I. and Zajonc, T. (2006). Religious school enrollment in Pakistan: a look at the data. *Comparative Education Review*, *50*(3): 446-477.

Anfara, V. A., Brown, K. M., & Mangione, T. L. (2002). Qualitative analysis on stage: Making the research process more public. *Educational Researcher, 31*(7), 28-38

Angrosino, M. V. and K. A. Mays de Perez (2000). Rethinking observation: From method to context. In N. K. Denzin and Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.) *Handbook of qualitative research.* Thousand Oaks: Sage.

Anthias, F. and N. Yuval-Davis (1989). Introduction. In N. Yuval-Davis & F. Anthias (Eds.) *II Woman Nation State*. Basingstoke: Macmillan.

Anthias, F. and N. Yuval-Davis (1992). *Radicalized Boundaries: race, nation, gender, colour and class and the anti-racist struggle*. London: Routledge.

Anyon, J. (1979). Ideology and U.S. history textbooks. *Harvard Educational Review*, *49*(3), 361–386.

Anyon. J. (1981). Social class and school knowledge. *Curriculum*, 11 (3), 42.

Appadurai, A. (1996). *Modernity at large: Cultural dimensions of globalization*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Appadurai, A. (2000). The grounds of the nation-state: identity, violence and territory. In K. Goldman, U. Hannerz & C. Westin (Eds.), *Nationalism and internationalism in the post- cold war era.* London: Routledge.

Apple, M. W. (1982). *Education and power*. Boston: Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Apple, M. W. (1990). *Ideology and curriculum*. New York: Routledge.

Apple, M. W. (1993) *Official knowledge. Democratic education in a conservative age.* New York: Routledge.

Apple, M. W. (1996). *Cultural politics and education.* Buckingham: Open University Press.

Arnot, M. and J. Dillabough (2006). Feminist politics and democratic values in education. In H. Lauder, P. Brown, J. Dillabough & A. H. Halsey (Eds), *Education, globalization and social change*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Aronowitz, S. & H. A. Giroux (1993). Education Still Under Siege. Westport, Conn.: Bergin and Garvey.

Arvin, M., Tuck, E., & Morrill, A. (2013). Decolonizing feminism: Challenging connections between settler colonialism and heteropatriarchy. *Feminist Formations*, 8-34.

Atkinson, P. and A. Coffey (2002). Revisiting the relationship between participant observation and interviewing. In J. F. Gubrium and J.A . Holstein (Eds), *Handbook of interview and research: context and method.* Thousand Oaks: Sage.

Aziz, K. K. (1993). *The murder of history: A critique of history textbooks used in Pakistan*. Lahore: Vanguard

Baker, C. (1982). Adolescent-adult talk as a practical interpretive problem. In G. C. F. Payne & E. C. Cuff (Eds.), *Doing teaching: The practical management of classrooms.* London: Batsford Academic and Educational Ltd.

Balakrishnan, G. (1996). The national imagination. In G. Balakrishnan (Eds), *Mapping the nation.* London: Verso.

Balibar, E. (1996). The nation form: history and ideology. In G. Eley and R. G. Suny (Eds.), *Becoming national: A reader*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Ball, S. J. (1990). Introducing Monsieur Foucault. In S. J. Ball (Eds.), *Foucault and education: Disciplines and knowledge*. London: Routledge.

Ball, S. J. (1994) *Education reform: A critical and post-structural approach.* Buckingham: Open University Press.

Ball, S. J. (1995) Culture, crisis and morality: The struggle over the national curriculum. In P. Atkinson, B. Davies and S. Delamont (Eds.), *Discourse and reproduction: essays in honor of Basil Bernstein.* Cresskill: Hampton Press.

Banerjee, M. (2000). *The Puthan unarmed: Opposition and memory in north west frontier.* Oxford: James Currey.

Banks. M. (1996.) *Ethnicity: Anthropological constructions*. London: Routledge.

Bannerji, H. (2000) *The dark side of the nation: Essays on multiculturalism, nationalism and gender.* Toronto: Canadian Scholars' Press.

Barth, F. (1969). Pathan identity and its maintenance. In F. Barth (Eds.), *Ethnic groups and boundaries: The social organization of cultural difference.* London: Routledge.

Barth, F. (1981). Ethnic groups and boundaries. In *Selected Essays of Fredrik Barth: process and form in social life*. London: Routledge.

Bartlett, S., Burton, D. & Peim, N. (2001). *Introduction to education studies*. London: Paul Chapman Publishing.

Barton, K. C. & McCully, A. W. (2005). History, identity, and the school curriculum in Northern Island: An empirical study of secondary students' ideas and perspectives, *Journal of Curriculum Studies, 37*(1), 85-116.

Basu, A. (1998). Appropriating gender. In P. Jeffery & A. Basu (Eds.), *Appropriating gender: Women's activism and politicized religion in South Asia.* New York: Routledge.

Basu, A. M., & Stephenson, R. (2005). Low levels of maternal education and the proximate determinants of childhood mortality: A little learning is not a dangerous thing. *Social Science & Medicine*, *60*(9), 2011-2023.

Bauer, M. W. (2000). Classical content analysis: A review. In M. W. Bauer & G. Gaskell (Eds.), *Qualitative researching with text, image and sound. A practical handbook.* London: Sage.

Basier, O. (1996). The nation. In G. Balakrishnan (Eds.), *Mapping the nation*. London: Verso.

Bogdan, R., & Biklen, S. K. (1998). *Qualitative research for education: An introduction to theory and methods* (3rd ed.). Boston, MA: Allyn and Bacon.

Bernstein. B. (1975). *Class, codes and control: Towards a theory of educational transmission.* London: Routledge.

Bernstein, B. (2000). *Pedagogy, symbolic control and identity: Theory, research, critique.* Lanham: Rowman and Littlefield.

Bhabha, H. K. (1990). *Nation and narration*. Routledge.

Bhabha, H. K. (1994). *The location of culture.* London ; New York: Routledge.

Billig, M. (1995). *Banal nationalism.* London: Sage.

Billig, M. (2001). Discursive, rhetorical and ideological messages. In M. Wetherell, S. Taylor & S. J. Yates (Eds.), *Discourse theory and practice: A reader.* London: Sage.

Bloom, W. (1990). *Personal identity, national identity, and international relations.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Blumen, O., & Halevi, S. (2005). Negotiating national boundaries: Palestinian and Jewish women studies students in Israel. *Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power*, *12*, 505-538.

Blumer, M. (2001) The ethics of social research. In N. Gilbert (ed.) *researching social life.*

London: Sage.

Bond, R. (2006) Belonging and becoming: National identity and exclusion. *Sociology*, *40*(4): 609- 626.

Bourdieu, P. (1977). *Language and symbolic power.* Cambridge: Polity Press.

Bourdieu, P. (1984). *Distinction: A social critique of the judgment of taste.* Cambridge MA: Harvard University Press.

Brass, P. R. (1971). Elite groups, symbol manipulation, and ethnic identity among the Muslims of South Asia. In D. Taylor and M. Yapp (Eds.), *Political identity in South Asia.* London: Curzon Press.

Brubaker. R. (1996). *Nationalism refrained: Nationhood and the national question in the new Europe.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Brubaker, R. (1998). Myths and misconceptions in the study of nationalism. In J. A. Hall (Eds.), *The study of the nation: Ernest Gellner and the theory of nationalism.* Cambridge University Press.

