CHALLENGING MASCULINITIES: THE ROLE OF GENDER IN *OS LUSÍADAS* BY LUÍS VAZ DE CAMÕES.

By

Denise Saive

A dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment of

the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

(Portuguese)

at the

University of Wisconsin-Madison

2013

Date of final oral examination: 08/23/13

The Dissertation is approved by the following members of the Final Oral Committee:

Ellen Sapega, Professor, Portuguese

David Hildner, Professor, Spanish

Luís Madureira, Professor, Portuguese

Severino Albuquerque, Professor, Portuguese

Jolanda Vanderwal Taylor, Professor, Dutch

Paulo de Medeiros, Professor, Portuguese

© Copyright by Denise Saive 2013 All Rights Reserved Veur mien awwers

/

To my parents

Abstract

CHALLENGING MASCULINITIES: THE ROLE OF GENDER IN *Os Lusíadas* by Luís Vaz de Camões

Denise Saive

Under the supervision of Professor Ellen W. Sapega

At the University of Wisconsin-Madison

This dissertation explores how representations of gender in *Os Lusiadas* are paramount to understanding the poem, as they express contemporary concerns about the Portuguese nation and its empire. Masculinity and femininity play a crucial role, both at the historical and the mythological level in the definition of Portuguese identity during a time of crisis. Reading with an eye for gender showcases the many ambivalences in the poem and identifies those instances in which the dominant discourse about the nation and the empire is under stress, due to anxieties about the changes taking place in the Portuguese patriarchy. I consider particularly the representations of gender that emerge from the text and question heroic masculinity. Moreover, there are several "others" that are significant, such as women, non-Western men and mythological figures, who challenge, subvert and question Portuguese masculinity.

Through a close reading of the epic poem I demonstrate how the poet's adaptation of Classical mythology and its fusion with history reveals the anxieties and ambiguities of the imperial context. I argue that women and mythological figures allegorize issues such as sexuality and marriage and communicate an important message to D. Sebastião, the dedicatee of the poem, who fails in his role as a father to the nation, and by extension, corrupts his masculinity. Moreover, Camões expresses his anxiety about the continuation of Portuguese heroic glory (*kleos*) and reveals that masculinity is threatened by the crumbling empire.

Acknowledgements

The process of writing a thesis has often been compared to undertaking a voyage, in which the process of reaching the destination is a learning experience and leads towards many side trails. My personal experience with this thesis was also an "epic" undertaking, as I moved from Madison to New York, and then to The Netherlands, always bringing along my beloved books and a worn out copy of *Os Lusíadas*.

Countless libraries, desks and offices, café's or archives, in the US and in Europe, provided a space on the go to jot down ideas and slowly give light to this thesis. Many people also helped me in innumerous ways. I am grateful to the librarians at the Biblioteca Nacional, the New York Public Library, the University of Utrecht Library and the Public Library of Eindhoven, who lended a helping hand to obtain various bibliographical references. Several fellow academics shared their views with me at conferences or during inspiring conversations, even if their field of expertise was very different from my own. During the last stretch of thesis writing, the colleagues of the TU/e's Department of Mathematics provided a welcome encouragement.

I am particularly grateful for the Tinker Nave Field Research grant I received from the Department of Latin-American, Caribbean and Iberian Studies at the University of Wisconsin-Madison, that allowed me to do the preliminary research for this thesis at the Biblioteca Nacional of Lisbon during the Summer of 2008. Thanks to the help of Isabel Almeida, Manuel Ferro and João Figueiredo, this became a very inspiring research trip that made me very enthused about studying gender in Camões. At the Department of Spanish and Portuguese at the University of Wisconsin-Madison, I would like to thank my fellow graduate students. A special thanks goes to Jared Hendrickson, for helping printing this thesis from a distance. Our graduate coordinator Lucy Ghastin has been a great help providing all necessary information and figuring out the rules concerning a "traveling" case like me.

I would like to thank my committee members since without their help and guidance this project would have been impossible to realize. Paulo de Medeiros, who ignited this big adventure to the United States, you are a great academic example and friend. Severino Albuquerque, who was a warm Brazilian welcome since my arrival in Madison and an excellent professor of language. Jolanda Vanderwal Taylor, with whom I had many pleasant conversations - those Dutch "Senseo" moments we shared were always very uplifting during the long and cold Madison winters. Luís Madureira, whose intelligence intensified my curiosity in undertaking "imperium studies," and whose office door was always open whenever I needed. David Hildner, a fellow "fã de Camões," provided an essential and critical reading of my thesis. Finally, my thesis director Ellen Sapega has taught me very much. You were extremely helpful, particularly by adapting to my situation - it must not have been always easy to advise someone across the ocean. But thanks to Skype, scanners and visits to Portugal you managed to guide me in an excellent way. Muito obrigada!

Without my friends and family who followed me, my undertaking would have been very solitary. A special thanks to Ana Raquel Fernandes, Laura Balzano and Maria Tavares who shared with me their views about women and academia and of course their friendship. My Portuguese family has always been a safe haven and provided me with a

v

home in Portugal. I am particularly grateful to Maria Dinora, who always took care of me during my Camões adventure. My American "family," Ana and Duncan, made my defense trip a wonderful experience.

Wherever I am, I'll always long to go homeward-bound because of my loving family. My brother Michel, and Agnieszka, you are forever friends. My parents always supported me and gave loving advice – I dedicate this thesis to you. Rui, you are my soul mate that understands me like no other and are my rock in any type of sea. Joaquim, you grew along with this thesis and not only made me a mother but also a better person and researcher. I hope we will embark on many more adventures together.

Abstract	ii
Acknowledgements	iv
Introduction Gender theory and Camonian criticism	1 11
Chapter One: White Mythologies and Figures of Darkness. Mythology in the Encounter between Portugal, the South, and the East. Introduction	18 18
Black and White Mythologies. Mythology in the History of the Encounter. Adamastor and the Dangers of Love. Bacchus and the Glory of Paternity. Conclusion	24 35 44 53
 Chapter Two: Significant Others. Female Figures in Os Lusiadas. Introduction Women of History: Objects of Sacrifice and Subjects of Patriarchy. Mythological Figures, Erotic Distractions or Subversive Powers? Conclusion 	56 56 61 81 91
 Chapter 3. "Transforma-se o Amador na cousa amada." Dynamics of Gender on the Isle of Love. Introduction Sexual and Textual Violence; Heralds of Dominion or Gender-Bending? "E fareis claro o Rei, que tanto amais." The Allegorized Rhetoric of Canto IX. Conclusion 	93 93 104 124 137
 Chapter Four: Between "heróis do mar" and "um bicho da terra tão pequeno." Masculinities and the Concept of <i>Kleos</i> in <i>Os Lusíadas</i>. Introduction "Quem não sabe arte, não na estima." Camões's Musings on the Heroic Ideal. Dying to be Men. <i>Kleos</i> and the Construction of Masculinity. Conclusion 	140 140 148 163 177
Conclusion Bibliography	180 185

Introduction

"Sem a loucura que é o homem / Mais que a besta sadia, / Cadáver adiado que procria?"

Mensagem Fernando Pessoa

This dissertation identifies the representation of gender in the Portuguese epic poem Os Lusíadas (1572) by Luís Vaz de Camões. I focus on how non-Western Others, who are often considered marginal and effeminate, women, and mythological figures challenge and subvert the hegemonic Portuguese male explorers, to examine how masculinity and femininity are represented. The mythological parts of the poem are not solely a Classical inheritance but rather tropes that allow Camões to explore topics that relate to gender and sexuality, and that may diverge from the imperial discourse that is present in the poem as well. This dissertation also considers the role of the hero and how *kleos*, the heroic glory assigned by the poet and won by heroes through death, is essential to the Portuguese imperial project, even if *kleos* at times points to rot and decay. The theme of paternity is closely linked to masculinity and the empire, and although Portuguese paternity proves empty at times, the poet anxiously calls on D. Sebastião, the young king of Portugal and dedicatee of the poem, to be a father, both literally, and to the nation as well, by creating a royal heir. Therefore, reading the epic through a lens that considers gender may reveal how important changing conceptions of masculinity and femininity were in the shaping of Portuguese national identity.

The idea for the subject of this thesis emerged during a research trip to the National Library in Lisbon, Portugal funded by a Tinker Nave Short Term Field Research Grant from the UW-Madison Latin American, Caribbean and Iberian Studies Program (LACIS). In the summer of 2008, I had the privilege to consult a considerable amount of scholarship on Camões. When I notified the library clerk about my interest in critical work written on Camões's *Os Lusíadas*, special authorization needed to be requested, as all these works were housed in the *Sala dos Reservados*. This room holds rare historical records and manuscripts that are not easily accessible to the public. The fact that the works on Camões are so closeted perhaps reflects the sparse interest in the Renaissance poet. Yet, for the Portuguese people the epic is similar to a sacred text, as João de Barros (2012) remarks:

> costume dizer-se que *Os Lusíadas* são a Bíblia da Pátria, ou, menos retoricamente, o livro nacional por excelência. De facto. Mas essa Bíblia, esse livro intrinsecamente nacional, só tomam contacto com ele — quando o tomam... — os alunos dos liceus, a partir do meio do seu curso, e os adultos. (7)

As Barros acknowledges, the text may be famous but is perhaps not that well "known." Moreover, the criticism it has generated frequently reveals more about the time period of the critic than about the poem itself.

The Renaissance poem *Os Lusíadas* consists of ten cantos, with a variable number of stanzas, written in the decasyllabic *ottava rima*. The epic narrates the history of Portugal; there is a genealogy of the Portuguese kings and queens, mixed with the

narration of Vasco da Gama's route to the East (1497-1498). Besides the historical level of the poem, a mythological level narrates how the gods of Olympus, and some other mythological creations, accompany Gama and his men, and either help or block them. The historical storyline opens in *medias res* when Vasco da Gama and his men find themselves at Mozambique isle, half way on their voyage. The first two cantos describe the encounter with Africa and at Melindi the local king requests a discourse on Portugal and its history. Six episodes and two prophecies take place within this long speech. Canto VI describes the departure at Melindi and the continuation of the voyage to India. Halfway through, a storm is incited by Neptune to hinder the Portuguese, however Venus comes to their aid by calming down the winds. Canto VII and VIII describe the events in India where the Portuguese encounter Monçaide, a friendly Moor that speaks Castilian, and the Zamorin, leader of Calicut. Then Paulo da Gama explains the symbols on the various flags to the Catual, incorporating again parts of Portuguese history. Canto IX describes the return of the armada to Portugal but they are first received at the Isle of Love, an isle prepared by the mythological figure Venus, where an erotic encounter takes place between the Portuguese and nymphs. The canto ends with the historical line that explains the allegorical meaning of the Isle and the poetic voice makes exclamations about those who dream of immortality. Canto X opens at Tethys's palace, who gives the final prophecy describing the future events of the Portuguese helped by the Maquina do *Mundo*; a miniature universe. Finally, the Portuguese return home and the canto ends with a didactic speech directed to young king Sebastião.

Os Luíadas is an epic of both glorification and regret that has several ambiguous passages. The passages in which the poet addresses his didactic rhetoric to dedicatee

King Sebastião are significant and illustrate much about the time period of Camões. Moreover, it is important to note that *Os Lusíadas* was written *post factum*, about 50 years after the Portuguese discovered the sea route to India. Camões was born around 1524 and grew up in a society that had changed significantly due to this historic event. However, during his lifetime, the overseas empire was threatened by both internal and external factors. This unique situation gives the poet hindsight, which often appears in the epic.

The second half of the sixteenth century was a turbulent period, and there were in particular three factors that affected Camões' writings. First, the Portuguese empire that once had been impressive and famous was rapidly declining. Subrahmanyam describes the years 1530-1550 as the "midcentury crisis" where the "personal power and private trade" of certain men in the Estado da Índia had increasingly destabilizing effects (103). According to Subrahmanyam, the private gain of some Portuguese also affected the trade with local rulers and these tensions led in the 1550s to a "major debate among the administrators in Portuguese Asia, on the manner in which commercial affairs and general administration are to be conducted" (104). These were years in which the empire disintegrated slowly but steadily. Newitt states that this period "saw the dismantling of the royal monopolies and the centralised bureaucratic state and its replacement by a new decentralised, privatised empire with the fortress captains enjoying a high degree of independence and the royal monopolies being sold off to private consortia" (253). During the same period, "unofficial Portuguese settlements" grew fast, as did the endeavors of missionaries. The growing corruption and dispersion threatened the Portuguese empire from the inside, while at the external level there was a growing influence from Spain

within the Portuguese court, and both the French and the Dutch intensified their imperial efforts. Despite his personal experience with the corrupt state of the empire, Camões nonetheless hoped for a revival of imperial glory. Hence, the poet dedicated his poem to D. Sebastião and urged the king to lead Portugal on an imperial mission against the Saracens, even when he feared that the Portuguese empire was already in irrevocable decay.

At the domestic level, politics changed during the reign of João III, son of D. Manuel who had given command to Gama's enterprise. D. João was very religious and quite conservative, although his policy in the first 10 years of his reign still reflected his father's humanist ideals. Later, one could detect "a growing subordination of the Portuguese court to currents from Hapsburg Spain" (Subrahmanyam 90). D. João's children died young and his grandson inherited the throne in 1557. Sebastião grew up in an environment "of hysterical religious fervor accompanied by an anachronistic revival of chivalrous ideals" (Macedo 1983, 4). Slowly, the open-minded Renaissance society was closing itself off from any differences or novelties.

A third societal factor that troubled Camões and added to the contradictory nature of the epic was the establishment of the Inquisition in Portugal. Officially installed in the early 1540s, it only took a few decades for the ideas of the Conter Reformation to take hold, both in Portugal and in its overseas territories, which meant an "astonishingly rapid reversal" of the Renaissance humanism that prevailed at the beginning of the century (Subrahmanyam 90). Francisco Bethencourt aptly defines the Inquisition as "an ecclesiastical power that largely shaped religious debate, reasserted Catholic doctrine, structured relations between Church and state, diffused a value system and defined boundaries of behaviour (and thought) among the population" (2). Bethencourt further emphasizes "its disruptive effects at all levels of society" (1), which confirms that Camões was likely affected by the Inquisition to some extent. There are several instances in the poem, especially in the ninth canto, where the poet conceals a critical message about national politics with the help of allegory and myth.¹

I briefly mention these three factors here, as they sketch a picture of a midsixteenth century Portuguese society that was in crisis and decline, but also increasingly under the pressure of a religious yoke. I believe that it is important to keep the historical context of the poem in mind, especially since the poet's hindsight is often revealed throughout the poem. The particular historical and cultural circumstances may allow us to understand the epic better, since the poet is always a product of his time.

Os Lusíadas has been popular since its publication in 1572. Its first commentator was Manuel de Faria e Sousa (1639), after which many critics followed, and the poem is internationally recognized. By the eighteenth century Camões became a critical favorite in France and England; he was praised by both Voltaire and Montesquieu and was admired by European Romantic poets. The nineteenth century meant a revival of Camões in Portugal, Romantic writers such as Almeida Garrett and Oliveira Martins propagated the poet's life and work, which resulted in the dedication of his first and most famous statue in Lisbon's *Bairro Alto*. Three hundred years after his death, Camões had become a national symbol as the tricentennial coincided with the political crisis that led to Portugal's transformation from monarchy to republic. During the twentieth century the

¹ I believe that more research is needed to understand the influence of the Inquisition on Portuguese writers and self-censorship. Interesting in this respect is the concept of Crypto Judaism and Bento Teixeira's *Prosopopeia*, which was inspired by *Os Lusíadas*.

idea of the national epic carried on and Os Lusíadas came to serve the nationalist propaganda of the Estado Novo. The Salazar regime often linked the epic to arguably racist, misogynist or chauvinist ways of thinking, and boundlessly emphasized its imperial content, while certain critical passages of the poem were hardly acknowledged. After the democratic revolution of 1974, the popularity of Os Lusíadas decreased because the poem was inevitably linked to the regime. Fortunately, since the 1990s there has been renewed interest in the poem, particularly by scholars who apply post-colonial and postimperial theories. Two key publications in this regard are *Moorings* (2009) by Josiah Blackmore and the edition "Post-imperial Camões" of the Portuguese Literary and Cultural Studies journal (2002). Moorings explores the "Portuguese textual fashioning of Africa and its people" and uses Os Lusíadas as a key text for analysis. Blackmore sees Os *Lusíadas* as foundational to Western imperial discourse and states that "[t]he focus in *Moorings* on the early documents of expansion reflects the fact that the is still much to be done in considering how empire functioned discursively in its initial years" (xxii). The critic refers to Barbara Fuchs's suggestion to "designate the contemporary analysis of early-modern empire and its textual productions" as "imperium studies" (xxii).² The Camões issue of Portuguese Literary and Cultural Studies follows that same course and gathers a selection of the papers from a conference held at the University of Massachusetts-Dartmouth in 2002. Its title "post-imperial" is to be "read broadly," as Figueiredo suggests in the introduction, as contributors "engage in a reflection about the

² Fuchs observes: "When discussing early modern imperialism, the temptation is to turn to postcolonial criticism, yet it clearly behooves critics working on earlier periods both to develop theoretical concepts better suited to our field, and to historicize postcolonial concepts in order to expose the early modern foundations of later imperialist representations" (71).

role of Camões's poetry after the demise of the empire," and "do not care about the burden of the empire in Camões scholarship, or simply that the poet belongs to whoever wants to make him his or her own property" (Figueiredo xiv).

This thesis not only extends some of these recent approaches, but also formalizes the use of gender as a category to examine the poem, since analyses of the representation of gender and sexuality are still underrepresented in the critical field of Camonian studies. By looking at how masculinity and femininity are represented in the poem and in what way these representations reflect the tensions of Camões's time period, I provide an original contribution to the field of Camonian studies. The central argument for my thesis is that gender, i.e. the social roles of men and women and how they interrelate, is a useful category to analyze Os Lusíadas. Camões wrote an epic replete with significant references to gender that are worth exploring. The study of the representations of gender in Os Lusíadas can help clarify the complex time period of Camões and give new insights about the Portuguese empire in the second half of the 16th century and the important societal, political, economic, and social changes that took place during that time. During that turbulent epoch, power relations were shifting and the need for a strong hand of the Portuguese (male) rulers increased. In order to represent Portuguese masculinity in a positive way, femininity and non-European masculinity are often disparaged. However, the representation of these marginalized identities may also reflect the anxiety present in Portuguese masculinity. Patriarchy and anxiety are inevitably linked as Breitenberg suggests, since patriarchy means that men become "individuals whose identities are formed by the assumption of their own privilege" and therefore "must also have

8

incorporated varying degrees of anxiety about the potential loss of that privilege" (3).³ Camões expresses his worry about a loss of glory, and an analogy may be drawn between (the fear of) effeminacy and the failing empire (Milligan, Tylus 24).

The first chapter combines gender and post-colonial theory to analyze several (non-Western) Others who challenge the supremacy of the Portuguese during their encounter with the South and the East. I study the interactions between the Portuguese mariners and non-Europeans as well as the postcolonial identity of mythological figures Adamastor and Bacchus to demonstrate that the divide between the Portuguese "self" and the non-Western or mythological "other" is not as wide as the poet seems to initially establish.

The second chapter moves then from non-European males to women, another group of "significant" others who challenge Portuguese masculinity. Critics have never included all female characters of the poem in their analyses, however, and I attempt to bring these women out of the shadows. I believe this is not only important from a feminist point of view but also think that these figures can reveal much about attitudes towards women during Camões's time. The female presence in the poem questions masculinity and demonstrates how love is linked with the concept of the nation. As such, the women become tools to warn D. Sebastião about his duties as king; the poet urges that the young king should marry to ensure a future heir.

Camões's rhetorical language, directed to his dedicatee Sebastião to ensure he realizes his duties, becomes even more significant in the third chapter that focuses on the

³ Breitenberg further stresses that masculine anxiety should be read "as a signifier of cultural tensions and contradictions, but also as an enabling condition of male subjectivity in early modern patriarchal culture" (3).

ninth canto in which representations of sexuality on the Isle of Love are a central theme. Because of its controversial content this canto is better "known" but was also often censured. The description of a pornotropic isle where nymphs and mariners have a feast reveals that the time period of Camões was quite misogynist. However, when reading between the lines, it is through these sexualized descriptions that masculine insecurity becomes clear. Love and desire can weaken the male and threaten his masculinity, yet, without love, men may be seen as effeminate. Moreover, my reading of the Isle of Love episode shows that, through the use of allegory, Camões criticizes the actions of D. Sebastião. His excessive love of hunting instead of hunting for a spouse places Portuguese independence in great peril.

The final chapter draws on the findings of the previous chapters, showing that masculinity is not necessarily superior. On the contrary, it is under constant influence of "others" since men depend on "inferior" identities to establish their patriarchal power. Masculinity also depends on (historical) representation, which may alter masculinity as it is constructed through the words of an author. Therefore, the chapter links the concept of the hero with that of masculinity and *kleos* and examines the representation of the epic heroes. Camões subtly criticizes the political situation of Portugal and its "empire" by representing the historical heroes such as Vasco da Gama in an ambiguous way and by furthering an anxious image of Portuguese masculinity. The nearly overdone emphasis on heroic behavior in the tenth canto, which provides an overview of the Portuguese expansion in the East, actually demonstrates a fear of losing control. Moreover, the masculinity that is shown is in decay, as generations of men are dying whilst trying to defend the empire.

Gender theory and Camonian criticism

Os Lusíadas is a complex poem imbued with various contradictions that have engaged critics since its publication. Two key disagreements about the poem's equivocal content are about its representation of imperialism and its treatment of mythology. About the latter, Thomas Greene asserts that the intertwining of pagan Gods with a Christian poem is a "cosmic confusion" (225). Scholars often debate how the mythological storyline and the allegorical content of the poem should be interpreted. White insists that we should "accept Camões's gods and goddesses as entertaining fictions" (xvi). This is similar to Aguiar e Silva's stance as he develops a symbolic reading of the ninth canto and traces its Classical elements (1972). Klobucka has rightly stated that "to opt for an exclusively allegorical reading of the episode, while at the same time rejecting the entire dimension of external reference as not only irrelevant but in fact deleterious to the task of interpretation" (127) makes a meaningful reading of the episode very difficult, if not impossible. Oliveira e Silva demonstrates how the poet employs a chivalric and nationalistic theme "as a kind of leitmotiv, in order to move the monarch in other, more humanistic directions, with the help, of course, of the arts of rhetoric and allegory" (744). I agree with Klobucka and Oliveira e Silva and believe that the allegory in the poem has a certain purpose. It is important to remember that rhetoric was an important aspect of Renaissance literature; authors did not write necessarily to entertain their audience but also wanted to teach them something. Consequently, I read the allegoric and mythological content of the poem as highly relevant, as it may indicate important points

of view of the poet. Often, it seems that Classical mythology is inserted when the main imperial discourse of the poem is challenged by (non-Western) Others, and allegory is introduced whenever the poet's voice is critical of the course of the nation. The Inquisition, additionally, may have contributed to the confused cosmos of the poem. The fact that *Os Lusíadas* passed the Inquisitorial Board, authorizing the poet to publish his work for 10 years, does not rule out the likelihood that Camões self-censored his work.⁴ Moreover, gender and sexuality, which were taboo subjects at the time, play a paramount role in the mythological storyline.

Second, critics have argued whether the poem is to be considered imperialist or rather critical of the empire. Nicholas Meihuizen, a South African scholar, aptly calls Camões an "ambiguous imperialist" (2002). Given the fact that most critics interpret the text in light of their own experiences, no clear answer can be given in this ongoing debate. For instance, José Madeira reads *Os Lusíadas* as an anti-epic and claims that Camões combats the Empire and expansionism, while Anthony Soares argues that the poem contains a "discursive violence that destroys the identities of native peoples [and] paves the way for the physical violence that will create the space—both ideological and physical—for Portugal's imperial identity" (84). While both views have their merits and pitfalls, I concur with Josiah Blackmore, who importantly notes that it is not possible to read *Os Lusíadas* "as an 'epic' text in the univocal mold, [nor] is it possible to read the text as a wholesale condemnation of [empire]" (26).

⁴ As a matter of fact, Maria Letícia Dionísio, claims that "[e]mbora as quarto primeiras edições de *Os Lusíadas* tivessem saído mutiladas, Camões conseguiu obter a permissão de impressão da obra por dez anos" (17).

I think it is key to remember that the national poem was and is often (ab)used by scholars or politicians who emphasize those aspects of the poem that suit their ideological, moral, or ethical agenda. I believe that *Os Lusíadas* consists of many layers and has plenty of contradictions and ambiguities and, throughout this dissertation, I use Susan Wofford's idea that: "Classical and Renaissance epic poems often work against their expressed moral and political values, generating a poetics of division and disruption" (1). Therefore, the epic should be seen as "an institution that can express and define an entire cultural system while also revealing its contradictions and the costs of its ethical paradigms and political solutions" (Wofford 2). The scholar furthermore argues that, "the historical pressures on a text are often best seen as a dialectic in which ideology shapes poetic process while poetry counters, resists, figures, or generates the tropes of ideology itself" (3). I believe that representations of gender may also reveal how the ideological and imperial discourse is under stress, and are therefore of paramount importance.

Besides gender metaphors, which can be detected in *Os Lusíadas* and that support the standard patriarchal imperial ideology, representations of gender can also indicate a subversion of this ideological system. Louis Montrose notes that viewing "gender representations historically - in terms of a multivalent ideological process that perpetually generates, constrains, and contests cultural meanings and values" may reveal "beneath the apparent stability and consistency of collective structures, myriad local and individual sites of social reproduction, variation, and change"(1). I agree and believe that Camões's representation of the historical route of Gama showcases a "gendering of the New World as feminine and the sexualizing of its exploration" (2). Consequently, the gendered discourse seems powerful at first; however, there are several moments that manage to disturb this apparent hegemony and subvert its ideological discourse. This thesis pays attention to those moments and exposes the representations of gender in the poem that make clear how the ideological discourse becomes undermined.

Very few of the many studies on Os Lusíadas have focused on gender representations. Exceptions can be found in articles by Anna Klobucka ("Lusotropical Romance: Camões, Gilberto Freyre, and the Isle of Love" [2003]) and René Garay ("First Encounters: Epic, Gender and the Portuguese Overseas Venture" [2001]). Garay notes how there is a "play with gender in Camoes's configuration of nationhood" which, "although striving to validate Western forms of masculine hierarchies against the anarchic, female- identified East, also points to other directions that will test the limits of that dominant discourse" (86). Garay further adds that this strategy is evident in canto IX of Os Lusíadas, the same canto that has Klobucka's focus of attention. Clementine Rabassa, Anson Piper and Patricia Zecevic deserve further mention as they also have written essays on the female presence in Camões' poem. These are refreshing approaches after the mainly misogynist comments from scholars such as Oliveira Martins, who falls into stereotypes about women, or those who speculate about the erotic stanzas of canto IX. The stance of these scholars seems to objectify women and exemplary is the debate about the location of the Isle of Love, in which critics stereotype certain islands, such as here Tahiti: "A ilha de Taiti é uma replica sensacional à Ilha dos Amores. O mesmo ambiente paradisíaco; a mesma moral; (...) as mesmas fáceis uniões das mulheres com os marinheiros (...) a mesma orgia pagã" (Lourenço 33). An approach that pays attention to the many different aspects of gender representations is much needed to counteract these

pigeonholed analyses about women.

The study of gender still is underrepresented both in Camonian scholarship as well as in studies of Portuguese literature from the early modern period in general. The few approaches to gender, mentioned in the paragraph above, are limited to the Isle of Love episode and some political women such as Inês de Castro. One possible explanation for the lack of attention to women, sexuality, or the varieties of masculinity to be found in the poem arises from the fact that the epic is traditionally considered as a masculine genre that focuses on the endeavors of heroic males. Yet, efforts from scholars such as Sara Poor, Barbara Fuchs and Elizabeth Davis demonstrate that, with the study of epic literature through the lens of gender analysis, attention can be drawn to "previously marginalized or ignored women authors of epic, women characters in epic, and women's history as reflected upon in these texts" (Poor 3).

Another reason to focus on gender is the fact that *Os Lusíadas* dates from the period of the Portuguese Expansion. Traditional scholarship on the period of the Discoveries has very rarely focused on issues of gender and sexuality and it seems that no women ever participated in the imperial history. Furthermore, instances where masculinity can be perceived as different or "other" have not received much attention. In the field of Portuguese history and literature, the 1994 publication of *O rosto feminino da expansão portuguesa* has brought together efforts of scholars who aim to fill this void. Joan Wallach Scott states in 1988 how "the use of gender" is "a primary way of signifying relationships of power" (48), which makes gender an essential category to the study of the period of Expansion when relationships of power changed drastically.

Moreover, Connell identifies the early modern period as crucial for the construction of masculinity.

This thesis offers a reading of *Os Lusíadas* that focuses on gender for two reasons. First, this particular focus follows the idea of "rewriting" patriarchal history from a new perspective. A second reason for writing on gender in *Os Lusíadas* is that, by paying attention to masculinity and femininity, a different light can be shed on the use of the mythology in the poem. Although representations of gender play a scant role in the historical storyline that describes the voyage of Vasco da Gama to India and glorifies the Portuguese past, in most of the mythological storyline, love, sexuality, and gender are paramount.

In the absence of a theoretical framework that regards gender in Early Modern Portuguese Literature, I use the theories of various scholars in Classical Studies, Literary Studies, History and Social Studies. An idea that recurs in most chapters is that "others" may threaten the hegemonic male and that these "threatening" moments can be identified whenever attention is given to representations of gender. In the light of the Expansion, which marked masculinity significantly, Anne McClintock's concept of "boundary loss," the paranoia caused by venturing into the unknown world, is highly relevant to this thesis. Besides the bravado of the male explorers that comes to the fore throughout the epic, the instances where their power is subverted, either through the actions of women or mythological figures, reveal what Mark Breitenberg calls "masculine anxiety." Breitenberg argues that early modern masculinity "relies on a variety of constructions of woman as Other – on the perceived necessity of maintaining a discourse of gendered difference and hierarchy – that reveal in their most excessive moments a deeper suspicion

16

that the model itself may be merely functional rather than descriptive of inherent truth" (11).

In fact, the insisting on patrilineality to mark masculine heroic identity disavows the crucial role of women who nurture the sons, as McClintock also suggests. Sebastião's lack of interest in women and inclination to marry and to "father" the nation cause a certain anxiety in the poet. Therefore, the emphasis on procreation is a major thread in the poem, even if the role of women therein may be downplayed at times. In that sense, Fernando Pessoa is more forgiving with the young king who asks him to be mad instead of procreating, as the quote at the beginning of this introduction indicates. Camões must have had in mind that Portuguese *kleos* would live on with Sebastião and his successors, encouraging him and his noblemen to fight the Saracens. Only hindsight shows that the venturing to Alcácer Quibir proved utter madness.

Chapter One: White Mythologies and Figures of Darkness. Mythology in the Encounter between Portugal, the South, and the East.

" - it is very difficult indeed to separate myth from history, and many do not even wish to try"

Sanjay Subrahmanyam The Portuguese Empire in Asia, 1500-1700

Introduction

The rounding of the Cape of Storms, which was later renamed Cape of Good Hope by Bartolomeu Dias in 1488, was crucial for the history of the Discoveries. When Vasco da Gama and his men followed the African coastline in 1497 soon after the Cape of Good Hope they found themselves in unknown waters, where no Portuguese had been before. In *Os Lusíadas* this breaking point between the known and unknown is masterfully narrated with the apparition of Adamastor. Still, it is important to remember that Camões had hindsight and, while his poem presents Africa as a novelty to be discovered, the continent was already "known" in his time. Even for Vasco da Gama Africa was not "new"; Luso-African relations were already established in many coastal settlements and during the 1480s many Portuguese travelers and ambassadors "travelled widely in West Africa and penetrated as far as the Niger bend" (Newitt). Some knowledge about India that Afonso de Paiva and Pêro de Covilhã had gathered during their expedition over land was useful for Gama's voyage. Even more sources⁵ were available in the second half of the sixteenth century when Camões wrote his poem, and of course he could draw on his personal experiences in the East. Despite the accessibility of many travel accounts *Os Lusíadas* still represents Africa and India as mysterious sites that are either rejected or desired. In many respects, Africa is presented as the hindrance that needs to be overcome in order to reach the much-desired India. Moreover, Camões mythologizes the history of the encounter between the Portuguese and the non-Western world, mixing fact and myth throughout the narrative.

The goal of this chapter is to illustrate how Camões makes use of mythology in his description of the encounter between Portugal and the non-Western world. The poet inserts mythology into his epos in a very original way, different from any of his contemporaries, and one can ask what the motive was for taking this approach. Even if the use of Classical mythology is a common characteristic of the Renaissance period, Camões's use of it is complex and takes place at different levels, which does not allow for an easy interpretation. His "fusion of the human and the supernatural" has "no clear parallel in ancient poetry with all its varied god-man relationship" (Pierce). The figure of Adamastor, for instance, is a clear example of Camões's creativity. Frank Pierce concludes that Camões: "makes the ancient pantheon acquire a new meaning," which therefore "calls for a new focusing of the view of the epos and of its traditional elements" (121). Unfortunately, in the years following Pierce's study not many scholars have taken on the task of studying the role of mythology in *Os Lusíadas*. This chapter hopes to provide a new view, and I believe that analyzing Camões's original way of intertwining

⁵ Please see critics like Catz and Albuquerque who have done an excellent job of surveying the sources used by Camões.

mythology and history can help to better understand the imperial context of the sixteenth century.

The poem's complexity calls for a cautious analysis, so I borrow ideas from various theories in my approach. Without dismissing Classicist scholars, who give valuable insight into the relation between the Classics and Os Lusíadas, I believe my analysis will benefit from the inclusion of some postcolonial theory.⁶ However, postcolonial scholars often either dismiss the Renaissance work, since it is perceived as pro-imperial, or read the text through a post-colonial lens, claiming that Camões was against expansion.⁷ A more nuanced view is given by Josiah Blackmore, who notes that "Camões intentionally construes the relationship between national glory and failure in equivocal terms" (26). For instance, the mythological figures that the poet creates demonstrate hybridity;⁸ both Bacchus and Adamastor represent respectively India and Africa, although they are essentially Western characters. Homi Bhabha's The Location of Culture (1994) explores hybridity as a form of colonial anxiety. His key argument is that colonial hybridity, as a cultural form, produces ambivalence and as such alters the authority of power. With the creation of hybrid mythological figures Camões goes against the grain and demonstrates how Portuguese power was under pressure, because of various external and internal factors, despite his own involvement in the imperial project. As Paulo de Medeiros notes, it is possible to "take many examples from canonized texts within Portuguese literature

⁶ The term "white mythologies," in the chapter's title, is borrowed from Robert Young's important work in Postcolonial Theory *White Mythologies: Writing History and the West* (1990).

⁷ See José Madeira, *Camões contra a expansão e o império. Os Lusíadas como antiepopeia* (2000).

⁸ I use this term in the sense of the mixing of cultures and identities, which often happens in the colonial context.

and demonstrate how the paradoxes involved in colonialism were always present in the minds of those themselves serving as agents of colonialism" (52).

Besides the paradoxes of colonialism and imperialism the Inquisitional Censor also impeded clarity and honesty, thereby causing sixteenth century authors to develop ambiguous ways to voice their opinions. Established in 1536, the Inquisition influenced various elements of Portuguese society, as well as its overseas areas. Camões makes ingenious use of mythology as a tool to self-censor his poem and mask those subjects that were taboo. Luiza Nóbrega calls it a mistake when critics forget that the poem "escrito em tempos de censura inquisitorial, teria que forçosamente dissimular, quando heterodoxos, suas crenças e valores" (104). Hence, it is possible that the poet uses mythology to obscure his discontent about certain aspects of the imperial policy. The poet claims that his mythological inventions are fictions, although this can be viewed as a technique to mislead the Censor.

An analysis of the use of mythology in the description of the encounter between Portugal and the non-Western world demonstrates how the encounter with the South and the East shaped Portuguese national identity.⁹ Shankar Raman focuses particularly

⁹ Even though the concept of a Portuguese "national identity" is problematic, as the concept of national identity started to take form only in the late 18th century, with aid of the national printing press as Benedict Anderson argues, I do use the term national identity to point to the feeling of patriotism or public spirit to honor one's king which was likely prevalent during the sixteenth century. As Blackmore notes "the formation of Portugal as a seafaring, imperial nation emerges alongside this historiographic activity, so that what Richard Helgerson claims for Elizabethan England – that '[t]he discursive forms of nationhood and the nation's political forms were mutually self-constituting' (11) holds true for Portugal as it moved from a land-bound, medieval past to a seafaring, early-modern present and future" (34). Writings for the crown then seem a precusor of

on "the European desire for 'India' in early modern culture," and is one of the few critics that links the epic's mythology to its imperial society. His reading suggests that "Camões's reaching back to the antique world is itself a symptom of a crisis: a complex and contradictory response to the loss of the stability and order associated with the figure of the cosmos" (60). However, Raman's statement that the pagan gods "guarantee their colonial empire" (53) ignores the complex relations that take place between the Portuguese and these mythological figures. Bacchus, for instance, is one of the gods that hinders the armada at several points in the poem. Similarly, the imperial discourse evident throughout the poem and seemingly "guaranteeing the colonial empire" is at times shown to be under stress, either at the end of certain cantos through personal utterances of the poet, or in episodes that challenge the Portuguese male heroes.

With this chapter, I hope to contribute to the debate on *Os Lusíadas*' mythological content by arguing that Camões's use of mythology is twofold. Sometimes mythology is used to establish racial difference between Portuguese and non-Western Others and as such distance the Other from the Self, and other times it serves to "mask" a more critical voice; in the description of the historical encounter mythology is applied in those instances that disapprove of imperialism. Furthermore, Camões creates and adapts two mythological figures, Adamastor and Bacchus, to voice warnings about the vices that threaten the empire. The first section of this chapter demonstrates how Camões mixes historiography with mythology and applies a black-white binary to distance Self from the

the formation of a "class" identity that was largely influenced by class and descent, but unfortunately never gave a complete picture of the total society.

non-Western Other. Naturally, Camões was not alone in following this binary scheme. However, it is curious that in other descriptions of Gama's voyage, such as those by João de Barros and Álvaro Velho, the authors seem to follow the scientific explanations for color differences that Humanism offered at that time. By combining the black-white binary with Classical mythology, Camões reaches back and ignores early modern science, thereby contradicting the idea that the Portuguese were very innovative and novel. One may consider Luís Madureira demonstration of a presence of imperial belatedness in several sixteenth century Portuguese accounts of the expansion that, despite their "memorialization of voyages across 'oceans where none had ever sailed before," also are aware of "the disturbing prospect that 'others' may have preceded them; and that these others may ultimately outlast them" (49).