Bryrrnan, A. (2004). *Social research methods.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Burgoyne, C. B. & Routh, D. A. (1999). National identity. European identity and the Curo. In K. Cameron (Eds.), *National identity*. Exeter: Intellect Books.

Burki, S. J. (1999). *Pakistan: Fifty years of nationhood.* Boulder: Westview Press.

Butler, J. (1990). Gender trouble: Feminism and the subversion of identity. New York: Routledge.

Butler, J. (2006). Performative acts and gender constitutions. In M. Arnot and M. Mac and Ghaill (Eds.), *The Routledge Falmer reader in gender and education.* London: Routledge Falmer.

Byrd, J. A. (2011). *The transit of empire: Indigenous critiques of colonialism*. U of Minnesota Press.

Calhoun, C. (1997). *Nationalism.* Buckingham: Open University Press.

Cameron, K. (1999). Introduction. In K. Cameron (Eds.), *National Identity.* Exeter: Intellect Books.

Carrington, B. & Short, G. (1995). What makes a person British? Children's conceptions of their national identity. *Educational Studies*, *21*(2), 217-238.

Carrington, B. & Short, G. (1996). Who counts, who cares? Scottish children's perceptions of national identity. *Educational Studies, 22*(2), 203-204.

Carspecken, P. F. (1996). *Critical ethnography in educational research: A theoretical and practical guide*. New York: Routledge.

Carspecken, P. F. (2002). The hidden praxis: History of praxis theory within critical ethnography and the criticalism / postmodernism problematic. In Y. Zou, & E. T. Trueba (Eds.), *Ethnography and schools: Qualitative approaches to the study of education* (pp. 55-87). Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.

Castells, M. (1997) *The power of identity*. Oxford: Blackwell.

Chakravarty, R. & Gooptu, N. (2000) Imagi-nation: The media, nation and politics in contemporary India. In E. Hallam and B. V. Street (Eds.), *Cultural encounters. Representing `otherness'*. London: Routledge.

Chakravarti, U. (2012). Re-thinking the goals of education: Some thoughts on women's education and women's development. *Contemporary Education Dialogue*, *9*(2), 223-243.

Chatterjee, P. (1993). The nation and its fragments: Colonial and postcolonial histories.

Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Chatterjee, P. (1996). Whose imagined community? In G. Balakrishnan (ed.) Mapping the Nation. London: Verso.

Cherryholmes, C. H. (1987). A social project for curriculum: post-structural perspectives. *Journal of Curriculum Studies, 19*(4), 295-316.

Cockburn, C. (1998). *The Space between us: Negotiating gender and national identities in conflict.* London: Zed books.

Coffey, A. (1999). *Ethnographic self: Fieldwork and the representation of identity*. London: Sage Publications.

Cohen, L., Manion, L., & Morrison, K. (2000). *Research methods in education.* London: RoutledgeFalmer.

Cohen, R. (1994). *Frontiers of identity: the British and the others.* London: Longman.

Cohen, S. P. (2002). The nation and the state of Pakistan. *The Washington Quarterly*, *25*(3): 109-122.

Cohen. S. P. (2005). *The idea of Pakistan.* Lahore: Vanguard.

Connell, R. W. (1990). The state, gender and sexual politics: theory and appraisal. *Theory & Society, 19*(5), 507-544.

Connell. R. W. (2002). *Gender.* Cambridge: Polity.

Cooper, R. L. (1989). *Language planning and social change.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Crawford, K. (2000) History textbooks and the construction of national memory: A comparative analysis of teaching the Second World War. *Journal of Curriculum. 21*(1), 26-38.

Creswell, J. W. (2003). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed method approaches.* Thousand Oaks: Sage.

Crossley, N. (2005). *Key concepts in Critical Social Theory.* London: Sage.

Curie, A. (1973). *Education for liberation.* New York: John Wiley and Sons, Inc.

Das Gupta, J. (1985). Language, national unity, and shared development in South Asia. In W. R. Beer and J. E. Jacob (Eds.), *Language Police' and National Unity*. Totowa: Rowman & Allenheld.

David, M. & Sutton, C.D. (2004). *Social research: The basics.* London: Sage.

Davies, B. & Harre, R. (1990). Positioning: The discursive production of selves. *Journal for the Theory of Social Behavior, 20*(l), 43-63.

Davies. D. & Dodd, J. (2002) Qualitative research and the question of rigor. *Qualitative Health Research, 1*(2), 279-289.

Davila Balsera, P. (2005). The educational system and national identities: The case of Spain in the twentieth century. *History of Education, 34*(l): 23-40.

de Groot, A. (1998). Coexisting and conflicting identities: «-omen and nationalism in twentieth century Iran. In R. R. Pierson & N. Chaudhuri (Eds.), *Nation, Empire, Colony: Historicizing gender and race*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

Dean, B. (2005). Citizenship education in Pakistani schools: problems and possibilities, *International Journal of Citizenship and Teacher Education, 1*(2), 35-55.

DeMunck, Victor C. & Sobo, Elisa J. (Eds.), (1998). *Using methods in the field: a practical introduction and casebook*. Walnut Creek, CA: AltaMira Press.

Denzin, N. K. and Lincoln, Y. S. (2003). Introduction: The discipline and practice of qualitative research. In N. K. Denzin and Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), *The landscape of qualitative research: theories and issues*. Thousand Oakes: Sage.

Dijkink, G. (1996). *National identity, and geopolitical visions*. London: Routledge.

Doucct. A. & Mauthner, N. (2002). Knowing responsibly: Linking ethics, research practice and epistemology. In M. Mauthner. M. Birch, J. Jessop & T. Miller (Eds.), *Ethics in qualitative research.* London: Sage.

Duncan, N. (1996) Introduction: (Re)placings. In N. Duncan (Eds.), *Body space: destabilizilig geographies of gender and sexuality.* London: Routledge.

Dunne, M. & Leach, F. (2005). *Gendered school experiences: The impact on retention and achievement in Botswana and Ghana*. DFID Education Research, 56. London: DFID.

Dunne, M., J. Pryor & P. Yates (2005). Becoming a researcher: A companion to the research process. Maidenhead: Open University Press.

Dura, P. (l 996). Historicizing national identity, or who imagines what and when. In G. Elev, and R. G. Suny (Eds.), *Becoming national: a reader.* New York: Oxford University Press.

Durkheim, E. (1912). *The elementary forms of religious life.* New York: Free Press. (Translation, Karen E. Fields).

Eagleton, T. (1991). *Ideology: an introduction*. London: Verso.

Echeverria, B. (2001) Privileging masculinity in the social construction of Basque identity. *Nations and Nationalism, 7*(3), 339-363.

Edensor, T. (2002). *National identity, popular culture and everyday life.* Oxford: Berg Publishers.

Eder, D. & Fingerson, L. (2002). Interviewing children and adolescent. In J. F. Gubrium and J. A. Holstein (Eds.), *Handbook of interview research: Context and method.* Thousand Oaks:Sage.

Ewards, J. (1994). *Multiculturalism.* London: Penguin Books.

Edwards, R. & Mauthner, M. (2002). Ethics and feminist research: theory and practice. In M. Mauthner, M. Birch, J. Jessop and T. Miller (Eds.), *Ethics in qualitative research.* London: Sage.

Eley, G. (2000). Culture, nation and gender. In I. Blom, K. Hagemann, and C. Hall (Eds.), *Gendered Nations: nationalisms and gender order in the long nineteenth century.* Oxford: Berg.