Each of the other two sections deal with Adamastor and Bacchus, mythological figures used by the poet to question greed and desire. Both these figures become parables of the empire that represent Africa and India but also reflect the Portuguese. They mirror certain Portuguese qualities, which may lead to the downfall of empire. As such, they become tools to warn and criticize the imperial trajectory. Adamastor warns against the emasculating power of love and the dangers of boundary loss,¹⁰ two dangers that appear in canto IX on the Ilha dos Amores as well. Bacchus is an ambiguous father figure that warns against too much greed and voices the concerns of the old orders. He also points to

¹⁰ Anne McClintock mentions that "male imperial discourse" is often "redolent not only of a male megalomania and imperial aggression but also of male anxiety and paranoia." McClintock suggests that this "may be seen as the simultaneous dread of catastrophic boundary *loss* (implosion), associated with fears of impotence and infantilization and attended by an *excess* of boundary order and fantasies of unlimited power. In this way, the augural scene of discovery becomes a scene of ambivalence, suspended between an imperial megalomania, with its fantasy of unstoppable rapine – and a contrary fear of engulfment, with its fantasy of dismemberment and emasculation" (26-27).

the impending failure of *kleos*, which will be the subject of the fourth chapter of this thesis. *Kleos* signals fame or glory and is accomplished through great deeds, often through the hero's own death. It is invariably transferred from father to son, the son being responsible for carrying on and building upon the "glory" of the father. In that sense Bacchus voices the difficulties of maintaining Portuguese fame in the East.

Black and White Mythologies. Mythology in the History of the Encounter.

Before the Age of Discoveries there were two dominant theories in Europe that would explain dark skin: "a divine intervention" that linked the color of Africans to the biblical sin committed by their predecessor Ham or, dark skin as the result of proximity to the sun or the equator. During the period of the Discoveries a more nuanced picture appeared when travelers would return, "bringing with them descriptions of black-, yellow, or red-hued peoples" (Klaus 3). Curiously, however, these nuances are lacking when Camões describes the encounter between Portuguese and non-Western peoples. The reaction of the Portuguese upon first viewing the people on the Island of Mozambique is described as follows: "A gente da cor era verdadeira, / Que Faeton, nas terras acendidas, / Ao mundo deu, de ousado, o não prudente" (I.46).¹¹ Interestingly, the writers whose works served as sources to Camões do make an effort to describe different skin tones. Hence, Luís de Albuquerque points out in a footnote of his "A viagem de

¹¹ Phaeton is the son of Clymene, an Oceanid sometimes referred to as Asia, and Helios, god of the Sun. According to the myth, Phaeton questioned the paternity of Helios and thus rose up to the skies and asked his father to ride a chariot with horses that represent the Sun. However, in his inability to drive, the horses came too close to the earth, leaving a dessert and its inhabitants blackened (Day).

Vasco da Gama entre Moçambique e Melinde, segundo Os Lusíadas e segundo as Crónicas":

Não podem deixar de merecer reparo as divergências dos autores quanto à cor dos indígenas de Moçambique: ruivos na Relação, negros para Camões, baços segundo Castanheda e mesmo brancos para João de Barros. Que saibamos, nunca tais diferenças foram aceitàvelmente explicadas. (21)

Camões doesn't use the actual word *negro* or *preto*; however, the poet applies Classical mythology to suggest racial difference. This gesture could of course be explained as a common Renaissance practice but that would deny the imperial discourse that is also present in the description of the skin color of the people at Mozambique Island.

Often, but not always, non-Western Others are perceived as negative. This negative depiction reveals an anxiety typical of Camões's time period, in which the authority of power was being altered by both non-Western and Western Others. Hence, the establishment of this binary reveals a fear of imperial belatedness, i.e. a feeling that the Portuguese were in danger of being surpassed by other nations, as well as an anxiety about Portuguese identity, as it was identified as marginal.

The opposition between black and white is an important thread in the narrative of *Os Lusiadas*. Josiah Blackmore states that invoking "a white/black binary is often an idealizing gesture" and that furthermore, this idealization "confirms ideological importance" (24). Curiously, this binarism is not present in the text of some of the earlier sources that describe the encounter between Gama's crew and non-Western people as the first paragraph of this section demonstrates. The need for this ideological construct and

the use of racial terms from Classical mythology can be explained perhaps by the time period in which Camões was living, a time of national anxiety about a disintegrated empire and increased attacks by foreign nations. This recalls Kim F. Hall's observation that the use of this binarism increased in England during a moment when English expansion coincided with "a heightened nervousness about group identity and power" (2-3). Hall then explains how: "This moment of transition sets the stage for the longer process by which preexisting literary tropes of blackness profoundly interacted with the fast changing economic relations of white Europeans and their darker 'others' during the Renaissance" (4).

In Camões's time economic relations were also quickly changing; the need for a strong overseas empire was growing as foreign nations increasingly tried to establish trade relations with non-Western others. This Portuguese frustration is depicted through the episode of the honey gatherer included in canto V. This African is significantly described as "black," as Josiah Blackmore notes:

The sighting of this black African is noteworthy in the demographic logic of Camões's poem because the honey-gatherer is not a *mouro*, the blanket term used to cast Africans and natives of India as inimical to expansion as practitioners of Islam. This African is a *preto* (black), a sub-Saharan African without culture, religion, or intelligible language. (89)

Again Camões applies Classical mythology to reference non-Western others; the honey-

gatherer is described as "[s]elvagem mais que o bruto Polifemo" (V.29).¹² Moreover, his darkness also points to unenlightened-ness and wildness, as he doesn't respond to the precious metals and materials that are shown him: "o gentil metal supremo, / A prata fina, a quente especiaria: / A nada disto o bruto se movia" (V.29). Like the blind Polyphemus the honey-gatherer becomes "representative of a brutish, African blindness to the products of culture (...) Gama's expansionist embrace of the world, present here by the listing of products foreign to Portugal, trumps the unenlightened vision of the hapless African" (Blackmore 90). The unenlightendness of the Africans is indeed reflected in their enthusiastic response to some worthless red hats. However, in this episode the Khoikhoi are also a catalyst of Portuguese frustration and fear. None of the critics that have analyzed this passage have focused on the product that is linked with the gatherer. Since the men in stanza 26 long to see strange things, they must have been rather disappointed when two stanzas later the person they encounter is collecting something so common as honey. Besides this economic frustration the Khoikhoi are able to hinder the Portuguese significantly. I agree with Luís Madureira who notes how:

> Devoid of humanity (gente bestial, bruta), emptied of culture and history, the Khoikhoi emerge nonetheless from the epic's borders as an insurmountable alterity. (...) They present a formidable obstacle to Portuguese maritime progress and commercial penetration. (54)

¹² Polyphemus was a one-eyed giant who practiced cannibalism and ate some of Odysseus men who finally got away by puncturing the giant's eye with a pointy stick. Blackmore notes how the comparison to Polyphemus "anticipates Adamastor a few stanzas later" (89). This point is also made by Quint, among others, when he traces the history of Polyphemus in Homer and Virgil (106-111).

The honey-gatherer whom Blackmore calls "hapless" is thus on one hand described as brute and uncivilized but on the other hand this blackness also indicates fear and frustration. Significantly, besides the honey-gatherer, the word *negro* is also applied in canto V to specify the terror of the sea and to describe Adamastor's mouth, that utters sinister prophecies. Moreover, the death of Manuel Sepúlveda and his wife is referred to as their "negro fado." This shows that black embodies fear for the Portuguese and the color throughout the whole poem has a connotation of evil.

The following examples illustrate that the black-white binary is applied to the description of the encounter when Portuguese power is failing and feelings of suspicion arise. In India, for instance, the Catual is the embodiment of all negativity and becomes a metonym of the Islamic infidel (Calçada). Historians have pointed out how Gama's scarce gifts insulted the Zamorin and how "a series of misunderstandings, which had their origin in the Portuguese captain's incurable suspicion of all Muslims, almost led him to break off diplomatic relations entirely" (Newitt 58). *Os Lusíadas* describes the Zamorin as someone easily impressed by Gama's words, while all misunderstandings are ascribed to the Catual, who is described as "negro" at stanza 93 of canto VII. Here, the adjective points to negativity and reveals that the Catual sensed and unraveled the poor diplomatic power of the Portuguese.

As the Portuguese follow the African coastline the different meanings of the color binary are extended further and the concept of night and day gains importance. Sunlight is often seen as good and references to night reveal suspicion and anxiety. João Figueiredo points out that Bacchus always operates at night, while Venus, who is

28

associated with good and beauty, appears only in the daytime (23). However, light and dark also play a significant role in the historical parts of the poem. Camões presents the sites that the Portuguese encounter as mysterious and unknown to emphasize the idea that Gama and his men superseded any other nation. Yet, the uncanniness of the places described also enhances the feeling of boundary loss. As the Portuguese pass the limits of the known world, "darkness" is encountered in the skin color of people. For instance, at Cape Verde and the Sanagá river: "Passamos o limite aonde chega / O Sol, que para o Norte os carros guia" to arrive "Onde jazem os povos a quem nega / O filho de Climene a cor do dia" (V.7). When later in the poem they arrive at the Quelimane River (Rio dos Bons Sinais) in Mozambique it becomes clear that "brute" and "savage" Africa is left behind. Here the people tell the Portuguese about "terra onde havia Gente, assim como nós, da cor do dia" (V.77). This indication of sameness in color as the Portuguese clearly is a discursive way of indicating goodness.¹³ Often, night is seen as a time for danger and Gama and his crew refuse to go on land at night. For instance, at Mozambique nightfall is described in great detail, with words that recall darkness and lightness in order to create

¹³It is interesting how Camões applies these tropes and "whitens" non-Western people that are considered good. This happens in one of the few stanzas where Camões makes a direct reference to non-Western women at stanza 62 of Canto V: "As mulheres queimadas vêm em cima / Dos vagarosos bois, ali sentadas, / Animais que eles têm em mais estima / Que todo o outro gado das manadas. / Cantigas pastoris, ou prosa ou rima, / Na sua língua cantam concertadas / Com o doce som das rústicas avenas, / Imitando de Títiro as Camenas" (V.63). Curiously, these women are not black but "queimadas." It is important to note that sunburn is not only a scientific way of explaining racial differences but is also "a compelling, powerful trope literary influence" (Hall 100). Here, the non-Western woman is very familiar to the Western self. According to Hall the whitening of females have a "dual function in that they allow poets to praise 'fair' European women while simultaneously reminding their audience of the disguised, potentially unruly sexuality and destructiveness of these potentially 'dark' women" (115).

extra tension. Hence, the night is described: "...Febo nas águas encerrou, / ... o claro dia, / Dando cargo à irmã, que alumiasse / O largo mundo, enquanto repousasse" (I.56). Feelings of positivity versus negativity are also assigned to respectively night and day: "A noite se passou na lassa frota / Com estranha alegria, e não cuidada" (I.57), at sunrise happiness takes over: "Ao claro Hiperiónio, que acordou, / Começa a embandeirar-se toda a armada, / E de toldos alegres se adornou/" (I.58). At Melindi Gama agrees to meet with the King only during daytime.

When the king of Melinde and his court dignitaries arrive, a lot of attention is directed towards the physical description of their clothing and accessories: "Um batel grande e largo, que toldado / Vinha de sedas de diversas cores," and on the King's head rests "uma fota guarnecida / De ouro, e de seda e de algodão tecida" (II.94). The king further wears a

Cabaia de Damasco rico e dino, Da Tíria cor, entre eles estimada, Um colar ao pescoço, de ouro fino, Onde a matéria da obra é superada, C'um resplendor reluze adamantine Na cinta, a rica bem lavrada Nas alparcas dos pés, em fim de tudo, Cobrem ouro e aljôfar ao veludo. (II.95)

This is quite an ample description, which only focuses on the exterior. All the different

fabrics and materials are mentioned as if an inventory were being made. The Portuguese gaze screens the exposed richness that can be found in Melinde and Asia. The description of the Melindian king is juxtaposed with Gama who "[n]ão menos guarnecido o Lusitano / Nos seus batéis, da frota se partia / A receber no mar o Melindano" (II.97). The captain is dressed "ao modo Hispano, / Mas Francesa era a roupa que vestia, / De cetim da Adriática Veneza / Carmesi, cor que a gente tanto preza" (II.97). Again the concept of light is important as his clothing

De botões douro as mangas vêm tomadas, Onde o Sol reluzindo a vista cega; As calças soldadescas recamadas Do metal, que Fortuna a tantos nega, E com pontas do mesmo delicadas Os golpes do gibão ajunta e achega; Ao Itálico modo a áurea espada; Pluma na gorra, um pouco declinada. (II.98)

Obviously, the extensive description of the clothing shows how first contacts were about appearances and first impressions. Exotic others were gazed upon and, in case of nudity, immediately categorized as inferior. Here, the clothes of the Melindian king are not only screened to learn about potential economic profit but also to show a power struggle and comparison of masculinity. Christian M. Billing notes about early modern clothing that "the relationship between various material fabrics and the fabric of society was organized in relation to essentialist concepts of virility and masculinity. Clothing was an outward signifier; it showed both the internal worth and status of its wearer" (90). Both the Melindian king and the Portuguese captain wear clothing that reflect the light and are full of splendor but, while the king's fabrics show more material wealth, the captain is dressed in "soldadesca" manner which indicates military might and power.

The paragraphs above show how Camões reaches back for mythology and lightdark binaries to describe the non-Western world. In doing so, he reveals a deep anxiety, or what Madureira calls "imperial belatedness." Camões's textual gesture of using stereotypes whilst early modern knowledge was available contradicts his boasting that Gama's crew sails on "mares nunca d'antes navegados" and reveals notions of insecurity and boundary loss. Moreover, the few instances that describe how the non-Western Others reacted upon encountering the Portuguese show how they are often misidentified, which further enhances this notion of insecurity and marginalization.

First, when the Melindian king requests to hear about the part of the voyage that occurred in Africa, he mentions how his people are "enlightened" by the Sun:

Não tanto desviado resplandece De nós o claro Sol, para julgares Que os Melindanos têm tão rudo peito, Que não estimem muito um grande feito. (II.111)

The king then mentions in the final two stanzas of the third canto some of these "grandes

feitos," which all originate from Greek and Roman mythology.¹⁴ All these myths reflect the desire of Gama and his men to reach India, although it is important to note that these myths also had a disastrous end. It is interesting how Camões here uses a non-Western other as a critical voice that condemns certain vices of imperialism.

Another example of this critical voice can be found in India where, after the long exposition of Paulo da Gama, once more night is described as a place of mystery: "já a luz se se mostrava duvidosa, / Porque a a lâmpada grande se escondia" (VIII.44). In the next stanza a local priest appointed by the Zamorin delivers another type of prophecy. He practices haruspicy¹⁵ to inquire about the arrival of the foreigners. Camões first describes it as a diabolic practice but in the prediction a clear preview of colonialism appears:

Sinal lhe mostra o Demo verdadeiro,

De como a nova gente lhe seria

Jugo perpétuo, eterno cativeiro,

Destruição de gente, e de valia. (VIII. 46)

Keeping in mind that the poet possessed hindsight, these words seem a criticism

¹⁴ The first myth about the Giants that tried to overtake mount Olympus, is also known as Gigantomachy, a symbolic struggle of the cosmic order. However, the attack of the Giants to the power of Zeus resulted in their slaughter. Then, there is mentioning of Pirithous, who helped Theseus to kidnap Persephone, the wife of Pluto that represents Spring. Both were unlucky, as the multi-headed dog Cerberus ate Pirithous, and Theseus was imprisoned until Hercules freed him. The final myth mentions Herostratus, a man who in his effort to seek fame, set the Temple of Artemis, which belonged to the Seven Wonders of the Ancient World, on fire. His name still resonates in the expression "herostratic fame" which means fame at any costs.

¹⁵ Haruspicy is a religious practice that uses the intestines of sacrifical animals to discover the will of the gods.

of Portuguese practice in the East, as they describe the oppressing yoke that the new people, or the Portuguese, will impose. It seems then that, through the "critical voices" of non-Western Others, imperial practices are condemned, which challenges the imperial ideology that is also present in the poem.

Subversion is also revealed when the reaction of the non-Western people as they first encounter the Portuguese crew is read against the grain.¹⁶ Often the Portuguese are misidentified, which damages their heroic reputation. For instance in stanza 62 of canto I the "Moors" mistake the Portuguese for Turks, whose Ottoman empire ruled most of Southeast Europe, North Africa, and parts of Asia:

Também o Mouro astuto está confuso, Olhando a cor, o trajo, e a forte armada;

E perguntando tudo, lhe dizia

"Se por ventura vinham de Turquia?" (I.62)

The fact that the Africans misinterpret the nationality of the Portuguese because they identify them as the mighty Turks subverts the notion of the Portuguese as "fortes Lusitanos" (I.50). In India the Zamorin and his principals identify the Portuguese as pirates: "Dizendo que são gentes inquietas, / Que, ... / Vivem só de piráticas rapinas, / Sem Rei, sem leis humanas ou divinas" (VIII. 53). Here the imperial stereotype of "sem Rei, sem Lei," which is often applied to non-Western Others, is redirected at the Portuguese. When the Zamorin addresses Gama he questions his national identity:

¹⁶ With reading against the grain, I mean the act of reading a text critically and paying attention to the different, and sometimes marginalized, meanings a text might have.

"Porque nem tu tens Rei, nem pátria amada / Mas vagabundo vás passando a vida" (VIII. 61). The Zamorin thus assumes that Vasco da Gama and his men are "desterrados" or pirates who do not operate for the Crown. Ironically, the notion of the Crown was declining in Camões's time, as Malyn Newitt convincingly argues. Newitt demonstrates that alongside the official overseas empire many Portuguese lived in the margins, creating an unofficial empire "made up of settlements founded by Portuguese traders, mercenaries, missionaries and adventurers" (92). According to the scholar, the existence and growth of non-official settlements show "how Portuguese expansion acquired a dynamic of its own and ceased to depend on initiatives from Lisbon" (99). Hence, it is clear that the few instances in which the "opinion" of non-Western Others can be read, a critical voice about imperial practices is demonstrated and also Portuguese collective identity is questioned.

Focusing on mythology in the encounter reveals that the black-white binary is an ideological construct. The forced way of distancing Self from Other indicates that there is actually little difference between Portuguese and non-Western Other, especially since Portuguese identity is also questioned. Mythology thus embodies ambiguity and hybridity and as such reveals an anxiety. This hybridity also comes to the fore in the two dark figures, Adamastor and Bacchus.

Adamastor and the Dangers of Love.

In canto V of *Os Lusíadas* Camões masterfully creates the mythological figure of Adamastor, who represents the Cape and utters various prophecies prior to letting Gama

and his crew continue on their route to India. Various (postcolonial) critics such as David Quint, Lawrence Lipking, Jared Banks and Josiah Blackmore have done important work analyzing the Adamastor episode and their readings offer interesting viewpoints that I will outline in this section. However, I believe that most analyses lack a focus on love and desire, two important aspects of the episode, which may also be read as a preview of the happenings on the Isle of Love (canto IX). I take my cue from one of Adamastor's prophecies, which is the story of the Sepúlveda shipwreck, since it embodies the dangers of love and desire. Hence, in this section I argue that Adamastor warns the Portuguese against the emasculating power of love and an excess of desire, be it sexual or economic, as this may contribute to the downfall of the empire.

Already in 1792 Voltaire noted how the Adamastor episode was able to "please people of all times and all nations"(324). Consequently many Camonian critics have focused on this figure that is the poet's original creation. During the last two decades of the twentieth century Adamastor has been analyzed in light of postcolonial studies. Paulo de Medeiros argues that he is a figure who is "an apt conflation of centre and periphery, indeed a superimposition of the margin upon the centre, or its voiding" (46). Adamastor embodies the ambiguity present in *Os Lusíadas* and consolidates issues of race, sexuality and gender, which are key to this thesis. The description of his apparition to the Portuguese crew takes place at a central point in the poem, at the middle of canto V, so that Jared Banks concludes from this that Adamastor represents "a liminal moment in *Os Lusíadas* for the Portuguese empire" (3). Five days after the encounter with the honey-gatherer, a huge cloud covers the Portuguese out of which:

Não acabava, quando uma figura

Se nos mostra no ar, robusta e válida, De disforme e grandíssima estatura, O rosto carregado, a barba esquálida, Os olhos encovados, e a postura Medonha e má, e a cor terrena e pálida, Cheios de terra e crespos os cabelos, A boca negra, os dentes amarelos. (V.39)

This creature presents itself as the Cape and states: "Eu sou aquele oculto e grande Cabo, / A quem chamais vós outros Tormentório" (V.50). In the episode Adamastor's speech directed to Vasco da Gama is twofold. First, he appears out of a cloud and warns the Portuguese that their struggles are not yet over:

> Ouve os danos de mim, que apercebidos Estão a teu sobejo atrevimento, Por todo o largo mar e pela terra, Que ainda hás de sojugar com dura Guerra. (V.42)

Then a series of prophecies follow, of which I will analyze the one about Leonor de Sepúlveda in detail in the paragraphs below. After Gama asks the monster to identify himself, Adamastor changes the nature of his speech and mournfully narrates how his love for Thetis turned him into the rock that he has become.

Adamastor's connection to Africa is pointed out by David Quint, who examines

how "the figure of Adamastor is both substituted for the Africans and simultaneously emptied of their presence" (123). The giant becomes "a mirror image of the Portuguese victor" and seems to be serving imperialistic ideology (124), yet Jared Banks nuances this thought by ascribing to Adamastor the role of "a bearer of an already-fulfilled prophecy of both glory and suffering with Camões like the chronicler in the role of critic of the empire, not as a representative voice of the African victims of colonization"(9). Luís Madureira builds on Banks' argument and importantly points out how Camões used gigantomachy¹⁷ to point out marginality:

while the giant may well be a reflection of Portugal's colonial and epistemic grasp, he is at the same time prosopopoeic, not of the potential endlessness of the empire, as Quint would have it (Epic and Empire 124), but of its impending closure, of its precarious marginality. (56)

Adamastor is thus an important critical voice that warns of the marginality of the Portuguese empire. Josiah Blackmore offers an original and insightful reading of the Adamastor episode, by demonstrating how melancholy is paramount: "[t]he erotic connotations of lament suffusing Adamastor's autobiographical voice suggest that imperial pursuit can occasion loss and longing, and that therefore empire is a form of desire in the melancholic imagination" (143). Blackmore states that: "Adamastor's defeat in this respect is didactic, a warning against unmeasured and irrational desire" (144).

I believe that this desire can be understood as either sexual or economic; the greed

¹⁷ Gigantomachy is the ancient struggle between the gods and giants.

for spices and gold drove the Portuguese into expansion and conquest of the non-Western world and often sex was a part of this conquest.¹⁸ Adamastor can be linked to the Portuguese Self; both are foreigners in Africa and driven by desire. It is Adamastor's love for Thetis that binds him to Africa as Blackmore very aptly points out: "as a Titan, he originates elsewhere so is a foreigner to the shore of Africa, but his obsessive love for Thetis, in the Ovidian metamorphoses that generates his shapes, has converted him into the land of Africa" (129). The similarity between the Portuguese and the giant causes certain unease, as Blackmore argues:

> the successful doubling of the cape leaves in its wake a testimony of the Portuguese/ European preoccupation with the potent, African male body with its ability to block or impede imperial ambitions. This preoccupation is quasi-fetishistic because Camões expresses it initially as a heightened attention to, and awareness of, Adamastor's body parts, and then to the giant's potential (but unrealized) ability to hinder the voyage. (146)

Aside from the physical threat that Adamastor causes, I suggest that his personal story and the prophecy about Sepúlveda also consist of a psychological threat, namely the emasculating power of love. If the Portuguese do not want to become like Adamastor, they should be cautious of the powers of love. The Adamastor episode is an important prelude to the ninth canto, where the Portuguese fall for the seductive nymphs who

¹⁸ The Ilha dos Amores episode, which is the subject of chapter 3, has often been understood as a sexual allegory of the maritime conquest.

threaten their masculinity.

The three stanzas that prophesize the shipwreck and death of Manuel de Sousa Sepúlveda and his wife Leonor embody various aspects that are paramount to this thesis such as love, sexuality and gender, but also point to a subversion of imperial masculinity. The happenings on the African soil as narrated by Adamastor are inspired by the shipwreck of the São João that took place in 1552.¹⁹ I believe that the inclusion of the shipwreck narrative points to an obstruction of the idea of conquest and a judgment of greed. In a sense, greed leads to disgrace; an idea that Camões utters at various points in his poem.²⁰ However, it is still telling that Camões chose this particular shipwreck in which love and gender play such a big role.

I argue that Adamastor is one of the important critical voices in the poem and that the Sepúlveda prophecy warns against too much desire and reveals the emasculating powers of love. Therefore, it is important to look both at the historical source²¹ and its representation in the stanzas of the epic poem. One of the main differences between *Os*

¹⁹ Survivor Álvaro Fernandes transmitted the story that was widely spread after the publication of the História Trágico Maritima of Gomes de Brito. Shipwreck narratives became increasingly popular in the seventeenth century and these narratives "undermine the master historiographic narrative of imperialism in all its cultural, political, and economic valences, upsetting the imperative of order and the unifying paradigms of 'discovery' or 'conquest' textuality" (Blackmore 2002 xxi). João Almeida Flor points that shipwreck often happened on the route back and was due to the fact that "frequently in detriment to the safety of both people and goods, all the available space was overladen with silks, cotton, exotic woods, porcelain, pepper, cinnamon and other spices" (14) ²⁰ Camões's contemporary and friend Diogo de Couto ended the account of the shipwreck of the Great Ship São Tomé, in which a reference to Sepúlveda's fate was made, with a warning against greed: "These disasters, and others which occur every day in this India voyage, might serve as warnings to men, especially to the *fidalgos* who are captains of fortresses, to moderate themselves and be content with what the good Lord gives them, and allow the poor to live; for God has not made the sun in the heaven and the water in the spring for the great ones of the earth alone" (94).

²¹ For an in depth analysis of the São João shipwreck see the works of Josiah Blackmore and João Almeida Flor.

Lusíadas and the *Relação da mui notável perda do Galeão Grande S. João* is the focus on love. Manuel de Sousa Sepúlveda is described as "Liberal, cavaleiro, *enamorado*" (my emphasis) and he takes with him "a formosa dama / Que Amor por grã mercê lhe terá dado" (V.46). Camões gives the relationship between Sepúlveda and his wife lyrical proportions; the two seem very in love, something that cannot be read from the historical narrative.²² Hence, the poet presents Leonor as a victim of love whose sad faith is a consequence of the imperial pursuit. She plays a very passive role in the epic and Love is seen as the culprit of her death,²³ because she followed her husband. Camões does not attribute any voice to her, whilst in the historical narrative Leonor gradually transforms from a fragile *fidalga* into a more masculine being. Josiah Blackmore notes how in the historical text "gender and patriarchal authority dissolve, or are inverted" and that "authority transfers from Manuel to Leonor" (70). None of this comes to the fore in the epic poem that lyricizes, to a certain extent, the struggle for survival of the Sepúlvedas.

Although Leonor becomes victimized in the epic, which obscures this inversion of patriarchal authority, one can still observe how patriarchy becomes subverted by looking at how masculinity is affected. According to the *Relação da mui notável perda do Galeão Grande S. João*, Leonor fiercely defends herself after the Africans undo her of her

²² Moreover, it is an ironic detail that apparently, Luís Falcão, captain of Ormuz and Diu was fiancé of the beautiful Leonor de Sá, but he "ended up being murdered under mysterious circumstances." As João Almeida Flor notes "the fact that, shortly afterwards, Leonor de Sá married Manuel de Sousa Sepúlveda, caused the latter to be suspected of moral or material involvement in a murder that was never solved" (21). Contemporary readers of the poem were perhaps aware of this situation which clearly would have intensified the dramatic effect of the closing lines about "Os dois amantes míseros" that "Com lágrimas de dor, de mágoa pura, / Abraçados as almas soltarão / Da formosa e misérrima prisão" (V.48).

²³ Blaming Love for the sad death of a noblewoman is also present in *Os Lusíadas* in the Inês de Castro episode, which will be analyzed in chapter two.

clothing: "Aqui dizem que D. Leonor se não deixava despir, e que às punhadas e às bofetadas se defendia, porque era tal, que queria antes que a matassem os cafres que ver se nua diante da gente" (Lanciani 209). The poet is silent about Leonor's physical defense, perhaps because this is not perceived as very ladylike.

From the narrative it appears that Leonor is terribly embarrassed about her nudity and that even her husband suggesting that everyone is born naked does not make her feel more at ease. Leonor rejects her status naturalis: "vendo-se D. Leonor despida, lançou-se logo no chão e cobriu-se toda com os seus cabelos, que eram muito compridos, fazendo uma cova na areia, onde se meteu até à cintura, sem mais se erguer dali" (210). Her hiding under the ground does not appear in the stanzas of the epic poem. There the "Cafres ásperos e avaros" come to "Tirar à linda dama seus vestidos; / Os cristalinos membros ... / ... ao frio, ao ar verão despidos, / Depois de ter pisada longamente / Co'os delicados pés a areia ardente" (V.47). Leonor's delicateness and her crystalline body contrasts with the Africans' rigidity and greediness. Once more, black and white are juxtaposed in the classical binary of good and evil. Luís Madureira notes that the "cruel disrobement of Lady Leonor Sepúlveda by the 'harsh and grasping' African natives" and her exposure to the natural elements "provides a kind of counterpoint to the collective unveiling (descobrimento) of beautiful bodies (9.65) and albescent flesh (9.71) by Gama's ardent home-bound crew in the Island of Love" (58). While the Ilha, according to Madureira, "represents an allegory of Portugal's conquest of the ocean (of its multiple and transgressive discoveries [descobrimentos])" the story of Leonor Sepúlveda "signifies their reversal and obstruction" (58).

I agree that the inclusion of the shipwreck obstructs the imperial discourse present

in *Os Lusíadas* but suggest that the Sepúlveda story also points to how femininity threatens masculinity. Madureira links the Ilha dos Amores to the story of Leonor Sepúlveda but it is important to note that the ninth and tenth cantos have a more ambiguous content and are more than pure allegory of conquest. As will be discussed in chapter three the nymphs subvert traditional gender roles at various points and "undermine" Portuguese masculinity. It seems that for Camões love and relationships are threatened by imperial goals but are at the same time essential to the survival of empire; both are required for creating royal progeny and colonizing "new" lands.

Blackmore interestingly suggests that Adamastor, the narrator of the story in *Os Lusíadas*, empathizes with Leonor because she physically merges with the African land (31). However, it is also compelling to see how also Manuel can be linked with the giant. From the historical text one can read how Leonor takes over Manuel's power since he is "maltratado do miolo" and walks around "fora de seu perfeito juizo" (204, 207). His delicate state progresses fast after his wife dies; "tornou a tomar o caminho que fazia quando ia buscar as frutas, sem dizer nada às escravas, e se meteu pelo mato, e nunca mais o viram" (211). As his wife merges into the African earth, Manuel disappears from its surface. In a sense, his disappearance links him with Adamastor, who also became crazy with grief over a woman and whose weeping "borders dangerously on a feminine or nonphallic expression of affect because it is an impotence" (Blackmore 144). Hence, these "feminine" traits undermine the masculinity of both figures and as such both Adamastor and his prophecy provide an important warning for the Portuguese.

Bacchus and the Glory of Paternity.

While Adamastor disturbs the Portuguese at the Cape, the pagan deity Bacchus functions as another dark figure that has a critical voice throughout the poem. This section studies Bacchus's role in relation to the Portuguese and his ability to undermine the power of the Portuguese crew on their way to India. It shows how not only his physical actions can interfere with the voyage but also how his being reflects in a disturbing manner the negative aspects of the Portuguese heroes. I argue that, since Bacchus is the mythological father of the Portuguese, his mourning about the loss of his empire in India predicts the Portuguese destiny, as they will suffer the same loss. As prophesied by Adamastor, the Portuguese empire would crumble and cost many lives, a fact that was already taking place in Camões's time and likely preoccupied the poet. In order to show how Bacchus is a reflection of the Portuguese, it is key to analyze the moments in which he appears in the poem. He appears in cantos I, II, VI, VII and VIII, mostly to hinder the Portuguese, franticly trying to protect his erstwhile empire in the East. The section further shows that Camões likely chose Bacchus as the prime negative character as he embodies ambivalence.

Bacchus's contradictory nature has triggered several responses from critics. The text's first commentator, Faria e Sousa, sees him as a representation of the Devil. Twentieth century Classicist scholars, such as Costa Ramalho, Eugenio Asensio, Maria Helena Ribeiro da Cunha and, to a certain extent, Vítor Aguiar e Silva, focus on the resemblance of *Os Lusíadas* with Homer's *Odyssey*; its Greek equivalent. According to these critics Bacchus plays the same role as Juno as he is an opponent of the Portuguese. Cunha summarizes the opinion of many, commenting: "Baco foi escolhido por Camões para adversário dos Portugueses por estar ligado à Índia, e sua razão de ser neste poema é a oposição à Fortuna. Ao criar esta personagem Luís de Camões tinha o pensamento voltado para Homero e Vergílio"(74). Only recently has the work of Luiza Nóbrega and Hélio Alves stressed the importance of Bacchus who is considered a "peça-chave" or one of the leading figures (Nóbrega 81).

The deity is often only seen as an adversary and long been identified with India. However, there is a pitfall in this comparison, as it repeats an imperial stereotype. The god of wine reflects some of the stereotypes that existed about non-Western people, mythology depicts him often as feminine, immoral²⁴ and the connection between India and Bacchus is therefore often easily made. Vasco Graça Moura attributes to Bacchus the role of the voice of India. He identifies the deity as one of the three critical voices present in the poem, next to the Velho do Restelo at the end of canto IV and the poet himself, who can be heard at several moments. According to the scholar, Bacchus "é

²⁴ The Roman god Bacchus is known as the god of wine and harvest and also the god of epiphany, which means he reveals himself to humans. In Greek mythology he appears as Dionysius and as Vítor Aguiar e Silva has identified: "é um deus multiforme e polimórfico, que se transmuta ora em leão, ora em pantera, ora em touro, ora em serpente, ora em bode, etc" (Silva). Most of Bacchus' mythological background can be found in Heraclites who wrote about the devotion of Bacchus as a debauchery of orgies in which wine, sex and hedonism had the upperhand. These debaucheries show similarities with the stereotypes about non-Western people that were current during the Expansion. Often travel writers describe native tribes as anthropophagi, who play crazy music and practice strange rituals. As such Bacchus becomes linked with the pagan. Yet, besides being evil and subaltern Bacchus is also linked to the feminine, another stereotype that is also often applied to the East. Bacchus is often represented as very feminine with a juvenile face ("aquele que sempre a mocidade/ Tem no rosto perpétua" II.10) and he carries a staff called thyrsus, a fertility phallus. Silva comments how: "Baco é uma divindade primigeniamente feminina, criada por mulheres, rodeada de mulheres lascivas, frenéticas e enlouquecidas, representativa dos mistérios, dos fascínios e da violência da sexualidade e do parto" (134).

fundamentalmente a voz que desafia o requisitório das populações do oriente atingidas por quase um século de expansão cobiçosa e de não muito fundos escrúpulos" (36). I agree that Bacchus is one of the critical voices but perhaps the deity does not represent the Indian population, concurring with Shankar Raman, who shows how Bacchus functions to empty out the voice of the discovered lands and its people (2001: 142). Bacchus resists the Portuguese expansion in India even if he cannot be seen as "Indian," his critical voice expresses reluctance about the Portuguese empire rather than representing the Indian people. Hence, I suggest that Bacchus reflects some of the internal factors that threatened the Portuguese empire and comes uncannily close to a representation of the Portuguese Self. It is important to note that he can be linked to the Portuguese through their similar experience as imperial *conquistadores* and because he also is the mythological father of Lusus. Hence, this section argues that the role of Bacchus is paramount, as he voices the poet's concern for the imperial project through the introduction of *kleos*; a fame that needs to be regained. Two examples illustrate how Bacchus cannot be seen as a minor character but rather as an actor who plays a variety of roles so as to warn and teach the Portuguese.

First, it is important to note that he is the predecessor to the Portuguese in the East. He is known for his conquest of India, which was seen as a civilizing mission. Aguiar e Silva is the only critic who points out that for Camões the relevancy of the Bacchus myth is in "o seu significado geopolítico, político-religioso e político-militar, a sua significação imperial ou proto-imperial, como conquistador celebrado e como civilizador da India" (139). Various oriental campaigns that took place during the Roman Empire created a renewed interest in the mythical stories about Bacchus's triumphs in India.²⁵

Bacchus first appears during the council of the Gods on mount Olympus in canto I. When Jupiter mentions how Fate is with the Portuguese navigators ("Prometido lhe está do Fado eterno, / ... / Que tenham longos tempos o governo / Do mar que vê do Sol a roxa entrada" (I.28)) Bacchus objects, saying that "Que esquecerão seus feitos no Oriente, / Se lá passar a Lusitana gente" (I. 30). As stated before, Josiah Blackmore's reading of Os Lusíadas brilliantly links the concept of melancholia with the Portuguese imperial experience. When analyzing Bacchus he notes how the mythic memory of Bacchus will be replaced by another memory: "Camões creates a historiographic home and authority that legitimizes Portugal's foreign enterprise and resides at the heart of a new memory, one that supplants the pagan, melancholic memory of Bacchus and his dominion over the East" (82). However, the moment when Portuguese replace the empire of Bacchus their own empire already belongs to the past. Poor government and increased foreign competition had led to corruption and disintegration in the overseas areas. Bacchus functions as a mirror for the Portuguese: what has happened to him (someone taking over his empire) will happen and is already happening to the Portuguese. As Nóbrega points out, it is the *lusitanos* that "vivem experiência similar à do deus de quem descendem" (83). Moreover, Bacchus's laments resemble the voice of the poet that at times criticizes the Portuguese policy in the East. It is telling that Bacchus uses verbs in stanza 31 and 32 that signify dominion "sujugado," "venceria," sujeitaria"; just as Bacchus has dominated, the Portuguese will try to control India. But just as his name will

²⁵ Aguiar e Silva notes it was Septimius Severus who: "proclamou Baco uma das divindades oficiais do Império, tendo-se tornado tanto Líber Pater como Hércules diipatrii, isto é, divindades representativas e protectoras por excelência da ideologia imperial romana" (134).

be forgotten ("Teme agora que seja sepultado / Seu tão célebre nome em negro vaso / D'água do esquecimento" (I.32)) the glory of the Portuguese will also cease. Thus, like Adamastor and Thetis, Bacchus is able to prophesize; his personal experiences provide an outlook on the future of the Portuguese imperial experience.

Besides his mythical past as the civilizer of India, Bacchus is also know as the god of fertility and agriculture, which are rather non-expansionist aspects. In Portugal at the time of Gama the big landowners opposed an oceanic expansion.²⁶ Walker notes how, by choosing Bacchus, Camões "could represent the old order of things, those people that valued the element of land over water" (Walker 173). Unfortunately, Walker does not elaborate on his excellent observation. Still, it is clear that throughout the epic poem Bacchus only operates on land. In order to disturb the sea he needs to convince Neptune and the other sea gods in canto VI to help him. Bacchus embodies the conflicting ideas about expansion that were current in Camões's time and his voice resonates that of the Velho do Restelo. So to deter Gama's arrival in Mombassa, Bacchus reveals his plans as follows: "Eu descerei à Terra e o indignado / Peito revolverei da Maura gente" (I.76). Bacchus is not to be identified as a Moor, yet he needs to disguise himself as a Moor in order not to raise suspicion with the Xeque (governor). In his words directed to the governor the Portuguese are pictured as "roubadores" (I.78). The word is repeated 3

²⁶ Sanjay Subrahmanyam states that, "at the time of the first Portuguese maritime expeditions to Asia the Portuguese state played a significant and relatively direct role. The state itself was driven by tensions, between different social classes, within the elite itself, and between different regions. No obvious consensus existed on the issue of maritime expansion, and this explains the shifting nature of the regimes employed to harness the possibilities of trade" (290). He further notes that the crisis years of the 1540s and 1550s "witness a major debate among the administrators in Portuguese Asia, on the manner in which commercial affairs and general administration are to be conducted" (104).

times, which has an emphasizing effect.²⁷

In stanza 79 some of the crimes that the Portuguese, and later many other European nations, committed during their maritime expansion are summarized in Bacchus' speech to the Xeque:

Tenho destes Cristãos sanguinolentos Que quase todo o mar tem destruído Com roubos, com incêndios violentos; E trazem já de longe engano urdido Contra nós; e que todos os seus intentos São para nos matarem e roubarem, E mulheres e filhos cativarem. (I. 79)

Bacchus' final words uttered at VIII. 50 are worth analyzing since they do not lament his defeat but instead warn about the end of empire. The stanza reads:

Enquanto é fraca a força desta gente,

Ordena como em tudo se resista,

Porque, quando o Sol sai, facilmente

Se pode nele pôr a aguda vista;

Porém, depois que sobe claro e ardente,

Se agudeza dos olhos o conquista,

²⁷ The same repetition takes place in the critical voice of the author when he renounces greed in his personal utterances at the end of canto VIII.

Tão cega fica, quanto ficareis,

Se raízes criar lhe não tolheis. (VIII.50)

As Hélio Alves remarks, Bacchus's last word "is not an suggestion of Western imperium sine fine, but rather an order for a future of Oriental resistance with no foreseeable end" (103). The stanza mentions blindness and sunlight, which Figueiredo interprets as follows:

A metáfora que Baco utiliza para representar o perigo que a qualquer momento se pode abater sobre a Índia muçulmana se os portugueses lá chegarem é a do sol que desenvolve raízes e se fixa, imóvel, num sítio, como uma árvore (...) Baco receia que o curso do sol se detenha e que a alternância dos dias e das noites seja perturbada, quer através de um excesso de luminosidade quer de um excesso de cegueira. (26)

Even though Bacchus is presented as the enemy, these examples show how it is actually the deity who warns the Portuguese against their enemies. Bacchus thus cannot be seen as simply a mythological figure as he embodies various functions. Nóbrega concludes that he represents the poet: "Observadas as funções que Baco desempenha no poema (...) inferimos que o deus é, com efeito, persona principal do eu poético, entre todas as que lhe servem de máscara (...) o tirso representa o cetro do poeta que resiste ao poder político" (113). I agree that Bacchus has much in common with the poetic voice of Camões but also want to stress the importance of Bacchus' paternal function. As Philip

Rothwell observes, the depiction of paternity in *Os Lusíadas* is "fraught from the outset of the epic, since Bacchus is none other than Luso's father" (37). By hindering the Portuguese, Bacchus seems to be teaching Gama and his crew a lesson. The pagan god can be interpreted as a worried father who sees *kleos* failing since the Portuguese do not continue his glory. Nóbrega does point out that the Portuguese are mythological descendents of the deity (109) but unfortunately does not elaborate on Bacchus's paternity. Also, Hélio Alves notes that there is "a tremendous psychoanalytical interest" (102) in the relationship between Bacchus and the Portuguese but does not explore the paternal function. I believe that conflicted paternity in *Os Lusíadas* may illustrate how the imperial project transformed ideas about heroic glory and national identity

In the epic there are quite a few references to Bacchus and paternity. This is most clear in canto VIII, where Paulo da Gama explains the relationship between Lusus and Bacchus to the Catual of Calicut. He first clarifies how the Lusitanians are derived from Lusus, the mythical founder of Portugal and then notes that Lusus: "Foi filho e companheiro do Tebano,²⁸ / Que tão diversas partes conquistou; / Parece vindo ter ao ninho Hispano / ... / Que ali quis dar aos já cansados ossos / Eterna sepultura, e nome aos nossos" (VIII.4). When Bacchus appears at Ilha de Moçambique it is mentioned in stanza 73 how, according to legend, he was born premature and further nurtured at his father Jupiter's thigh. Bacchus's dialogue takes place between stanzas 74 and 81 and mentions how Fate has predicted that the Portuguese would win victories over the Indian people. He then mentions Alexander the Great, the Macedonian emperor who also led an expedition to India. Curiously, Bacchus does not mention Alexander's name but refers to

²⁸ Thebes is a Greek city, where some of the Bacchus myths originate.

him as "o filho de Filipo" (I. 75). This positions Alexander in a genealogical lineage, in which his forefathers also matter, and establishes a link between father and son, hence emphasizing the importance of paternity and *kleos*.

Only a few scholars have mentioned how the relationship between the Portuguese and Bacchus leads to an identity struggle between the mythical sons and the father. According to Jorge Sena, Bacchus "procura impedir que os filhos se lhe substituam. Isto é da própria essência antropológica da sucessão do poder político, e tem fortes incidências psicanalíticas nas castrações mentais, a que muitos procedem, de seus filhos" (155). Aguiar e Silva returns to the Classics to explain how Bacchus's own youth was filled with paternal conflicts: "Baco, aliás, repetia e sofria, a seu modo, o historial de violência familiar dos deuses primordiais: Júpiter destruíra o poder de seu pai Saturno, o qual, por sua vez, castrara o seu pai, Urano" (147). Alves sees the conflicted relationship between the deity and the Portuguese as an epic convention that tests the limits of Portuguese heroic qualities in which "deceit is contextualized positively as an indispensable and unavoidable resource of every good leader struggling" (103). I would add that the heroic struggle also points to *kleos*, which besides meaning a quest for fame, is also a "search for masculine identity" (Petropoulus ix).

I believe this search for identity can be linked to the greater context of the Portuguese empire; by the time that Camões was writing the imperial identity was increasingly under pressure as external powers threatened the Portuguese presence in the East. Bacchus' paternity is an important prelude to canto X, the subject of the fourth chapter of this thesis where it becomes clear how many fathers are lost, and how generations of men desperately try to maintain the empire. Camões makes various

52

references to the father-son relationships of these heroes, and as he celebrates them in his poetic lines, one can also read the desperation linked with the need to preserve the overseas empire. Philip Rothwell's analysis of paternity asserts that the Portuguese imperial project denied Portugal its potential fathers. Hence, the problematic relationship between Bacchus and the Portuguese should be seen as a didactic warning: Camões makes Bacchus point to the pitfalls of Portuguese succession in India and the complexities of *kleos*.

Thus Bacchus, like Adamastor, is not a minor mythological figure as his warning function comes close to the utterances of the poet at the end of some cantos. Father Bacchus wants to return to the old order but sees his own characteristics reflected in the Portuguese ambition. Reading Bacchus then as a subaltern or evil character subverts the notion of the Portuguese as sublime and "good" heroes, as essentially the Portuguese are what Bacchus once was.

Conclusion

Often, when mythology in *Os Lusíadas* is studied, most Camonian critics focus exclusively on the pagan gods. However, this ignores the interweaving of Classical mythology with the description of the Portuguese encounter with the non-Western Other. In this chapter I have tried to show how and why Camões used mythology at different levels of his poem. With the use of Classical examples non-Western Others are represented as black and evil, and as such become threatening to the Portuguese. Consequently, Camões alters the history of the encounter that can be found more "objectively," for instance, in Álvaro Velho's *Roteiro*. Although the poet ostensibly applies a black-white binary to distance the Self from the Other, the actual application of the binary implies fear and anxiety about Portuguese national identity, its marginality and the stability of the empire. By paying attention to the symbolic use of night and day it becomes clear that the poet introduces Classical mythology at moments when the imperial discourse is under stress, i.e. when Portuguese imperial power is challenged by non-Western Others. Moreover, the fear of a marginalized empire becomes clear in the stanzas that describe how non-Western Others perceived the Portuguese as pirates or mighty Turks. At times, however, references to mythology also reverberate a more critical, albeit composed, voice that condemns certain aspects of the empire, such as greed. When the mythological figures Adamastor and Bacchus are carefully analyzed the concept of hybridity is revealed. At first, it seems that these figures represent Africa and India, but an attentive reading showcases significant similarities between these figures and the Portuguese.

I believe that it is useful to read the mythology in *Os Lusíadas* through a postcolonial lens, in addition to applying a more traditional Classicist approach, since this can clarify why Camões chose to incorporate mythology of the Ancients into his epic. Joining the concept of hybridity to readings of mythology explains how mythology reveals the anxieties and ambiguities of the imperial context in which Camões was writing. Raman notes that the contradictory use of mythology was for Camões "a necessary response to his historical moment" (60).

In Camões's time the Portuguese empire was under considerable strain and the period became known as the "crisis years." Corruption and personal gain threatened the

Estado da Índia from within, while at the same time other European nations appeared on the Asian scene. In *Os Lusíadas* much of the anxiety around this crisis is obscured by the use of mythology. Therefore, Camões creates mythological figures that warn against certain vices, such as greed and too much ambition, that obstruct the revival of the empire. Also, they stand for the dangers of love, and the importance of paternity and *kleos*; all transmit important messages to the young king. Moreover, at the same moment the influence of the Inquisition on the Portuguese society was intense. This seems to have urged Camões to voice more critical opinions, either about the empire or about Sebastião, through the use of mythology.

Saying that mythology merely is present in *Os Lusíadas* to serve as a Renaissance adornment or to please the reader would be rather unsatisfying. Camões was unique in creating Adamastor and the use of the deity Bacchus is also highly original. Neither figure can be seen as marginal since their importance lies in the fact that they embody various ambiguities that are reflected in the historical context of the poem. Moreover, both figures challenge Portuguese power and have a warning and didactic function. They introduce two important concepts of the poem; namely love and paternity, which will be subject of chapters 3 and 4. Thus, I believe Frank Pierce was right in 1953 when he urged that a "new view" is needed about mythology and Camões. Separating myth from history is indeed difficult, as pointed out by Subrahmanyam in the introductory quote. However, when one tries, many interesting findings can come to the surface, as this chapter demonstrates.

Chapter Two: Significant Others. Female Figures in Os Lusíadas.

De Espanha, nem bom vento nem bom casamento - Portuguese proverb

"The early modern period appears, then, to be a time of continual reinforcement of gender hierarchies and patriarchal structures"

Merry E. Wiesner, Women and Gender in Early Modern Europe

Introduction

Women in *Os Lusíadas* are often seen as "Others," as the title to this chapter suggests. Despite the fact that the colloquial meaning of "significant other" points to a person's romantic or sexual partner, I use the term to emphasize that women are often seen as "Others" or as different in a patriarchal construct, while at the same time, this construct deems relationships with women of paramount importance, hence, making women highly significant. Similarly, critics often see the women in the epic poem as marginal figures or downplay their importance and complexity, thereby ignoring the centrality of their relationships with men that are described in the poem. An extreme example is Oliveira Martins's view on the women in the epic poem: "Nos *Lusíadas* há três mulheres: Vénus, Maria a formosíssima, e a linda Ignez. Em todas elas se vê o traço fundamental do carácter feminino: a meiguice" (36). The historian concludes that "Nestas

três figuras está a mulher inteira, completamente feita de abnegação. Amante, esposa e martyr: nestas três palavras se resume a essência d'aquellas que, junto de nós, são até certo ponto o symbolo real da existência, porque são a poesia da espécie" (37). It is of course important to keep in mind that these comments date from the nineteenth century, and that nowadays various generations of feminist researchers have encouraged more attention to the role of women in literature, which counter-balances Martins's masculinist comment. Unfortunately, however, in the vast body of critical work on *Os Lusíadas*, the analysis of female figures still plays a subordinate role. Illustrative is Frank Pierce's suggestion that the Inês de Castro episode should be read, "as something recorded (...) outside the central action of the epic" (126). Pierce sees it as "less independent and as less significant for the poem's structure than the Adamastor episode with which it has often been figured in separate editions" (126).

I believe that it is problematic that the critical studies that focus on females in *Os Lusíadas* very often categorize them into a specific role, such as the mother or the mistress. Moreover, critics such as Corrêa link the women with the biblical figures Eve or Maria. Frequently, studies on the epic poem exclude one group of women or just point to the better-known Inês de Castro and Venus (Lamas; Ovtcharenko; Rabassa; Rector). These approaches rule out ambiguity and diversity that, as I will demonstrate, are often present in the representation of women. Moreover, a focus on female characters can reveal "the varied and complex ways that these characters facilitate and enable the male heroism and power that are so central to the narratives. At the same time, these characters also function to test the limits of this power, often in unexpected ways" (Poor 3).

Scholars that focus on the role of women in epic poetry, demonstrate that even though "traditionally epic is about a male hero and his heroic deeds of honor" women often play "key roles" in epic narratives (Poor 1, 3). I believe that analyzing the female figures in Os *Lusíadas* is critical since it reveals the sociological and political importance of women, even if this importance is somewhat obscured in the poem. In 1980 Clementine Rabassa wrote about the political significance of the women in the third canto, noting how Camões does not follow the "political reality" but rather "romanticizes femininity"(195). I think that Rabassa is right about Camões's desire to romanticize women, but believe that the objectifying of women nonetheless reveals a great deal about the poet's time period.

My goal for this chapter is to demonstrate how the portrayal of the female figures is illustrative of the poet's stance in relation to women and gender, and how the feminine can be linked to important political and societal factors. The representation of women in *Os Lusíadas* is possibly not very illustrative of the actual historical reality of women, yet it exemplifies the beliefs and views of the poet. I depart from Juliet Perkins's excellent observation that Inês de Castro "may even be regarded as an empty vessel into which writers pour their own desires, beliefs, even prejudices, about women and love" (46), and extend this further to the other women of the poem.

The women that are featured in the poem reflect the division of gender roles during the sixteenth-century. Often epic poems are written during a time of major changes, and both the changing worldview of the Renaissance and imperial expansionism dramatically altered the Portuguese society of the sixteenth century. During the medieval period Portuguese society was already patriarchal although there was more equality between men and women than during the Renaissance. For instance, Oliveira Marques describes in his *Daily Life in Portugal in the Late Middle Ages* how men and women were relatively equal after they had started a family (166). Yet, during the Early Modern period "patriarchy was literally understood to signify rule by fathers" (Shephard 3) and women were put in an increasingly subordinate role.²⁹

The fathers that ruled, however, needed mothers to create a family, and royal ladies especially felt the pressure to produce an heir. Hence, maternity was seen as the most important quality for women and the issues that the poet addresses, such as marriage, adultery and progeny, point to important preoccupations of the time period. Yet, Camões presents us with a broader range of important female figures even if they, as in many epics, "most often act and speak from the margins of the male community" (Foley 105). The poem features various historical women and one can learn something about how they loved and died, even though the poet describes them in a way that often hides their agency. Also, Camões's personal preferences are revealed when behavior that is too masculine is denounced or when their bodies are objectified in a Petrarchan way.³⁰

Curiously, the historical women are not necessarily described according to the chivalric code, where physical desire and a spiritual connection operated at the same

²⁹ The sixteenth and seventeenth century also saw the rise of a "political thought, which approached kingship in terms of paternal rule" (Shephard 3). This meant that the king was seen as a father figure to the nation and needed to exert the paternal function. In Portugal young king Sebastião, who was sickly and seemed not very interested in girls, was not performing this paternal function, which seems to have worried Camões significantly.

³⁰ Italian Renaissance poet Petrarch imagined his subject Laura as extremely chaste. However, as Teodolinda Barolini notes, Petrarch uses this representation "to dramatize and explore his own psyche, nuancing and psychologizing the narcissism and selfprojection that typify the courtly tradition, in which the lady is present as foil to the male lover/poet but not as a subject with her own inner life and moral choices" (35).

time, but rather become objects whose bodies are often linked to violence and sacrifice. The body of the mythological female figures is depicted freely and in a sexualized manner. The focus on the body reflects the common Early Modern thought that women were unreasonable, "ruled by their physical body rather than their rational capacity" (Wiesner 307), but also reveals some masculine anxiety. That is to say that the sacrifice of the historical female body is essential for the political survival of the male, while the sensual mythological body exposes the danger of female seduction that can threaten masculinity.

I will start my analysis of female figures with the Inês de Castro episode and suggest that the episode is of paramount importance in the central action of the epic poem. Allison Keith describes how in Roman epic "dead and dying women assume a new thematic and aesthetic prominence, for the beautiful female corpse possesses an intrinsic importance in Roman political myths of war and city foundation" (102).³¹ I believe that the Inês de Castro episode can also be considered what Keith calls a "crucial moment" where "the rape and death of a woman set in motion events leading to the establishment of political institutions" that are central to the state (102). I argue that in *Os Lusiadas* the Portuguese nation benefits from the political consequences of the sacrifice of Inês de Castro and that therefore the episode may be considered as "central" to the epic poem. Thus, the first section focuses on how Camões mythifies Inês and lyricizes her death and, as such, gives an important insight in the division of gender roles during the Renaissance.

³¹ Keith gives several examples of women that die in epic; she points to "innocent" women, such as, Ilia, Iphigenia, Creusa, Polyxena, the daughters of Anius and Orion and Helle, as well as "dangerous" women as, for instance, Dido, Cleopatra and Camilla.

Inês stands for the historical women who married mainly for political reasons and were sacrificed for the nation, such as Leonor Teles and Dona Teresa.

The second part of this chapter pays attention to the mythological women who, like Adamastor and Bacchus, portray taboos or challenge the Portuguese heroes. The mythological women are considered pagan and thus can be safely depicted in a sexualized way. However, a close analysis reveals how these erotic figures function not solely to seduce the reader; they also both block and help the imperial heroes depending on the situation. Helene Foley argues that there is a "prominent role in Greek and Latin epic" of "complex and often ambiguous goddesses, lesser female divinities and mortal women in alternatively seducing, threatening, or delaying heroes and or in making their heroic success possible" (107). The mythological women play a more ambiguous role, as Camões made use of their "fictitiousness." As such, these figures while still representing important values such as marriage, motherhood and progeny, are also able to subvert the patriarchal and imperial discourse of the poem.

Women of History: Objects of Sacrifice and Subjects of Patriarchy.

Most historical women that feature in the poem have an important function as details of their representation give an interesting insight about how gender was regarded during Camões's time. Although the society was quite male-centered, moments of female agency reveal the existence of important fissures in the patriarchal system. Also, the imperial context resulted in changed gender roles, as women disposed of more independence at home while their husbands were at sea, while at the same time male anxiety and patriarchal pressure increased. However, the poet often chooses to ignore the agency of the women of the Discoveries and represents them as victims of the imperial expansion.³² At the same time, Camões attributes the historical women with various qualities, and in a sense, mythifies their behavior. For instance, as Juliet Perkins importantly notes, the Inês de Castro myth "owes little to who she was or what she did but almost everything to what she represented" (43). Inês stands for eternal love; however, her presence in the epic poem also points to sacrifice and the political consequences of marrying the wrong person. Perkins further notes that Inês's "enigmatic personality made it possible for subsequent writers to speak on her behalf, to put words into her mouth" (45). I believe that this is the case for all women in *Os Lusiadas* and therefore it is too simplistic to downplay the importance of women by classifying them as mothers or minor characters of history. Rather, the women that are featured in the epic poem demonstrate the poet's ideas about gender and the body, love and adultery and introduce concepts such as marital and paternal duties.

In the Portuguese-speaking world, the legendary love story between Prince Pedro and Inês de Castro has reached mythical proportions and the figure of Inês has been

³² Female figures of the imperial context are Leonor Sepúlveda, who was analyzed in the previous chapter, and the women of the Restelo from the end of canto IV. In both instances, women are described by Camões in a way that hides their agency. Leonor was a woman of the upper classes and able to travel with her husband to Índia. Her story can be traced from historical documents and shows her to be a woman with certain agency, eventually taking power from her husband. Camões hides this "masculine" behavior and describes her as a victim. The women of the Restelo are depicted as abandoned victims as well; they cry at the Praia das Lágrimas and show their emotions, something that is considered as feminine. In a sense, Camões hides their agency as well. It is true that these women lived in a patriarchal society and were subordinate to men, however, the fact that men were leaving to the non-Western world, gave them more agency at home, as they became the heads of the household. This different reality is shown in the work of Gil Vicente, as Ana Paula Ferreira convincingly argues.

particularly iconized as she is subject of many literary and artistic productions. ³³ Garcia de Resende compiled the *Cancioneiro Geral* in 1516 that features the "Trovas que Garcia de Resende fez à morte de D. Inês de Castro, que el-rei D. Afonso, o Quarto, de Portugal, matou em Coimbra por o príncipe D. Pedro, seu filho, a ter como mulher, e, polo bem que lhe queria, nam queria casar. Enderençadas às damas." The tragedy *Castro* by Antonio Ferreira was published in 1587 but already appeared written and on stage in 1577. It is unlikely that Camões knew the tragedy before the publication of his epic poem but it does point to a renewed interest in the theme during the second half of the sixteenth century. Scholarly attention has been given previously to the episode, featured in the third canto of *Os Lusíadas*, and papers by Jorge de Sena, Maria Leonor Machado de Sousa, Frank Pierce and Juliet Perkins have provided important insights into how Camões eternalized the dramatic consequences of the affair between Pedro and Inês.

Two aspects of the episode indicate its significance in the epic poem. First, Camões introduces the theme of Love and destiny, thereby linking the Inês episode to the Adamastor episode (canto V) and the Isle of Love (canto IX and X). The poet deviates from the historical sources and indicates love as the main reason behind Inês's death. Second, with his extended narration of Inês' murder and close focus on her dead body Camões marks the episode as a "crucial moment." I use the idea of Allison Keith who analyzes female death in Latin epic, observing that the "death of a beautiful woman repeatedly serves as the catalyst in Latin epic for the epic hero's assertion of political agency" (Keith 130). Moreover, as I will explain, the exposure of Inês's corpse indicates

³³ Recently Margarida Rebelo Pinto, a popular novelist, published *Minha querida Inês* (2011), a historical novel. The subtitle "O relato apaixonante dos últimos dias da maior heroína romântica da História de Portugal" aptly demonstrates how vivid the legend of eternal love still is today.

a gender hierarchy that is enforced by the erotic undercurrent present in the description of her death.

By using a focus on gender and the body, Camões idealizes the female and demonstrates a Petrarchan view of the woman (Silvério Augusto Benedito, 19).³⁴ The beautiful Inês is described passionately, Gama no longer seems to be narrating her fate but rather a very sympathetic poetic voice can be distinguished. However, the strong focus on her body also suggests violence, as it reveals a male gaze on the female body that is being sacrificed. This inscriptive violence, which indicates an important gender hierarchy, demonstrates that women were easily objectified in Camões's time. Also, in his treatment of the history of Inês and Pedro, Camões seems to ignore certain social and political elements of their medieval story and adapts them to the morals of his own time period.

First, it is interesting to see how Camões idealizes the true love between Pedro and Inês, even if this was an adulterous, and possible incestuous, relationship.³⁵ During medieval times it was not uncommon to have a mistress and bastards were "hardly

³⁴ Maria Formosa is another example of an idealized woman. Camões describes her beauty in Canto III and links her to Venus who also pleads to her father (III.106). Maria suffered because it was publicly known that her husband, Alfonso XI of Castile, was having an open relationship with his mistress Leonor Núñez de Guzman. Afonso IV was not happy to see his daughter abused, which led to a war between 1336 and 1339. Later the two kings became allies in the Batalha do Salado. According to Rabassa, Camões chose to present Maria as "the intercessor for Castille's salvation to assure the success against Islam" (191). I believe Maria also serves as an introduction to the important Inês de Castro episode. Maria is the "un-official" sister-in-law of Inês and exposes important details about Afonso IV and the prevalent ideas about marriage.

³⁵ Saraiva notes that Inês de Castro was the godmother of the second child of Pedro and Constança "ficando por tanto a ser comadre do casal. Nesse tempo, o compadrio era um laço de parentesco religioso que impedia o casamento entre os compadres." Besides that Pedro was a full cousin of Inês' father: "o que, segundo as leis canónicas, também impedia a união sexual" (48).

unusual" (Perkins 44). Yet, Camões, at other moments in the poem condemns adultery as it threatens paternity and succession, two aspects he deems highly important. Secondly, Inês's influence was a threat to the Portuguese nation as Rabassa explains: "Inês was sacrificed in order to assure the stability of the monarchy" (193). Hence, as Rabassa suggests, Camões does present Inês as a more innocent character than the historical facts would document:³⁶ "Although the tender image of a 'donzela fraca e sem força' is undeniably moving, the historical evidence reveals that Inês de Castro manipulated the prince 'like a puppet' and the reasons were inextricably linked to the political designs of her brothers in Castille" (193). Curiously, Camões does not clearly outline this Castilian link but rather fuses the historical facts with classical mythology to emphasize love and sacrifice.³⁷

³⁶ Inês de Castro was fruit of the relationship between Pedro Fernández de Castro, a Castilian nobleman and his noble Portuguese mistress Aldonça Lourenço de Valadares. Although her mother descended both from the Galician and Portuguese nobilities, it nonetheless made Inês unfit for the role of queen since this was by illegitimate descent. In 1340 Inês came to Portugal as a lady-in-waiting of Constança of Castile, recently married for political reasons to Pedro, the heir to the Portuguese throne. The prince fell in love with Inês and started to neglect Constança, endangering the already unstable relations with Castile. Moreover, Pedro's love for Inês brought the exiled Castilian nobility very close to power, with Inês's brothers becoming the prince's friends and trusted advisors (Marques; Mattoso). After several attempts to keep the lovers apart, Afonso IV ordered Inês's death. Three of his noblemen served as executers, Pêro Coelho, Álvaro Gonçalves, and Diogo Lopes Pacheco, went to the Monastery of Santa Clara in Coimbra, where Inês was detained, and killed in 1355.

³⁷ References are made in stanza 126 about the mother of Nino who is Semiramis, queen of Assyria. According to legend she was abandoned by her mother on a mountain and fed by doves. Also, a reference is made to Romulus and Remus, two feral children that, fed by a wolf, later became the mythical founders of Rome. Inês is further compared to Polyxena, a loyal Trojan lady, who was sacrificed to end the war. Finally, Pierce points out how she recalls Cassandra in *Aeneid*, a female figure from the epic tradition who exemplifies the tragic condition of humankind (128).

There is another departure from the historical reality, namely the fact that the poet appoints love as the main culprit of all wrongs. The poet directs himself to Love in the famous lines: "Tu só, tu, puro Amor, com força crua, / Que os corações humanos tanto obriga, / Deste causa à molesta morte sua, / Como se fora pérfida inimiga" (III. 119). As Pierce notes: "Love is personified as a tyrant whose bloodthirstiness seems to pre-figure the action of Inês's executioners, and would also seem to act as a warning signal rather than simply a repetition of poetic commonplaces" (128). However, it is king Afonso IV and ultimately the people that demand her death. The king, described as a friendly man who, as a father of both Pedro and the Portuguese people, has to make responsible decisions, is visibly moved by her speech but still has to follow the wish of his people. In stanza 124, it is shown that Afonso IV had a change of heart but that the final decision is with the people: "o Rei, já movido a piedade / Mas o povo, com falsas e ferozes / Razões, à morte crua o persuade" (III.124). Stanza 130 is similar, where once more it becomes clear that the Portuguese people do not accept the love-affair between Pedro and Inês:

Queria perdoar-lhe o Rei benino, Movido das palavras que o magoam; Mas o pertinaz povo, e seu destino (Que desta sorte o quis) lhe não perdoam. (III.130)

In a sense, the death of Inês yields a political advantage and is therefore of major importance. Camões's audience would have readily recognized the fact that her death lead Pedro to start a relationship with Teresa Lourenço, who gave birth to their son João I. João played an important role during the 1383-1385 Interregnum, started Portuguese expansion in Africa and was father of the "Ínclita geração."³⁸ So, at a first glance, these lines seem to condemn the wish of the people that do not excuse the love between Pedro and Inês. However, besides the inflexible will of the people, Camões carefully introduces the concept of destiny that requires Inês's death "Que desta sorte o quis." Inês needs to be sacrificed to change Portugal's destiny. Keith suggests that female death in epic "entails beneficial consequences for the political community of male survivors" (104). Even if Camões seems to condemn the "peitos carniceiros" that demand Inês's death, he also, by pointing to the theme of sacrifice, emphasizes how her death benefits the greater good.

I believe that Camões follows the Latin pattern of putting female death to the fore by describing in lengthy detail the death of Pedro's mistress. He is master in adding a lyrical tone, which intensifies the description of personal suffering, and as such masks the political factors by blaming Love. This ambiguous view of love appears throughout the poem. For instance, Love can be tragic and weaken the male soul and as such it can make men effeminate, as the Adamastor episode shows. However, Camões also criticizes those

³⁸ Stating that Inês is sacrificed for João I is perhaps a big leap but the fact that both Resende and Camões dispose of *hindsight* does make them point out a connection. Garcia de Resende, for instance, makes one of Afonso IV's knights utter the following words: "Com sua morte escusareis muitas mortes, muitos danos; vós, senhor, descansareis, e a vós e a nós dareis paz para duzentos anos. O príncepe casará, filhos de bençam terá." Also Saraiva connects the story of Pedro and Inês to the Ínclita Geração: "O contrapolo deste sentimento de amor - a ascese pela castidade - nunca deixou de estar presente no espírito da cristandade. Na geração dos filhos e netos de D. Pedro, esta presença é muito visível- A familia real, na geração seguinte à de D. Pedro, formada por seu filho D.João, por D. Filipa de Lencastre e por seus netos, é apresentada, quer por Zurara, na Crónica da Tomada de Ceuta, quer por D. Duarte, no Leal Conselheiro, como uma família exemplar e onde nunca se pressente o cheiro de Eros" (*O crepúsculo da Idade Média em Portugal* 55)

that flee from love and its beautiful forms. In the Isle of Love episode the poet warns dedicatee D. Sebastião that his lack of love for women and of efforts to procreate brings the nation in peril of losing independence.

Besides pointing to the powers of Love, however, the murder of Inês also had important political consequences, which become clear when her death is analyzed. Interestingly, Camões narrates her fate in full detail and gives special attention to the representation of her body. This narration takes place in the most dramatic stanzas of the episode: those that narrate her plea to king Afonso and her subsequent death (stanzas 124 to 132). In these stanzas, it is relevant to focus on the representation of Inês's body and the violence that is inscribed on her, for I disagree with Machado de Sousa who states that Camões "atenuou de certa maneira a violência dos acontecimentos" (77). It is true that the poet uses several figures of speech that suggest a softening of the violence; notwithstanding, he simultaneously includes references to Classical mythology that indicate sacrifice, abandonment and death. Pierce finds that the reference made to Polyxena in stanza 130 is "a most effective figure of speech in that it is not the details (...) but the clear import of the sacrifice that makes it serve the purpose of reinforcing the episode's action" (130). Pierce mentions those items that are "carefully listed" and consist of a "shade of Achilles, sword, Pyrrhus, the look of the girl" (130). The critic unfortunately skips over them, as he believes that the story of Polyxena is clear enough to point to sacrifice. Yet, these very details provide important information about the way Inês is sacrificed and how her body is "both the site of male mastery and the locus of a rhetoric of violence" (Keith 130).

A specific focus on the body comes to the fore in the description of Inês. Keith points out that in passages about death in Greek and Latin epic "embodiment (...) is exclusively reserved for the female characters" (105). At the beginning of the episode in question, Inês's body is immediately exposed when the poet directs his words to her: "Estavas, linda Inês, posta em sossego, / De teus anos colhendo doce fruto" (III.120). Pretty Inês is described as having "fermosos olhos" and she has Pedro's name written in her heart "O nome que no peito escrito tinhas" (III.120). After stanzas 121 to 124, which explain how both king and people disapproved of Pedro's love for Inês, in stanza 125 the poet's gaze returns to Inês's body. Here, still alive, Inês pleads to Afonso IV as she raises "Com lágrimas os olhos piedosos," using her eyes "porque as mãos lhe estava atando / Um dos duros ministros rigorosos." It is important to note that Inês is the only character that is described physically.

Embodiment is exclusively reserved for Inês; moreover, the other actors in the scene of her death are male. This indicates a gender hierarchy that is reinforced by the erotic undercurrent present in the description of Inês's death. It is important to note that the murder weapons, the "espadas de aço fino," are a phallic symbol. As Keith suggests in her analysis of Polyxena, the Trojan woman that Inês is compared to in stanza 131, "the piercing of her body with a sword is analogous to the sexual defloration of the virginal bride" (123). Another key that symbolizes sexual initiation or violation is the red-white color contrast that is suggested when Inês's "colo de alabastro" is juxtaposed with "as espadas banhando" (III.132) in blood (Fowler 190). The rich imagery that Camões gives to the description of Inês's murder is thus linked to gender and sexuality. This symbolism continues in the final stanzas of the episode where the Quinta das

Lágrimas is described. Frank Pierce notes that these stanzas give "a general pastoral sentimental background:" however, one may add that they also recall the *cantigas de amigo*, medieval songs that are replete with gender and fertility symbols. By comparing Inês to a daisy that is picked too soon, "Assim como a bonina, que cortada / Antes do tempo foi, cândida e bela" (III. 134), Camões hints at her sexuality. Marilyn Skinner, who analyzes sexuality in Greek and Roman culture, observes how whenever a lyric composer alludes to a grassy or flowery field a whole symbolic system is brought into play and "the language is likely to have hidden sexual implications" (50).

The hidden sexuality present in the description of Inês and especially her portrayal as a virgin,³⁹ is, as Perkins notes, "hard to reconcile (...) with her matronal status and middle-age" (51). Indeed, the sexual symbolism in the episode contrasts with the maternal qualities that are also outlined in her plea to king Afonso. Yet, I believe that the symbolism reveals Camões's convoluted way of depicting sexuality during a time in which this subject was increasingly censored. Moreover, in his effort to mythify and glorify Inês, sexual imagery is used as a quality to enhance her persona. In a sense, the representation of Inês coincides with the general view on women during the sixteenth century.

It is important to note that, regardless of the fact that the material for Inês de Castro's love story was situated in the medieval epoch, Camões was a man of his time. His depiction of Inês is clearly influenced by poets such as Dante and Petrarch who were contemporaries of Inês but whose humanist and lyrical texts were popular during Camões's sixteenth century. The Petrarchan view of woman reveals itself as quite male-

³⁹ Perkins notes that Garcia de Resende particularly uses the word "virgo" to refer to Inês, which is not the case in *Os Lusíadas*.

centered, which influenced the patriarchal construct of many Early Modern societies, to a certain extend. Significantly, the (sexualized) way in which Inês dies and the weapons that cause her death are also demonstrative of Camões's time. It is likely that in reality she was decapitated, as this was a common way of executing people during the Middle Ages, yet Resende and Camões describe her dying from a thrust in the chest. This "ambiguous treatment of Inês's mode of death" may have, as Perkins suggests, "a cultural cause, apart from any phallic connotations," as it is possible that for Resende "sword fighting had lost its primitive, two-handed, side-to-side action, and had been transformed into fencing-like thrusts, all too reminiscent of erotic movement" (51).

Hence, the representation of Inês gives some useful insight into the way women were viewed during Camões's time. Merry Wiesner demonstrates the increase of "emphasis on the male lineage" during the Early Modern period that "paralleled an increasing concern among male religious, literary and political writers with the authority and role of the male head of household" (74). This male authority of the household was extended even metaphorically, as the king was seen as the head of the household of the entire nation. As Julia Adams notes "there was a mimetic or fractal relationship between ruling family and kingdom" (6). She also states that, "The continuity and legitimacy of the royal family formed the bedrock of power relations and underwrote the stability of rule itself" (7). Hence, the story of Inês also points to the importance of patrilineage and the respect for King Afonso who does what is in the best interest of his people, and as such provides an important hint about the duties of D. Sebastião.

I hope to have demonstrated in this section that a case can be made for the centrality of the lyrical episode of Inês de Castro and that the episode in canto III of *Os*

Lusiadas is much more than a beautiful but tragic love story. First, the story of Inês demonstrates how sacrifice is an important part of epic and that women were viewed as mothers that need to produce heirs. In a sense, Inês is objectified as a beautiful dving corpse. However, Camões gives the episode a very central position by carefully narrating this episode, augmenting drama and sadness. As Keith notes it is the "centrality of female death in Latin epic narrative" that "works to undermine the genre's denial of female subjectivity" (130). Second, Inês serves as an example of a sacrificed woman who dies to stabilize the nation. By objectifying her body and showing how people profit from her death it becomes clear how her death guaranteed stability. On one hand, the sacrifice is needed to ensure Portuguese independence and avoid Castilian interference. At the same time, her death points to the consequences of not marrying the right person, an important issue during the time of Camões. The poet's anxiety about Sebastião's lack of interest in marriage becomes clear from several parts of Os Lusíadas, especially in those where gender and sexuality play a role. As such, the episode of Inês de Castro with the dramatic narration of her death and close focus on her body is not an episode "outside the central action of epic" as Pierce suggests, but rather carries epic action to another level by introducing important concepts about love and sacrifice and therefore deserves more critical attention.