Eley, G. & Suny, R. G. (1996). Introduction. In G. Eley, and R. G. Suny (Eds.), *Becoming national: a reader.* New York: Oxford University Press.

Englund, T. (1996) The public and the text. *Journal of Curriculum Studies. 28*(1), 1-35.

Eriksen, T. H. (1997). Ethnicity, race and nation. In M. Guibernau and J. Rex (Eds.), *The ethnicity: Reader.* Cambridge: Polity Press.

Escobar, A. (1995). *Encountering Development. The Making and Unmaking of the Third World*. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press.

Evans, L. & Davies, K. (2000). No sissy boys here: a content analysis of the representation of masculinity in elementary school reading textbooks. *Sex Roles*, *42*(3/4), 255-270.

Findor, A. (2006). Limits and alternative ways of studying the "nations": From real groups to the categories of practice. *Sociologia, 38*(4), 313-326.

Flick, U. (1998). *An introduction to qualitative research.* London: Sage.

Flyvbjerg, B. (2001). *Making social science matter: Why social inquiry fails and how it can succeed again.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Fontana, A. & Frey. J.H. (2005). The interview: From neutral stance to political involvement. In N. K. Denzin and Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), *The SAGE handbook of qualitative research.* Thousand Oaks: Sage.

Foucault, M. (1974). *The archaeology of knowledge.* London: Tavistock.

Foucault, M. (1977). *Discipline and punish: The birth of the prison.* London: Allen Lane.

Foucault, M. (1978). *The history of sexuality,(Volume 1).* London: Allan Lane. (Translation. Rober Hurley).

Foucault, M. (1980). *Power/Knowledge: Selected interviews and other writings*. 1972-1977, Brighton: Harvester Press. (Edited by C. Gordon).

Foucault, M. (1993). Space, power and knowledge. In S. During (ed.) *The Cultural Studies Reader.* London: Routledge.

Fox. C. (2001). The question of identity from a comparative education perspective. In R. F. Arnov and C. A. Torres (Eds.), *Comparative education: The dialectic of the global and the local.* Lanham: Rowman and Littlefield.

Francis, B. (2001) Beyond postmodernism: feminist agency in educational research. In B. Francis and C. Skelton (Eds.), *Investigating Gender: contemporary perspeciii, es in education.* Buckingham: Open University Press.

Fraser, N. (1991). The uses and abuses of French discourse theories for feminist politics. In P. Wexler (Eds.), *Critical Theory Now*. London: The Falmer Press.

Fraser, N. (1995a). False antitheses. In S. Benhabib, J. Butler. D. Cornell and N. Fraser, *Feminist Contentions: a philosophical exchange*. New York: Routledge.

Fraser, N. and L. J. Nicholson (1990). Social criticism without philosophy: an encounter between feminism and postmodernism. In L. J. Nicholson (ed.) *Feminisim/Postmodernism*. New York: Routledge.

Frow, J. (1985). Discourse and power. *Economy and Society, 14*(2), 193-214.

Gardezi, H. N. (19921). Religion, ethnicity and state power in Pakistan: The question of class. In D. Allen (Eds.), *Religion and political conflict in South Asia: India, Pakistan and Sri Lanka.* Westport: Greenwood Press.

Gazdar, H. (1999). *Universal basic education in Pakistan: A commentary on strategy and results of a survey*. Islamabad: Social Development policy institute.

Geertz, C. (1973). *The interpretation of culture.* New York: Basic Books.

Geertz, C. (2004). Being there. In C. Seale (ed.) *Social Research Methods: A reader*. London: Routledge.

Gellner, E. (1983). *Nations and Nationalisms.* Oxford: Basil Blackwell.

Gibson, R. (1986). *Critical Theory and Education.* London: Hodder and Stoughton.

Giddens, A. (1985). *Nation-State and Violence.* Cambridge: Polity Press.

Gilbert, R. (1984). *The Impotent Image: Reflections of ideology in the secondary school curriculum.* London: Falmer.

Gilbert, R. (1989). Text analysis and ideology critique of curricular content. In S. de Castell, A.Luke and C. Luke (Eds.), *Language Authority and Criticism: readings on the school textbook.* London: The Falmer Press.

Glaser, B. G., & Strauss, A. L. (1967). *The discovery of grounded theory: Strategies for qualitative research*. Chicago: Aldine Pub. Co

Goalen, P. (1998) The history curriculum and national identity: Exploring children's perceptions of national identity. *Curriculum, 19*(l), 23-32.

Goodson. I. F. (1994). *Studying curriculum: Cases and methods.* Buckingham: Open University Press.

Gore, J. (1992). What can we do for you! What can "we" do for "you"? Struggling over empowerment in critical and feminist pedagogy. In C. Luke and J. Gore (Eds.), *Feminisms and Critical Pedagogy.* New York: Routledge.

Gore, J. (1993). *The struggle for pedagogies: Critical and feminist discourses as regimes of*

truth. New York: Routledge.

Gove, J. and S. Watt (2004). Identity and gender. In K. Woodward (Eds.) *Questioning identity: Gender, class, ethnicity.* London: Routledge.

Government of Pakistan (1947). Ministry of the Interior (Education Division).Proceedings of the Pakistan educational conference.

Government of Pakistan (1951). Education Division, Proceedings of the educational conference.

Government of Pakistan (1957). National Planning Board, First Five Year Plan: 1955-60.

Government of Pakistan (1959). Ministry of Education, Report of the commission on national education.

Government of Pakistan (1970). Ministry of Education and Scientific Research. The New education policy.

Government of Pakistan (1972). Ministry of Education. The Education Policy.

Government of Pakistan (1979). Ministry of Education. National education policy and implementation program.

Government of Pakistan (1981). Ministry of Education. The Gazette of Pakistan, Part111, February 17.

Government of Pakistan (1985). Report of the commission on the status of women. Islamabad. Printing Corporation of Pakistan.

Government of Pakistan (1985a). Literacy and Mass Education Commission, PC-l, National literacy programme: 1984-85.

Government of Pakistan (1986). Literacy and Mass Education Commission. PC-l, Droping schools. Government of Pakistan (2001). Education Sector Reforms: Action Plan (2001-

2005).

Government of Pakistan (2002a). Social and Gender Statistics. Islamabad: Federal Bureau of Statistics.

Government of Pakistan (2002c). Revised Pakistan Studies Curriculum for Class 9th and 10th. Islamabad: National Bureau of Curriculum and Textbooks, Ministry of Education.

Govermment of Pakistan (1986a). Literacy and Mass Education Commission. PC-l, Nationwide literacy program.

Govemment of Pakistan (1986b). Literacy and Mass Education Commission. PC-l, Nai Roshni schools.

Govemment of Pakistan (1989). Academy of Educational Planning and Management, Evaluation of Iqra pilot project.

Govemment of Pakistan (1992). Ministry of Education, National education policy.

Govemment of Pakistan, Federal Ministry of Education, (Curriculum Wing), (2002).

Government of Pakistan, Federal Ministry of Education, (Curriculum Wing), (2002f).

National curriculum: Education for classes 9-10. Islamabad: National Book Foundation.

Government of Pakistan, Ministry of Education Website. Available at www.moe.gov.pk.

Government of Pakistan, Planning Commission (1978). Fifth Five Year Plan: 1978-83.

Government of Pakistan, Planning Commission (1983). Sixth Five Year Plan: 1983-88.

Government of Pakistan, Planning Commission (1988). Seventh Five Year Plan: 1988- 93.