Other historical women influence the epic action such as Dona Teresa, mother of Afonso Henriques, founder of Portugal. Her history is related to the circumstances that are important in explaining Portugal's definitive separation from León (Oliveira Marques). Camões criticizes Teresa's blind passion that threatens the future of the nation but at the same time demonstrates how she needs to be sacrificed in order to make way for the founder king of Portugal. Teresa's story reflects the masculine medieval values of marrying for political merit and creating conflict over land. She is both punished and sacrificed, as she is reduced to the function of womb to provide Portugal's first king. Afonso Henriques is a messianic figure much like Sebastião, who by the time *Os Lusíadas* was published still had not managed to meet the marital expectations of the public.

In contrast to the representation of Inês, Teresa is not described with a focus on corporality. There is no masculine desire apparent in the description of the female. Rather, the poet seems to condemn female behavior, as for instance her "uncontrollable desire." Camões's attempt to represent Teresa as a negative figure is illustrative of the Renaissance ideas on love and manners that subordinated "women to the interests of husbands and male-dominated kin groups and served to justify the removal of women from a 'unladylike' position of power and erotic independence" (Kelly 47). In order to censure Teresa, he compares her to Medea,⁴⁰ the Classical example of a mad and frightening woman. However, Medea can also be seen as a type of antihero as Messing notes. Her portrayal by Euripides illustrates "how grievously women in his society are injured by an oppressive patriarchy" (Messing 4). Similarly, Camões not only condemns Teresa's un-motherly behavior, but as I will show, he also indirectly criticizes certain masculine ethics. Moreover, the importance of respecting one's parents is also emphasized.

Teresa's portrayal provides interesting information regarding gender roles and is illustrative of the ideas of power and women in a patriarchal construct. This historical

⁴⁰ Medea features in the *Argonautica* and became famous for having killed her own children.

figure⁴¹ that stands at the basis of the Portuguese nation is represented by Camões as an evil character mainly because she is female. Women rulers in patriarchal societies were, according to Julia Adams, "anomalies, and as such likely to be coded as polluting or actively threatening, as sources of unwelcome ambiguity and instability in the categories of rule" (7). Her powerful position seems to have been perceived as threatening given that the role of women was to be ruled rather than to rule. Thus, Camões presents her as evil and neglects Afonso Henriques' ambitious and aggressive behavior as he forces his mother away from power. His role as a messianic father of the nation needs to be emphasized by presenting Teresa as a lustful woman who is unable to govern.⁴² In his speech about the history of Portugal to the King of Melindi, Gama starts narrating the story of Dona Teresa with: "Mas o velho rumor, não sei se errado, / Que em tanta antiguidade não há certeza, / Conta que a mãe, tomando todo o estado, / Do segundo himeneu não se despreza. / O filho órfão deixava deserdado" (III.29).

⁴¹ An illegitimate daughter of Alfonso VI of Léon, Teresa was married to Henry of Burgundy, one of the French vassals that aided him in the battle against the Muslim "infidels." After Alfonso VI's death, his only legitimate child, Teresa's half-sister Urraca, inherited all the lands. However, Henry invaded Léon in order to claim the lands, which led to a civil struggle. After Henry's death in 1112, Teresa was responsible for the military and political decisions. Oliveira Margues notes that she "was good in intrigue and used it several times" (39). This attitude is exemplified in her use of the title queen in order to upset Urraca. Teresa successfully defended Coimbra by keeping the Moors south of the river Mondego. She remained involved in the power-struggle with her half-sister Oueen Urraca of Castille and later allied with Fernão Peres de Trava, a count from Galicia. This alliance was not well received by her son, Afonso Henriques, who had different political ideas. Tensions arose when Urraca died in 1126 and her son Alfonso Raimundez wanted to make Teresa a vassal of the Castilian Court. She declined, which went against the desire of Afonso Henriques who was bound to make vassality promises with his cousin. Another factor that increased the power of Afonso Henriques was an internal rebellion in Portugal against the influence of the Galician Trava family. This led him to take up arms against his mother's troops and in 1128, during the Battle of São Mamede, near Guimarães, conquer his mother and take the initial steps toward the founding of the Portuguese nation (Oliveira Marques; Mattoso).

⁴² Of course, Camões was neither the first nor the last to adopt this perspective.

It is clear that *himeneu* points to Teresa's much-criticized union with Fernão Peres de Trava, and that the son without heritance is Afonso Henriques. As is known from history, both parties entered into conflict over land and Afonso Henriques took the crown from his mother. However, the use of the word "old rumor" creates a certain ambiguity about the historical truth.⁴³ Instead of focusing on the conflict over Portugal, the poet condemns Teresa's adultery and points out that therefore she is not a good mother.

Camões once again mythologizes history when he outlines the reasons for the conflicting parties. While Afonso Henriques is guided by roman god of war Mars (III.29) his proud ("soberba") mother is unable to see how she goes against God and maternal love, since "nela o sensual era maior" (III.30). Dona Teresa chooses her lover over her own son and denies him her maternal love. This is intensified when the following stanza

⁴³ Although the main arguments of this thesis evolve from the 1572 edition of *Os* Lusíadas, I would like to consider the comments made about Dona Teresa in the Pedro Coello manuscript that explain the ambiguity around the "velho rumor." It is well known among Camonian scholars that Manuel de Faria e Sousa and Manuel Correia Montenegro, two critics of the sixteenth century, claim to have found a manuscript that includes stanzas that never made it into the 1572 edition. Although the latter is perceived as less veridical, Valeria Tocca, Vasco Graca Moura and several other critics credit some value to Manuel de Faria e Sousa's findings that became known as "o manuscrito ditto de Pedro Coello." In this manuscript it reads instead of stanza 29 "Mas o velho rumor (...) deserdado": "Mas a iníqua mãe seguindo em tudo / do peito feminil a condição / tomava por marido a dom Bermudo, / e a dom Bermudo a toma um seu irmão / Vêde um pecado grave, bruto e rudo, / De outro nascido! Oh grande admiração! / Que o marido deixado vem a ter / Quem tem por enteada, e por mulher" (Tocco 42). History teaches that there was indeed a case of "double incest." After Henry of Burgundy's death it appears that Teresa had a second marriage with Bermudo Peres de Trava. This impeded an official marriage to his younger brother, Teresa's lover Fernão Peres de Trava, which would be seen as incestuous. Historian José Mattoso analyzes their case and notes that: "bastava uma união ilícita anterior para impedir um casamento posterior com um consanguíneo proximo da pessoa com quem houvera relações" (47). It is a salient detail that Bermudo later married Teresa's daughter Urraca Henriques thus creating a situation that is "doubly incestuous" as is stated in the omitted stanza of the Pedro Coello manuscript. As for the reasons why this stanza did not end up in Os Lusíadas, Graça Moura points to the fact that censorship likely played a big role (190).

cries: "Ó Progne crua! ó mágica Medeia! / Se em vossos próprios filhos vos vingais / Da maldade dos pais, da culpa alheia, / Olhai que inda Teresa peca mais" (III.31). Teresa is seen as a sinner and is being compared to Progne and Medea, two women of mythology that killed their offspring out of revenge. Teresa never goes to such lengths, but as Anson Piper has noted: "Camões is at pains to inform us of the wicked mother of Prince Afonso Henriques, Teresa" which contrasts heavily with "the purity of Inês de Castro's maternal love" (Piper 235). The poet exaggerates the defects of Teresa when he points to her: "Incontinência má, cobiça feia, / São as causas deste erro principais" (III.32). His complaints reach a climax when she is compared to Cila (Skylla) a once beautiful nymph who turned into a sea-monster and, according to myth, killed her own father.

The comparison with Medea becomes relevant again when there is a sudden change in tone between the condemnatory stanza 32 and the next stanza where Afonso Henriques' behavior is outlined. It explains how he imprisons his own mother, something that cannot be verified from history, for that matter: "Porém, vencido de ira o entendimento, / A mãe em ferros ásperos atava" (III.33). The plot then takes an interesting turn when the poet adds that Teresa: "Mas de Deus foi vingada em tempo breve: / Tanta veneração aos pais se deve!" (III.33). While Teresa is punished for her lack of maternal love and selfish lustful behavior, her son's act is also condemned. Clementine Rabassa points to an apparent legend in which Teresa cursed Afonso and notes that:

Afonso did in reality receive leg wounds several times, years after her death. In battle against the Castilians at Badajoz, his limb is shattered against an iron bar, which deprives him thenceforth of participation in any martial or equestrian feat (lxix-lxx). Condign retribution is his lot, for he is defeated by the same ferrous material that bound his mother until death. (19)

One may conclude that Teresa is represented as the "antithesis of motherly love" (Rabassa) but also is sacrificed for Portugal.⁴⁴ The poet condemns adultery and masculine behavior of women and, by referring to the classical example of Euripides who "has constructed Medea in a way that can only reinforce masculine supremacy" (19), Camões sets down Teresa as a person that hinders patriarchy. The stanzas about Teresa and Afonso Henriques also point to the complexities of maternity and paternity and, in a sense, function as a precursor to chapter 4 where the importance of *kleos* in the epic is outlined.

Kleos and succession also play an important role in the description of Leonor Teles⁴⁵, the historical woman who diverted King Fernando with her charms and whose

⁴⁴ The description of Egas Moniz that follows right after Teresa is an even more positive example of sacrifice.

⁴⁵ Dona Leonor Teles, a redheaded beauty and great-great-great granddaughter of an illegitimate daughter of King Sancho I was married to Dom João Lourenço da Cunha, a nobleman from Porto with whom she had a son, Dom Álvaro da Cunha. Her sister, Dona Maria Teles de Menezes, was a lady-in-waiting to the Infanta Beatriz, daughter of Pedro and Inês. With this connection, Leonor attended a royal wedding where she met prince Fernando, heir to the Portuguese throne, who fell passionately in love with her. Although it was already agreed that he would marry the daughter of Henry II of Castille, Fernando managed to annul Leonor's first marriage on grounds of consanguinity. The two then secretly married in 1372. Fernando was of poor health and died in 1383 and thus Leonor was nominated regent in the name of her daughter Beatriz who was 10 years old at the time. Involved in another relationship with João Fernandes Andeiro, Leonor ruled Portugal but was not beloved by the people. When she married her young daughter Beatriz to the Castilian king Juan I, revolts broke out both in the nobility and the lower classes. The fear of a loss of independence caused a rebellion led by the Mestre of Aviz, the son of Pedro I and Teresa Lourenco. João first killed Leonor's lover, which led to several events that are called the 1383-1385 crisis, a period marked by hostilities between Castille and Portugal. The ensuing fight, the battle of Aljubarrota, was fought in 1385

love affair greatly contributed to the *Interregnum* of 1383-1385. She is described in Os Lusíadas between stanzas 138 till 143 and is perhaps one of the famous women of Portuguese history who would never lose the negative reputation she gained throughout historiography.

There are two small instances in *Os Lusíadas* that point negatively to Leonor. First she is subtly referred to as a Medusa, a monstrous woman that was one of the three Gorgon sisters, also known however for her extraordinary beauty (III. 142), and she is implicitly compared to a girl from a lower social station (III.141). Still, critics believe that Camões was very mild with Leonor Teles, especially when it is considered that chronicler Fernão Lopes described her much less favorably. According to Leonard Bacon, Leonor is "one of the most hateful women in history" (430) and adds that it "seems curious" that Camões "overlooks" her orchestrating the murder of her own sister, which was executed by Inês de Castro's son. Philip Rothwell notes how:

Lopes employs a number of rhetorical strategies (...) including questioning the legality of Fernando and Leonor's marriage, and pointing out their loyalty to the antipope in Avignon. The most damning tactic is to impugn Leonor Teles as a woman whose nature was loose. As a consequence, there is no way of knowing who Beatriz's father is. At a stroke of Lopes's pen, she becomes a bastard by implication. (18)

where Nuno Alvares Pereira and João I managed to decimate the Castilian armies of Juan I. As for Leonor, she died in exile at a monastery at Tordesilhas (Oliveira Marques 124-127).

Thus, while Lopes⁴⁶ creates an image of Leonor that is shared by many, in *Os Lusíadas* she is, as Rabassa states "barely slapped on the wrists (...) as he presents the emasculating attraction of King Fernando to her inexorable charm" (194). It becomes apparent that the poetic voice directs himself mainly to Fernando, who as a man and heir to the throne is mainly responsible for the relationship, as it seems.

When the stanzas that describe the affair between Leonor and Fernando are analyzed, a certain ambiguity can be noted. It seems that the poet points to two different options: either Fernando is a weak person or he is so because of love. The shortcoming of Fernando is twice emphasized "Que um fraco Rei faz fraca a forte gente" (III.138) and "Mole se fez e fraco; e bem parece, / Que um baixo amor os fortes enfraquece" (III.139). The ambiguity is clearly exposed in the either-or question in stanza 139 where either love or sin is blamed: "Ou foi castigo claro do pecado / De tirar Lianor a seu marido," and then: "Ou foi que o coração sujeito e dado / Ao vício vil, de quem se viu rendido, / Mole se fez e fraco" (III. 139). A passive picture of Leonor is drawn here; it appears as if she had no say in the matter and was just taken away from her husband by Fernando. Then, in stanza 140, as Rabassa points out: "Camões supports his judgment with a store of impressive allusions to biblical and classical personages to show the destructive effects of erotic passion or 'amor louco' and violation of the divine marriage code by citing the cases of Helen, Sarah, Bathsheba, Dinah, Omphale, Cleopatra, Lucretia, and so on" (194). It is important to note how in all of these examples the men or their nations suffer

⁴⁶ For the representation of Leonor Teles in Fernão Lopes' chronicles please see Coser Cabral and Hutchinson.

the consequences of their acts, and therefore exemplify that men who abduct women will have to pay.

Secondly, Camões doesn't only allude to Greek or Roman myth, as he usually does, but also makes biblical references thus attaching a moral judgment to the relationship of Leonor and Fernando. In stanza 141, it is again emphasized that love resolves and makes moral questions less pertinent: "Um inconcesso amor desatinado" is able to weaken even strong characters ("peitos fortes"). Two examples show how Love can alter the behavior of powerful men; first it is pointed out how Mark Anthony, the loyal friend of Julius Ceasar, ran off with Cleopatra after Ceasar's death and, secondly, there is a reference to Hannibal who falls in love with a girl from Apulia that came from lower classes. The final two stanzas are of a more philosophic nature: "Mas quem pode livrar-se por ventura / Dos laços que Amor arma brandamente" (III. 142). Finally, there is forgiveness towards Fernando since love is irresistible. Camões emphasizes how someone who has experienced Love will be less judgmental towards Fernando: "Que tivesse contra ela resistência? / Desculpado por certo está Fernando, / Para quem tem de amor experiência" (III.143).

Again, just as was the case with Inês de Castro, Love is seen as the main culprit of this "adulterous" relationship. Hence, the emasculating effects of Fernando's love for the beautiful Leonor are also emphasized. In a sense, she embodies the Early Modern idea that with love's magic a "woman could gain power of men's bodies and minds" (Wiesner 307). Leonor Teles's emasculating love powers link her with the nymphs of canto IX that are able to subvert masculinity. The fact that Camões mainly criticized Fernando's behavior can perhaps be explained by the words of historian José Mattoso who states

that: "o facto de D. Fernando chegar a rei solteiro, sem esposa negociada dentro dos interesses do Estado (...) haverá de revelar-se, devido à escolha matrimonial ditada aparentemente por mero impulso emotivo, extremamente desestabilizador" (411). In a sense, this is another hint to Sebastião who should not marry for love but also with the nation's interest in mind.

Mythological Figures, Erotic Distractions or Subversive Powers?

In addition to the historical women of the third canto, there are various mythological female figures that feature in the cantos of *Os Lusíadas* and I believe that they are not solely erotic adornments to the poem, but that Camões attributes them with important functions. Given the fact that the mythological women are considered "fictitious," they are perfect figures to conceal a more critical voice. Unfortunately, the mythological female figure that first comes to mind is Venus, and many critics mainly focus on the Ilha dos Amores episode, while the other mythological female figures that appear throughout the poem have received little attention. Usually, critics see the mythological women either as Renaissance adornments or as literary side-figures that are purely fictitious. Post-colonial scholars have put more critical emphasis on these figures and note that the mythological women may symbolize non-Western women (Klobucka and Quint). However, their approach does not seem all-inclusive as they mainly focus on Venus and the nymphs as well.⁴⁷

⁴⁷ Throughout the poem various mythological females play a role, such as the muses, the nymphs, Venus, Thethys and Thetis, and Fama. The Muses and their relationship to the

This section demonstrates that the female mythological figures in *Os Lusíadas* have a variety of functions. Camões uses them to address important values such as maternity and marriage. Moreover, with their depiction, Camões could express certain subjects such as sexuality more freely.⁴⁸ Hence, the bodily attention that is present in Inês de Castro comes again to the fore in Venus and the nymphs. It demonstrates not only a masculinist view but also insecurity about the changing world order and changes in gender patterns. This ambiguity is reflected in the dual functions of the female figures: they are both blockers and helpers in their relation to the heroes of the poem. Ironically, the fact that mythological females are helping the heroes subverts the idea of patriarchy and masculinity.

The foremost figure that helps the Portuguese seafarers is Venus, yet what has provoked most critics is her seductive role in the poem. She is represented as a sexualized being who "invests oceanic voyaging with decidedly erotic overtones" (Blackmore 146). Her physical description in stanzas 36 and 37 urges Garay to conclude that a "gendered idiom of Western misogyny" (84) is at play. Another critic, Pedro Fonseca sees in the description of Venus a personification of the seductions of the East: "Vênus, é verdadeira protetora e propiciadora da 'orientalização' dos portugueses, uma vez que é através da deusa do amor pagão que a expedição de Vasco da Gama resulta-se bem sucedida no plano simbólico da significação mitopoética da epopéia camoniana" (88). I cite parts of two stanzas here to make a different point, because I think that the description of Venus

poetic voice will be analyzed in greater detail in chapter 4 and chapter 3 includes a section on Fama.

⁴⁸ It is interesting that in Camões's personal letters the word nymph is applied to women that are considered sexy. For a further analysis and translation see Clive Willis.

is more European than non-Western. In canto II, Venus is depicted as follows: "Os crespos fios d'ouro se esparziam / Pelo colo, que a neve escurecia; / Andando, as lácteas tetas lhe tremiam" (II.36). Camões here describes Venus as a European-looking woman. With her golden hair and milk white skin she resembles a Botticellesque Venus, far from the non-Western women she is, according to Garay and Fonseca, representing. However, I agree with Garay that the following stanza demonstrates a certain masculine European desire that was often "released" on non-Western women after a long voyage: "Porém nem tudo esconde, nem descobre, / O véu, ... / Mas, para que o desejo acenda o dobre, / Lhe põe diante aquele objeto raro" (II.37). While she is depicted naked, only lightly covered with a semi-transparent veil, she is not necessarily linked with women in the East (Camões doesn't refer in the poem to many naked women except for Venus). It is rather a Renaissance depiction of the pagan, a safe and accepted way to depict female nudity.⁴⁹

Reading beyond the distractions of the female semi-naked body, it becomes clear that Venus' role is more significant than being merely an erotic adornment. Venus leads the Portuguese and saves them whenever they find themselves in trouble. At the same time, her presence indicates an important gender play (Garay 86). Camões is, as Garay notes, "striving to validate Western forms of masculine hierarchies, against the anarchic,

⁴⁹ The nudity of Venus in Canto II stanza 36 as well as Canto II stanza 22 often was omitted from schoolbooks for being too perverse. Ramos' justification of the inclusion of this scene in his version of *Os Lusíadas* (1980) summarizes the controversy in Portugal about these particular stanzas: "Ao direito de ler o que se prefere e como se deseja deveria corresponder, sensatamente, a obrigação de evitar que dessa leitura resultem danos próprios ou alheios. As oitavas numeros 33-42 deste canto II foram, certamente por prudencia integrável nesse pensamento, omitidas por alguns comentadores (até nossos contemporâneos) d'*Os Lusíadas*, de cujo saber didático, todavia, nos distanciamos. É que nos parece mais eficaz a leitura cuidadosamente motivada, a orientação oportuna e bastante, a atenção aos riscos de qualquer referência que se converta em estímulo perverso" (395).

female-identified East" yet, at times, the poem points to "other directions that will test that dominant discourse" (86). Josiah Blackmore calls the Portuguese expansion "a masculine enterprise, an expression of male power and plenitude carried out under Venus's guidance" (2009:144). The outcome of the masculine voyage, however, highly depends on Venus, and in a sense she controls the fate of the Portuguese crew.

Hence, the voyage is supported by Venus and at several points in the poem the deity comes to the rescue. Venus sees good qualities in the Portuguese crew and is delighted about the fact that the Portuguese language originates from Latin: "Por quantas qualidades via nela / Da antiga tão amada sua Romana" (I.33).⁵⁰ Later in canto I, she changes the route that the "piloto falso" has indicated: "Não consente que em terra tão remota / Se perca a gente dela tanto amada" (I.100), and thus uses contrary winds to ensure that Gama does not enter the port: "Mas, não querendo a Deusa guardadora, / Não entra pela barra, e surge fora" (I.102). Venus is thus a guardian that keeps an eye on the Portuguese sailors and protects them. In canto VII Venus manages the winds again before they land at Calcutta: "Depois que a branda Vénus enfraquece / O furor vão dos ventos repugnantes" (VII.15).

In canto II, this guarding becomes more physical and interactive. When Venus notices the threat at Mombassa, she descends to earth: "Voa do Céu ao mar como uma seta" (II.18). As Venus intervenes, helped by some Nereids, her role becomes more defined and her maternal features are emphasized. In her description, there is a focus on her smooth chest, which she uses to push the Portuguese ship in the right direction: "Põe-

⁵⁰ This contrast with an idea that appears in the poem at various moments (I.3, etc.); the Portuguese are surpassing the Classics. Here the Roman origins are important and appreciated.

se a Deusa com outras em direito / Da proa capitaina, e ali fechando / O caminho da barra, estão de jeito, / ... / Põem no madeiro duro o brando peito, / Para detrás a forte nau forçando; / Outras em derredor levando-a ... / E da barra inimiga a desviavam" (II. 22). The use of her chest to protect the Portuguese recalls nurturing act of a mother offering her breasts to a child. Venus thus represents the maternal figure even if she is depicted as an amorous seductress as well.

Venus' maternity can be juxtaposed with Bacchus' paternity. Both deities oppose each other, and their conflict is set out in the first canto during the council of the gods. While Bacchus opposes the expansion of the Portuguese to India, it is Venus that lends a helping hand to "her" Portuguese. However, just as paternity is ambiguous in Bacchus, the maternity of Venus is equivocal. It seems that Venus is not so much interested in helping the sea-faring heroes but rather encourages the prosperity of the Portuguese people. Her wish to help the Portuguese nation is revealed when she pleads with Jupiter to help "her" Portuguese. In her plea, the special relationship (or even the suggestion that she is mother of the Portuguese) is emphasized: "Este *povo que é meu*, por quem derramo / As lágrimas que em vão caídas vejo, / Que assaz de mal lhe quero, pois que o amo" (II.40, italics mine).

It is emphasized here that Venus wants to help the Portuguese people and that her motherly function perhaps is more ambiguous.⁵¹ As Martha Gimbel notes about the *Aeneid*, "Venus' concern is for the future of Rome, not for the future of her son. Her role

⁵¹ Like Bacchus, Venus has a curious birth story. Hence, it is important to note that Venus, according to Hesiod's *Theogony* is born out of the castrated genitals of Uranus which places her outside the genealogical scheme and in a sense makes her a "motherless creation." Her curious origins were popular during the Renaissance as they propagate the "myth of masculine self-sufficiency" (Valeria Finucci 67). Finucci points to the "fantasy of escape from the maternal matrix" during the patriarchal Renaissance (65).

as a divine patroness of a city is more important to her than her role as a mother" (68). She points out that if "Aeneas should perish, the next generation can continue her dreams of divine glory" (68). This indicates that Venus introduces the concept of *kleos* and diminishes the importance of Gama as a hero. Namely, when the maternal role of Venus is read against the grain, it seems that Camões uses her to emphasize the importance of renewing Portuguese glory. Hence, Venus includes a message to Sebastião, who is urged to raise Portugal back to its past splendor.

The acts of the nymphs, who are headed by Venus, further emphasize the insubstantiality of Gama as the main hero of the epic poem. I believe that the role of the nymphs in the epic is paramount; they are featured throughout the entire canto IX, as well as at other decisive moments in the poem by blocking or helping the epic heroes in various ways. The nymph is a sexually desirable figure, hence also "usually free of the familial restrictions applied to mortal women and [they] can rarely be fully domesticated" (Larson 4). This undermines the idea of patriarchy, while the fact that they often act as "the aggressors in ephemeral affairs with mortals" points to an important gender inversion.⁵²

Camões often lets mythological figures take on a proactive role, herewith disturbing a patriarchal pattern that tends to erase female initiative. For instance, in the second canto it reads "Quais para a cova as próvidas formigas, / Levando o peso grande acomodado, / As forças exercitam, de inimigas / ... / Ali são seus trabalhos e fadigas" (II.23). Here, the nymphs work like ants to deviate the ships of the Portuguese. This is a

⁵² Chapter 3 of this thesis analyzes the assertive role of the nymphs in relation the Portuguese heroes.

good example of how gender roles can be inverted: "Ali mostram vigor nunca esperado / Tais andavam as Ninfas estorvando / A gente Portuguesa o fim nefando" (II.23). ⁵³

Another example of using nymphs' sensuality as a tool of power takes place at stanzas 87-91 of the sixth canto. There, Venus uses the nymphs to seduce the angry winds so that they lie down and facilitate the voyage of the Portuguese. A reference is made to the love between Orithyia and Boreas, the north wind, in order to point out how women can rule through love "Que o coração no peito lhe não cabe, / de contente de ver que a dama o manda" (VI. 90). Again, this points to a subversion of patriarchal values as Camões describes what Natalie Zemon Davis calls a "woman on top." Davis studies how these "switches in sex roles" became a "widespread form of cultural play, in literature, in art and in festivity" at the end of the Middle Ages and in early modern Europe (152). She demonstrates that "in hierarchical and conflictive societies, which loved to reflect on the world turned upside down, the topos of the woman on top was one of the most enjoyed" and demonstrates how women on top "disputed changes on the distribution of power in family and political life" (182). I believe that the nymphs and their switching of the traditional sex role may point to the poet's anxiety about the changing dynamics of power in the Portuguese court. D. Sebastião's lack of interest in establishing a family threatens the young king's masculinity as well as the independence of the Portuguese nation, as chapter three also shows. The next chapter then will further demonstrate how the nymphs become tools for the poet to voice his discontent about Sebastião and his courtly advisors. The Isle of Love episode contains a rhetorical message to the young king about the right course of action in issues of love, marriage and procreation.

⁵³ Landeg White notes how the "ants" is a mock-heroic version of *Aeneid*, iv. 401-7.

At other moments in the poem the poet also uses hints that point to marriage. For instance, nymph Tethys⁵⁴ has a dual function of promoting marriage and forecasting imperial rule. While Venus helps the Portuguese, Tethys seems to block the voyage until the Portuguese reach the Ilha dos Amores. She appears in the poem when references are made about marriage and about empire, which indicates that these were two important issues at the time. However, at times Tethys can also be critical of certain imperial vices. In that sense, she is similar to Adamastor and Bacchus who function much in the same way, as the first chapter demonstrates.

The first reference to Tethys in the poem is given in the dedicatory to king Sebastião. Tethys here is depicted as a bride that gives lordship over the ocean as her dowry "...todo o cerúleo senhorio / Tem para vós por dote aparelhado; / Que afeiçoada ao gesto belo e tenro, / Deseja de comprar-vos para genro" (I.16). These lines clearly point to the national anxiety concerning Sebastião's singleness. As Landeg White notes "his duty to marry is hinted at in the reference to Tethys who is preparing the 'world's green oceans' as a dowry" (229). The word "genro" also links the dedicatory to the

⁵⁴ In Classical Greek poetry Tethys, daughter of Uranus and Gaia, is invoked as a sea goddess. She is the wife of Oceanus and mother of the main rivers of the world that were known to the Greeks, as well as about three thousand daughters called the Oceanids. It is important to note that in Canto V a sea nymph appears whose name very closely resembles that of Tethys. While Tethys is a sea goddess, Thetis is a nymph and one of the fifty Nereids. According to the *Theogony*, Thetis is the mother of Achilles, the Greek hero of the Trojan War, but was a reluctant bride. As Skinner notes: "According to the myth, Thetis was fated to bear a son greater than his father; Zeus therefore bestowed her upon Peleus instead of sleeping with her himself. Reluctant to marry a mortal. Thetis attempted to escape from Peleus by transforming herself into various wild creatures, but Peleus proved his mettle by holding her firm" (93). This "capture motif" (Larson 71) is also present in the Adamastor episode, however, when the Titan attempts to grasp Thetis he changes shape instead of Thetis. It is very likely that the poet used the resembling names of these two female figures to create a link between Gama and Adamastor. David Quint points to the "symbolic economy" of the poem, in which "Adamastor's loss looks very much like da Gama's gain" (119).

episode of Ilha de Amores where Tethys no longer is Neptune's bride but will be Gama's spouse. In other words, it points to how Sebastião should symbolically marry a daughter of Tethys so that he will become immortal or a half-god.

Although Tethys hints at marriage she also becomes a symbol of imperial rule. Of course, she makes her main appearance in the final two cantos but throughout the poem she appears a few times and always in the context of conquest. For example, in canto III, Tethys is linked with the battle against the Moors. The following line "a casa de Tethys" (III.115) is used to designate the sea while the stanza describes the Batalha do Salado. When the first Portuguese conquest in Africa at Ceuta is recounted, which took place under the reign of João I, the passage of ships through the strait of Gibraltar is again linked with the sea goddess: "Eis mil nadantes aves pelo argento / Da furiosa Tethys inquieta / Abrindo as pandas asas vão ao vento" (IV. 49). In the following stanza, a hint is made at king João I's progeny, "Inclita geração, altos Infantes" (IV.50) This offspring from the politically important union between João I and Filipa of Lancaster marked the course of History and played an important role in the period of conquest and Discoveries. They serve as an example to Sebastião who again is urged to marry. So Tethys is epithetically used to refer to the sea but also mainly at moments of (re)-conquest. Her function is to seduce Sebastião to conquer the seas, thereby preserving progeny and *kleos* at the same time.

In contrast to Venus, Tethys is not a protectress of the Portuguese, as she argues for stirring up the winds in the sixth canto during the underwater council of the gods. When Proteus⁵⁵ wants to utter a prophecy in favor of the Portuguese, requesting to calm down the winds, a "tumulto se moveu / Súbito na divina companhia" (VI.36). Then, in the following lines, it is Tethys who pushes her will: "Que Tethys indignada lhe bradou: / 'Neptuno sabe bem o que mandou'"(VI.36). Here, Tethys clearly functions as a blocker, as she is delaying Gama and his men on their way to India.

Finally, in canto IX and X Tethys plays the role of the "intellectual" goddess who symbolically marries Gama and then prophesizes the Portuguese future with help of the *Máquina do Mundo*. Her speech reveals ideology and indicates the future gains for the Portuguese empire, as becomes clear from the following lines:

Por este mar a gente Lusitana,

Que com armas virá despois de ti,

Terá vitórias, terras e cidades,

Nas quais hão-de viver muitas idades. (X.107)

However, read against the grain there is also a certain amount of disapproval in her speech. For instance, when Tethys narrates the deeds of future governors and explorers in canto X, she ends her song with reference to Afonso de Albuquerque, who erred and damaged his fame by punishing one of his soldiers for having an affair with an Indian woman.⁵⁶ Secondly, the speech of canto X can be read as critical, as chapter 4

⁵⁵ It is important to note that Proteus who goes against the wish of the gods to stir up the winds, is called by Homer the "Old man of the sea," which links him to the *Velho do Restelo* who appears at the end of canto IV.

⁵⁶ See chapter four for a more thorough analysis of this incident.

demonstrates, since it reveals how generations of men will try to maintain the empire. Tethys's speech thus demonstrates that the Portuguese empire was not an automatic guarantee, but that it rather included death and destruction.

Conclusion

In this chapter I showed that bringing the female figures into the critical discussion of *Os Lusíadas* reveals something about the poet's view on women and the division of gender roles during his time. Acquiring knowledge about women in Camões's time is important for two reasons. First, understanding the historical context of the poem better, including the role gender plays, can help (future) analyses of the poem a great deal. It is not only important to point to the key roles of women in epic poetry, but also to unravel, as Sara Poor notes, "the larger implications these stories might have for our understanding of gender ideologies as they are formed in different literary and historical contexts, including our own" (3). Second, the women introduce important concepts such as marriage and kleos that will be further analyzed in chapter three and four. Even if at first it seems that female figures play a minor role, their relationship to the epic heroes and concealed messages to King Sebastião puts them to the fore. As such, the observations about women in this chapter serve as an important prelude to the final two chapters of this thesis, where issues of femininity and masculinity are again central.

The next chapter analyzes the happenings on the Isle of Love and argues that the ninth canto combines an allegorical representation of love and heroic reward with important lessons to young King Sebastião, whose obsession with hunting is threatening the nation. Venus and the nymphs play a significant role on the Isle and the theme of love and marriage is of paramount importance. The final chapter sheds light on the representation of heroic masculinity in *Os Lusíadas*, and focuses particularly on how *kleos* is of crucial importance in canto X.

One can conclude that regardless the patriarchal discourse present in *Os Lusíadas*, which in itself is very illustrative about Camões's context, there is no need to take little notice of the women in the poem. Helene Foley argues that Roman epic "often creates an explicit contradiction between women and epic by insisting on the masculinity of epic as a genre in contrast to the focus on erotic and feminine matters in elegy, and then including these very erotic topics (especially women in love and male conflicts over women) in epic itself" (105). Camões's poetry is no different, in the sense that women are represented contrastingly, both as marginal figures or central characters, as well as being subordinate or influential. Consequently, the women may be "others" but they are highly significant.

Chapter 3. "Transforma-se o Amador na cousa amada." Dynamics of Gender on the Isle of Love.

The "discoverers" – filthy, ravenous, unhealthy and evil-smelling as they most likely were, scavenging along the edges of their known world and beaching on the fatal shores of their "new" worlds, their limbs pocked with abscess and ulcers, their minds infested by fantasies of the unknown – had stepped far beyond any sanctioned guarantees. Their unsavory rages, their massacres and rapes, their atrocious rituals of militarized masculinity not only sprang from the economic lust for spices, silver and gold, but also from the implacable rage of paranoia."

Anne McClintock - Imperial Leather: Race, Gender and Sexuality in the Colonial Contest

Introduction

When the historical and mythological strands of *Os Lusíadas* unite in the ninth and tenth cantos, the mythological play of the epic reaches a new dimension. On the Isle of Love, an island constructed by Venus, the Portuguese crew has a sexual encounter with nymphs before receiving another imperial prophecy. Besides joining the mythological and the historical, a gesture that some critics see as problematic or as a "cosmic confusion,"⁵⁷ the happenings on the Isle also reflect a part of History that is not often included in official documents about first encounters⁵⁸ and that narrates a more "personal" history of what happened with men who had traveled several months on sea without female company. The epigraph to this chapter gives an original insight to what probably happened during these first encounters and how paranoia was a key feature of the male discoverers' psychology. It demonstrates the non-heroic and dark side of the discoverers that is often excluded from history books.

This chapter's title comes from Camões's lyrical poetry and reflects how love can change gender dynamics. During the Renaissance, the effects of love on the psyche gained popularity. In 1621 Robert Burton, for instance, wrote about "Love Melancholy," noting that it is "full of fear, anxiety, doubt, care, peevishness, it turns a man into a woman" (729). In his representation of love on the Isle, Camões softens rape by putting it in a lyrical form. In fact, few scholars have focused on the violent nature of the rape at the Isle that may reflect the cruelties of imperial conquest, as they read it merely as a sensual encounter between the Portuguese and mythological nymphs. Camões makes an effort to lyricize this imperial "love" yet, at the same time, reveals how the lover can be transformed into the loved one, which also indicates that men can become effeminate through the process of love.

 ⁵⁷ Thomas Greene, *The Descent from Heaven. A Study in Epic Continuity*, p. 225.
 ⁵⁸ Later travel documents did include descriptions of marvelous encounters but only after the lands had already been "discovered." An exception is the Carta of Pêro Vaz de Caminha. For my reading of the Letter see "A Carta de Pero Vaz de Caminha: Pornografia do século XVI?" *Tiresias. Department of Romance Languages and Literatures, University of Michigan* (3) (April 2009).

The sensual episode of the Isle of Love has received several types of critical attention and the different points of view on the episode illustrate the change over the years in approaches to the history of the Portuguese discoveries. Perhaps because of its sexual content the episode has seduced and provoked critics to develop various types of readings, ranging from historical to allegorical and from feminist to post-colonial. I will briefly outline these readings in this introductory section. My reading will draw upon theories of gender to point out that the Isle of Love reflects the violence of the conquest but that the episode simultaneously expresses the danger of female sexuality, as it is seen as able to subvert male power. I will analyze the rape scenes on the Isle of Love and demonstrate how their ambiguous content gives important clues about the patriarchal society of the mid-sixteenth century. I use the idea of Margaret Carroll that, during the Renaissance, forcing a woman to submit sexually was seen as parallel to dominating one's subjects politically (5). Yet, the ineptitude of some of the Portuguese mariners with the nymphs reflects the instability of the Portuguese court and its diminishing political influence. Os Lusíadas is a work stemming from a patriarchal time, and its representation of sexuality and the interactions with women demonstrate how the male psyche was affected in a period that was undergoing significant changes.⁵⁹ I believe that the representation of the women on the Isle gives important clues about what Camões

⁵⁹ The Renaissance period occasioned a different worldview because of the oceanic expansion that literally broadened people's worlds, as did the religious challenges of the Reformation. D.E. Underwood has pointed out that people during various periods in history have feared "an impending breakdown of the social order" (116) and the changing worldview during the years 1500 to 1600 may have led to the possibility of a crisis in gender relations" (121). Moreover, Susan Bordo has called the period as particularly "gynophobic."

envisioned about both masculinity and the future of the nation, and how he communicated this to king Sebastião, the dedicatee of his poem.

During the twentieth century, the Isle of Love episode instigated critical debate on its "reality" and one can distinguish two main views. The first view takes an "historical" approach and believes that the episode represents the encounters of Vasco da Gama and his men with non-Western women. The pitfall of this mainly Eurocentric view⁶⁰ is that many critics subsequently have tried to identify several islands as being the one on which Camões based his Isle of Love episode, hence labeling their female inhabitants as lascivious or sexually forward. The second view sees the episode of the Isle of Love as purely allegorical. António José Saraiva for example, sees the episodes that include gods, goddesses and other mythical creatures as a fable that teaches the moral lesson of love (163). The gods express the humanist idea and "exprimem não só uma concepção da natureza, mas um ideal humano, ou, se se prefere, social" (167). Vítor Aguiar e Silva also performs a allegorical reading in his Camões: labirintos e fascínios (1994), and Anna Klobucka has rightly stated that such a reading "makes it difficult if not impossible to postulate any kind of meaningful relationship between the events of the last two cantos of Camões's poem and the historical enterprise of exploration and empire-building carried out by the Portuguese" (127). Both views, however, disregard the description of sexual actions on the Isle and, by doing so, erase the violence that is inherent in both the description of the Isle and the sexual hunt that takes place on it.

⁶⁰ Critics that wrote during the Estado Novo, such as António Salgado Júnior, Torre Negra, Luiz da Cunha Gonçalves, Lopes Lourenço and António Cirurgião, all glorify the Portuguese Expansion and its reflection in the Isle. David Lopes, who found Oriental influences in the ninth canto, takes an important non-Eurocentric approach, in his essay entitled "A ilha dos Amores num conto oriental árabe." The essay was severely criticized and even led to a polemic.

Carmen Nontencelli-Truett does take this violence into account and argues in her dissertation entitled *Islands of Love: Europe, 'India', and Interracial Romance* that "the strange climax of the poem sought to develop an erotics of imperialism that placed sexual practices and domestic arrangements at the very center of colonial purview" (19). She also points to the "intimations of sexual violence" that are imbedded in the Isle's description as an important prefiguration of Portuguese imperialism. It is important to note that these poetics of sexual violence were not uncommon in both Classical and Renaissance literature (Wolfthal). However, the erasure of this violence is problematic and should be brought back to the surface as Lynn Higgins suggests:

The insistence on taking rape literally often necessitates a conscious critical act of reading the violence and the sexuality back into texts where it has been deflected, either by the text itself or by the critics: where it has been turned into a metaphor or a symbol or represented rhetorically as titillation, persuasion, ravishment, seduction, or desire (poetic, narrative, courtly, military). (4)

I believe that Higgins is right that sexual violence is often deflected, but also think that attempts at reading sexuality and violence back into texts often automatically victimize the female figure and pay no attention to any ambiguities that may also be present. In the Ilha dos Amores episode there are several instances that question a traditional rape⁶¹

⁶¹ One of the main ambivalences in the Isle of Love episode is the fact that the nymphs are hit by Cupid's arrows and as such have a change of heart and fall for the Portuguese. I believe that the poet probably allegorizes Love and euphemises sexual violence by using

pattern. This chapter focuses on the ambivalences of the patriarchal "rape" and argues that these paradoxes clarify how gender relations and anxieties about sexuality are central in the Isle of Love episode.

The importance of gender and sexuality in the episode is clearly pointed out by Anna Klobucka. Her article, "Lusotropical Romance: Camões, Gilberto Freyre, and the Isle of Love" (2002), is of paramount importance in the field of post-imperial Portuguese Studies as she links the discourse of Lusotropicalism⁶² to the canonical work of Camões:

The "Isle of Love" episode of *The Lusiads* may be read as an implicit antecedent of Freyre's insistence on amorous underpinnings of the Lusotropical continuum. The narrative sequence of cantos nine and ten, (...) is shown to reverberate in the unresolved contradiction of Freyre's argument, with its simultaneous endorsement of the colonial contract viewed as a monogamous conjugal union and as polygamous multiplication of procreative opportunity. (121)

Klobucka indicates that Freyre's theory includes an "unresolved contradiction," which resonates in the ongoing debate whether the mythological figures represent "real" women or not. Klobucka, and scholars such as Quint and Nontencelli-Truett, suggest that

mythological figures. Yet, as my analysis in this chapter demonstrates, the shooting of the nymphs by Cupid is an important metaphor of the imperial conquest.

⁶² Rothwell defines Lusotropicalism as "an official discourse of Portuguese imperialism, as it became in the latter part of the Salazar dictatorship, [that] purposefully celebrates the notion of hybridity as an imperial master narrative in the Portuguese-speaking world. As such, it somewhat emasculates the subversive pungency of hybridity, in official discourse at least, as an undermining of clear demarcations between colonized and colonizer" (24).

the nymphs on the Isle are allegories of "willing native girls" (Quint 119). It could very well be true that Camões saw the delights on the Isle as a description of a historical reality that is inherent in the first encounter. However, this view is problematized by the fact that these nymphs/native girls are *neither* conquered *nor* submissive. Moreover, the description of the Isle recalls "home," with Western flora and fauna, contradicting the idea of the exotic *locus amoenus* (Elwert). Klobucka links Camões to Freyre, but the Brazilian scholar had already claimed Camões as lusotropicalist. Speculating on the author's biography, he writes that: "Camões, the blonde and apparently dolichocephalic Celt, seems to have delighted with special ardour in the love of dark-skinned, yellow, and perhaps even of black women, whom he encountered in hot lands and among oriental peoples" (1961: 122). Freyre is thus very clear in linking the poet to Lusotropicalism, without any historical evidence, and one can question to what extent the theorist abuses Camões's nearly mythical fame as the national poet for his own purpose, even if Camões's work is often replete with imperial, racist, and sexist claims.

Moreover, I believe that more research is needed to understand the influences of Freyre's theory and its occurrence in certain texts and, subsequently, how they might relate to Portuguese colonialism. As Philip Rothwell rightly states: "If, and this is a very big if, Portugal officially encouraged the creation of a hybrid 'lusotropical' nation, then postcolonial studies need to adapt to take account of the official discourse of one of the world's longest-lasting colonial powers" (24).⁶³ In this chapter I will step aside from the discussion on Lusotropicalism and its influence on Portuguese imperialism and

⁶³ Two different takes on the "difference" of luso-postcolonialism can be found in Boaventura Sousa Santos' essay "Entre Próspero e Caliban: Colonialismo, Pós-Colonialismo e Inter-Identidade" (2002) and Luís Madureira's "Where's the Difference? The Question of Lusophone Postcolonialism."

colonialism. As Philip Rothwell notes, it is "a very big if" and I am not sure whether an analysis solely of canto IX and X of *Os Lusíadas* will be sufficient to aptly discuss these issues. Instead, I would like to focus on those contradictions in the episode that can help to better understand the complex time-period of Camões and offer a new reading that deviates from some of the issues traditionally studied by Camonian critics, whether they be "lusotropicalist" or not.

Klobucka importantly shows that the Isle entails a lesson for young Sebastião as she states that there is "pedagogical significance" in the episode as the poet is "educating King Sebastian in the art of 'desiring well'"(130); however, her work does not recognize the criticism directed to the king and included in the episode. Very few scholars in fact, have elaborated on the critical function of the Isle,⁶⁴ and the goal of this chapter is to analyze how and when Camões deploys a critical attitude in his poetic creation of the Isle. I will argue that the (textual and sexual) domination of the female that is present in the text reveals an image of anxious masculinity and demonstrates a certain paranoia about losing control.⁶⁵ Dom Sebastião is one of the targets of his criticism that is obscured by the use of allegory.

In order to understand Camões's poetic construction as a critical device it is important to read "rape" against the grain. Diane Wolfthal has worked on heroic rape

⁶⁴ Often the Isle is only seen as a heroic award for the Portuguese crew. Scholars that analyze, to a certain extent, the criticism directed towards D. Sebastião are Faria e Sousa, Helder Macedo and António Sérgio.

⁶⁵ It is clear that during the mid-sixteenth century tensions had arisen, both in the overseas "empire" as well as in the national court, that caused a fear of losing control. In fact, from the beginning the Portuguese found themselves in a marginal position, as Luís Madureira convincingly argues. It seems that the Portuguese explorers were well aware of the "perilous liminality of [their] imperial project" (2002: 132). Therefore, there was a constant fear of losing the control over the lands conquered.

imagery produced during the fifteenth through seventeenth centuries and points to "three primary functions of heroic rape imagery": "to elucidate marital doctrine, to serve as erotic stimulation, and to assert the political authority of aristocratic patrons" (10). This third function is deployed in the episode in a highly ambivalent manner, as Camões demonstrates his discontent about the young king and is pessimistic about the future of the Portuguese empire. I believe that a close reading will expose the critical instances of the episode, which spring from what Breitenberg calls "male anxiety." This is revealed in the landscape of the Isle and the use of violence. Breitenberg defines masculine anxiety as follows:

a necessary and inevitable condition that operates on at least two significant levels: it reveals the fissures and contradictions of patriarchal systems and, at the same time, it paradoxically enables and drives patriarchy's reproduction and continuation of itself. (2)

The scholar further stresses that "anxiety is an inevitable product of patriarchy at the same time as it contributes to the reproduction of patriarchy" (3) and points out that "the early modern sex/gender system experienced an especially heightened period of agitation and unrest" (17). Although Breitenberg focuses on the "crisis of order"(1559-1640) in England, a period in which the country "confronted and negotiated profound changes in virtually all aspects of its economic, political and social fabric," I believe that in the second half of the sixteenth-century Portugal underwent similar changes and that it is thus valid to apply Breitenberg's theory to the Camonian epic.

This chapter argues that the Isle of Love is like a palimpsest in the sense that underneath its sexual description that arguably reveals misogyny, other layers actually may suggest a contrary reading. First, the episode is an account of a sexual hunt (rape) of nymphs by the Portuguese. This hunt is paradoxical and points at various levels to changing dynamics of gender and a deeper embedded "male anxiety." Second, the Isle is a rhetorical device to instruct young Sebastião. In fact, Camões uses the theme of hunting throughout the ninth canto to attract the awareness of his royal dedicatee, who was an avid hunter himself. The allegory of mythological figures such as Actaeon, Cupid and Fama are then used by Camões to criticize current affairs at the Portuguese court and express a fear about both Sebastião's abilities and his masculinity.

Although the episode of the Isle of Love comprises two cantos (canto IX and canto X), I will focus mainly on canto IX in this chapter and will analyze canto X in the final chapter. I will look first at the description of the Isle and demonstrate how the feminization of the landscape challenges and questions masculinity. My reading will use Anne McClintock's argument that the feminizing of land is ultimately a type of "male paranoia." Closely related to the feminized landscape are its pastoral elements, as the Isle often resembles Classical literature, which idealizes a place outside of the urban landscape. Macedo is the only scholar that relates the Isle to the pastoral and claims that the allegory of the Isle of Love "represents the pastoral joys of the Golden Age which reward the heroes of the past and which also may be attained by the heroes of the future if they show themselves worthy by redeeming the unheroic present time" (35). This unheroic present time is "what the pastoral regrets" (32) according to Macedo. I elaborate on the scholar's observation by describing how rhetorical allegorizations illustrate what

exactly is being regretted and how it is expressed. The first section closely analyzes the rape scenes and reveals how the violence directed at the nymphs affects the Portuguese. The scenes indicate how love loosens gender divisions and how the patriarchy is under considerable strain because of female agency. The final section examines the allegories of the Hunt, Love and Fame on the Isle and how they implicitly criticize the Portuguese court.

Before starting my analysis of the episode, I believe it is useful to give a short summary of the events that take place in the ninth canto. Canto IX opens with the Portuguese sailors returning to their *patria* after being helped by Monsayeed in Calicut. Then, between stanzas 18 and 25, Venus makes a plan to reward them. Subsequently, her son Cupid is described, who is on an expedition against the "rebellious world," and criticizes that nowadays "ninguém ama o que deve." Between stanzas 25 and 35 various sinners against love are described. Stanzas 37 through 42 narrate Venus' speech proposing the Isle and then Cupid shoots the nymphs with his arrows of love and requests the help of Fama, who convinces the other gods of Olympus that the Portuguese seafarers deserve the reward of the Isle. A description of its flora and fauna is given between stanzas 53 and 65. Then at stanza 66, the Portuguese embark on the isle and hunt the nymphs that are first spotted by Veloso. The Leonardo episode between stanzas 75 and 83 seems exemplary of the love between nymph and Portuguese. Stanzas 84 to 88 narrate the act of *hieros gamos*, the wedding between the nymphs and their sailors. Then, at stanza 89, Camões hints at the allegorical meaning of the "ilha angélica pintada,"

something he repeats again in stanza 82 of canto X.⁶⁶ Finally, in stanzas 90-95 the poetic voice exhorts to those who want to become immortalized, i.e. the future heroes of the Portuguese nation, that they should help their king.

Sexual and Textual Violence; Heralds of Dominion or Gender-Bending?

The use of violence often is a source of pride and a defense of honor, especially among males who believe that it defines manhood. But at the same time, violence is ambivalent and contradictory, since it is often employed by men (and women) to mask their own insecurities and fears. Therefore, it can be seen as a demonstration of power and control over another but also suggests a fear of losing this power. The "other" is submitted and manipulated only by the use of force, which is often more revealing about the psyche and imbedded fears of the violator. Both the Portuguese and the mythological figures Venus and Cupid initiate episodes of sexual violence in the epic poem. The feminization of the landscape that takes place in canto IX is a type of textual violence as well, in the sense that it describes the land as a metaphor of the female body, thereby degrading and reducing the female body to an object.

The description of the Isle, which takes place between stanzas 54 and 63, reveals a feminization of the landscape. According to Geography scholar J. Douglas Porteous, the use of the body-landscape metaphor was already in vogue during the Renaissance. He clarifies that the focus on the female body as landscape is a result of a "male-dominant culture" (2). However, a close reading of this female landscape reveals some paradoxes,

⁶⁶ I will further analyze the complications of the allegorical meaning of the poem in the final section of this chapter.

in line with the idea of Anne McClintock, who stresses "from the outset that the feminizing of the land is both a *poetics* of ambivalence and a *politics* of violence" (28). In *Os Lusíadas*, sexuality is an essential part of the description of the landscape, which prefigures the sexual violence, undertaken first by mythological figures and then later followed by the Portuguese. However, it is possible to read the sexualized representation of the isle as a subversion of male power and an illustration of male paranoia, which comes to the fore in the paramount role of Venus and in the mini-episode of the unsure soldier Leonardo. Reading against the grain uncovers a critical and at times anxious attitude of the poet, which will be analyzed in further detail in the final section.

Pastoral⁶⁷ elements are particularly visible in Camões's lyrical work, but the ninth canto of the epic can also be defined as pastoral. Helder Macedo, for example, observes that Camões uses a "pastoral metaphor for a projection of the future" (247) in the Isle of Love episode. He notes that the Island "is not only a reward but a moral objective. Having achieved this objective, the heroes of the past can become the instruments of a pastoral criticism of the present" (1990: 35). I concur with Macedo that the pastoral elements of the Isle of Love are not solely a literary mode to depict herdsmen or nymphs populating a paradisiacal place, but rather are instruments of criticism. Terry Gifford, who specializes in the pastoral, notes that, whenever a work describes "a retreat to a place apparently without the anxieties of the town, or the court, or the present," it "actually delivers insight into the culture from which it originates" (Gifford 82). Hence, by using

⁶⁷ The use of the pastoral, a literary mode that has its origins in the Classical period and idealizes the lives of shepherds by describing life in the countryside, was quite common during the Renaissance. Virgil's *Eclogues* were a major source of inspiration for Renaissance writers and the idea of Arcadia as a lost world of idyllic bliss resurfaced in Jacopo Sannazaro's prose and verse work *Arcadia*, first published in Venice in 1502.

the pastoral Camões is able to voice the preoccupations and tensions of his time and society.

Macedo does not elaborate much on the type of criticism that is voiced through the use of the pastoral and it remains unclear what caused Camões to criticize the present. It is essential to see the pastoral mode not only as an instrument for social or cultural criticism but also as a literary form that is intrinsically linked with issues of sexuality and gender. Macedo disregards the tensions that had arisen in Portugal during the sixteenth century, which caused a change in gender patterns and sexuality, and that come to the fore in the feminized description of the Isle. I believe that these tensions may be at the root of Camões's critical attitude.

Love and sexuality often play a paramount role in the idealized world of the pastoral. Despite the yoke of the Inquisitorial censor, Camões could easily portray the "taboo" subject of sexuality, due to the pastoral characteristic that allows sexuality to be explored "in the shaded space of the pastoral borderland" (Gifford 66). Still, Camões's portrayal of the island is quite explicit. Klobucka and Frateschi Vieira observe that Camoes describes the Isle as "a perfect pornotopia," a utopian fantasy that "sets the stage for and encourages sexual commerce"⁶⁸ (Klobucka 129; Frateschi Vieira 198). Klobucka notes that "the heavily eroticized descriptions of the lush vegetation covering the Isle of Love prefigure the orgy that is to take place in its midst" (129). She further notes that the conjugal union between the nymphs and the Portuguese sailors is achieved "through a confluence of love and convenience" and that, "the context in which such unproblematic

⁶⁸ Klobucka and Frateschi Vieira borrow the term from Steven Marcus' account of sexuality and pornography in mid-nineteenth-century England *The Other Victorians: A Study of Sexuality and Pornography in Mid-Nineteenth-Century England.*

symbiosis is made possible emerges in Camões's epic as an absolute utopia, a tropical locus amoenus" (132).

I believe that the scholar is right about the eroticized descriptions, which I will analyze below, but see two drawbacks to Klobucka's observation. She seems to suggest that the Isle is a utopian paradise where sex is the only pastime. However, when discussing utopia it is important, as Fátima Vieira notes, "to distinguish the original meaning attributed to the word by Thomas More from the different meanings that various epochs and currents of thought have accredited to it" (3). Utopia is not merely a positive space but "to be seen essentially as a strategy." Vieira states that, "by imagining another reality, in a virtual present or in a hypothetical future, utopia is set as a strategy for the questioning of reality and of the present" (23). It is crucial then to pay attention to the critical or contradictory content embedded in the depictions of the Isle. Furthermore, Klobucka does not elaborate on how the feminization of the land may point to anxiety and a fear of losing control. The feminizing of land is often a controlling gesture, especially in the context of the Discoveries, where lands are described in terms of exploration and possession. Moreover, Douglas Porteous notes that "in terms of coordinates, pornotopia is both timeless and placeless" (10), and this notion of absence subverts the idea of the male being in control.

I believe that the description of the Isle as particularly female is a controlling gesture that nevertheless shows a "gynophobic" attitude. Susan Bordo points to the years between 1550 and 1650 as a "particularly gynophobic century" in which there was an obsession with "the untamed natural power of female generativity and a dedication to bringing it under forceful cultural control" (457). In the Isle of Love episode the space is

represented in an ambiguous way; the landscape is feminized but somehow female power takes the upperhand.

Camões's description of the Isle recalls the image of a reclining female body. The image is not complete but focuses, as Yara Frateschi Vieira notes, on the erogenous zones (198). Represented without a face or arms, the description of the "body" focuses on "Três formosos outeiros se mostravam / Erguidos com soberba graciosa" (IX.54). Sims notes that the "exquisite shape, graceful pride, and smooth color" of the mountains suggest, "implicitly the kind of anatomical association Camões openly makes" (170) when later on fruits are described. Between the breasts and legs, further down there is a "vale ameno, que os outeiros fende, / Vinham as claras águas ajuntar-se" (IX.55). Besides the Isle-body there is also the description of fruits that summon sexuality such as "Os formosos limões ali, cheirando, / Estão virgíneas tetas imitando" (IX.56) or the description of the pomegranate as genitalia: "Abre a romã, mostrando a rubicunda / Cor, com que tu, rubi, teu preço perdes" (IX.59). Jack Winkler points to the existence of "sexual metaphors for plants and body parts" (77) and notes that fleshy fruit (melon) has a "wider extension of meanings." "Melon signifies various 'clitoral objects' and the sensitivity of these objects to pressure is one of the bases for the analogy" (79). This focus on genitalia and the overall feminizing of the land seem to indicate the "eroticization of domination" in which the process of colonization is associated with the use of sexual metaphors (Dirks, x). The sexualized description of plant life may be understood as the expressions of a misogynist and patriarchal society, in the sense that the patriarchy often sought to suppress and objectify the female. At the same time, the

108

religious fervor of the time put a constraint on the subject of sexuality and, therefore, sexualizing merely objects helped obscure a taboo subject.

However, the feminizing of the land is also a common element in texts of the encounter and may point to male paranoia, as well. When European men describe the territories of the new world, a "persistent gendering of the imperial unknown" takes place, as McClintock notes, who explores the ways in which "women served as the boundary markers of imperialism" (24). The Isle of Love is presented as a Utopia,⁶⁹ yet its content reflects some of the historical texts that McClintock analyzes. The next two examples reveal how the Portuguese sailors depend on female elements before and after the actual encounter with the nymphs, which questions the male bravado present in the encounter with the Isle. I follow McClintock's suggestion that the feminizing of the land can also be interpreted as a "compensatory gesture," since it very much "betrays acute paranoia and a profound, if not pathological, sense of male anxiety and boundary loss" (24).

First, McClintock suggests that "representation of the land is a traumatic trope" which occurs "in the aftermath of male boundary confusion" (24). Throughout the epic poem references can be found about how sailing the seas jeopardizes the Portuguese crew. Canto IX describes how, on their way back home, the Portuguese are lost in the vastness of the Ocean: "Apartadas assim da ardente costa / As venturosas naus, levando a proa / Para onde a Natureza tinha posta / ... / Outra vez cometendo os duros medos / Do mar incerto, tímidos e ledos" (IX.16). Sailing beyond the limits of the known seas, the Portuguese sailors found themselves at the margins of the known and unknown world,

⁶⁹ It is also important to remember that Utopia often maintains a " critical perspective of the present" (Vieira 20).

which caused fear and insecurity. This insecurity challenges male rationality as it becomes clear that the knowledge of maps, nautical charts and *rosas dos ventos*, become trivial in these virtually unknown parts of the ocean. McClintock notes that, very often, female figures serve "as mediating and threshold figures by means of which men oriented themselves in space" (24). Here, the Portuguese hand over their power to "Natureza," which is represented as a female figure⁷⁰ that guides the seafarers, while at the same time also challenging their masculinity.

Moreover, it is deity Venus who brings the shelter of the Island to the Portuguese:

De longe a Ilha viram fresca e bela, Que Vénus pelas ondas lha levava (Bem como o vento leva branca vela) Para onde a forte armada se enxergava Que, por que não passassem, sem que nela Tomassem porto, como desejava, Para onde as naus navegam a movia A Acidália, que tudo enfim podia. (IX.52)

⁷⁰ Also the ship itself is a female space, as Josiah Blackmore notes: "a ship's obligations to its passengers are in many ways maternal in nature: it contains and holds them and should see to their safety. The ship's natural space – expanses of limitless water- invokes a maternal, womblike world" (*Manifest Perdition* 70). Besides this womb, Camões describes the sails as "brancas e redondas" (IX.49), which resemble female breasts.

The Isle of Love hovers in the ocean and is directed by Venus. The fact that the Isle moves, and thus resides nowhere, implies an ambiguity; it cannot be pinpointed or "known." Venus manipulates the Isle and stops it as soon as the Portuguese crew sees it: "Mas firme a fez e imóvel, como viu / Que era dos Nautas vista e demandada" (IX.53). The epic entrusts the Portuguese safety and destiny to Venus, which disempowers the Portuguese navigators, who are no longer in control. The female figures Natureza and Venus then subvert the image of the masculine heroic discoverers that rule the oceans. Created and managed by Venus, the Isle of Love summons the Portuguese to surrender.

A second example of how Portuguese men depended on female figures clarifies how feelings of boundary loss were often disavowed, "by reinscribing a ritual excess of boundary" which were "accompanied, all too often, by an excess of military violence" (McClintock 24). Most historical accounts reveal how European men exercised violence towards non-Western Others, and often this "anti-social" behavior "is the proper expression of [the colonizers'] marginal condition" (McClintock 25). Curiously, in *Os Lusíadas*, the female figure Venus seems to be introducing the typical violence of the conquest, as she manages the nymphs on the Isle for the purpose of a sexual reward for the Portuguese seafarers.

The description of Venus riding a cart pulled by swans already indicates sexual violence:

No carro ajunta as aves que na vida Vão da morte as exéquias celebrando, E aquelas em que já foi convertida Perístera, as boninas apanhando. (IX.24)

The swans point to the erotic and popular Renaissance motif of Leda and the Swan⁷¹ and Peristera refers to a nymph who had beaten Venus in a race to pick flowers and was then changed into a dove by Cupid. It is significant that the flowers from the contest are described by Camões as "boninas;" the same flowers that appear in the "erotic" setting of the Quinta das Lágrimas in the Inês de Castro episode. Thus, the text implicates defloration and sexual violence. It is clear that both Venus and Cupid set the stage for the sexual hunt that takes place on the Isle of Love.

Canto IX describes how both Cupid and the Portuguese "harm" the nymphs in an apparently typical patriarchal pattern, in which men dominate women. However, the sexual hunt also demonstrates a certain subversion of male power. Before the sexual hunt of the Portuguese takes place, Cupid, born out of the affair between Venus and Mars, is charged by Venus to "shoot" the nymphs. There is a certain sexual energy when Cupid attacks. His arrows are like phallic symbols that stir up the ocean. The ocean, a feminine space *pur sang*, sighs under the attacks of Cupid's arrows: "geme o mar com os tiros; / Direitas pelas ondas inquietas" (IX.47). The nymphs, as they are being hit, resemble women climaxing: "Caem as Ninfas, lançam das secretas / Entranhas ardentíssimos suspiros" (IX.47). Even without seeing the Portuguese, "Cai qualquer, sem ver o vulto

⁷¹ Zeus admired Leda, who was married to Tyndareus, and seduced her in the guise of a swan. As a swan, Zeus fell into her arms for protection from a pursuing eagle. Their affair resulted in two eggs from which hatched Helen — later known as the beautiful "Helen of Troy" — Clytemnestra, and Castor and Pollux. Malcolm Bull explains how this reference was used during the Renaissance: "it was perhaps easier in those days to depict women with a swan than with a human" (167).

que ama: / Que tanto, como a vista, pode a fama" (IX.47); the women are "conquered." The following lines demonstrate how the nymphs are wounded by Cupid, who overpowers them: "Os cornos ajuntou da ebúrnea lua / Com força o moço indómito excessiva, / ... / Já não fica ... / ... nos equóreos campos Ninfa viva / E se feridas ainda estão vivendo, / Será para sentir que vão morrendo" (IX. 48). The nymphs are subsequently healed by Venus: "vedes, Vénus traz a medicina, / ... Que vêm por cima da água Netunina. / Para que tu recíproco respondas, / Ardente Amor, à flama feminina" yet, there is also a notion of following Venus' wants: "É, forçado que a pudicícia honesta / Faça quanto lhe Vénus amoesta" (IX.49). Thus, the mythological figures Venus and Cupid set up a reward for the Portuguese in the form of domesticated nymphs that will be at their disposal.⁷²

Furthermore, it is interesting to note that the goddess of Love is represented as a type of madam, who manages her nymph girls and presents them to the Portuguese:

Já todo o belo coro se aparelha Das Nereidas, e junto caminhava Em coreias gentis, usança velha, Para a ilha, a que Vénus as guiava. Ali a formosa Deusa lhe aconselha O que ela fez mil vezes, quando amava. Elas, que vão do doce amor vencidas,

⁷² It is important to note that Venus initiates the episode and may embody this violence of the conquest, even if she is female. In fact, as Skinner notes, she is a "equivocal figure" whose tension between "her 'beneficial' and 'destructive' aspects" are described by Lucretius and Vergil (229).

Estão a seu conselho oferecidas. (IX. 50) (emphasis mine).

Venus that arranges for the sexual contact to undermine the sexual hunt of the Portuguese, which is taking place when they land at the island; the nymphs are given to the Portuguese, yet, the male discoverers seem unaware of the effortlessness of their pursuit. The preparation of the Isle by the mythological figures and the textual violence of its feminized description nevertheless reflect paranoia, as McClintock also suggests. The physical encounter between nymphs and Portuguese reveals certain fissures that point to a fear of female control or a lack of masculinity as well, as the next paragraphs show.

After the mythological figures have prepared the Isle, the Portuguese disembark and have a rather violent encounter with the nymphs that is interspersed with hunting images. The theme of the hunt can be seen as something inherent to epic; however, it is quite interesting from a gender point of view. As Giamatti remarks, the theme of the hunt serves "to save the scene from sentimentality or softness, and imply that the pleasures of the island are masculine ones, untouched by frivolity" (218). According to Rabassa, Camões revitalizes the themes of war and love and the hunt is part of the "variations of the spirit of adventure associated with epos" (1973: 207). Already, prior to the discovery of the nymphs that are significantly seen as *caça*, the Portuguese belligerence is described. When the men go ashore, the word "cobiçosos"⁷³ is used to express the Portuguese men's *desire* to exchange the sea for a sturdier surface. Weapons are taken to hand immediately, which expresses an aggressive and expansionist attitude. While some

⁷³ It is important to note that this is one of the vices that Camões often criticizes.

go into the woods to "ferir os cervos"⁷⁴ (IX.67), others defend the beach. Woods and beach are juxtaposed; the woods are described as a dark site that needs to be explored while a peaceful "praia leda" with white pebbles represents the already conquered space.

When the bright colors in the woods are identified as "humanas rosas" by Veloso,⁷⁵ the nymphs are referred to as "caça estranha" (IX.69). Subsequently, the women are chased and conquered in the following stanzas. Stanza 72 in particular describes a scene that is a simulacrum to rape:

Outros, por outra parte, vão topar Com as Deusas despidas, que se lavam: Elas começam súbito a gritar, Como que assalto tal não esperavam Umas, fingindo menos estimar A vergonha que a força, se lançavam Nuas por entre o mato, aos olhos dando O que às mãos cobiçosas vão negando.

At first glance, the images of Portuguese sailors pursuing nymphs seem to serve as erotic stimulation for the reader. It is important to remember that D. Sebastião, as the dedicatee of the poem, is also the implied reader. Since he didn't show much interest in

⁷⁴ This is another reference to the myth of Actaeon. References to the myth appear frequently in the ninth canto, and can be read as a criticism directed towards King Sebastião, as will be explained in the next section .

⁷⁵ Throughout the epic poem Veloso plays a notable role; he is one of the "anonymous" men of Gama's crew, yet Camões attributes a voice to him at various moments.

girls it seems that the erotic stimulus was also intended to promote marital doctrine as they urge the young king to pursue a spouse. The pornotopic description of the lush Isle causes arousal while it is also implied that "realizing carnal desire in the ways exhibited in the episode would be, for Sebastian, the morally correct course of action" (Klobucka 129). However, the following paragraphs reveal how, in the encounter with the nymphs, an inversion of gender roles also may take place, which makes the Portuguese pursuit controversial.

First, it is curious how Camões animalizes the Portuguese in his description of the hunt. While the nymphs are sexual objects that need to be tracked down, the Portuguese men are transformed from "mancebos" into deers and dogs: ""Sigamos estas Deusas,… / … / Isto dito, velozes mais que *gamos*, / Se lançam a correr pelas ribeiras. / Fugindo as Ninfas vão … / Mas… / Pouco e pouco sorrindo e gritos dando, / Se deixam ir dos *galgos* alcançando" (XI. 70) (italics mine). A few stanzas later, another reference is made where a youngster's eagerness is compared to a "cão de caçador, sagaz e ardido, / Usado a tomar na água a ave ferida"(IX.74). This transformation appears to put the Portuguese on the same level with non-Western Others, who are often seen as bestial and inferior. The animals that they are compared to are also significant, as most of the Muslim enemies are described as *cães*. This animalization of the Portuguese male subverts the image of a strong hero, a fact that is even further emphasized when the active role of mythological figures is analyzed.

Consequently, it is important to note that mythological figures have already set the stage; the Portuguese feel the need to chase the nymphs since they "flee" from them; however, the men are unaware that the nymphs are following Venus's orders. The

116

nymphs are no longer "wild" but domesticated by Venus and Cupid, hence they are described as "tão suave, doméstica e benigna / Qual ferida lha tinha já Ericina."(IX.66). Venus has instructed the nymphs to seduce the Portuguese: "Assim lhe aconselhara a mestra experta; / Que andassem pelos campos espalhadas; / Que, ... / Se fizessem primeiro desejadas" (IX.65). Their flight from the Portuguese is fake in a sense, since females are in control on the Isle. Nontecelli-Truett notes how the episode is constructed "as a triumph of feminine guile." The nymphs want to be captured and their flight is a game "that implicates fear only insofar as it serves to heighten and amplify the pleasures of love making" (15). This feminine guile is juxtaposed against the description of the Portuguese as "fortes mancebos"; it questions their male seductive powers and masculinity, now that the initiative comes from women. These changing dynamics of gender, in which the female challenges the male, are also revealed in the Leonardo episode.

Between stanzas 75 to 83, after the description of the Portuguese sailors discovering and hunting down the nymphs and right before the mass wedding ceremony, the mini-episode of Leonardo narrates how one of Gama's men pursues nymph Efire.⁷⁶ Like Veloso, Leonardo, "soldado bem disposto, / Manhoso, cavaleiro e namorado" (IX. 75) is a character with a name and a story⁷⁷ who belongs to the simpler soldier class and

⁷⁶ Ephyra was the eponymous Nymph of the town of Ephyraia (Corinth) on the Isthmos (southern Greece). She was described as either a wife or daughter of the Titan Epimetheus. As his wife, she was probably one of the Okeanides, a fresh-water Naiad representing the town's water supply. (Paus. ii. 1. § 1; Virg. Georg. iv. 343.).

http://www.theoi.com/Nymphe/NympheEphyra.html, 02-05-2013.

⁷⁷ Valeria Tocco points out that in the Pedro Coelho edition of *Os Lusíadas*, Leonardo also played an active role in the episode of the "Doze da Inglaterra" which furthermore

is not one of the "heroic" captains. The episode can teach important lessons about love in the time of Camões, and is refreshing since it deviates from the concept of *amor cortês*. The Leonardo episode is exemplary of how the pursuit of desire can be read as a threat to masculinity since the quest for love and the assertive behavior of the nymph may indicate looser gender divisions. The use of Petrarchism is also significant, and I will argue that the particular quote used by Camões, "Tra la spica e la man, qual muro è messo" (IX.79), works as a rhetorical device to address King Sebastião.⁷⁸ In the episode, Camões describes the soldier Leonardo, who is unlucky in love but nonetheless hunts down the nymph Efire. His quest for love is described in a playful way that shows how both the nymph and the soldier's masculinity and femininity change back and forth. As such, the episode demonstrates how desire can transform the masculine subject into an effeminate being, and secondly, how women in power are first fetishized but ultimately submitted to by men.

Unfortunately, few critics have analyzed this episode and its use of Petrarchism; however, those who have commented on it do not fully include a thorough reading of the episode and its function in the poem. Macedo mentions how Camões lived in a period of transition and was on a "quest to give universal meaning to personal experience"

indicates that Camões gave a prime role to several non- upper-class people in his epic (68).

⁷⁸ In Leonardo's speech directed to Efire he suddenly quotes Petrarch: "Tra la spica e la man, qual muro è messo" (IX.79). This line is taken directly from sonnet 56 of Petrarch's *Canzioniere* (Song Book) written in Italian during the first half of the fourteenth century. The main theme of the Canzioniere is the poet's love for Laura. However, other themes such as religion, poetry, politics, time, and glory are equally important and the love theme works as a nucleus. The particular line may be translated as "Between the corn and the hand, what a wall is placed,' i.e. "there's many a slip between cup and lip" (White 253), which implies that even when the outcome of an event seems certain, things can still go wrong.

(2010:15). The critic notes that the Petrarchism in the Leonardo episode was a result of the poet frequenting brothels in his youth where Petrarch was mentioned (49). While Macedo links the quote to Camões's personal life, which I find rather speculative. Anson Piper sees Leonardo's exhortation as "definitely out of place" and states that: "The fact that Lionardo takes the trouble to quote a line from Petrarch as he pursues the nymph is but one of the reasons why this speech is unquestionably the least convincing of the entire poem" (62). Both scholars do not give merit to the episode and its possible function(s), although Macedo does point to the influence the time period may have had on the poem.⁷⁹ Hence, the episode of Leonardo and its use of Petrarch are worth exploring for two reasons. First, it reveals how patriarchy is always under pressure and that the pursuit of love is one of the key moments in which the concept of masculinity is intimidated, since Petrarchism is, as Breitenberg notes, "a socio-literary convention that provides a compensatory form of masculine empowerment in response to the perception of psychic and emotional vulnerability" (134). On the other hand, the episode embodies an important lesson for the Portuguese king; it teaches that nothing in life should be taken for granted and that anything can go wrong at anytime. Indeed, the quote from Petrarch that contains a reference to hunting seems to be a call for the attention of Sebastião.

The episode first gives a rather passive description of Leonardo as a character that suffers from love:

A quem amor não dera um só desgosto,

Mas sempre fora dele maltratado,

⁷⁹ Petrarch was considered a key figure during the Renaissance and seen as the "father of humanism"; thus the use of his quote may reflect important societal issues of Camões's time period.

E tinha já por firme pressuposto

Ser com amores mal afortunado. (IX. 75)

Leonardo is cast as the unfortunate lover, which causes a sense of male anxiety as he resembles the Petrarchan lover who "is disempowered by the excess and irrationality of his love" (Breitenberg 136), and thus can be read as "effeminized." The narrative then describes how Leonardo runs after the nymph Efire, who flees and is not willing to surrender. Her attitude is an example of what Breitenberg calls "counter-patriarchal moments," in which a woman exposes and ridicules the amorous advances of a man (135). By withstanding Leonardo she exposes his insecurity and desperation, which may even give a comic effect to the episode. According to Breitenberg, female resistance however, also "impels masculine desire, given that masculine desire is produced by deferral and resistance in the first place" (Breitenberg 140).