Government of Pakistan, Planning Commission (1993). Eighth Five Year Plan: 1993-98.

Government of Pakistan, Planning Commission (1998). Ninth Five Year Plan: 1998-03.

Government of Pakistan, Statistics Division. Available at:

http://www.statpak.gov.pk/depts/az/az.html

Gramsci, A. (1971). *Selections from the Prison Notebooks of Antonio Gramsci*. London: Lawrence and Wishart. (edited by Q. Hoare and G. Smith).

Grare, F. (2006a). *Pakistan: The resurgence of Baluch nationalism*. Washington D. C.: Carnegie Endowment for International Peace.

Green. A. (1997). *Education. Globalization and the Nation State.* Basingstoke: MacmilIan

Green, A., J. Preston and J. G. Janmaat (2006). Education, Equality and Social Cohesion: comparative analysis. Basingstoke: Palgrave.

Greenfeld, L. (1993). Transcending the nation's worth, Daedalus. 122(3), 47-62.

Greenfeld, L. (1996). Nationalism and modernity. *Social Research, 63*(l), 3-40.

Grosvenor, I. (1999). `There's no place like home': Education and the making of national identity. *History of Education, 28*(3), 235-250.

Guba, E. G. & Lincoln, Y.S. (1994). Competing paradigms in qualitative research. In N. K. Denzin and Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), *Handbook of Qualitative Research.* Thousand Oaks: Sage.

Guba, E. G. & Lincoln, Y. S. (2005) Paradigmatic controversies, contradictions and emerging confluences. In N. K. Denzin and Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), *The Sage Handbook of Qualitative Research.* Thousand Oaks: Sage.

Guibernau, M. (1996). *Nationalisms: The nation-state and nationalism in the twentieth century.* Cambridge: Polity Press.

Gupta, A. & Ferguson, J. (1992). Beyond "culture"': Space, identity and the politics of difference, *Cultural Anthropology, 7*(1), 6-23.

Haleem, I. (2003). Ethnic and sectarian violence and the propensity towards praetorianism in Pakistan, *Third World Quarterly, 214*(3), 463-477.

Hall, S. (1992). The question of cultural identity. In S. Hall, D. Held and T. McGrew (Eds.), *Modernity and its Futures*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Hall, S. (I 996a). Introduction: who needs 'identity'? In S. Hall and P. du Gay (Eds.), *Questions of Cultural Identity*. London: Sage.

Hall, S. (1996b). Ethnicity: Identity and Difference. In G. Eley. and R. G. Suny (Eds.), *Becoming national: A reader*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Hamilton, D. (1989). *Towards a Theory of Schooling.* London: Falmer.

Hammersley, M. (1992). *What's Wrong with Ethnography?* London: Routledge.

Hammersley, M. (1999). *Taking sides in social research: Essays on partisanship and bias in social enquiry.* London: Routledge.

Hammersley, M. (2004). Hierarchy and emancipation. In C. Seale (Eds.), *Social Research Methods: A reader.* London: Routledge.

Hammersley, M. and P. Atkinson (1995). *Ethnography: principles in practice.* London: Routledge.

Hanushek, E. A., Schwerdt, G., Woessmann, L., & Zhang, L. (2017). General education, vocational education, and labor-market outcomes over the lifecycle. *Journal of Human Resources*, *52*(1), 48-87.

Haqqani, H. (2005). *Pakistan: Between mosque and military.* Washington. D. C.: Carnegie Endowment for International Peace.

Haque, A. R. (1993). The position and status of English in Pakistan. In R. J. Baumgardner (Eds.), *The English Language in Pakistan.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Harding, J. F., Morris, P. A., & Hughes, D. (2015). The relationship between maternal education and children's academic outcomes: A theoretical framework. *Journal of Marriage and Family*, *77*(1), 60-76

Hasanain, S. K. (2003). Omissions that could have been enriching. In H. A. Nayyar and A. Salim (Eds.), *The Subtle Subversion: the state of curricula and textbooks in Pakistan.* Islamabad: Sustainable Development Policy Institute.

Hasan, 1. (1993). Gender analysis of middle school textbooks. *Journal of Behavioral Sciences*.

Hastings, A. (1997). *The Construction of Nationhood: ethnicity, religion and nationalism.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Hayes, C. J. (1960). *Nationalism: A religion*. New York: The Macmillan Company.

Hayes, L. D. (1987). *The crisis of education in Pakistan.* Lahore: Vanguard.

Helie-Lucas, M. (1994). The preferential symbol for Islamic identity: women in Muslim personal laws. In V. M. Moghadam (ed.) *Identity Politics and Women: cultural reassertions and feminisms in international perspective*. Boulder: Westview Press.

Hess, D. E., & McAvoy, P. (2014). *The political classroom: Evidence and ethics in democratic education*. Routledge.

Hobsbawm, E. J. (1990). *Nations and Nationalism since 1780: Programme, myth reality Cambridge:* Cambridge University Press.

Hobsbawm. E. J. (1996a). Ethnicity and nationalism in Europe today. In G. Balakrishnan (Eds.), *Mapping the Nation*. London: Verso.

Hoodbhoy, P. & Nayyar, A. (1985). Rewriting the History of Pakistan. In A. Khan (Ed.), *Islam, Pakistan and the state: The Pakistan experience.* London: Zed Books.

Hoodbhoy, P. (1998). Preface: Out of Pakistan's Education Morass: Possible? How?

Hoodbhoy (Ed.), *Education and the state: Fifty years of Pakistan.* Karachi, Oxford, New York,

Delhi: Oxford University Press.

Hook, D. (2001). Discourse, knowledge, materiality, and history: Foucault and discourse analysis, *Theory and Psychology, 11*(4), 521-547.

Humphrcvs, S. (2001). Schooling Identity: gender relations and classroom discourse in selected junior secondary schools in Botswana. Unpublished PhD Thesis, University of Sussex.

Hussain, A. (2000). Peregrinations of Pakistani nationalism. In M. Leifer (Eds.), *Asian Nationalism.* London and New York: Routledge.

Imtiaz, S.,(2012). "Domiciles: Don't Forget Your Place. Retrieved from https://tribune.com.pk/

Isin, E. F. and P. K. Wood (1999). *Citizenship and Identity.* London: Sage Publications.

Jaffrelot, C. (2002) *Pakistan: Nationalism without a nation?* London: Zed Books.

Jafri, R. (1994). *Gender Bias in Pakistan School Textbooks*. Lahore: Aurat Foundation.

Jalal, A. (1995a). Conjuring Pakistan: history as official imagining, International *Journal out Middle East Studies. 27*, 73-89.

Jalal, A. (1995b). *Democracy and authoritarianism in South Asia: A comparative and historical perspective*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Jamal, A. (2005). Transnational feminisms as critical practice: A reading of feminist discourses in Pakistan, Meridians: feminism, race, transnationalism, 5(2): 7-82. Jenkins, R. (1996). Social Identity. London: Routledge.

Jamal, A. (2015). Engaging men for gender justice: Overcoming barriers to girls' education in the Pashtun tribes of Pakistan. *International Journal of Social Welfare*, *24*(3), 273-286.

Jamal, A. (2016). Why He Won't Send His Daughter to School—Barriers to Girls' Education in Northwest Pakistan: A Qualitative Delphi Study of Pashtun Men. *SAGE Open*, *6*(3).

Jinnah, M. A. (1948). *Speeches of Quaid-i-Azam Mohammad Ali Jinnah as Governor General of Pakistan.* Karachi: Sindh Observer Press.