What follows is Leonardo's speech,⁸⁰ in which particularly the Petrarchan quote, "tra la spica e la man qual muro he messo,"⁸¹ is significant, as I will point out in this

⁸⁰ Leonardo's speech starts at stanza 76: Já cansado correndo lhe dizia: / "Ó formosura indigna de aspereza, / Pois desta vida te concedo a palma, / Espera um corpo de quem levas a alma" (IX.76). "Todas de correr cansam, Ninfa pura, / Rendendo-se à vontade do inimigo, / Tu só de mi só foges na espessura? / Quem te disse que eu era o que te sigo? / Se to tem dito já aquela ventura, / Que em toda a parte sempre anda comigo, / Ó não na creias, porque eu, quando a cria, / Mil vezes cada hora me mentia" (IX.77). "Não canses, que me cansas: e se queres / Fugir-me, por que não possa tocar-te, / Minha ventura é tal que, ainda que esperes, / Ela fará que não possa alcançar-te. / Espera; quero ver, se tu quiseres, / Que subtil modo busca de escapar-te, / E notarás, no fim deste sucesso, / Tra la spica e la man, qual muro è messo" (IX.78). "Ó não me fujas! Assim nunca o breve / Tempo fuja de tua formosura! / Que, só com refrear o passo leve, / Vencerás da fortuna a força dura. / Que Imperador, que exército se atreve / A quebrantar a fúria da ventura, / Que, em quanto desejei, me vai seguindo, / O que tu só farás não me fugindo!" (IX.79)."Pões-te da parte da desdita minha? / Fraqueza é dar ajuda ao mais potente. / Levas-me um coração, que livre tinha? / Solta-me, e correrás mais levemente./ Não te

section. In general, the speech directed to Efire demonstrates how romantic love is often, as Breitenberg notes, "construed by patriarchal thinking in terms of loss and fear" (147). Finally, Efire surrenders to Leonardo and, even if she does so voluntarily, it is clear that the female submits to the male. Moreover, what follows is one of the most erotic parts of the whole canto, wherein a sexual orgy is described in a lyrical manner:

Oh, que famintos beijos na floresta,

E que mimoso choro que soava!

Que afagos tão suaves! Que ira honesta,

Que em risinhos alegres se tornava!

O que mais passam na manhã e na sesta,

Que Vénus com prazeres inflamava,

Melhor é exprimentá-lo que julgá-lo;

Mas julgue-o quem não pode exprimentá-lo. (IX.83)

carrega essa alma tão mesquinha, / Que nesses fios de ouro reluzente / Atada levas? Ou, depois de presa,/ Lhe mudaste a ventura, e menos pesa?" (IX.80). "Nesta esperança só te vou seguindo: / Que, ou tu não sofrerás o peso dela, / Ou na virtude de teu gesto lindo / Lhe mudarás a triste e dura estrela: / E se se lhe mudar, não vás fugindo, / Que Amor te ferirá, gentil donzela, / E tu me esperarás, se Amor te fere: / E se me esperas, não há mais que espere." (IX.81).

⁸¹ The proverb first appears in the Greek epic *Argonautica*. When the king of Samos, Ancaeus planted a vineyard, a seer told him that he would never taste its wine. Ancaeus then joined the voyage of the Argonauts, and returned home safely, by which time the grapes were ripe and had been made into wine. He summoned the seer before him, and raised a cup of his own wine to his lips, and was ready to taste it for the first time. He then mocked the seer, who replied: "There is many a slip between the cup and the lip." Before Ancaeus had tasted the wine, an alarm was raised that a wild boar was ravaging the vineyard. This boar finally killed the king. Often, mythographers confuse Ancaeus with another Argonaut who is also named Ancaeus and also met his death at the tusks of a wild boar. This Ancaeus was participating in the Calydonian boar hunt (Rhodios 2007: 384).

The location of this famous erotic stanza, which precedes the mass wedding between the Portuguese sailors and their nymphs, would seem to contradict Anson Piper's statement that the soldier's speech is irrelevant. The episode clearly reflects some of the changes in gender relations that were common in Camões's time period.

Furthermore, I believe that Leonardo's speech is also a device for the poet to voice his opinion on the political course of the nation. Throughout the Isle of Love episode, pointers are given to the dedicatee of the poem and the particular line from Petrarch's sonnet "Se col cieco desir che 'l cor distrugge," which was selected by Camões out of thousands, seems to have a special meaning. Petrarch's sonnet⁸² "gives form to the opposition between the lover's passionate hopes and his feared disappointment" (Musa 558). In that sense the sonnet reflects Leonardo's feelings, as he fears Efire's rejection. Petrarch repeats three proverbs in his sonnet, which he couches as a question. Camões modifies the question into a warning, which is significant because it may be read as a warning to Sebastião as well as the conservative aristocracy that opposed to the maritime expansion. Moreover, the proverb that Camões uses is spelled differently. José da Costa Miranda claims that the proverb was taken from Ariosto's *Orlando Furioso*, who indeed also uses Petrarch's line in a modified way. I believe that especially the meaning of the

⁸² Musa gives the following translation: "If, counting all the hours with blind desire / gnawing my heart, I tell myself the truth, / then now, while I am speaking, time is passing, / the time promised to me and my pity. / What shadow is so cruel to harm the seed / that is so close to the desired fruit? / And in my sheepfold what wild beast is roaring? / Between the grain and hand what wall exists? / Alas, I do not know, but I know well / that Love, to make my life more sorrowful, / has led me into such joyous hope, / and now what I once read comes back to mind: / before the day we finally depart / a man cannot consider himself blest" (93).

proverb; namely that even when the outcome seems certain things may still go wrong, is of importance here.

Therefore, the use of Petrarch is not only an intertextual gesture to suggest "uma ilustre ascendência de amores irrealizados e irrealizáveis" as Frateschi Vieira notes (202). Petrarchism was highly popular in the final decades of the sixteenth century and "provided a discourse available to poets and to the culture in general during historical moments of uncertainty toward the prevailing sex/gender system" (Breitenberg 134). Camões's time also contained uncertainty, which not only stemmed from the socioeconomic and religious changes but was also due to King Sebastião's failure to display masculine behavior. The king showed little interest in women but rather preferred hunting, which caused anxiety as he was not performing his paternal duty and fulfilling the requirement of creating an heir. It is significant that the theme of hunting reappears through the use of this Petrarchan line. In Petrarch, the sonnet has a more agricultural meaning, yet, as stated before, Camões wanted to convince Portugal's landowning aristocracy, who were often avid hunters like Sebastião, of the need for maritime expansion. Also, the origin of the proverb that appears first in the Argonautica refers to the boar hunt. Hence, Camões perhaps used this particular line to criticize the obsessive hunting of Sebastião. It is also possible that Petrarch's sentence refers to the national situation of the time period when the poem was written. In his effort to revitalize the imperial efforts of Portugal, Camões may thus have used the Pertrarchan sentence as a warning, similar to that of the Old Man of Restelo, or as they are uttered at the end of several cantos. As I will point out in the next section, there are other moments where

Camões uses mythology to condemn D. Sebastião's lack of interest in women and his poor judgment when appointing people at the royal court.

"E fareis claro o Rei, que tanto amais." The Allegorized Rhetoric of Canto IX.

The feminized description of the Isle, as well as the sexual encounter of sailors and nymphs, is replete with hunting images that reveal the right course of action for Sebastião. The sexualized description of the hunt works as a rhetorical device, and the "rape imagery" may have had an important purpose for its readers. In this section I analyze the rhetorical allegorizations that the poet uses to address his dedicatee, and to what extent the images of sexuality may be of a more critical nature. As mentioned in the introduction of this chapter, Diane Wolfthal has pointed to the three functions of "rape imagery." The first two functions - the promoting of marriage and the providing of erotic pleasure - can be readily recognized in cantos IX and X of Os Lusíadas. Wolfthal summarizes the third function as "to assert the political authority of aristocratic patrons" (10). She emphasizes that "heroic' rape imagery aroused not only sexual desire but also feelings of omnipotence" (23). Hence, often patriotism permitted sexual violence or any ruthless acts that "would assure the future of the nation" (23). However, Os Lusíadas reveals that the future of the nation is a source of worry for Camões, who criticizes his aristocratic patrons through the use of mythological figures such as Actaeon, Cupid and Fama, all of whom reference aspects that are insubstantial in Sebastião, such as masculinity, love and glory.

Camões uses various allegorizations to draw the attention of his dedicatee and

denounce certain aspects of Sebastião and his courtly advisors. At the same time the poet tries to persuade the King and the aristocracy to take a different course. For instance, Camões uses the myth of Actaeon as a rhetorical device to warn Sebastião against his abstinence from women. Camões describes the Isle of Love not only as a pedagogical example but he also suggests that Sebastião is neglecting his masculinity. By linking Sebastião to Actaeon who "Foge da gente e bela forma humana" (IX.26), it is suggested that Sebastião is effeminate, unable to pursue both his masculine and his royal duties. In addition, the mythological figure Fama instructs the king about the requirements of the Portuguese heroic. The delights of the Isle of Love thus have a double function; they both entice the reader and lament the course of the nation.⁸³

The critical content of the ninth canto is, unfortunately, hardly discussed by scholars, which is probably due to the fact that the canto is often viewed as an allegory. In fact, Camões points at the allegorical content of the Isle of Love at the end of canto IX, when he mentions that it is a "ilha angélica pintada" (IX.89) and also towards the end of the tenth canto when Tethys mentions:

Aqui, só verdadeiros, gloriosos Divos estão, porque eu, Saturno e Jano, Júpiter, Juno, fomos fabulosos, Fingidos de mortal e cego engano. Só pera fazer versos deleitosos

⁸³ Costa Ramalho points to another important testimony of a literary text that criticizes D. Sebastião's behavior; *Desenganos dos Perdidos* by D. Gaspar de Leão which was printed in Goa in 1573.

Servimos; e, se mais o trato humano

Nos pode dar, é só que o nome nosso

Nestas estrelas pôs o engenho vosso. (X.82)

These lines have instigated a long debate on the allegorical content of the episode. While they may indicate that the episode should be understood as purely symbolic, they may also undermine the whole mythological machinery of the poem. It is clear that, with these lines, Camões gives a Catholic explanation that likely pleased the Inquisition. Silva Dias,⁸⁴ Pierce, and Giamatti all reject the idea that the "poem had been interfered with by the Inquisition or that [Camões] held views that could meet with its disapproval" (Pierce 108). However, I believe that it is also possible that the poet likely adapted his work to the changing censorship and ideas about religion in general. For instance, Raman, who identifies the work as "post-tridentine,"⁸⁵ believes that Camões in this stanza "largely disowns his pagan supernatural scheme, apparently in order to harmonize the epic's classical antecedents with the dictates of Christianity" (33).

Pointing to the fakeness of the Isle indicates that the poet plays with the notion of "truth," while balancing his art with the demands of the Inquisitorial board, or perhaps

⁸⁴ Giamatti and Pierce both refer to Silva Dias whose opinion is that: "Camões effectivamente não podia ter intenção de contrariar as crenças catholicas, e singularmente enganado andará quem supuser que em matéria religiosa será licito comparar o Poeta sequer a Damião de Goes" (xxii).

⁸⁵ Post-tridentine Catholicism was a response to the changing world of the sixteenth century. H. Outram Evennett sees it as an "evolutionary adaptation of the Catholic religion and of the Catholic church to new forces both in the spiritual and in the material order" (3).

even his own beliefs. Camões likely used allegory as part of Euhemerism,⁸⁶ as a form of self-censorship, in order to say what he couldn't under the Inquisition. It is also important to note that allegory, which had originated in philosophy and moved into poetry, became established during the times of Homer as a rhetorical device (Most 37). John de Oliveira e Silva warns that: "A failure to acknowledge the allegorical dimensions of the work, i.e., not making a distinction between the veil and the 'idea' behind it, will obviate an appreciation for the *Lusíadas* as anything more than a superficially ideological, historical, or bibliographical literary work" (742). It is thus important to look at the "rhetorical technique of voice and address, together with its allegorical poetics," since, as Camões asserts, "pela sombra conhece a verdadeira" (VII.51) (Oliveira e Silva). Stanzas 25 to 35 are especially adverse and therefore require even more reading against the grain, as they are interspersed with allegorical messages to Sebastião and his advisors. Therefore, I believe that these allegorizations require a more careful analysis, as they reveal a voice similar to the critical exclamations at the end of most cantos and illustrate the poet's stance on royal masculinity.

The poet's disquiet about the course of the nation results in a rhetorical appeal to renew Portuguese glory. Todd Reeser investigates the French Renaissance and notes that the focus on the (male) heir is "another potential source of masculine anxiety."⁸⁷ Reeser

⁸⁶ Euhemerism is a rationalizing method of interpretation that treats mythological accounts as a reflection of actual historical events shaped by retelling and traditional mores. One of its main scholars is Jean Seznec, *The Survival of the Pagan Gods: Mythological Tradition in Renaissance Humanism and Art.*

⁸⁷ Reeser makes a case study of French king Henri III (1574-89) who was "Unable to produce a male heir and repeatedly accused of tyranny, sodomy, effeminacy, excess, and various other vices" (241). He examines Thomas Artus's *L'Isle des hermaphrodites* (The Island of the Hermaphrodites), first published in 1605 but probably written earlier:

states that: "Sexual impotency, or an unstable reproductive sexuality on the part of the king, becomes a potential way in which royal masculinity can not be taken for granted and must be earned" (240). Thus, the production of a royal descendant and the preservation of male power are intrinsically linked. In Portugal, however, this royal male power was declining, since Sebastião had not yet secured the future of the Portuguese nation by having children. The Portuguese were preoccupied with the King's excessive lifestyle and, as Américo da Costa Ramalho points out, "era patente a sua misoginia" (71). The lack of an heir not only threatened the Portuguese nation but also Sebastião's masculinity. In fact, "without a conjugal other" as Reeser notes, "moderate masculinity cannot operate, and the gendered analogies break down" (45). Also the absence of children was seen as negative, according to Valeria Finucci, who connects paternity to masculinity and notes that men who were unable to father were seen as effeminate during the Renaissance (178).

Few Camonian critics comment on Camões's disapproval of Sebastião that is present in the ninth canto and thus far no one recognized the masculine anxiety that Sebastião's conduct may have created. Faria e Sousa, Macedo and António Sérgio, do note how Cupid is used by Camões as a tool to criticize the mismanagement of the Portuguese court and nation. The son of Venus appears between stanzas 25 and 35 where

[&]quot;Written in the travel narrative genre, the text depicts a group of shipwrecked explorers who happen upon an island ruled by a hermaphroditic king and inhabited by other hermaphrodites. Portraying the king and his minions in this way, the Isle is generally considered a highly satirical text of the court of Henri III, in which gender deviance-or more precisely, masculinity deviance-is central to critiques of the king" (242). Although Camões never calls Sebastião a hermaphrodite there are some interesting similarities between the two kings. Artus uses the Isle to mock Henri III's policy and I believe that some elements of mockery can also be found in the Isle of Love episode.

he observes how people corrupt the concept of love. At stanza 26 he observes Actaeon, the hunter from Classical mythology, who allegorizes Sebastião. António Sérgio rightly states that the comments from these stanzas are not a general critique of a lack of morals but a very explicit address to the young king and his advisors. Especially, the line "há dias" (IX.25) indicates that the poet is referencing to his own time-period. According to Macedo, these stanzas give an "account of corruption and injustice in high places" (Macedo 12). It is suggested that the world is ruled by egoism and self-love and that the courtly advisors are not the right people to influence the "novo trigo florescente" i.e. Sebastião:

Vê que esses que frequentam os reais Paços, por verdadeira e sã doutrina Vendem adulação, que mal consente Mondar-se o novo trigo florescente (IX.27).

The subsequent stanzas 28 and 29 conclude the errors of both king and country and also start with the verb $V\hat{e}$, as if the poet is trying to make his readers see the vices as well. Macedo states that these stanzas describe how Sebastião is neglecting his "public duty" that "amounts to a rejection of *caritas patriae* (love of country) so dear to civic humanism" (13).

I believe that the ninth canto also uses allegory to caution against a neglect of masculine behavior in Sebastião and to rhetorically advise him on how to become a heroic male. Sérgio and Macedo rightly state that the references to Actaeon in *Os*

Lusíadas point quite clearly to Dom Sebastião. Obsessed with hunting, the boy king was sinning "against love both in the narrow sense of rejecting women and marriage, and in the broader sense of neglecting the public good" (Macedo 12). However, the critic does not elaborate or explain in what ways the well being of the public was being overlooked. Yet, I argue that the myth of Actaeon reveals Camões's discontent about Sebastião, who was deemed too inexperienced and immoderate to rule the public.

The famous myth of Actaeon and Diana was a popular subject in Classical and Renaissance art and various versions are known.⁸⁸ Probably the main source for Camões is Ovid's *Metamorphoses*, which treats the myth in Book III. In *Os Lusíadas* it is Cupid who observes Actaeon:

Via Acteon na caça tão austero,

De cego na alegria bruta, insana, Que por seguir um feio animal fero,

Foge da gente e bela forma humana;

E por castigo quer, doce e severo,

Mostrar-lhe a formosura de Diana;

E guarde-se não seja ainda comido

⁸⁸ In Classic literature Actaeon appears as a hunter and Theban hero. The Classical myth narrates how one day he saw Diana bathing naked. Diana is the goddess of the hunt and known for her virginity; she is one of the three maiden goddesses who, together with Minerva and Vesta, swore never to marry. She thus became a protectress of women and virgins and is an emblem of chastity. With his desiring gaze Actaeon embarrassed Diana and to punish him for his sin she transformed him into a stag. Unable to speak and defend himself Actaeon was killed by his own hunting dogs that subsequently attacked their owner whom they no longer recognized. For an in depth analysis of the various sources of the myth see Lamar Ronald Lacy, "Aktaion and a Lost 'Bath of Artemis'" *The Journal of Hellenic Studies* 110 (1990: 26-42).

Desses cães que agora ama, e consumido (IX.26).

What Actaeon and Sebastião have in common is their love for hunting, although Actaeon's desire is directed not only at the animals he hunts but as well at the maiden goddess Diana. Sebastião, on the other hand, took part in "hyper-masculine activities such as jousting and hunting" (Johnson 22) without showing any interest in women. In fact, during the seventeenth century Francisco Manuel de Melo commented in his *Carta de Guia de Casados* how men at Sebastião's court pretended to be more masculine so as to hide divergent behavior: "como se poderá crer que naquele reinado de el-rei D. Sebastião, em que os homens se fingiam de ferro, por contemplação dos excessos de el-rei, era costume andarem os fidalgos mancebos encostados em seus pajens, como hoje as damas?" (103-104) Hence, it seems that masculinity was something that needed to be performed, and by emphasizing male activities such as hunting one could divert the attention from any controversy around the king.⁸⁹

It is important to remember that, in the patriarchal society of the sixteenth century, family was the bedrock of the nation and for a monarch it was paramount to be "seen to subsume and control the royal family-household and, by metaphorical extension, the entire kingdom or empire" (Adams 7). Yet, Camões appears to know that finding an appropriate spouse for the prince was not an easy task, and high standards were in order. It seems that the poet was well aware of the crisis at the court; Sebastião apparently

⁸⁹ Some historians such as Johnson and Fernando Bruquetas de Castro have suggested that the king had feelings of homosexuality. Whether Sebastião fell for men or not is perhaps not of great importance here, but it is clear that there was some controversy about his lack of interest in women, which caused anxiety.

received some marriage proposals that he declined and it's known that his grandmother Catherine of Austria tried to arrange a wedding for her grandson several times.

Consequently, the poet condemns incest through the allegory of inexperienced cherubs who create imperfect relationships: "Destes tiros assim desordenados, / ... / Nascem amores mil desconcertados ... / ...nos heróis de altos estados" (IX.34). Camões alludes to royal inbreeding, which was not uncommon among royal classes in those days, by referring to incestuous cases of Classical mythology: "Exemplos mil se vêem de amor nefando, / Qual o das moças Bíbli e Cinireia, / Um mancebo de Assíria, um de Judeia" (IX.34).⁹⁰ Thus, the poet seems to condemn Sebastião's lack of interest in women not only because it would threaten the chance of having royal progeny, as he notices that the right candidate should be chosen, but rather seems hesitant about the young king's abilities and character.

Sebastião's misogyny and dubious sexuality causes the poet to question his ability to rule the nation. Normally, sexual imagery was attributed to kings to create an image of the omnipotent ruler, but in Camões the description of rape reveals fissures that question masculinity and power. Todd Reeser has noted a "gendered crisis" around the French king Henri III during the late Renaissance and sees it as a "manifestation of a cultural fear that the king be unable to rule his kingdom because he cannot rule himself" (30). I believe that it is valid to state that such a cultural fear also existed in Portugal and will demonstrate the expressions of this anxiety in the representation of the Actaeon myth and the allegorization of Fama. Margaret Carroll has shown that aristocratic rulers identified

⁹⁰ References are made to Byblis who fell in love with her brother, to Amnon the son of King David and who raped his sister Tamar, to Ninyas who was possibly the son of Semiramis, with whom he had an affair (White 252).

with heroes and gods who had absolute power and operated above the law (5); however, the fact that Camões identifies his royal dedicatee with Actaeon, who is not such a powerful hero, elucidates how Sebastião's abilities were also scrutinized.

It is important to note that a remarkable gender inversion takes place in the myth of Actaeon and Diana. At first, Actaeon is in power when his male gaze "penetrates" the body of Diana. Then, Diana punishes Actaeon by splashing water on him with which she returns the violence of his gaze. Finally, Actaeon transforms into a stag and is consequently eaten by his own dogs. When Actaeon loses his speech he is no longer in power, and after the metamorphosis he also becomes subject to a violent gaze as Salzmann-Micthell observes: "While a hunter, an epitome of masculinity, particularly in sexuality, Actaeon was the one who controlled his prey with his eyes; his gaze was fixed on the prey. As a stag, he is the object of the gaze of his hounds and the target of their desire" (51). In Camões, however, the ocular "rape" of Diana is not described as clearly as is the defeat and death of Actaeon. Thereby, the poet seems to suggest that his Actaeon, i.e. Sebastião, is being transformed into a weaker "effeminate" being.

Besides their shared love for hunting, Actaeon and Sebastião have another interesting commonality. Salzmann-Mitchell notes that Actaeon is "an 'incomplete' or problematic male whose youth makes him a *puer*" in the sense that he is "stranded on the threshold of mature masculinity, and that he has not stopped being a child" (58). The Portuguese boy king also seems stranded and not able to perform his masculinity to the fullest. Even before he was born, Sebastião had already received the cognomen *o desejado* and had to meet the high expectations of the public. Sebastião was fourteen years old when he inherited the throne, and although he was no longer considered a minor, it seems that Camões did doubt his experience. Reeser demonstrates how during the Renaissance the general opinion was that "childhood and adulthood were distinct stages" and that especially boys were sent to "the pedagogue" who would "develop his masculinity by separating him from the clinging mother/nurse" (94). Sebastião's case reflects this practice, as his own mother Juana de Austria left him at three months of age with his grandmother who picked D. Aleixo de Meneses as a guardian (Johnson 11). The young prince had grown up mostly in the presence of men and Jesuits, yet, he still lacked experience and masculinity.

The idea of the incomplete male is further suggested because of the image of the stag. Curiously, Camões recurs to Actaeon in the description of the landscape, later on in canto IX: "Da sombra de seus cornos não se espanta / Acteon, n'água cristalina e bela" (IX. 63). Here, Actaeon is depicted already as a stag, who is not surprised to see his antlers. His representation as an animal with antlers (horns) can be linked to the image of the cuckold.⁹¹ Cuckolds were often depicted wearing horns or antlers and, during the Renaissance, cuckoldry anxiety was common as changing conditions in the early modern period increased a fear of female sexual power, which often caused cuckoldry anxiety (Breitenberg 6). By drawing more attention to Actaeon as a stag than to his harassment of Diana, Camões creates an effeminate image of the hero that allegorizes the Portuguese king. It is suggested that Sebastião is not capable of having an influence, either on women or on his people.

While the myth of Actaeon functions as a warning to Dom Sebastião, Fama teaches him how to become a man and suggests that he should continue the heroic glory

⁹¹ Nowadays, the Portuguese *corno* still refers to a betrayed husband.

or *kleos* of the Portuguese. Yet, Fama's equivocal nature makes her a perfect allegorization through which the poet can denounce and question the nation and its rulers. I believe that while Actaeon is an allegory of Sebastião, Fama addresses the noblemen (aristocracy) that need to help the boyish and inexperienced king. These contemporary noblemen were expected to continue the *kleos* of the heroes of the past, namely both of Gama and his men as the heroes of the imperial conquest, who are featured in canto X. Hence, Fama introduces the concept of *kleos* that will be the subject of the next chapter, but also warns against the contradictory nature of heroic glory.

It is curious that no critic has ever focused on the function of Fama⁹² in the episode, given her prominent role in bringing the Isle of Love into existence. She descends the ocean to persuade the sea gods, and convinces even those that were on Bacchus' side that the Portuguese deserve their heroic reward of the Isle. Stanza 45 narrates how Fama "... celebrando vá com tuba clara / Os louvores da gente navegante" descending the ocean "Já murmurando a Fama penetrante / Pelas fundas cavernas se espalhara" (IX.45). There is a sexual analogy in the words penetrating and "fundas cavernas" that depict masculine behavior, while at the same time her femininity has persuasive powers: "Mudando, os fez um pouco afeiçoados. / O peito feminil, que levemente / Muda quaisquer propósitos tomados" (IX.46). Keith Botelho states that in the Renaissance, "Rumor or Fama" is "an ambiguously gendered figure" that is able to

⁹² Fama or Pheme, was the goddess of the rumor and report and is the personification of fame and honor in Classical mythology. Camões describes her in stanza 44 as: "A Deusa Giganteia, temerária, / Jactante, mentirosa, e verdadeira, / Que com cem olhos vê, e por onde voa, / O que vê, com mil bocas apregoa" (IX.44). These lines describe her ambiguous character, as in Classical mythology Fama was also known as being able to spread scandalous rumors. Botelho notes that, "it is essential to consider the dual nature of fama in the early modern period – *fama* as rumor and *fama* as reputation" (2).

undermine masculine and feminine authority (3). Hence, the Portuguese heroes depend on "others" once more, just as they also needed the assistance of Venus and the nymphs, as Fama may bring them glory.

Moreover, Fama can be seen as "a distorter and shape-shifter, whose twistings and perversions have the effect of transforming the human narrative" (Hardie 98) and the fact that she lies and speaks the truth at the same time makes her the perfect allegory for Camões to channel his criticism of Sebastião and the nation.⁹³ Accordingly, Fama transforms the heroic narrative in the last stanzas of the ninth canto, while the poet changes his register to a more personal voice. These last stanzas focus on what is needed to be a "hero." Simple human beings can become heroes through "feitos imortais e soberanos" (IX.91). It is Fama, however, that adds titles, and by using this ambiguous figure, who does not always speak the truth, the poet questions the concept of fame and titles. Moreover, a warning against too much ambition and greed takes place in stanza 93: "E ponde na cobiça um freio duro, / E na ambição também … Porque essas honras vãs, esse ouro puro / Verdadeiro valor não dão à gente" (IX.93). Camões implies that these vices may bring a title but are not truly honorable. In other words, titles may give rumor or hearsay but true honor must be earned.

The second part of the exclamation by the poetic voice then consists of an encouragement to those who esteem true fame "Se quiserdes no mundo ser tamanhos / Despertai já do sono do ócio ignavo" (IX.92). Honor must be earned and this can be done

⁹³ In fact, in various epics Fama tends to be one of the poet's voices and thus she "may also be read in a larger context as a figure for the fictional powers of the epic poet himself" (Hardie 98).

by serving the Kingdom and fighting the Sarracens: "vos vesti nas armas rutilantes, / Contra a lei dos inimigos Sarracenos" (IX.94). Here, the poet directs his voice to the people of the nation, especially its aristocracy, and advises them to not only bring fame to themselves but also to their beloved king: "E fareis claro o Rei, que tanto amais" (IX.95). Since the much *desejado* boy king Sebastião is regarded as being too young, the male heroes are necessary to save the future of the nation. By stating in the final stanza that aspiring this fame will make the men immortal, just like their heroic ancestors, the important concept of *kleos* is introduced.

Canto X, which will be analyzed in the next chapter, then describes the hardships of these famous ancestors but simultaneously reveals how *kleos* can be pointless and destructive. Hence, Fama's function is to prepare the reader for the prophecy of canto X and to teach that glory and fame are easily transformed in mere rumor. She is needed in order to glorify the Portuguese heroes, however at the same time, her equivocal character also corrupts Portuguese renown.

Conclusion

A close reading of the Isle of Love episode reveals that the "rape" of the nymphs incorporates various paradoxes that question Portuguese male power. The literary fabrication of the Isle as a pastoral artifact can be interpreted as a way for Camões to voice his preoccupations about the course of the nation. Therefore, it is important to point out the rhetorical powers of the ninth canto, even if these are often obscured through the use of allegory, which, by the way, was commonly used as a tool in rhetorical training. Copeland and Struck observe that to compose allegorically is usually understood as "writing with a double meaning: what appears on the surface and another meaning to which the apparent sense points" (2). A literary text can also undergo an "allegorical interpretation (allegoresis)" which is understood as "explaining a work, or a figure in myth, or any created entity, as if there were another sense to which it referred, that is, presuming the work or figure to be encoded with meaning intended by the author or a higher spiritual authority" (2). I believe that it is paramount to understand the double meaning of the Isle of Love, as it not only describes the violence of the conquest and the attempt of the Portuguese to dominate non-Western Others, but also reveals how gender and sexuality are important as they shape Portuguese national identity.

The violent disembarkation of the Portuguese mariners on the Isle of Love reveals feelings of paranoia and loss that are later reflected in the disquiet of the poet about king Sebastião and his court. While the male "weakness" of the Portuguese discoverers becomes clear through the mythological interference of Venus, who manages their sexual pleasure, a transgression of gender is depicted in the episode of Leonardo that indicates looser gender divisions in the patriarchal context that lead to male anxiety. Secondly, the worry of the poet is channeled through the allegories of Actaeon, Cupid and Fama, who criticize and warn the young king about his mismanagement of the nation as well as his love life. Their appearance in canto IX indicates how the poet worried about the masculinity of the king and the future of the Portuguese nation.

Anna Klobucka has pointed out the important educational function of the Isle for young king Sebastião. In fact, as I have shown in this chapter, the theme of the hunt is

used by Camões throughout canto IX, serving as a rhetorical device to call the attention of Sebastião. Since the actions of the King influence the course of the nation, Camões most likely used the allegory of the Isle of Love to voice his concerns. The Isle of Love has a lyrical setting, in the sense that it expresses the feelings of the poet about a contemporary concern and as such can be instructive of the changing dynamics of gender in Camões's time period.

Nevertheless, more research is needed on the use of allegory as a rhetorical device in *Os Lusíadas*, as well as on how the subjects of love and masculinity helped shape Camões's time period and his epic poem. Despite its fictitiousness and allegorical content, the Isle of Love episode may be seen as essentially the heart of the epic, as it centralizes the poet's ideas for the future of the nation and defines what distinguishes a real hero. While canto IX ends with Fama describing what it takes to be a Portuguese hero, canto X continues the episode by giving a preview of Portuguese imperialism and extending the deeds of the heroes of the imperial conquest. Masculinity is of paramount importance and the way in which the male epic hero is often fraught will be subject of the next chapter. Chapter Four: Between "heróis do mar" and "um bicho da terra tão pequeno." Masculinities and the Concept of *Kleos* in *Os Lusíadas*.

"Manhood is a form of identity politics"

Maurice Berger - Constructing Masculinity

"What happens when the phallic structure of *amor patriae* turns into anxious ambivalence?" Homi K. Bhabha- "Are you a Man or a Mouse?"

Introduction

The previous chapters bear witness to the presence of an important gender paradigm in *Os Lusíadas*. The representation of male and female in the epic may provide important insight into Camões's time and Portuguese mid-sixteenth century society. This final chapter focuses particularly on the representation of masculinity and the hero, as it comes to the fore in the Camonian epic. Even though the epic is interspersed with references to the male or masculinity, for this chapter I limit myself to the representation of Gama as a hero and the heroes of canto X. The large presence of instances of masculinity in *Os Lusíadas* is quite logical given the fact that "epic norms coincide with western norms for the masculine," as Susan Stanford Friedman shows. Friedman further states that "the epic hero is traditionally male, his heroic qualities are masculine, and the ordeal he faces is a masculine *agon*" (205).

Unfortunately, few scholars have explored the subject of masculinity in *Os Lusiadas*. This is perhaps due to the fact that masculinity studies in Portuguese literature are still in their infancy, especially in regard to the Early Modern period.⁹⁴ In spite of that, masculinity is a pertinent topic for the early modern studies, particularly when the expansionism of the period is considered. According to R.W. Connell, "the creation of overseas empires by the Atlantic seaboard states" influenced the "social practice that we now call 'masculinity'" (246). Hence, this chapter follows the idea that: "masculinities are not only shaped by the process of imperial expansion, they are active in that process and help to shape it" (245). It will be interesting, then, to look at how Portuguese masculinity was shaped through its empire, which was already in decline during the second half of the sixteenth century, as history shows.⁹⁵

The contradictions and tensions of Camões's society are reflected in the ambivalent representation of the hero in *Os Lusíadas*. Camões subtly criticizes the political situation of Portugal and its "empire" by representing the historical heroes such as Vasco da Gama in an ambiguous way; often the poet juxtaposes the glory of the "heróis do mar" and the "barões" with instances of anxious masculinity or the antiheroic.

⁹⁴ Various papers have been written on the subject of Masculinity, but published books on Portuguese Masculinity are few. Exceptions are the works of Miguel Vale de Almeida and Philip Rothwell. For the relevancy of Masculinity in the Early Modern Period one may point out *Poetics of Masculinity in Early Modern Italy and Spain*, ed. Gerry Milligan and Jane Tylus, Toronto: Centre for Reformation and Renaissance Studies, 2010.
⁹⁵ Malyn Newitt for instance notes that the Portuguese empire in India was not truly an empire in the sense that it "controlled virtually no territory and there was no legal framework for the various communities and enterprises that were loosely entitled Estado da India" (5). Malyn Newitt, *The First Portuguese Colonial Empire* (University of Exeter Press, 1986).

Famous is the example of the "bicho da terra" at the end of canto I, where the poet exclaims about the vulnerability of humans.⁹⁶ Hart states that the comment fits "into a general pattern of reflections on the anti-heroic values which, in Camões's view, now threaten to dominate Portuguese society" (50). I do agree that the anti-heroic becomes clear from these lines, but would add that they generate feelings of anxiety about man's fate and weakness. It is as though the poet realizes that beside the heroic achievements of the Discoveries, man is only a minor aspect of the Cosmos. The heroic and the insignificant go side-by-side and, therefore, Camões's representation of the heroic code reveals certain ambiguities. Susanne Wofford notes how:

From the Iliad on, the disjunction between the represented action of characters in epic (in war, in love and in moral struggle) and the figurative claims made about that action by the poet becomes a defining feature of epic poetry, bringing to the epic an ideological and moral ambivalence that comes from its simultaneous articulation of two contrasting claims about the value of heroic action. (7)

Hence, it is necessary to analyze the representation and definition of the hero in order to understand the heroic code of *Os Lusíadas*.

The definition of the hero is a complex one. First, one can think of the leading character of a literary or artistic piece, who has several qualities that distinguish him/her

⁹⁶ "No mar tanta tormenta, e tanto dano, / Tantas vezes a morte apercebida! / Na terra tanta guerra, tanto engano, / Tanta necessidade avorrecida! / Onde pode acolher-se um fraco humano, / Onde terá segura a curta vida, / Que não se arme, e se indigne o Céu sereno / Contra um bicho da terra tão pequeno?" (I.106).

such as courage, strength, wisdom etc. Also, in Classical literature the hero may be a semigod: a person that has both human as godlike characteristics and is often offspring of a union between the gods and a human being. In *Os Lusíadas* references to both "types" of heroes can be found. For instance, canto IX, analyzed in the previous chapter, describes the marriage between the Portuguese and the nymphs. This act of *hieros gamos*, a sexual ritual where humans and deities become united and gives the navigators a semi-divine nature, appoints Gama and his men as the heroes of the epic. Curiously, however, the first definition of hero does not automatically apply to Gama in contrast with other Classical epics. Gama as hero is, in a sense, swept away by other heroes that Camões appoints, such as the mythological figures that take a leading role, or the Portuguese people that act as a collective hero. Also, at several moments, the poem reveals that the poet presents himself as the heroe.

Camões uses the concept of the hero in an ambiguous way, which becomes clear from several examples. First, the title of the epic is highly contradictory. Most Classical poems name their epics after the main hero, but by naming his epic *Os Lusíadas*, Camões points to Lusus, ancestor of the Portuguese and son of Bacchus, which gives "a curious ambiguity to the poem's never satisfactorily explained title" (Macedo, 1999: 76). Moreover, compared to the historical characters, the gods play a paramount role as Saraiva notes: "Para o poeta e para os seus leitores, quem obrava, quem era o agente real da acção, eram os deuses fabulosos. Esses é que puxavam efectivamente os cordelinhos que faziam dançar os homens" (1992:115). It is true that often the historical characters seem bleak when compared to the gods of Olympus. Perhaps this is the (unwanted) result of the obvious glorification of the Portuguese as represented by Camões. When compared to the historical sources that documented the voyage of Gama and his men, such as Álvaro Velho's *Roteiro*, Camões often chooses to polish the historical facts. Still, there are instances in which Gama is represented not very positively which are highly relevant for this chapter.

The idea of the hero and the contradictory way in which he is represented coincides with the way in which Camões deploys the authorial voice. In Os Lusíadas voices change often and, by ending several of the epic's cantos with a very "personal" poet's voice, Camoes seems to appoint himself as a hero. This method is quite curious; other Renaissance epics, since they had to merge several "redirective processes in early modern Europe" such as the Renaissance, Reformation, and colonial exploration and empire building, tended to follow Virgil, as they "attached and shaped antique themes to the central fact of great discoveries, and the Virgilian model especially presented itself as a paradigm of migration and armed conquest" (Miller 17). Although Os Lusíadas has clear Virgilian influences, it also follows its own course, which is unique for the time period. In the sixteenth century, when *imitatio* was in vogue, poets reasoned from the Aristotelian idea that the poet should comment as little as possible in a personal voice, that diverges from the storyline. As Thomas Hart notes: "Camões' decision to depart from Virgilian practice by commenting on a variety of subjects in propria persona may thus represent a deliberate break with an important sector of contemporary critical opinion" (48).

This chapter suggests that understanding the representation of the heroic benefits from a focus on *kleos*. Unfortunately, Camonian scholars have never before applied this term for eternal fame as it is realized through epic, yet studies on masculinity and the

144

heroic in the Classical epics mention the term more often. *Kleos* stands for "renown" and glory, which is transferred from father to son and often gained through dying a heroic death. The term is also etymologically and semantically related to the verb "to hear" and thus means, "that which is heard," a "report" or even "rumor" (Goldhill 69). The first chapter of this thesis already mentions the concept of *kleos* and its link to paternity. Since Bacchus is the father of Lusus, the collective hero of the poem as the title suggests, he fears that his mythological sons are overtaking his glory. This continuation of the heroic glory becomes again pertinent especially in canto X, which describes the generations of fathers and sons that conquer and defend the Portuguese empire. However, the second meaning of *kleos*, namely "hearsay," renders a better understanding of the representation of the heroic by the poet. The poet's voice reports and transfers *kleos* and therefore it is ultimately the poet who appoints heroes. On top of that, *kleos* can be ambiguous at times, especially since the Muses also play an important role in the song about heroes. Pucci states that:

The renown and fame for which the hero chooses to die, this *kleos* that the Muses sing about him must also be marked by the unreliability and anonymity of mere hearsay: the heroic deed itself then receives the same ambivalent connotations that qualify the celebration (*kleos*) of the deed. (173)

I believe that the heroic deeds in *Os Lusíadas* also have equivocal connotations that are important to study as they illustrate how masculinity, which is interspersed with the heroic, was under pressure in the Portuguese empire. The first section of this chapter concentrates on *kleos* as "hearsay" and demonstrates how the poetic "report" or poetic voice describes and assigns heroes. It reveals how Camões appoints himself as a hero and distinguishes himself from Gama and other historical heroes, thereby creating two types of heroes, juxtaposing letters and arms. The section also focuses on the role of the Muses in spreading rumor or *kleos* and reveals how different Muses serve the different types of heroes. I analyze a few passages of the poem that show Gama's ambiguous representation in the poem. On one hand, the captain is celebrated, but the description of his growing suspicion and need for the use of firearms indicate a fear of losing control and reveal a degeneration of masculinity and the heroic ideal. The examples are either a representation of un-heroic behavior or of heroic and aggressive behavior that nonetheless points to anxiety. Whenever masculinity is promoted too obviously, it actually may point in the opposite direction; the "masculine" behavior shows an undercurrent of deep insecurity and a fear of marginality.

The second section analyzes the *kleos* of the heroes of canto X and argues that "heroic glory" is under constant pressure and very hard to maintain. Canto X of *Os Lusíadas* is often seen as a glorification of imperialism, as Tethys demonstrates to Gama the parts of the world that the Portuguese will conquer. Yet, the canto also reveals a large number of sacrifices that need to be made in order to maintain the empire. First, the prophecy of Tethys narrates the violent battles of several heroes, successors of Gama and his men, who continue the conquest of the South and East. This display of violence serves to celebrate imperial masculinity; however, at the same time, it demonstrates loss and death. Other successors of Gama are only mentioned briefly, which indicates that the poet finds them unworthy of glory or hearsay. Historical sources reveal that the governors that receive little mention were often involved in controversy or corruption. The representation of these governors indicates, then, that corruption and decay played a significant role in the overseas empire, which undermines the heroic glory of canto X.

Subsequently, Portuguese kleos is put to the fore in a genealogical and chronological list that narrates the deeds of fathers and sons; however, their quest for glory that may transfer from generation to generation proves at times useless. In the poem, the list of heroes strikingly mentions several father-son relationships. I will argue that the heroes of canto X can be read as "empty fathers," a term coined by Philip Rothwell in his book A Canon of Empty Fathers: Paternity in Portuguese Narrative (2007).⁹⁷ During the colonizing years discovered lands were "donated" to Portuguese men who were expected to start families and spread their Portuguese seed overseas, thereby creating a lusotropical colony. However, canto X shows how the beginning years of Portuguese conquest belie the utopian image of the lusotropical doctrine. In various examples from the first part of Tethys' prophecy, there is an excess of male bravado and bloodshed. Consequently, canto X of Os Lusíadas illustrates how many fathers are lost, and how generations of men desperately try to maintain the empire. Camões's celebration of heroes reveals an anxious attitude about preserving the empire and the capacities of the Portuguese noblemen. Reading between the lines shows then that the Portuguese heroes may not be able to cope with keeping the empire under their control. Moreover, the masculinity that is shown is in decay; generations of men are dying whilst trying to defend the empire. Hence, the exemplary heroes of the past that "conquered" the empire

⁹⁷ Rothwell sees empty paternity as a national mindset of the Portuguese that tends to cast their leaders as "as national father figures" who are "to be without biological children" (16).

are "empty fathers" to the nation. Their sacrifice for the Portuguese nation seems heroic at first but also points to uselessness and inefficiency.

"Quem não sabe arte, não na estima." Camões's Musings on the Heroic Ideal.

As stated in the introduction, *Os Lusíadas* is unique for its use of the personal voice. Especially at the end of cantos, but sometimes also in the midst of the narrative, the personal voice appears and comments on the narrative. Some Camonian scholars, such as Ronald Sousa, Thomas Hart, Paul Dixon and John de Oliveira e Silva have analyzed this personal voice. For instance, R.W. Sousa states that:

Repeatedly but very subtly it is suggested to the reader that the voice that speaks the words of the poem is not some neutral, technical voice, but rather the voice of the poet, a poetized speaker-figure who lurks about in the foreground of the text, occasionally suggesting textually his corporal or intellectual presence as the teller of his tale. (15)

Sousa points to only two "voices" or "speaker-figures," which he calls the macro-poem and the micro-poem, the micro-poem being the exclamations that occur outside the general storyline. However, if only two "voices" are operating in the poem, the fact that these exclamations seem to be of a different nature and do not always deal with the same subject is unfortunately ignored. Oliveira e Silva, who identifies the principal narrator as the "poet-orator," does point to the different content of the various exclamations. The critic argues that the poet-orator, who has a rhetorical function, "touches upon five overarching and often overlapping topics" that help "shape and define the entire poem"(255).⁹⁸

Oliveira e Silva mentions the capacity of poetry "to bring glory, fame and immortality to its patrons" but does not link this to the concept of *kleos*. Still, Goldhill, who studies Classical epic poetry, importantly notes that, "the notion of *kleos* is linked in a fundamental way to the poet's voice, and no adequate discussion of the poet's voice could ignore this topic" (69). In this section, I will demonstrate how the poet's voice not only serves to make comments at the end of cantos, but that the use of the voice also introduces the poet as a heroic character as well. Therewith the poet distances himself from the other heroic figures that feature in the epic, such as Gama and his crew. In a sense, one could say that there are two types of heroes in the poem, the masculine soldier hero and the literary hero. Ultimately it is the literary hero that prevails, since he is the one that appoints *kleos* and is helped by the Muses. Camões therewith implies that his audience needs to be able to understand and appreciate literature in order to comprehend the rhetorical messages of the poem that are often hidden in allegory, as shown in the preceding chapter.

In many Renaissance epics, according to Steadman, it is possible to encounter "significant disparities between the heroic values conventional in the epic tradition and

⁹⁸ The scholar distinguishes "the importance of poetry in general and of the present poem in particular as a source of instruction and delight in a healthy commonwealth; the capacity of poetry, if supported, to bring glory, fame and immortality to its patrons; the neglect of poetry, and the arts in general, in his native land (e.g., 7.78-87); the unfortunate royal tendency of preferring self-serving ministers and theoreticians in influential positions to the devoted, loyal veterans and men of experience at home and abroad; and the ubiquity of human greed and unmerited wealth in places of power requiring just the opposite: humility and virtue (e.g., 8.96-99;9.87-95)" (255-256).

those of the poet's own society – tensions between the traditional ethos of the epic hero and the norms of the 'higher heroism'" (151). In fact, the changes taking place in Camões's own society seem to have caused anxiety about heroic values that were being altered. Hart rightly states that the exclamations at the end of cantos V, VI, VII, and VIII, where Camões speaks in his own voice, "all deal, implicitly or explicitly, with the corrupting power of money" and the "authorial interventions in the later cantos suggest that behavior which had once been merely an individual aberration now threatens to become the norm for a whole society" (52). Therefore, Camões "reveals himself as troubled by the growth of a new force in Portuguese society" (52). As a consequence, Hart notes that "Camões' role, as narrator and as a minor actor in his own narrative" enables him to "question the practical usefulness, though never the intrinsic worth, of the heroic ideal celebrated in the poem" (52). Besides the changes in the heroic ideal, Steadman further states that there is a "disparity between martial and ethical content" in Renaissance epic poems (155). It seems that Camões resolves this disparity by not only having separate narrators and poetic voices but also separate heroes. As such, he appoints himself, the poetic figure, as the virtuous hero with high moral principles and ideals, while Gama and other historical figures, who conquer and defend the empire, can be understood as martial heroes. Furthermore, various Muses are assigned to the different types of heroes, as I will show later on.

Several critics have seen Camões as a hero of his own poem. Macedo finds that Camões "representa a figura do herói da viagem simbólica significada n'*Os Lusíadas*: a ambiguidade das funções intermutáveis do poeta e das suas personagens como narradores do poema permite que Camões apresente aos seus contemporâneos - os destinatários do poema – a aventura dos heróis que celebra como se da sua própria aventura se tratasse" (62). There are several examples of a "personal appearance" of the poetic figure in the epic that bolster the heroic ideal. First, there is the famous example where Camões narrates his own shipwreck:

Este receberá, plácido e brando, No seu regaço os Cantos que molhados Vêm do naufrágio triste e miserando, Dos procelosos baxos escapados, Das fomes, dos perigos grandes, quando Será o injusto mando executado Naquele cuja Lira sonorosa Será mais afamada que ditosa. (X.128)

Gerald Moser notes that Camões here "adds a warning: the shipwreck is an omen of destruction" (216). However, I believe that the description of the shipwreck also enables the poet to stress his own heroic qualities of endurance. At the same time the poet points toward his literary talent by referring to the "Lira," thereby suggesting that he is a literary hero.

Significantly, the shipwreck is already hinted at in canto VII, stanza 80, when the poet gives a long personal speech: "Agora às costas escapando a vida, / Que dum fio pendia tão delgado / Que não menos milagre foi salvar-se" (VII.80). These lines are part of a longer exclamation that takes place between stanzas 79 and 87, where the poet

dramatizes himself as a "suffering and under-rewarded artist skilled enough to confer glory on those who support him but virtuous enough to withhold it from the undeserving" (Oliveira e Silva 758). In his speech, he condemns those leaders that have little interest in the Arts or in Poetry.

This same exclamation at canto VII is important since it is here where the poet makes a personal appearance for the second time. Canto VII ends with Paulo da Gama explaining to the Catual the figures on the banners of the Portuguese ships. In stanza 77 it is described how Paulo da Gama and the Catual see a figure arise that will speak⁹⁹: "Os olhos põe no bélico transunto / De um velho branco, aspecto venerando / ... / ... / No trajo a Grega usança está perfeita, / Um ramo por insígnia na direita" (VII. 77). The figure resembles a Greek bard and starts speaking in the poetic voice similar to the other exclamations at the end of cantos, and that seem to be personal interventions of Camões. By invoking the image of a Greek bard, Camões points to his literary qualities. Charles Segal notes that in Homer's *epos* Odysseus appears as "both hero and bard," which puts him "in the unique position of being the singer of his own *kleos*" (26). In *Os Lusíadas* Camões appropriates both the role of the epic bard and of the hero, and I believe that therefore the poet's function is similar to that of Odysseus, whose *Odyssey* "questions heroic values and the concept of *kleos* which lies at its center" (23).

⁹⁹ Valéria M. Souza has written a very interesting article on the stammer that takes place in this speech of the poet. She argues that this "epic stutter" is part of the "numerous unmistakably anti-epic voices" that work "against the epic agenda" of the poem. Souza concludes that, "[t]hese voices stammer, spill over, ramble, fall silent. In the process, they challenge the epic framework and, by extension, notions of masculine identity and empire" (20).

Camões raises objections to a certain type of hero that does not appreciate literature while he criticizes the vices of certain men of whom he no longer wishes to sing: "Nenhum ambicioso, que quisesse / Subir a grandes cargos, cantarei" (VII. 84). The poetic voice concludes: "Aqueles sós direi, que aventuraram / Por seu Deus, por seu Rei, a amada vida, / Onde, perdendo-a, em fama a dilataram" (VII. 87). According to Steadman, many poets of Renaissance epics struggled to balance the hero and the heroic ideal, since "[t]he martial hero could rarely provide a perfect exemplar of the higher heroism"; a heroism that transcends from epic violence and is of a more "philosophical" and "moral" nature (182). Therefore, it is key that the bard figure at the end of canto VII represents himself as a hero with "numa mão sempre a espada e noutra a pena" (VII. 79). By introducing himself as a Greek bard, Camões suggests that he manages both the arts as well as warfare, which makes him superior to Gama, who is merely a martial hero. Consequently, Camões offsets Gama, whose heroic deed of navigating the unknown waters towards India was crucial, but perhaps not a suitable subject for epic poetry. Camões's struggle with the heroic action of Gama is revealed through his representation of Gama as a martial hero whose actions are somewhat anti-heroic at times, as well as through a ambiguous use of *kleos* as hearsay or "being talked about."

When Gama finally concludes his long speech to the king of Malindi, at the end of canto V, the poet reveals that Gama is not a worthy subject of epic literature. The disinterest of Gama for literature, and especially poetry, frustrates the poetic voice, who notes that:

Enfim, não houve forte Capitão

Que não fosse também douto e ciente, Da Lácia, Grega ou Bárbara nação, Senão da Portuguesa tão-somente. Sem vergonha o não digo, que a rezão De algum não ser por versos excelente É não se ver prezado o verso e rima, Porque quem não sabe arte, não na estima. (V.97)

In a sense, Camões regrets Gama's lack of intellectualism, which is a quality that other captains do have. Thomas Earle notes that "anti-intellectualism was a living force even while *Os Lusíadas* was being composed" and that "Camões's direct attack on his hero at the end of canto V is combined with the more subtle ironies made possible by the use of Gama as a restricted narrator" (254). The restrictions put on Gama are important and indicate that the poet is at times doubtful about the heroic appropriateness of the Portuguese Captain.

Camões further states that the Muses are not on Gama's side: "As Musas agradeça o nosso Gama / o Muito amor da Pátria, que as obriga / A dar aos seus na lira nome e fama / .../ Que ele, nem quem na estirpe seu se chama, / Calíope não tem por tão amiga, / Nem as filhas do Tejo" (V. 99). According to Brownlee, the poet here "cleverly anticipates any negative reactions which his poem may elicit," casting his critics, along with da Gama, "into the category of 'bad readers""(182). Yet, the same stanzas indicate the importance of the Muses¹⁰⁰ and the fact that *kleos* or "hearsay" discloses the story of the hero. It is important to remember that the poet repeats what he has been told by the Muses and thus "repeats a "hearsay" – a *kleos*- and it is this repetition that produces *kleos* in the sense of immortal fame" (Meltzer 235). At the same time however, the heroic fame is subject to "distortion and error as the echo of the original source (the Muses) grows fainter and fainter. Meltzer notes that, even though "the poet *should* duplicate the Muses' account, the possibility of straying from it remains as *kleos* spreads through a series of repetitions, first by the poet himself and then by others" (235).

The Muses thus determine heroic fame, as their account can propagate the heroes' qualities, but at the same time the interference of the Muses may indicate a danger of false representation, or ambiguity. According to Lyne, they can be called "further voices" which are voices that "add to, comment upon, question, and occasionally subvert the implications of the epic voice" (2). They complement to a certain extent the poetic voice

¹⁰⁰ Typically, the Muses are invoked at or near the beginning of a literary work. This invocation indicates that the poet is following poetic conventions, however, in Os Lusíadas the Muses are invoked at other moments in the poem. Several epics and long lyrics in the Renaissance and Baroque periods represent a invocation of the Muses by the poet, especially at moments when he feels his power failing. On top of that, in Os *Lusíadas* there are three different muses that can be detected; the Tágides, Venus Acidalia and the Greek muse Calliope, who is the muse of epic poetry and is most used by Homer. Muses are the goddesses who inspire the creation of literature and the arts. They are considered a source of knowledge and appear often in poetic lyrics and myths. There are several versions of their genealogy; at first it was claimed that there were only three muses and later the idea of nine muses became generally accepted. Sometimes they are referred to as water nymphs as it was believed that they were born from sacred springs. Larson indicates that, "the distinction between Muse and nymph is not necessarily clear-cut" (224). Renaissance and Neoclassical art helped standardize the depiction of the nine Muses in sculptures or paintings, who could be distinguished by certain emblems. Each muse would represent a different area of literature or arts.

of the "poet-orator" and may be used as an allegorization of a more critical attitude of the author.¹⁰¹ Consequently, it is highly significant that in *Os Lusíadas* a different Muse is appointed per spokesperson. Gama's words are inspired by the old muse Calliope, which also is the case in the tenth canto, when Tethys prophesies. Yet, the poetic voice, or the bard, is solely inspired by his own creation, the Tágides.

The Tágides, or *filhas do Tejo*, exemplify Camões's originality and ability of poetic invention, as he converts the Classical Muses into something of his own. The Tágides are named after the river Tagus, and inspire the poet: "pois criado / Tendes em mim um novo engenho ardente" (I.4). Camões emphasizes that the Tágides' words are more true than those of the Muses of Antiquity: "Ouvi: que não vereis com vãs façanhas, / Fantásticas, fingidas, mentirosas, / Louvar os vossos, como nas estranhas / Musas (...) As verdadeiras vossas são tamanhas, / Que excedem as sonhadas, fabulosas " (I.11). Furthermore, the "old" Muses are rejected: "Cesse tudo o que a Musa antígua canta, / Que outro valor mais alto se alevanta" (I.3).

Therefore, it is quite curious that in canto III the poetic voice asks Calliope to teach him what "ilustre Gama" told the king: "Agora tu, Calíope, me ensina / O que contou ao Rei o ilustre Gama: / Inspira imortal canto e voz divina / Neste peito mortal, que tanto te ama" (III.1). The poetic voice thus falls back on the "old" muse to report "hearsay" about Gama. Another example of an "old" muse takes place at stanza 64 of canto VIII where Venus¹⁰² helps the speech of Gama to the Zamorin. By using various

¹⁰¹ Fama, who is analyzed in chapter three, is such an allegorization that reflects the author's critical thoughts on Portuguese fame.

¹⁰² She is referred to as Vénus Acidália; another Greek region where according to Servius, there was a well in which Venus used to bathe. This bathing is a typical behavior for nymphs thus here Venus is nymph-like and able to inspire as a muse.

Muses for different heroes, Camões makes a distinction between the bardic hero (i.e. the poet himself) and martial hero Gama. As Laird notes: "Muses allegorize the configuration of truth and power" (120). Indirectly, the use of different Muses suggests that Gama's and Tethys' words are somehow less "true" and creates ambiguity about Gama as a hero. Ultimately, Camões sees Gama as a mouthpiece that he can give a voice, thereby putting himself as poet in a superior position, since he holds the power over Gama's words. Throughout the poem Camões attributes voices to several characters, including himself, an action that pushes Gama off his pedestal.

Besides the use of the voice that is able to downplay Gama's heroic role, his representation as a martial hero also reveals interesting contradictions. As I briefly showed in the introduction to this chapter, it is clear Vasco da Gama is not the main hero of the epic. Although Gama is often referred to as "o illustre capitão," it is the collective hero, namely the Portuguese people or the *lusiada*, that are more important. Gama is mostly seen as a martial hero and his "soldadesca" qualities are celebrated by Camões, even if ambiguity can also be encountered in the represented heroic action.

Historical sources on the first voyage to India reveal that the Portuguese were not received with open arms and were rather seen by non-Western Others as marginal and conceited. Travelers' eyewitness accounts such as Álvaro Velho's *Roteiro* have several passages that can be interpreted as being critical of Gama's behavior. However, often Camões chooses to either leave these passages out or to polish them up, in favor of the Portuguese captain. *Os Lusíadas*, for instance, does not describe how the royal merchants in Calicut laugh at the poor merchandise that the Portuguese present them. According to

Madureira, "[n]othing points to the fragility and transience of Portugal's 'hegemony' more starkly" than this "derisory laughter" (28). By omitting the critical attitude of the royal merchants who expose Portuguese fragility, Camões protects his epic hero from potential embarrassment.

Sanjay Subrahmanyam has examined the historical figure of Vasco da Gama in great depth and believes that among all the sources Camões is the one who glorifies and mythifies the historical facts, since "Camões transforms Gama's voyage in tone and content, from the mundane to the divine" (155). Gama "strikes one happy pose after another" in *Os Lusíadas* and is not struggling with "his own partly paranoid sensibility," as becomes clear from other historical sources (155). Subrahmanyam's work helps demythify the heroic image of Gama by exposing the captain's anxieties, while also pointing towards Portugal's marginality. However, I believe that this marginality and anxiety are also present in the epic, when read against the grain. Besides Gama's happy poses, several anxious moments are included in the narrative.

For instance, Gama becomes increasingly wary to set foot on strange lands; something that Subrahmanyam points out as well. He states that, "It is a fundamental error to have a vision of Gama arriving in Calicut, fresh out of Portugal, so to speak. We note the growing shadow of a form of extreme suspicion in Gama's attitude towards the commercial centers, and rulers that he comes across (...) The three captains (...) rarely if ever set foot ashore themselves, even in circumstances as favourable as those in Malindi" (121). I believe that Camões creates this suspense already in canto I at stanza 101-104, where the fact that Gama is deceived by "o falso piloto" is only revealed to the reader. When in canto II stanza 5 it is described how the Portuguese arrive at Mombassa, Gama is already suspicious: "Ao mensageiro o Capitão responde / ... / E diz que, porque o Sol no mar se esconde, / Não entra para dentro ..." (II.5). Of course Camões creates suspense to penalize the people at Mombassa and to describe them as treacherous. However, at the same time, Gama's suspicion may threaten his masculinity as he is represented as less self-assured.

This suspicious attitude resulted often in a biased approach to Others and a display of violence. I believe that the showcase of weaponry is ultimately a form of anxious masculinity, even if the bravado of the act of violence seems heroic at first. To understand how Camões represents the use of violence by the Portuguese crew, it is interesting to consider the description of the bombardment of Mozambique, which takes place between stanzas 89-93 of canto I. When the Portuguese arrive at Ilha de Mozambique, they are in need of fresh water. The local ruler actually sets up an ambush, because he thinks Gama and his men might be pirates. In the poem, however, Camões emphasizes the fact that the local habitants are Moors. On top of that, Bacchus is introduced in the scene to influence the set-up of a religious conflict. On the first day, the Moors ask to see the Portuguese weapons, which they show except for the firearms. Then, Camões writes that on the next day Gama "foi-lhe respondido em som de guerra" (I. 85). The Portuguese bombard the defenseless town, whose people only possess inferior weapons: "Um de escudo embraçado e de azagaia, / Outro de arco encurvado e seta ervada" (I.86), and "de panos de algodão vinham vestidos" (I.47). The bombastic response is described as follows: "Eis nos batéis o fogo se levanta / Na furiosa e dura artilharia, / A plúmbea péla mata, o brado espanta, / Ferido o ar retumba e assovia" (I. 89). The following stanza shows that the Portuguese are merciless: "... a gente

Portuguesa, / ... seguindo a vitória estrui e mata; / A povoação, sem muro e sem defesa, / Esbombardeia, acende e desbarata" (I.90). Michael Murrin's excellent analysis of the use of modern weaponry in the Ilha de Mozambique conflict describes how Camões altered the historical incident since he "reduced four military incidents to one" as well as condensed "a military confrontation that extended over several days to one" (149). The scholar notes how: "this abridgement serves to exalt the picture of Portuguese power" (149). Yet, Murrin's conclusion that "the colonial soldier fought against odds" and "needed the gun to survive at all" (159) also reveals that Camões embellished the quality of Portuguese warfare perhaps out of anxiety about his "heroes" being the actual weaker party in combat. It reveals that the Portuguese feared their position and needed weaponry to maintain power over non-Western Others.

The exaggerated use of firearms is interesting from another point of view as well. One can, for example, think of the "sexualized imagery" that is linked with weapons and how they relate to masculinity. Henri Myrttinen shows how weapons are often used as tools "wielding power over unarmed males and females" and adds that this can often be linked to "a crisis of masculinity, when there is a fear of loss of male power and privilege" (37). I believe that the excessive use of weaponry by Gama and his men actually points to a fear as well. As I have pointed out in the previous chapter, the Portuguese found themselves sailing around unknown waters, which likely caused a sense of paranoia that McClintock terms "boundary loss." Feelings of suspense and a fear of the unknown cause Gama and his men to demonstrate power at several moments in the epic. For instance, at canto II, 92-100 when the Portuguese arrive at Malindi, there is a big display of their firearms and celebratory cannon shots are fired. Even though Malindi is a much friendlier place than Mombassa, Gama's attitude is wary and when night falls the Portuguese stay in their ships. Still, a celebratory party takes place, in which canons are shot, significantly first by the Portuguese, as a type of fireworks: "Não faltam ali os raios de artifício, / ... / Fazem os bombardeiros seu ofício, / O céu, a terra e as ondas atroando" (90). The people on land respond: "assim festeja / um ao outro, à maneira de peleja" (II.91). It is clear that these alternative fireworks can be interpreted as a way of showing (masculine) power and superiority. Perhaps Gama and his men wanted to emphasize their technologically superior position and anxiously show the Malindi people that they should not attack the Portuguese. It is possible to understand the power display as an underlying fear, which actually undermines and emasculates Portuguese power. As Myrtinnen shows: "Weapons and their public display seek to underline the 'manly' prowess of the bearer, but tragically often also undermine it" (38).

Another example of how Gama's use of violence may have an emasculating effect can be found in canto V, when the Portuguese imprison an innocent honey gatherer at St. Helena Bay. After several misunderstandings a conflict arises between the Portuguese and the Khoikhoi and Gama's leg is injured: " Da espessa nuvem setas e pedradas / Chovem sobre nós outros sem medida; / ... / ... esta perna trouxe eu dali ferida" (V.33). Besides being imprisoned by the Catual in India, Gama is only once physically under fire, which is described in canto V. Significantly, the people that injure Gama are "primitive" Khoikhoi that use handmade weapons and stones. But, unlike the Muslim enemy that is feared, they are capable of damaging the Portuguese. Hence, even if wounds received in battle may augment the honor of a soldier the people that harm Gama are considered inferior. The violent reply of the Portuguese crew is quite peculiar and one may question the glory awarded to the Portuguese hero after eliminating an inferior enemy:

Mas nós, como pessoas magoadas, A resposta lhe demos tão tecida, Que, em mais que nos barretes, se suspeita Que a cor vermelha levam desta feita. (V.33)

Camões refers to the cheap red caps that were first used to win the hearts of the Khoikhoi, and seem to indicate a cultural superiority of the Portuguese, to describe that the Portuguese reciprocate in a very bloody and violent way. Yet, the reference to the red caps also reveals that the encounter was awkward and full of misunderstanding and exposes that "the first African encounter in Vasco's voyage was doomed to fail" (Figueiredo 155). The Khoikhoi are cast as inferior and harmless, staged in a comical episode with Veloso, while they actually manage to challenge Gama and his men.

These examples show that Camões, even if he rewrote or polished the historical facts, represents Gama as a martial hero who depends on weapons to expose his power. The excessive use of violence by the Portuguese and their technological advances seem heroic at first, but also reveal "fissures and contradictions" since, as McClintock notes, "the colonials themselves all too often succeeded in settling matters of indecision with a violent excess of militarized masculinity" (16). Thus, the use of violence points to indecision and insecurity, which alters the representation of Gama as a hero. It is also significant that the growing suspicion of Gama is not effaced by Camões through a

rewriting of the history, as he did in other passages. Camões's poetic voice is ultimately the voice that appoints *kleos* or heroic glory, since he determines what others hear about Gama.

Dying to be Men. Kleos and the Construction of Masculinity.

The power of the poetic voice is quite significant since it is able to appoint heroes and boast of their glory or, on the other hand, question their heroic suitability, as the previous section shows. In fact, Redfield notes that there is a "curious reciprocity between a bard and his heroes. The bard sings of events, which have a *kleos*; without the heroes he would have nothing to sing about. At the same time the bard confers on his heroes a *kleos*, without which they would have no existence in the later world of the bardic audience" (31). The heroes of canto X are presented in a catalogue and the representation of their *kleos* elucidates heroic action and the construction of imperial masculinity.

Catalogues are a common element in Classical epics that consist of "a complete list of items, typically one in alphabetical or other systematic order," that provide extra information, thereby directing "the reader's attention and modify[ing] his impression of events and characters" (Gaertner 299). Gaertner further states that "the enumerative form of catalogues may lend rhetorical weight to the utterings of the speaker, be he the narrator or one of the characters" (299). Often, these catalogues then serve to boast, and in the case of *Os Lusíadas* the catalogue emphasizes the heroic "future" of the Portuguese empire. However, the imperial masculinity that is constructed through the catalogue is under stress, in three different ways. First, the catalogue showcases an excess of violence and destruction that reveal how non-Western Others actively resisted the Portuguese. As a consequence, a long list of governors and explorers, of which most become injured or die, exposes how *kleos*, in the sense of an inherited glory that must be carried on from father to son, is interrupted and may slowly fade away. Moreover, the ideological discourse of the catalogue contains certain slips, which disclose notions of corruption and decay. As Wofford notes, "the represented action" in epic poems often allows "an implicit, if unarticulated, demystification of the heroic ideology that shapes the epics" (9). The critic points to the *Aeneid* that incorporates a "demystification of the concept of *kleos* and of Virgil's imperial celebration" (9). I believe that the catalogue of heroes of canto X, to be specific, stanzas 10-73, on one hand serves to promote heroic and imperial ideology but that it simultaneously demystifies *kleos* and indicates that the decay of the empire may corrupt imperial masculinity.

The catalogue in the final canto of *Os Lusíadas* is similar to a genealogical list as it presents the *conquistadores* that came to the East after Vasco da Gama in a chronological order. Fifteen men, mainly governors or *vice-reis*, are passed in review in a total of 63 stanzas. Of course, the main purpose is to exalt their achievements; however, some men have only one stanza dedicated to them, while others receive more attention. As a matter of fact, it is important to remember that it is Tethys who narrates this prophecy, which indicates that Camões is distancing himself from his bardic task. It is Tethys who talks about the men and thus appoints them with *kleos*, but the fact that most die in battle also rewards them with immortal glory. Yet, the single stanzas that are

dedicated to some heroes require a reading between the lines. Often the scant poetic attention reveals cases of corruption and intrigue, indicating that these were common in the overseas empire.

For instance, Duarte de Meneses and Pedro de Mascarenhas have only one stanza dedicated to them. History shows that they were only in charge for a short term, yet, Camões leaves the reasons for their short reign in the open, thereby expecting his contemporary readers to be able to fill in these blanks. Duarte de Meneses, for instance, was only governor of India for two years, namely between 1522 and 1524. His governance turned out to be incompetent and corrupt. Subrahmanyam gives a detailed list "accusing D. Duarte of having received bribes and gifts in matters of justice (and of thus having encouraged criminality), but equally in order to appoint certain men (who were not the king's men) to captaincies and other posts" (308). His behavior resulted in an arrest by his successor, Vasco da Gama, in 1524. Camões does not make any mention of Meneses' doubtful reputation but the fact that only half a stanza (X.53) is dedicated to him does reveal that the governor does not deserve fame or hearsay.

Camões is more specific about Pedro de Mascarenhas, who was elected viceroy in 1526. Sources tell that, when he was elected to succeed D. Henrique de Meneses, he "was campaigning in Malacca and was denied the post through intrigue and imprisoned in Goa" (White 255). Camões mentions this intrigue in stanza 58: "Mas na Índia, cobiça e ambição, / .../ ... te farão / Vitupério nenhum, mas só desgosto. / ... / Com forças e poder em que está posto, / Não vence; que a vitória verdadeira / É saber ter justiça nua e inteira" (X.58). Subrahmanyam also mentions more details about this intrigue, as he states that at the center of this problem was "the complex figure of Afonso Mexia, whose

ambitions and inflated sense of the centrality of his post often led him to such sharp practices and abuses" (348).

Likewise, Nuno da Cunha, son of explorer and ambassador Tristão da Cunha, who is previously mentioned in the catalogue, has only one stanza dedicated to him. Yet, in comparison with the other governors that are briefly mentioned because of their equally short reign, Cunha governed for 10 years. As Redfield states, something or someone "has a *kleos* if it is talked about (...) especially if it is in someway remarkable" (32). Sources learn that Cunha was linked to corruption and that he was ordered back to Lisbon where he faced a "Castilian-style inquiry," but died at the Cape of Good Hope "in time to avoid the indignity of entering Lisbon in irons" (Newitt 110). These examples show that the poet is bitter about the intrigue and corruption, using again the concept of *cobiça* in relation to India. These "heroes" do not deserve much hearsay and certainly no fame. The silence about most of their achievements reveals then, to the attentive reader, that the *Estado da Índia* was corrupt and in decay.

Besides notions of silence or the elimination of words on certain governors there is another interesting interruption in the narration of the catalogue. Afonso de Albuquerque, viceroy of India and first duke of Goa, is one of the more heroic males in the catalogue, as he receives ample attention in five stanzas dedicated to him. Yet, at stanza 45 Tethys interrupts her speech: "Mais *estanças* cantara esta Sirena / Em louvor do ilustríssimo Albuquerque, / Mas alembrou-lhe uma ira que o condena" (X.45). Then it is narrated how Albuquerque is a "juiz cruel e inteiro" to his soldiers and examples are given of mythological figures, such as Campaspe, to indicate the involvement with a mistress. No explicit reference is given, but history teaches that Rui Dias, one of Albuquerque's officers was executed because of his relationship with an Indian woman (White 255). The exact details of the relationship are unclear and Camões does not elaborate as well, but the poet's discontent is clear. Albuquerque's reputation is damaged: "Põe na fama alva noda negra e feia" (X.47) and the interruption of Tethys then puts a stain on the heroic deeds of Albuquerque that are sung in the previous stanzas. It is important to point out that Tethys is called a *Sirena* here, as Charles Segal has argued that the nymph or siren with her seductive powers is "responsible for destroying heroic *kleos* instead of preserving it" while the muse is inspiring and aiding the hero (40). These examples show that within the heroic discourse of the catalogue certain moments can be detected that indicate corruption or the disruption of *kleos*.

In order to be talked about, it is necessary for a man to perform heroic behavior, which is often of a violent nature as non-Western Others are slaughtered and conquered, or to die heroically in battle. Griffin notes that the *Iliad* is "full of detailed accounts of the moment of death of the warrior" and that the violence is often stylized in order to "concentrate attention as exclusively as possible on the position of the hero, face to face with his destiny at the hands of another hero: either he must kill or be killed, dying a heroic death" (91). In *Os Lusíadas*, death is often described as pre-destined "Mas aquela fatal necessidade / De quem ninguém se exime dos humanos" (X.54) and seen as something positive as it is heroic and able to bring fame "coos barões / Que tão ledos as mortes tem por certas" (X.69).

Heroic death is honorable in the poem; in fact, the theme of the Christian martyr appears at several moments. For instance, Afonso de Albuquerque's second attack on Goa (X.43) took place on St. Catherine's day,¹⁰³ which is emphasized by the poet, thereby again hinting at the theme of sacrifice and martyrdom:

Irão soldados ínclitos, fazendo Mais que leões famélicos e touros, Na luz que sempre celebra e *dina* Será da Egípcia santa *Catarina*." (X.43).

The theme of martyrdom is further developed in stanza 69, where João de Castro wants his sons to be offered to God and also, the death of Lourenço de Almeida is predestined: "Mas de Deus a escondida providência /... / O porá onde esforço nem prudência / Poderá haver que a vida lhe reserve" (X.28). Lourenço is represented as a man with great courage, although by sacrificing his life for God he may, in a way, threaten the empire.

Still, unlike in the *Iliad*, the heroic death is not described in full detail. Rather, most stanzas focus on the violent actions of the Portuguese conquest. The catalogue becomes then a display of violence that showcases the clatter of weapons and canons, and the death and destruction that is caused by them. For instance, on their way to India, father and son Almeida first take a violent revenge at Kilwa and Mombassa: "Também farão Mombaça, que se arreia / De casas sumptuosas e edifícios, / Co ferro e fogo seu queimada e feia," (X.27). A lot of bloodshed and destruction happens also at Diu in 1535, which after various efforts was still not in Portuguese hands, and where Martim de Sousa "[d]espois irá com peito esforçadíssimo / A tolher que não passe o Rei gentio / ... / O fará

¹⁰³ Named after St. Catherine the Christian virgin and martyr.

retirar, de sangue cheio" (X.54). He continues, "Destruirá a cidade Repelim, / Pondo o seu Rei, com muitos, em fugida" (X.65). Martim, who is linked by the poet to Mars, the god of War, does justice to his name as he punishes Bhaktal, a port town: "De sangue e corpos mortos ficou cheia / E de fogo e trovões desfeita e feia" (X.66). In addition, the first attack on Diu, by Francisco de Almeida and his men, is described as follows and clearly demonstrates the bombastic use of violence:

Mas a de Mir Hocém, que, abalroando, A fúria esperará dos vingadores, Verá braços e pernas ir nadando Sem corpos, pelo mar, de seus senhores. Raios de fogo irão representando, No cego ardor, os bravos domadores. Quanto ali sentirão olhos e ouvidos É fumo, ferro, flamas e alaridos. (X.36)

Of course, these "heroic" feats serve to promote imperial ideology as non-Western Others become victimized. Nevertheless, the dismemberment of the dead bodies seems to reflect an emotional detachment as well. The format of the catalogue then aestheticizes the violence as these catalogues are, according to Feeney, "emblems of order, with everyone all lined up and itemized," which works to "interrupt the chaos of warfare" (190). However, as Beye notes, battle-scenes may become "mechanical and listlike" because of the catalogue (345). In the 67 stanzas of the Lusiadac catalogue that are a display of blood, corpses and weaponry, the use of violence then becomes repetitive, rather mechanical and therefore may lose its effect.¹⁰⁴

Moreover, it is important to note that, besides the violence directed at non-Western Others, there are also casualties on Portuguese side. Curiously, Camões hardly describes any of these injuries, which are rather seen as war trophies. An example is Lourenço de Almeida who, heavily injured, battles until his end:

Com toda üa coxa fora, que em pedaços

Lhe leva um cego tiro que passara,

Se serve inda dos animosos braços

E do grão coração que lhe ficara.