Jinnah, M. A. (2003). Presidential address of M. A. Jinnah, Lahore, March 1940. In B. Chakrabarty (Eds.), *Communal Identity in India: its construction and articulation in the twentieth century*. New Delhi: Oxford University Press.

Joireman, S. F. (2003). *Nationalism and Political Identity*. London: Continuum.

Jones, L. and B. Somekh (2005). Observation. In B. Somekh and C. Lewin (Eds.), *Research Methods in the Social Sciences.* London: Sage.

Jones, M. A., C. Kitetu and J. Sunderland (1997). Discourse roles, gender and language textbook dialogues. *Gender and Education, 9*(4), 469-490.

Joronen, M. (2017). "Refusing to be a victim, refusing to be an enemy". Form-of-life as resistance in the Palestinian struggle against settler colonialism. *Political Geography*, *56*, 91-100.

Joseph, J. F. (2004). *Language and identity: national, ethnic, religious.* Palgrave: Macmillan.

Jupp, V. and C. Norris (1993). Traditions in documentary analysis. In M. Hamrnersley (Eds.), *Social research: philosophic, politics and practice.* London: Sage.

Kalmus, V. (2004). What do pupils and textbooks do with each other? Methodological problems of research on socialization through educational media, *Journal of Curriculum Studies, 36*(4), 469-485.

Kandiyoti, D. (1991). Identity and its discontents: women and the nation. *Journal of International Studies, 20*(3): 429-443.

Kandiyoti, D. (2000). The awkward relationship: gender and nationalism: *Nations and Nationalism. 6*(4), 491-494.

Kellas, J. G. (1998). *The Politics of Nationalism and Ethnicity.* Basingstoke: Macmillan.

Kelly, A. V. (1999). *The curriculum: Theory and practice.* London: Paul Chapman Publishing Ltd.

Kendall, N., & Silver, R. (2014). The consequences of global mass education: Schooling, work, and well-being in EFA-era Malawi. *Globalization and education: Integration and contestation across cultures*, 247-265

Khan, A. (1999) Ethnicity, Islam and national identity in Pakistan. *South Asia: Journal of South Asian Studies, 22*, 67-182.

Khan, N. S. (1992). Voices With. In N.S. Khan (Eds.), *Dialogues with women and Islam.* Lahore: ASR Publications.

Khwwaja, S. (2001). Education as a system and discipline in Pakistan. In S. Hashmi (Eds.), *The State of Social Sciences in Pakistan*. Quaid-i-Azam University.

Kincheloe, J. L. & McLaren, P. (2005). Rethinking critical theory and qualitative research. In N. K. Dentin and Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), *The Sage Handbook of Qualitative Research.* Thousand Oaks: Sage.

Kishwar. M. (1998). *Religion at the Service of Nationalism and Other Delhi*. Open University Press.

Lakhi, M. V. (1997). Language and regionalism in Pakistan. In V. Grover and R. Arora (Eds.), *Pakistan: Fifty years of independence*, (Volume 2). New Delhi: Deep and Deep.

Lather, P. (1991). *Getting smart: Feminist research and pedagogy 10th in the postmodern.* New York: Routledge.

Lawton, D. (1989). *Education, Culture and the National Curriculum*. London: Hodder and Stoughton.

Leach, F. (2003). *Practising Gender Analysis in Education.* Oxford: Oxfam.

Leonardo, Z. (2003). Discourse and critique: outlines of a post-structural theory of ideology. *Journal of Education Policy, 18*(2), 203-214.

Lowe, R. (1999). Education and national identity. *History of Education, 28*(3), 231-233.

Lutz, H., A. Phoenix and N. Yuval-Davis (1995). Introduction: nationalism, racism and gender European crossfire. In H. Lutz, A. Phoenix and N. Yuval-Davis (Eds.), *Nationalism, racism and gender in Europe.* London: Pluto Press for the European Forum of Left Feminists.

Lyons, T. (2004). *Guns and guerilla girls: Women in the Zimbabwean national liberation struggle*. Africa World Press.

MacLure, M. (2003). *Discourse in Educational and Social Research.* Buckingham: Open University Press.

Malik, I.H. (1999). *Islam, Nationalism and the West: issues of identity in Pakistan.* Basingstoke: Macmillan.

Manzoor, R. (2008). Pakistani Women, Religious Extremism and Terrorism, 2015 Socialist Movement Pakistan. Retrieved from http://socialistpakistan.org/?p=398. http://socialistpakistan.org/?p=398

Markharn, I. (2001). Religion. In A. J. Motyl (ed.) *Encyclopedia of Nationalism*, (Volume 1). San Diego: Academic Press.

Mattu, A. and N. Hussain (2003) Gender biases and stereotypes in school textbooks. In A.H. Nayyar and A. Salim (Eds.), *The Subtle Subversion: the state of curricula and textbooks in Pakistan.* Islamabad: Sustainable Development Policy Institute.

Maxwell, J. A. (1996) *Qualitative Research Design: An interactive approach.* Thousand Oaks: Sage.

Mayer, T. (2000). Gender ironies of nationalism. In T. Mayer (Eds.), *Gender ironies of nationalism: Sexing the nation.* London: Routledge.

Maykut, P & Morehouse, R. (1994). *Beginning Qualitative Research: A Philosophic guide.* Falmer Press (London and Washington, D.C.)

McClintock, A. (1993). Family feuds: gender, nationalism and the family. *Feminist Review, 44,* 61-80.

McCutcheon, G. (1997). Curriculum and the work of teachers. In D. J. Flinders and S. J. Thornton (Eds.), *The Curriculum Studies Reader.* New York: Routledge.

McKernan, J. (1996). *Curriculum Action Research*. London: Kogan Page.

McKinney, C. (2005) *Representation in Textbooks for Diverse Learners: A critical analysis of learning materials used in South African Schools.* Cape Town: Human Sciences Research.

McLaren, P. (1999). *Schooling as a Ritual Performance: Toward a political economy of educational symbol and gestures.* Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield.

McLaughlin, T. H., and P. Juceviciene (1997). Education, democracy and the formation of national identity. In D. Bridges, D (Eds.), *Education, Autonomy and Democratic Citizenship.* London: Routledge.

McNav, L. (1992). *Foucault and Feminism: Power, gender and the self.* Cambridge: Blackxvell.

Meck. M. (2001). *Children's Literature and National Identity, Stroke on Trent.* Trentham Books.

Miles, M. B. and Huberman, A. M. (1984). *Qualitative Data Analysis: a source book of new methods.* Beverly Hills: Sage.

Miller, D. (1988). The ethical significance of nationality. *Ethics, 98*, 647-662.

Miller, D. (1995). *On nationality.* Oxford: Clarendon

Miller, D. (2000). *Citizenship and national identity.* Oxford: Polity Press.

Mills, S. (1995). *Feminist Stylistics.* London: Routledge.

Mills. S. (2003). *Michel Foucault.* London: Routledge.

Mirza. M. (2004). *Gender Analysis of School Curriculum and Textbooks*. Islamabad:

UNESCO.

Moghadam, V. M. (1994). Introduction and overview. In V. M. Moghadam (ed.) *Gender and identity: Women and politics in Muslim societies.* London: Zed Books.

Montgomery. K. (2006). Radicalized hegemony and nationalist mythologies: representations of war and peace in high school history textbooks, 1945-2005. *Journal of Peace Education, 3*(l): 19-37.

Morgan, D. L. and R. A. Krueger (1993). When to use focus groups and why. In D. L. Morgan (Eds.), *Successful Focus Groups: advancing the state of the art.* Newbury Park: Sage.

Morrow, R. A. & D. D. Brown (1994). *Critical Theory and Methodology*. Thousand Oakes: Sage.

Mullally, S. (2005).`As nearly as may be': debating women's human rights in Pakistan, *Social and Legal Studies, 14*(3), 341-358.

MuIIick, R. and J. Hraba (2001). Ethnic attitudes in Pakistan, International Journal of *Intercultural Relations, 25*(2),165-167.

Mumtaz, K. and F. Shaheed (1987). *Women of Pakistan: two steps forward, one step back.* London: Zed Books.

Mumtaz, K. and Y. Mitha (1996). *Pakistan: Tradition and change.* Oxford: Oxfam.

Mumtaz, S. (1999). Interpreting ethnic movements in Pakistan. *Pakistan Development Review: an international journal of developing economics, 38*(2): 207-217.

Murshid, T. M. (2001). Nations imagined and fragmented: Bengali ethnicity and the break up of Pakistan. In W. van Schendal and E. J. Zürcher (Eds.), Identity *Politics in Central Asia and the Muslim World: nationalism, ethnicity and labor in the twentieth century.* London: I. B. Tauris.

Naseem, M. A. (2006). The soldier and the seductress: a post-structuralist analysis of gendered citizenship through inclusion in and exclusion from language and social studies textbooks in Pakistan. *International Journal of Inclusive Education, 10* (4/5), 449-467.

Naseem, M. A. (2004). Gendered identity and the Educational discourse in Pakistan in P. Ninnes & S. Mehta (Eds.), *Re-imagining the discourse: Post foundational ideas for comparative education*. London: Routledge. Pp. 85-106.

Nash, C. (2000). Performativity in practice: some recent work in cultural geography, *Pi-ogress in Human Geography, 24*(4): 653-664.

Nash, M. (1989*). The Cauldron of Ethnicity in the Modern World.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Nasser, R. (2004). Exclusion and the making of Jordanian national identity: an analysis of school textbooks. *Nationalism and Ethnic Politics, 10*(2): 221-249.

National Institute of Population Studies (NIPS) [Pakistan] and ICF International. (2013). Pakistan Demographic and Health Survey 2012-13. Islamabad, Pakistan, and Calverton, Maryland, USA: NIPS and ICF International.

Nayyar, A. H. (2003a). Insensitivity to the religious diversity of the nation. In A. H. Nayyar and A. Salim (Eds.), *The Subtle Subversion: the state of curricula and textbooks in Pakistan.* Islamabad: Sustainable Development Policy Institute.

Nayyar, A. H. (2003b) Pakistan: Islamization of curricula, *South Asian Journal, 2*, 71-87.

Nayyar, A. H. and Salim, A. (2003). *The Subtle Subversion: the state of curricula and textbooks in Pakistan.* Islamabad: Sustainable Development Policy Institute.

Noddings, N. (2016). *Philosophy of Education*. Boulder, CO : Westview Press.

Norbu, D. (1992). *Culture and the Politics of Third World Nationalism*. London: Routledue.

Norval, A. J. (1996). Thinking identities: against a theory of ethnicity. In E. N. Wilmsen. and P. McAllister (Eds.), *The Politics of Difference: ethnic premises in a world of power.* Chicago: The Univcrsity of Chicago Press.

Oakes, L. (2001). *Language and National Identity: comparing France and Sweden.* Amsterdam: John Benjamins.

Oder, E. (2005). The social cohesion role of educational organizations: primary and secondary schools. *Peabody Journal of Education, 80*(4), 78-88.

Oliver, D. and D. Heater (1994). *The Foundations of Citizenship.* New York: Harvester Wheat sheaf.

Olson, D. R. (1989) On the language and authority of textbooks. In S. De Castell, A. Luke and C. Luke (Eds.), *Language Authority and Criticism: readings on the school textbook.* London: The Falmer Press.

Özkirimli, U. (2000). *Theories of Nationalism: A critical introduction.* Basingstoke: Pal grade.

Özkirimli. U (2005). *Contemporary Debates on Nationalism: A critical engagement*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Paasi, A. (2003). Region and place: regional identity in question. *Research in Human Geography, 27*(4), 475-485.

Paechter, C. (1998). *Educating the Other: gender, power and schooling.* London: The Falmer Press.

Paechter, C. (2000). *Changing School Subjects: power, gender and curriculum.* Buckingham: Open University Press.

Paechter, C. (2001). Using Poststructuralist ideas in gender theory and research. In B. Francis and C. Skelton (Eds.), *Investigating Gender contemporary, perspectives in education.* Buckingham: Open University Press.

Papanek, H. (1994). The ideal woman and the ideal society: control and autonomy in the construction of identity. In V. M. Moghadam (Eds.) *Identity' Politics and Women. – cultural reassertions and feminisms in international perspective*. Boulder: Westview Press.

Paquette, J. (1991). *Social Purpose and Schooling: alternative agendas and issues*. London: The Falmer Press.

Parekh, B. (1999). Defining national identity in a multicultural society. In Mortimer, E. (Eds.) *People. Nation and State*. London: I. B. Tauris Publishers.

Parekh, B. (2000). *Rethinking multiculturalism: Cultural diversity and political theory.* Basingstoke: Palgrave.

Parekh, B. (2003). Discourses on national identity. In B. Chakrabarty (Eds.), *Communal Identity in India: its construction and articulation in the twentieth century*. New Delhi: Oxford University Press.

Parker, A., M. Russo, D. Sommer and P. Yaegar (1992) Introduction. In A. Parker. M. Russo. D. Sommer and P. Yaegar (Eds.), *Nationalism and Sexualities.* New York: Routledge.

Parmenter, L. (1999). Constructing national identity in a changing world: perspectives in Japanese education, *British Journal of Sociology of Education, 20*(4), 453-463.

Pasternak, S., & Dafnos, T. (2018). How does a settler state secure the circuitry of capital? *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space*, *36*(4), 739-757.

Pennycook, A. (1996). Language Policy as Cultural Politics: the double-edged sword of language education in colonial Malaya and Hong Kong. *Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education*, *17*(2), 133-152.

Perera, S., M. Skully and J. Wickramanayake (2005) Human progress in South Asia: a multifaceted analysis, South Asia. *Journal of South Asian Studies, 28*(3): 437-456.

Pettman, J. J. (1996) *Worlding Women: a feminist international politics*. London: Routledge.

Pickering, M. (2001) *Stereotyping: the politics of representation*. Basingstoke: Palgrave.

Pierson, R. R. (2000) Nations: gendered, radicalized, crossed with empire. In I. Blom, K. Hagernann, and C. Hall (Eds.), *Gendered Nations: nationalisms and gender order in the long nineteenth century*. Oxford: Berg.

Pinar, W. F. (199 3) Notes on understanding curriculum as a racial text. In C. McCarthy and W. Crich low (Eds.), *Race, Identity and Representation in Education.* New York: Routledge.

Poole, R. (1999). *Nation and Identity.* London: Routledge.

Popkewitz, T. S. and L. Fendler (1999). *Critical Theories in Education: changing terrains of knowledge and politics*. New York: Routledge.

Pourzand, N. (1999). Female education and citizenship in Afghanistan: a turbulent relationship. In P. Werbner and N. Yuval-Davis (Eds.), *Women, Citizenship and Difference.* London: Zed Books.

Povinelli, E. (2011). Economies of abandonment. *Social Belonging and Endurance in Late Liberalism*. Duke University Press.

Preston, P. W. (1997). *Political/Cultural Identity: citizens and nations in a global era.* London: Sage.

Prior, L. (2003). Following in Foucault's footsteps: text and context in qualitative research. In S. N. Hesse-Biber and P. Leavy (Eds.), *Approaches to Qualitative Research: a reader on theory and practice*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Psacharopoulos, G and Patrinos, H. A. (2018). *Returns to investment in education : a decennial review of the global literature (English)*. Policy Research working paper; no. WPS 8402. Washington, D.C. : World Bank Group.

Punch. S. (2002). Research with children: the same or different from research with adults?, *Childhood. 9*(3): 321- 34 1.

Qureshi, S. (2003) *Pakistan: Education and gender policy. Girl's Education: a lifeline to development.* Budapest: SPS, Central European University.

Racioppi, L. and K. O'Sullivan. (2000). Engendering nation and national identity. In S. Radcliffe, S. and S. Westwood, *Remaking the nation: Place, identity*, MO politics

Rahman, T. (1997). The medium of instruction controversy in Pakistan, *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development, 18*(2), 145-154.

Rahman, T. (1999). *Language Teaching and Worldview in Pakistani Schools.* Islamabad: Sustainable Development Policy Institute.

Rahman, T. (2002b). Government Policies and the Politics of the teaching of Urdu in Pakistan, *The Annual of Urdu Studies, 17*, 95-124.

Rahman, T. (2002c). The language of the salariat. In S. M. Naseem and K. Nadvi (Eds.), *The Post- Colonial State and Social Transformation in India and Pakistan.* Karachi: Oxford University Press.

Rahman, T. (2004). Denizens of alien worlds: a survey of students and teachers at Pakistan's Urdu and English medium schools and madrassas, *Contemporary South Asia, 13*(3), 307-326.

Ranchod-Nilsson, S., T'etreault , M. A. (2000). Gender and nationalism: moving beyond fragmented conversations. In S. Ranchod-Nilsson and T'etreault , M. A. (Eds.), *Women, States, and Nationalism: At home in the nation?* London: Routledge.

Rashid, A. (1996). Pakistan: The politics of `fundamentalism'. In K. Rupesinghe and K. Mumtaz (Eds.), *Internal Conflicts in South Asia*. London: Sage.

Rashid, A. and F. Shaheed (1993). Pakistan: Ethno-politics and contending elites. UNRISD Discussion Paper 45. Switzerland: United Nations Research Institute for Social Development.

Rassool, N. (1998). Postmodernity, cultural pluralism and the nation-state: problem of language rights, human rights, identity and power. *Language Sciences. 20*(1): 89-99.

Rassool, N. (2000). Contested and contesting identities: conceptualizing linguistic minority rights within the global cultural economy*, Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development, 21*(5):386-398.

Rassool, N. (2004). Exploring the construction of social class in the educational discourse: the rational order of the nation state versus global uncertainties, *Pedagogy, Culture and Society, 12*(1): 121-139.

Rassool, N. and S. Mansoor (2007). Contemporary issues in language, education and development in Pakistan. In N. Rassool, *Global Issues in Language, Education and Development: Perspectives, from Postcolonial Countries*. Clevedon: Multilingual Matters Ltd.

Reicher, S. and N. Hopkins (2001). *Self and Nation*. London: Sage.

Riaz, A. (2002). *Nations, nation-state and the politics of Muslim identity in South Asia. Comparative Studies of South Asia, Africa and the Middle East.*

Richardson, L. (2003). Writing: a method of inquiry. In N. K. Denzin and Y. S. Lincoln (2003) *Collecting and Interpreting Qualitative Materials*. Thousand Oakes: Sage.

Rihani, M. A. (2006). Keeping the Promise: Five Benefits of Girls' Secondary Education. *Academy for Educational Development*

Rizvi, H. A. (2003) South Asia as seen by Pakistan, *South Asian Journal, 1*(5), 5-63.

Rizvi, M. and B. Elliot (2007). Enhancing and sustaining teacher professionalism in Pakistan. Teachers and Teaching: *Theory and practice, 13*(1): 5-9.

Ross, A. (2000). *Curriculum Construction and Critique.* London: Falmer Press.

Rosser, Y. C. (2003). Curriculum as Destiny: forging national identity in India, Pakistan, and Bangladesh. PhD Thesis, The University of Texas.

Rouse. S. (1992). Discourses on bender in Pakistan: convergence and contradiction. In D. Allen (Eds.), *Religion and Political Conflict in South Asia: India, Pakistan and Sri Lanka*.Westport: Greenwood Press.

Rouse, S. (1998). The outsider(s) withIn sovereignty and citizenship in Pakistan. In P. Jeffery and A. Basu (Eds.), *Appropriating Gender: women's activism and politicized religion in South Asia*. New York: Routledge.

Said, E. (1995). *Orientalism*. London: Penguin Books.

Saigol, R. (1995). *Knowledge and identity: articulation of gender in educational discourse in Pakistan.* Lahore: ASR Publications.

Saigol, R. (2002a). His rights /her duties: citizen and mother in the civic discourse. *Human Rights Education in Asian Schools, 5*, 129-156.

Saigol, R. (2002b). The Partitions of Self Mohajir women's sense of identity and nationhood. Working Paper Series number 77. Islamabad: Sustainable Development Policy Institute: Islamabad.

Saigol, R. (2004). Curriculum in India and Pakistan. *South Asian Journal. 6*, 105-132.

Saigol, R. (2005) Enemies within and enemies without: the besieged self in Pakistani textbooks. *Futures, 37*, 1005-1035.

Saigol, R. (undated). *Militarization, Nation and Gender: Women's Bodies as Arenas of violent Conflict.*

Salim, A. (2003). Historical falsehoods and inaccuracies. In A. H. Nayyar and A. Salim (Eds.), *The Subtle Subversion: the state of curricula and textbooks in Pakistan.* Islamabad: Sustainable Development Policy Institute.

Sathananthan, S. (2000.) Sindhi nationalism and Islamic revolution in Pakistan, *International Studies: Journal of the School of International Studies, 37*(3): 227-242.

Schostak, J. F. (2002). *Understanding. Designing and Conducting Qualitative Research in Education: framing the project*. Buckingham: Open University Press.

Scott, J. (1990). *A matter of record, documentary sources in social research.* Cambridge: Polity Press.

Seale, C. (2002). Qualitative issues in qualitative inquiry. *Qualitative Social work, 1*(1): 97-110.

Seale, C. (2004). Validity, reliability and the quality of research. In C. Seale (Eds.) *Researching Society and Culture.* London: Sage.

Shah, A. (2003). Pakistan's armored democracy, *Journal of Democracy*, *14(*4): 26-40.

Shaheed, F. (1998) The other side of the discourse: women's experience of identity, religion, and activism in Pakistan. In P. Jeffery and A. Basu (Eds.), *Appropriating gender: Women's activism and politicised religion in South Asia*. New York: Routledge.

Shaheed, F. (2002a). Women's experience of identity, religion and activism in Pakistan. In S. M. Naseem and K. Nadvi (Eds.), *The Post-Colonial State and Social Transformation in India and Pakistan.* Karachi: Oxford University Press.

Shaheed, F. (2002b). *Imagined citizenship: Women, state and politics in Pakistan.* Lahore: Shirkat Gah Women's Resource Centre.

Shibata, M. (2004). Controlling national identity and reshaping the role of education: the vision of state formation in Meiji Japan and the German Kaiserreich, *History of Education. 33*(1): 75-85.

Shimony, T. T. (2005). Gender socialization in national education and the formation of a new state: Israel as a case study, *History of Education, 34*(6): 639-656.

Silverman, D. (2001). *Interpreting Qualitative Data: Methods for ancali-sing talk, text and interaction.* London: Sage.

Silverman, D. (2003). Analyzing talk and text. In N. K. Denzin and Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), *Collecting and Interpreting Qualitative Materials*. Thousand Oakes: Sage.

Silverman, D. (2005). Doing Qualitative Research: a practical guide. London Sage. Sim, J. (1998) Collecting and analyzing qualitative data: issues raised by the focus group, *Journal of Advanced Nursing, 28*, 345-52.

Sleeter, C. E. and C. A. Grant (1997). Race, class, gender and disability in current textbooks. In D. J.Flinders and S. J. Thornton (Eds.), *The Curriculum Studies Reader.* Nexv York: Routledge.

Smith, A. and T. Vaux (2003). *Education, Conflict and International Development.* London: DFID.

Smith, A. D. (1991a). *National Identity*. London: Penguin.

Smith, A. D. (1991b) The nation: Invented, imagined, reconstructed? Millennium. *Journal of International studies, 20*(3), 33-53-368.

Smith, A. D. (1997). Structure and persistence of ethnic. In M. Guibernau and J. Rex (Eds.), *The Ethnicity Reader.* Cambridge: Polity Press.

Smith, A. D. (1998) *Nationalism and Modernism: a critical survey of recent theories of nations and nationalism*. London: Routledge.

Smith, A. D. (2000) The `sacred' dimension of nationalism, Millennium. *Journal of International Studies, 29*(3), 791-814.

Smith, A. D. (2001) Will and sacrifice: Images of national identity. Millennium. *Journal of International Studies, 30*(3): 571-582.

Smith, L. S. (1990) Ethics in qualitative field research: an individual perspective. In E. W. Eisner and A. Peshkin (Eds.), *Qualitative Inquiry in Education.* New York: Teacher College Press.

Spain, D. (1992) *Gendered Spaces*. Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina.

Spohn, W. (2003) Multiple modernity, nationalism and religion: a global perspective, *Current Sociology, 51*(3/4), 267-286.

Stapleton, K. and J. Wilson (2004). Gender, nationality and identity: a discursive study. *European Journal of Women Studies, 2*(1): 45-60.

Stephen, L. (2001). Gender, citizenship and the politics of identity. *Latin American Perspectives, 28*(6), 54-69.

Stern, R. W. (2001). *Democracy and Dictatorship in South Asia: dominant classes and political outcomes in India, Pakistan, and Bangladesh.* New Delhi: India Research Press.

Stray, C. (1994) Paradigms regained: towards a historical sociology of the textbook, *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, *26*(1): 1-29.

Strornquist. N. (1995) Romancing the state: gender and power in education, *Comparative Education Review, 39*(4): 423-54.

Sumara, D. J. and B. Davis (1998). Unskinning curriculum. In W. F. Pinar (ed.) *Curriculum*

toward new identities. New, York : Garland.

Sutherland, C. (2005). Nation-building through discourse theory, Nations and *Nationalism,* 1(2): 185-202.

Taylor, S. J. and R. Bogdan (1998). *Introduction to Qualitative Research Methods: a guidebook and resource.* New York: John Willey and Sons.

Telesetsky, A. (1998). In the shadows and behind the veil: Women in Afghanistan under the Taliban rule. *Berkeley Women's L.J. 13,* 293-305.

The Economist Intelligence Unit (2002). Country Profile: Pakistan and Afghanistan. London: Economist Group.

Thompson, A. (2001). Nations, national identities and human agency: putting people back into nations, The Sociological Review, 49(1): 8-32.

Thompson, J. B. (1990). Ideology and Modern Culture: critical social theory a, uJ the c'ra of mass communication. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Tormey, R. (2006). The construction of national identity through primary school history: the Irish case, British Journal of Sociology of Education, 27(3): 311-324.

Tripp, A. M. (2012). *Women and politics in Uganda*. University of Wisconsin Press.

UNESCO (2005) EFA Global Monitoring Report 2006. Education for all: literacy for life. Paris: UNESCO.

Ur-Rehman, K. (2007) Pakistan's Foreign Policy: a case of cognitive dissonance dynamics. Unpublished PhD Thesis, Shaheed Zulfikar Ali Bhutto Institute of Science & Technology, Karachi.

Wade, R. C. (1993). Content analysis of social studies textbooks: A review of ten years research. *Theory and Research in Social Education, 21(3), 232–256.*

Walby, S. (1996) Woman and nation. In G. Balakrishnan (Eds.) *Mapping the Nation*. London:Verso.

Walby, S, (2000). Gender, nations and states in a global era, *Nations and Nationalism, 6*(4): 52-3- 540.

Walkerdine, V. (1986) Post-structuralist theory and everyday social practices: the family and the school. In S. Wilkinson (Eds.) *Feminist Social Psychology: developing theory.' and practice.* Milton Keynes: Open University Press.

Walsh, D. (1998). Doing ethnography. In C. Seale (ed.) *Researching Society and Culture.*

Waseem, M. (2000). Ethnic and religious nationalism in Pakistan, Journal of South *Asian and Middle Eastern studies, 23*(2): 37-62.

Weedon, C. (1997) *Feminist Practice and Poststructuralist Theory.* Oxford: Blackwell.

Weiner, G. (199 3) The Gendered Curriculum - Producing the Text: developing a poststructural feminist analysis. Paper presented at the Annual Conference of the Australian Association for Research in Education. December 1993. Perth, Australia.

Weiner, G. (1994). *Feminisms in Education: An introduction*. Buckingham: Open University Press.

Werbner, P. and N. Yuval-Davis (1999). Introduction: women and the new discourse of citizenship. In N. Yuval-Davis and P. Werner (Eds.), *Women, Citizenship and Difference.* London: Zed Books.

Williams, L. (1999) National identity and the nation state: construction, reconstruction and contradiction. In K. Cameron (Eds.) *National Identity*. Exeter: Intellect Books.

Wirsing, R. G. (1981). *The Baluchis and the Pathans*. London: Minority Rights Group.

Woeber, C. A. (2000). 'A good education sets up a divine discontent': The Contribution of St Peter's School to Black South African Autobiography (Doctoral dissertation).

Woodward, K. (1997). *Concepts of identity and difference. In K. Woodard (ed.) Identity and Difference.* London: Sage Publications.

Yates, P. (2000) Legitimating the moral curriculum. In R. Gardner. J. Cairns. D. Lawton (Eds.), *Education for Values: morals, ethics and citizenship in contemporary teaching*. London: Kogan Page.

Yuval-Davis, N. (1994). Women, ethnicity and empowerment. In K-K Bhavani and A. Phoenix (Eds.), *Shifting Identities Shifting Racism: a feminism and psychology reader.* London: Sage.

Yuval-Davis, N. (1997). *Gender and Nation*. London: Sage.

Yuval-Davis. N. (1998). Gender and nation. In R. Wilford and R. L. Miller (Eds.), *Women, Ethnicity and Nationalism: the politics of transition*. London: Routledge.

Zakaria, R., (2012). A Pakistani Modernity. *Journal of the Pakistan Historical Society*.