Até que outro pelouro quebra os laços

Com que co alma o corpo se liara:

Ela, solta, voou da prisão fora

Onde súbito se acha vencedora. (X.31)

¹⁰⁴ I believe that the automatism of the battle-scenes also indicates a certain aversion to violence. As Fuchs notes, it was Cervantes who frequently moralized "on arms versus letters" while, at the same time casting a "skeptical eye on both war and heroism" (1843). Camões shares this with his Spanish contemporary, both of whom knew war from firsthand experience. Therefore, an exhaustion of war and violence can also be found in *Os Lusiadas*. By the end of the catalogue it seems that the poet has grown tired of the excess of violence. The final governor that receives the poet's attention is João de Castro, a naval officer who served in expeditions to the Red Sea and in Diu. Curiously, the conquest of Diu is ended in nearly abrupt manner: "Uns, paredes subindo, escusam porta; / ... / Feitos farão tão dinos de memória / Que não caibam em verso ou larga história" (X.71). Especially the last two lines are significant as they point to the limits of language to describe sublime acts of courage, yet without language to express heroic song *kleos* can not be transferred.

The same Lourenço apparently performed great heroic deeds, such as attacking four hundred enemies with only one sword: "Na capitaina imiga, dentro nela / Saltando o fará só com lança e espada / De quatrocentos Mouros despejada" (X.28). Kathleen Long notes how "exaggerated depictions of masculinity" may hint at "overcompensation for some lack" (xii). I believe that the excessive violence and the denial of injury are a form of what Long calls the "reversal of loss or lack," which is often an attempt to "reassert masculine control and at least the aura of superiority" (xii). The heroic conquests that are narrated in canto X also reveal how the use of violence is essential to maintain the empire and there is a certain anxiety between the lines as it is left open how many men die on Portuguese side. It becomes clear that the empire's existence was not automatically guaranteed, but rather under constant pressures due to the resistance of non-Western Others.

In fact, the non-Western enemy is at times able to subvert *kleos*. Meltzer, a scholar of Greek drama, questions "the assumptions upon which *kleos* is based" and notes that the *kleos* gained (or regained) in "a dubious victory over unarmed barbarians" is hollow (254-255). As such, one may question Franciso de Almeida's glory, as he wins his *kleos* by dying from an attack from the previously trivialized Khoikhoi. Almeida's efforts at Diu are in a sense worthless, since before he can receive his glory at home a sad destiny awaits him:

Mas ah, que desta próspera vitória, Com que despois virá ao pátrio Tejo, Quási lhe roubará a famosa glória Um sucesso, que triste e negro vejo! (X.37)

Then Camões recounts the attack of the Khoikhoi at the Cape of Storms, where Almeida loses his life. Camões masterfully links Almeida's faith to canto V where Adamastor already prophesized death to Gama and his men. There is also a link to the innocent honey gatherer that is taken by force by Gama and his men. It shows that:

Cafres selvagens poderão

O que destros imigos não puderam;

E rudos paus tostados sós farão

O que arcos e pelouros não fizeram. (X.38)

The simplicity of their weapons, that are nevertheless very effective, undermines the violent bravado and masculinity of the Portuguese, who need the power of guns and cannonballs to defend their empire. Moreover, as Luís Madureira shows, there is something ironic in the fact that the epic suppresses "the Khoikhoi's human identity and historicity" while they are at the same time able to slaughter Almeida (55). Hence, *kleos* won by dying from a battle with an inferior enemy does subvert the glory awarded to the hero. David Johnson, who refers to historian João de Barros to analyze the death of Almeida, notes that Barros "applauds Almeida's courage and sense of honour, but argues that his fate was meant as a lesson to future generations: 'God allowed this to happen as an example to the living, that they may learn to be more anxious to gain a good name than to acquire wealth.'" (108). The lesson to future generations is also an important

motive of the chronological list of heroic *barões* in canto X. They serve as examples and also imply that future generations should continue their so-called *kleos*.

A final set of examples reveals then how future generations may demystify the concept of *kleos*. It is important to note that a second characteristic also applies to *kleos*, namely the fact that it "is closely associated with the father as well as the individual hero" (Segal: 25). This second aspect is what makes the catalogue of heroes more interesting, as it is in the representation of father and son relationships that the canto becomes more vivid. Often the poet represents the heroes as objects without humanizing them, which is due to an essential characteristic of the concept of *kleos*, namely "the objectification of the hero's personal survival in epic song, the 'imperishable fame' which lives among men and keeps alive the hero's name" (Segal 26). The poet often views *kleos* "retrospectively" and "as part of an heroic tradition" and that tradition can, as Segal notes, "be held up for reflection, examination, criticism" (26). Camões examines *kleos* through his chronological list of leaders and explorers in India, as is shown in the previous section, but seems to put special emphasis on the blood ties between father and son.

Probably, one of the most dramatic stanzas in the catalogue is Francisco de Almeida's passionate and emotional response to his son Lourenço's death:

Eis vem o pai, com ânimo estupendo, Trazendo fúria e mágoa por antolhos, Com que o paterno amor lhe está movendo Fogo no coração, água nos olhos. A nobre ira lhe vinha prometendo Que o sangue fará dar pelos giolhos

Nas inimigas naus; senti-lo-á o Nilo,

Podê-lo-á o Indo ver e o Gange ouvi-lo. (X.33)

Camões seems to emphasize paternal relations as they are part of *kleos*, which is something that is transferred from father to son, but at the same time these relations reflect how imperial masculinity is constructed; important positions in the *Estado da Índia* are often passed from generation to generation (governors all came from the same elite families) or fathers take their sons to the battlefields as a rite of passage into a masculine world. Yet, the excessive violence of the conquest disrupts genealogical succession, as many sons die before their fathers do. In that sense, they may win glory for the father since "kleos is won by the warrior both for himself and for his father" (Redfield 33), but also reveal the beginning of a vacuum, where most men leave the imperial center to die overseas. The *kleos* related to fathers and sons exposes then the effects of imperial paternity on the Portuguese nation of the mid-sixteenth century.

Philip Rothwell has demonstrated how in Portuguese politics and literature there is an abundance of father figures who are "empty," since they either obliterate the Lacanian paternal function (in the sense that there is no affirmation and that it "is stiflingly prohibitive" (20)) or act as a lusotropical father who "is hardly a father at all, at least not to Portugal proper" (21). Although Rothwell's father figures date mostly from the nineteenth century onwards, he does point out to the "plethora of examples from the founding moment of the nation" (18). An important difference between the empty fathers of Rothwell and the fathers in this canto is that the empty father that Rothwell proposes

doesn't have any biological children of his own. Still, I would like to use the terminology that Rothwell proposes, since I see similarities between the empty fathers that he treats in his book and the heroes of canto X. Rothwell notes how "Portugal's empty fathers had been underpinned by the imperial enterprise. Part of their projected personae drew on colonial or colonizing discourses" (20). This is also the case in canto X and follows the scholar's argument that "empire" can be linked "to a malfunctioning father figure" (21). Rothwell states that the Portuguese imperial enterprise "donated' its best youth to an exploration of the globe, and to an albeit bogus and retroactively lusotropical project" and, as a consequence, "denied Portugal its potential fathers" (21). The lusotropical discourse is, according to Rothwell, "at heart, a discourse that evacuates the imperial center, transferring the gift of Portugal's brightest and most adventurous young men to the farthest corners of the known world" (24). I would argue that even before the surge of lusotropicalism, namely during and in the wake of the imperial conquest, Portugal lost its fathers, thereby weakening its center. The examples of father figures from Os Lusiadas, not only the fathers in the heroic catalogue but also Bacchus, reveal that empty paternity was already problematic in Camões time.

As Barbara Goff states, "heroic identity depends on paternity and simultaneously confirms it" and, as such, heroic identity is something that descends "via the male line" (219). Camões also hints several times at the male line, referring to sons as "ramo[s]" (X.63, X.70) thereby recalling the image of the family tree. Yet, some sons are regarded as less heroic than their fathers. For instance, of Vasco da Gama's own sons, Cristovão and Estevão, only the former is briefly mentioned: "Quando um teu ramo, ó Gama, se exprimenta / No governo do Império, cujo zelo / Com medo o Roxo Mar fará amarelo"

(X.63). History teaches that Cristovão died as a prisoner of war, which is not regarded a heroic death, and that Estevão, who governed India for two years, was considered a poor leader.¹⁰⁵ Also, the previously given example of Nuno da Cunha, who was the son of Tristão da Cunha, demonstrates how heroic genes are not always passed down and how *kleos* can be corrupted by the newer generations.

Furthermore, *kleos* can be read as something futile and empty in canto X, as the sons may die a heroic death that awards glory while at the same time generations are lost and a lack of successors will quickly arise. The sons of João de Castro are still very young when taken to war. Álvaro de Castro, a child of thirteen, was knighted while out on an expedition led by Estevão da Gama. A mine blew up the other son, Fernando de Castro, even before he reached Diu (White 256). Stanza 69 describes how João de Castro wants his sons to be offered to God: "Castro libertador, fazendo ofertas / Das vidas de seus filhos, quer que fiquem / Com fama eterna e a Deus se sacrifiquem" (X.69). Sacrifice and fame are regarded as positive and covetable, yet succession and continuation are brought to an end and this may weaken the empire.

These examples, then, show how *kleos*, in the sense that the son continues the glory of the father, fails in the attempt to maintain the Portuguese empire in Asia. There is a lack of men (sons) that can continue the glory of their fathers, and by dying early the

¹⁰⁵ José Manuel Azevedo e Silva and João Marinho dos Santos point out about Diogo de Couto's *Tratado dos feitos de Vasco da Gama e seus filhos na Índia*: "O facto de o *Tratado* lhe ter sido encomendado para enaltecer os feitos do Vasco da Gama e de seus filhos no Oriente, não coibiu Couto de emitir os seus juízos críticos, em nome da verdade histórica e da sua probidade moral. Por exemplo, acusa D. Estevão de manter «*pouco segredo*» e de ser «profiozo» (...) Critica-o por nem sempre conseguir dominar as suas paixões e de ser «hum pouco teimozo (couza que hade fugir quem estiver naquelle lugar» (fl. 126)" (Xxvi).

empire's success is weakened. The concept of empire is linked with empty paternity; the heroes fail in their *kleos* since they become empty fathers, either because they survive their sons or because the sons are otherwise incompetent. *Kleos* here thus becomes a source of anxiety, since in its desperate effort to promote "imperishable fame" it actually demonstrates its exact antithesis, namely "rot and decay" (Segal 40). This rot and decay of the empire is a major concern for Camões as is shown throughout this thesis and may have likely led to the poet's ambiguous representation of the hero.

Conclusion

The construction of masculinity is highly influenced by the historical process of expansionism and imperialism. Therefore, one may state that the representation of the heroes of the Portuguese expansion in *Os Lusíadas* reflects mid-sixteenth century imperial masculinity. Camões narrates the deeds of Gama and his successors mainly in a glorifying way, to support his epic's goal of giving an impulse of renewal to the Portuguese nation. However, an analysis of *kleos*, the Greek term for fame and hearsay that is transferred by the poet's words or gained through dying a heroic death, reveals certain fissures in the heroic discourse. Camões expresses at times an anxiety about his heroes' capabilities and makes a distinction between a literary hero and a martial hero. With the ingenious use of the poetic voice, Camões is able to comment on the heroic ideal.

In this chapter I suggest that the use of the concept of *kleos* may help explain Gama's role as a lesser hero in the poem, which is a contradiction that other scholars have pointed out. The poetics of *kleos* and the inventive use of the poetic voice reveal that Gama was not considered a Classical hero who could lead the epic poem. Rather, the societal changes of Camões's time reflect the ambiguous attitude of the poet, who at times seems to contradict the ideological discourse present in *Os Lusíadas*. The poet plays an important role in the construction of *kleos* or the fame and glory of his heroes. Like the Greek bards that show "tradition operating before our eyes (and in our ears) in the songs about great deeds of the past which poets sing and men 'hear' from generation to generation" (Segal 23), Camões performs his song to exalt the deeds of Gama and his successors. Yet, at the same time, it seems that the poet is in doubt about the heroic skills and morals of his heroes.

Overall, the poet creates an image for the reader of a perfectly governed empire; however, the attentive reader notices the quick successions and, as such, the poet raises doubt about the effectiveness of the empire. Also, the violent and excessive bloodshed may actually point to a lack of security and stability. One can conclude that a careful reading of Canto X reveals that the Portuguese empire was, on one hand, rather fragile and in constant need of defense, while Portuguese governors in Asia were often merciless and extremely violent. On the other hand, the Portuguese empire was also frail, since it was threatened from within by corruption and mismanagement. Camões dedicates notably less attention to those governors that have a doubtful reputation. At times the heroes are represented as Christian martyrs but the sacrifice they make may only be valuable for the act of self-sacrifice. For the sake of the empire their sacrifice is useless because, as the poet knows since he disposes of valuable hindsight, the Portuguese empire was already crumbling during the second half of the sixteenth century. By losing generations of men to a cause that is in decay, Portugal moves from being heroic "leader of the seas" into a marginal position.

The worries of the poet about the course of his beloved nation clarify how issues of gender are paramount. First, Camões reveals an anxiety about the continuation of Portuguese heroic glory as he tries to convince Sebastião to pursue glory and continue the kleos of his ancestors even if the poet has revealed how kleos in Os Lusíadas becomes inverted and useless; instead of pointing to imperial glory, the examples of kleos demonstrate that the empire is under pressure and in a state of decay, and as such masculinity comes under threat due to the failing empire. Furthermore, by anxiously pushing men to the fore, the importance of women for the continuation of the empire is denied. As McClintock remarks "The insistence on the patrimony marks a denial: that something different (a women) is needed to guarantee the reproduction of the same – the son with the same name as the father" (McClintock: 29). Yet, the patrimony that is represented in Os Lusíadas negates not only women; it also promotes the image of the empty father. Hence, the national leaders and heroes represent the emptiness of the patrimony. In a sense, a close reading of masculinity and the heroic in Os Lusíadas may shed an interesting light on Bhabha's question about how anxious ambivalence affects amor patriae.

Conclusion

"Mudam-se os tempos, mudam-se as vontades Muda-se o ser, muda-se a confiança: Todo o mundo é composto de mudança, Tomando sempre novas qualidades."

Luís Vaz de Camões Sonetos

In April 2013, the 20th anniversary of the popular Portuguese news magazine *Visão* was commemorated with the release of a new version of *Os Lusíadas*, written by Portuguese author José Luís Peixoto. The publication of the prose version took place in unison with the painting of a graffiti wall at the Avenida da Índia in Lisbon. José Luís Peixoto claims that his text is a reinterpretation of the epic and that it provides a "visão contemporânea." This indicates that the epic is still a vivid symbol, and that Camões' words speak to the imagination of the Portuguese nation, especially during challenging times.¹⁰⁶

¹⁰⁶ Pedro Camacho, director of *Visão* magazine, summarizes the project as follows: "a *Visão* vai traçar o novo retrato dos portugueses: um povo cada vez mais espalhado pelos quatro cantos do mundo, tentando encontrar, no exterior, a solução para as suas vidas e para o País, e, ao mesmo tempo, disseminando o português como língua universal. É dentro desse espírito que ganha maior significado a edição, em livros, de 'Os Lusíadas,' a obra que glorifica a diáspora portuguesa, que elogia a capacidade dos portugueses para enfrentar os 'mares nunca dantes navegados' e 'darem mais mundos ao mundo.' It seems that, once more, the epic is being used to symbolize the Portuguese nation and that its popularity increases in times of crisis.

The Portuguese initiative is uplifting for someone studying Camões and hoping for a renewed interest in the topic. I hope to have demonstrated with this thesis that a renewed interest is not only desirable but that a new approach to reading *Os Lusíadas* is also necessary. Published more than four centuries ago, the poem has had millions of readers. Nonetheless, opinions and interpretations of the text seem to gravitate around a small and restricted number of possible interpretations.¹⁰⁷ In fact, in the introduction of "Post-imperial Camões," João Figueiredo mentions the "major trend in Camões scholarship" to view the poet and his work as "Portugal's property." The critic rightfully states that, to determine a poem as "the expression of a national soul," is an "idealistic claim" (xiv).

This thesis demythologizes the role of the hero and demonstrates how the poet questions the heroic ideal. Since the epic is one of the literary forms that "explore the nature of masculinity" (30), it is relevant to consider how Camões's poem represents masculinity. My research has partially filled a lacuna in Camonian studies regarding gender, and offers a new reading that lays bare the function of the representations of gender in the poem. This thesis showed how the representation of gender often points to ambiguities and disturbances of the imperial discourse present in the epic. The mythological storyline is significant as many mythological figures either block or help

http://visao.sapo.pt/os-lusiadas-vao-ter-um-mural-em-graffiti-em-lisboa=f722302, accessed 10-6-2013.

¹⁰⁷ I am concerned, for instance, with Peixoto's phrasing of the Tágides as "ninfas da ninfetice total, apesar de mais velhas, mais maduras," as it repositions them as sexy adornments of a text, linking the muses to the popular meaning of the word "nymph." Another example is the depiction of Gama's arrival in India in the mural. Besides the fact that the artists claim to work with "um imaginário pop-surrealista," Gama is received by arguably the Zamorim who is represented as the elephant faced Hindu god Ganesha, thus creating an image of India as "animalized" and "Other."

the heroes thereby exposing the weaknesses of the Portuguese males. Moreover, women and non-Western Others challenge the heroes and question their masculinity. I believe that the portrayals of gender that are present in the poem can give important insights into the time of intense socio-economic and religious transition in which the Portuguese poet lived. As Jane Tylus and Gerry Milligan state "Matters of empire, autonomy, and war seem to produce texts with rich gender-focused arguments" and those texts are often "products of times of cultural unrest" (24). *Os Lusíadas* is such a text, in the sense that mid-sixteenth century Portugal was undergoing significant changes due to its imperial and national course, and it is therefore useful to scrutinize its numerous references to gender.

Chapter one demonstrated how the poet introduces Classical mythology at moments when the imperial discourse is under stress, especially when non-Western Others challenge Portuguese imperial power. Case studies of Adamastor and Bacchus revealed how both are able to prophesize future disgraces, such as death, shipwreck and loss of empire. Their experiences provide a preview of the future of the Portuguese imperial experience and they warn against an excess of greed and desire.

Chapter two then analyzed the representation of women in the poem and showed how the poet focuses mainly on the female body in his descriptions of historical and mythological female figures that are featured in the poem. The historical women, such as Inês de Castro, Leonor Teles and D. Teresa, become objects whose bodies are often linked to violence and sacrifice. The body of the mythological female figures, like Venus and the nymphs, is depicted freely and in a sexualized manner. The focus on the body indicates that Portuguese early modern society was mainly patriarchal and that women were seen as inferior and Other, but also reveals some masculine anxiety, in the sense that men realize that they must rely on women for the continuation of their family name. The sacrifice of the (historical) female body is essential for the political survival of the male, while the sensual mythological body exposes the dangers of female seduction that can threaten masculinity. Moreover, several representations of women in the poem may suggest to D. Sebastião that marriage and sacrifice are of paramount importance.

Chapter three focused on the contradictions in the Isle of Love episode that give valuable insight into the poem's complex time period. I provided a new reading of the Isle of Love episode and explained how space is represented in an ambiguous way in the episode; the landscape is feminized but somehow female power takes the upper hand and is able to subvert masculine "superiority." Moreover, mythology is used as an important rhetorical tool to pose questions regarding D. Sebastião's masculinity. I argued that regardless of its allegorical content, the Isle of Love episode may be seen as central to the epic, as it clarifies the poet's ideas about the nation's future and defines a characterization of the hero.

Finally, chapter four paid attention to Camões' portrayal of Gama as well as his successors. On one hand the poet exalts the deeds of these *conquistadores*, while at the same time doubt is being expressed about the skills and morals of his heroes. The discussion of the term *kleos* clarifies the representation of the heroic; ultimately it is the poet's voice that appoints heroes as it reports and transfers *kleos*. The *kleos* related to fathers and sons exposes the effects of imperial paternity on the Portuguese nation of the mid-sixteenth century. Canto X describes how sons accompany their fathers in conquest, as an important rite of passage confirming their masculinity. However, the canto also

183

reveals how many sons die prior to their fathers and that genealogical succession is therefore disrupted by the excessive violence of the conquest. Consequently, the empty paternity depicted in the final cantos indicates the beginning of a vacuum, in which most men leave the imperial center to die overseas, that eventually will lead to the decay of the empire.

Accordingly, each of the chapters demonstrates that reading the poem with an eye on gender can reveal the impact of a rhetorical encouragement to dedicatee D. Sebastião about how to be a "father" to his nation. Breitenberg points out that "[m]asculine identity in patrilineal cultures largely derives from the resources men inherit, including his status, and what he is able to pass on to his children" (16). I believe that this patrilineal construct was also present in the mid-sixteenth century when Camões wrote his epic, and that it showcases the importance of *kleos*. This is an essential theme for Camões, who uses it to spur on Sebastião to be a better king, by choosing a spouse and creating offspring, therewith ensuring the continuation of Portuguese glory. Sacrifice for the greater good of the nation is paramount, not only for Sebastião, but also for historical women such as Inês de Castro and D. Teresa. In the end, Camões reveals that both men and women are responsible for a glorious future of the Portuguese nation.

As Camões wrote in his sonnet, "Time changes, and our desires change. What we believe - even what we are - is ever-changing." Our perspective on the Portuguese epic poem has changed over the years. Hopefully, now the time is right to consider masculinity and femininity as essential aspects of the poem, so that *Os Lusíadas* can be appreciated even more in the near future.

Bibliography

Medieval Iberia: An Encyclopedia. Ed. E. Michael Gerli. London: Routledge, 2003.

Poetics of Masculinity in Early Modern Italy and Spain, ed. Gerry Milligan and Jane

Tylus, Toronto: Centre for Reformation and Renaissance Studies, 2010.

- Adams, Julia. "The Rule of the Father: Patriarchy and Patrimonialism in Early Modern Europe." *Max Weber at the Milennium: Economy and Sociology for the Twenty-First Century*. Ed. Charles Camic, Philip Gorski and David Trubek: Stanford University Press, 2004.
- Albuquerque, Luís de. "A viagem de Vasco da Gama entre Moçambique e Melinde, segundo *Os Lusíadas* e segundo as crónicas." *Garcia da Horta* número especial (1972): 11-36.
- Alves, Hélio J. S. "Post-Imperial Bacchus: The Politics of Literary Criticism in Camões Studies 1940-2001." *Portuguese Literary & Cultural Studies* 9 Journal Article (2002): 95-106.
- Azevedo, José Manuel e Silva and João Marinho dos Santos. "Introdução." Diogo de Couto's *Tratado dos feitos de Vasco da Gama e seus filhos na Índia*.Lisboa: Edições Cosmos, 1998, xiii-xxv.
- Bacon, Leonard. The Lusiads of Luiz De Camões. New York: Hispanic Society of America, 1950.
- Banks, Jared. "Adamastorying Mozambique: Ualalapi and Os Lusíadas." *Luso-Brazilian Review* 37 1 (2000): 1-16.

- Baroloni, Teodolinda. "The Self in the Labyrinth of Time." Petrarch: A Critical Guide to the Complete Works. Ed. Victoria Kirkham, Armando Maggi: University of Chicago Press, 2009.
- Barros, João de. Os Lusíadas de Luís de Vaz de Camões Contado às Crianças e Lembrados ao Povo. Adaptação em prosa de João de Barros. Lisboa: Marcador, 2012.
- Benedito, Silvério Augusto. "Introdução." Poemas Lusitanos. Castro De António Ferreira. Lisboa: Biblioteca Ulisseia, 1989.
- Berger, Maurice, Brian Wallis, Simon Watson. "Introduction." *Constructing Masculinity*.
 Ed. Maurice Berger, Brian Wallis, Simon Watson. London: Routledge, 1995, 110.
- Bernardes, José Augusto Cardoso. "Camões revistado" Santa Barbara Portuguese Studies, Luiz Vaz de Camões Revistado. Volume VIII, Center for Portuguese Studies, University of California at Santa Barbara, 2003, 9-13.
- Bethencourt, Francisco. *The Inquisition: A Global History* 1478-1834. Cambridge University Press, 1995.
- Beye, Charles Rowan. "Homeric Battle Narrative and Catalogues." *Harvard Studies in Classical Philology* 68 (1964): 345-73.
- Bhabha, Homi K. "Are you a Man or a Mouse?" Constructing Masculinity. Ed. Maurice Berger, Brian Wallis, Simon Watson. London: Routledge, 1995, 57-68.
- ---. The Location of Culture. London: Routledge, 1994.
- Billing, Christian M. "Apparel, Anatomy, Agency: Performative Challenges to Masculine Authority." *Masculinity, Corporality and the English Stage*.

Burlington, VT: Ashgate Publishing Company, 2008.

- Bitterli, Urs. Cultures in Conflict. Encounters between European and Non-European Cultures, 1492-1800. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1989.
- Blackmore, Josiah. *Manifest Perdition. Shipwreck Narrative and the Disruption of Empire*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2002.
- ----. *Moorings: Portuguese Expansion and the Writing of Africa*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2009.
- Bordo, Susan. "The Cartesian Masculinization of Thought." *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society* 11 3 (1986): 439-56.
- Botelho, Keith M. *Renaissance Earwitnesses: Rumor and Early Modern Masculinity*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009.
- Breitenberg, Mark. *Anxious Masculinity in Early Modern England*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1996.
- Brownlee, Marina. "The Dark Side of Myth in Camões' 'Frail Bark'." *Comparative Literature Studies* 32 2 (1995): 176-90.
- Bruquetas de Castro, Fernando. *Reis que amaram como Rainhas*. Lisboa: Esfera dos Livros, 2010.

Bull, Malcolm. The Mirror of the Gods. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005.

- Burton, Robert. *The Anatomy of Melancholy*. Part 2. Kessinger Publishing Rare Prints. http://www.kessinger.net
- Cabral Coser, Miriam. "Leonor Teles, rainha de coração cavalheiresco." *Esboços* 14 No. 18 (2007) : 11-30.

Calçada, Guiomar F. "O papel do Catual no poema Camoniano." Revista Camoniana

III Publicação do centro de estudos portugueses da universidade de São Paulo (Brasil) (1980): 97-112.

- Camões, Luís Vaz de. *The Lusíads*. Trans. White, Landeg. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001.
- Carroll, Margaret D. "The Erotics of Absolutism: Rubens and the Mystification of Sexual Violence." *Representations* No. 25 (Winter, 1989): 3-30.
- Cirurgião, António. "S. Helena é a Ilha dos Amores de Os Lusíadas." *Ocidente* (LXXIX) (1970): 206-212.
- Coates, Timothy J. Convicts and Orphans. Forced and State-Sponsored Colonizers in the Portuguese Empire, 1550-1755. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2001.
- Connell, R.W. "The History of Masculinity." *The Masculinity Studies Reader*. Ed. Rachel Adams, David Savran. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 2002, 245-261.
- Corrêa, Eloísa Porto. "Mais ou menos Marias: Alguns comportamentos femininos exaltados em *Os Lusíadas.*" *Cadernos do CNLF (Congresso Nacional de Linguística e Filologia)* XI 14 (2008): 70-86.
- Davis, Elizabeth. *Myth and Identity in the Epic of Imperial Spain*. Columbia: University of Missouri Press, 2000.
- Day, Malcolm, ed. 100 Characters from Classical Mythology. London : Quarto Publishing, 2007.
- Dias, Augusto Epiphanio da Silva. Os Lusíadas por Luís de Camões; Commentados por Augusto Epiphanio da Silva Dias. Porto, 1910.

Dionísio, Maria Letícia. "Introdução" Os Lusíadas. Publicações Europa-América, 1997.

- Dirks, Nicholas B. "Foreword." Colonialism and Its Forms of Knowledge: The British in India. Bernard S. Cohn. Princeton University Press, 1996, ix-xvii.
- Dixon, Paul B. "History as Prophecy in Camões's Os Lusíadas." *Luso-Brazilian Review* 22 2 (1985): 145-50.
- Earle, Thomas. "Rhetoric and The Construction of Narrative in *Os Lusíadas.*" Santa Barbara Portuguese Studies, Luiz Vaz de Camões Revistado. Volume VIII, Center for Portuguese Studies, University of California at Santa Barbara, 2003, 67-78.
- Elwert, W. Theodor. "Die Rolle Der Erotik in Den Lusiaden Des Camões." Homenagem a Joseph M. Piel por ocasião do seu 85.0 Aniversário. Ed. Kremer, Dieter. Tubingen: Niemeyer, 1988. 513-29.
- Ferreira, Ana Paula. "Uma lição de economia doméstica em tempos de inconstância." O rosto feminino da expansão portuguesa (1994): 105-112.
- Feeney, Denis. "Epic Violence, Epic Order. Killings, Catalogues and the Role of the Reader in Aeneid 10." *Reading Vergil's Aeneid: An Interpretive Guide*. Ed. Perkell, Christine G.: University of Oklahoma Press, 1999.
- Figueiredo, João R. "Comic Readings." *Portuguese Literary & Cultural Studies* 9 Post-Imperial Camões (2002): 153-64.
- --., "Pais Tiranos: O Baco de Os Lusíadas e Camões." A Teoria Do Programa. Uma Homenagem a Maria De Lourdes Ferraz E a M.S. Lourenço. Ed. Tamen, António M. Feijó e Miguel. Lisboa: Programa em Teoria da Literatura. Universidade de Lisboa, 2007.

Flor, João Almeida, ed. O Naufrágio De Sepúlveda. A Tragic Story of the Sea. Lisboa:

CEAUL, 2008.

- Foley, Helene P. "Women in Ancient Epic." A Companion to Ancient Epic. Ed. Foley, John Miles. Oxford Blackwell Publishing, 2005, 105-118.
- Fonseca, Pedro. "Discurso do género e identidade cultural na épica portuguesa ultramarina: Vénus e o oriente em Os Lusíadas de Camões." Lucero: A Journal of Iberian and Latin American Studies 8 (1997): 83-93.
- Friedman, Susan Stanford. "Gender and Genre Anxiety: Elizabeth Barrett Browning and H.D. As Epic Poets." *Tulsa Studies in Women's Literature* 5 2 (1986): 203-28.
- Fuchs, Barbara. "Dismantling Heroism: The Exhaustion of War in Don Quijote." *PMLA*, 124 (2009). 1842-1846.
- ---,."Imperium Studies: Theorizing Early Modern Expansion," in *Postcolonial Moves: Medieval through Modern*. Eds. Patricia Clare Ingham and Michelle R. Warren. New York: Palgrave, 2003, 71-90.
- ---,. *Mimesis and Empire: the New World, Islam, and European Identities*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001.
- Gaertner, Jan Felix. "The Homeric Catalogues and Their Function in Epic Narrative." *Hermes* 129 (2001): 298-305.
- Garay, René P. "First Encounters: Epic, Gender and the Portuguese Overseas Venture."
 Global Impact of the Portuguese Language. Ed. Rodriguez de Laguna, Asela.
 Mla-Ib. New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction, 2001. 77-94.
- Giamatti, A. Bartlett. *The Earthly Paradise and the Renaissance Epic*. Princeton, N.J: Princeton University Press, 1966.

Gifford, Terry. Pastoral. The New Critical Idiom. London: Routledge, 1999.

- Gimbel, Martha. "Thetis and Venus: Motherhood in Epic." *Brown Classical Journal* 19 (2007): 67-70.
- Goff, Barbara. "Sons of the Shield: Paternal Arms in Epic and Tragedy." Allusion, Authority, and Truth: Critical Perspectives on Greek Poetic and Rhetorical Praxis. Eds. Philip Mitsis and Christos Tsagalis. New York: De Gruyter, (2010): 319-334.
- Goldhill, Simon. *The poet's voice: essays on poetics and Greek literature*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991.
- Gonçalves, Luiz da Cunha. "Capítulo 1. O episódio da Ilha Namorada." *Estudos Camonianos*. Ed. Barreira, Editorial Domingos. Porto, 1947, 1-48.
- Gray, Stephen. "The White Mans Creation Myth of Africa." *Southern African Literature: An Introduction*. David Philip, 1979. 15-37.
- Greenblatt, Stephen. *Marvelous Possessions: The Wonder of the New World*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1991.
- Greene, Thomas *The Descent from Heaven. A Study in Epic Continuity*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1963.
- Hall, Kim F. Things of Darkness. Economies of Race and Gender in Early Modern England. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1995.

Hardie, Philip. "Metamorphosis, Metaphor and Allegory in Latin Epic." *Epic Traditions in the Contemporary World: The Poetics of Community*. Ed. Beissinger, Margaret, Tylus, Jane, Susanne Lindgren Wofford: University of California Press, 1999, 89-107.

- Hart, Thomas R. "The Author's Voice in the Lusiads." *Hispanic Review* 44 1 (1976): 45-55.
- Higgins, Lynn A. and Silver, Brenda R., "Introduction." *Rape and Representation*. Ed. Higgins, Lynn A. and Silver, Brenda R. New York: Columbia University Press, 1991, 1-14.
- Hutchinson, Amélia P. "Encontro de horizontes: um estudo metahistórico das figuras de Leonor Teles e Filipa de Lencastre nas crónicas de Fernão Lopes." *Hispania* 85
 No. 3, Special Portuguese Issue (2002): 476-85.
- Johnson, David. "Remembering the Khoikhoi Victory over Dom Francisco Almeida at the Cape in 1510.2 *Postcolonial Studies*, 12 1 (2009): 107-30.
- Johnson, Harold. "A Pedophile in the Palace or The Sexual Abuse of King Sebastian of Portugal (1554–1578) and Its Consequences." *Pelo Vaso Traseiro: Sodomy and Sodomites in Luso-Brazilian History*. Ed. Harold Johnson and Francis A. Dutra, eds. Tucson: Fenestra Books, 2007, 195–229.
- Juniór, António Salgado. "Os Lusíadas e Viagem do Gama. O Tratamento Mitológico duma Realidade Histórica." Conferencia realizada no Clube Fenianos Portuenses. Porto, 1938.
- Keith, A.M. *Engendering Rome. Women in Latin Epic* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000.
- Kelly, Joan. "Did Women Have a Renaissance?" Women, History, and Theory: The Essays of Joan Kelly. University of Chicago Press, 1986, 19-48.
- Klaus, Sidney N. "A History of the Science of Pigmention." *The Pigmentary System: Physiology and Pathophysiology*. Ed. James J. Nordlund, Raymond E. Boissy,

Vincent J. Hearing, Richard A. King. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2006, 5-11.

- Klobucka, Anna. "Lusotropical Romance: Camões, Gilberto Freyre, and the Isle of Love." *Portuguese Literary & Cultural Studies* 9 (2002): 121-38.
- Lacy, Ronald, "Aktaion and a Lost 'Bath of Artemis'" *The Journal of Hellenic Studies* 110 (1990): 26-42.
- Lamas, Maria Paula. D. Maria e D. Inês n'Os Lusíadas. Estudo histórico-literário. Lisboa: Prefácio, 2005.
- Lanciani, Giulia. Sucessos e naufrágios das naus portuguesas. Lisboa: Caminho, 1997.
- Larson, Jennifer. Greek Nymphs. Myth, Cult, Lore. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001.
- Lazarro, Claudia. "The Visual Language of Gender in Sixteenth-Cantury Garden Sculpture." *Refiguring Woman: Perspectives on Gender and the Italian Renaissance*. Ed. J.Schiesari and M. Migiel. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1991.
- Long, Kathleen. "Introduction." High Anxiety: Masculinity in Crisis in Early Modern France. Ed. Long, Kathleen. Kirksville, Missouri: Truman State University Press, 2002, ix-xvii.

Lopes, David. "A Ilha Dos Amores Num Conto Oriental Árabe." Portucale III 14 (1941).

- Lourenço, António Lopes. "A Ilha dos Amores na Realidade e na Fantasia." *Conferencia proferida na Casa Militar (Circulo dos Amigos da Índia)*. Lisboa, 1958.
- Macedo, Hélder. "Conceptual Oppositions in the Poetry of Camões." *Portuguese Literary* & *Cultural Studies* 9 Post-Imperial Camões (1999): 63-78.

- ---., "The Lusiads: Epic Celebration and Pastoral Regret." *Portuguese Studies* 6 (1990): 32-37.
- ---., "The Purpose of Praise. Past and Future in *The Lusiads* of Luís de Camões." Inaugural Lecture for the Camoens Chair of Portuguese. King's College London. November 15. 1983.
- Madeira, José. Camões contra a expansão e o império. Os Lusíadas como antiepopeia. Lisboa: Fenda, 2000.
- Madureira, Luís. "Where's the Difference? The Question of Lusophone Postcolonialism."

http://kellogg.nd.edu/projects/FLAD/pdfs/Madureira,%20Luis.pdf

---., "Where the Land Ends and the Sea Begins : The Margins of a Littoral Empire." Imaginary Geographies in Portuguese and Lusophone-African Literature.

Narratives of Discovery and Empire. New York: The Edwin Mellen Press, 2006.

- Marcus, Stephen. The Other Victorians: A Study of Sexuality and Pornography in Mid-Nineteenth-Century England. New York: Basic Books, 1966.
- Marques, António Henrique de Oliveira. *Daily Life in Portugal in the Late Middle Ages*. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1971.

---., History of Portugal. New York: Columbia University Press, 1976.

Mattoso, José. História De Portugal. Vol. 2. Lisboa: Estampa, 1993.

- McClintock, Anne. Imperial Leather: Race, Gender and Sexuality in the Colonial Contest. New York: Routledge, 1995.
- Medeiros, Paulo de. "Post-Colonial Identities." In H. Buescu & M.R. Sanches (Eds.), ACT 6: Literatura e Viagens Pós-Coloniais. Lisboa: Edições Colibri / Centro de

Estudos Comparatistas, 2002, 49-62.

- ---., "Voiding the Centre: Notes Towards a Reconfiguration of Postcolonial Studies."
 Towards a Portuguese Postcolonialism -Lusophone Studies. Ed. Soares, Anthony.
 Vol. 4. Bristol: University of Bristol Department of Hispanic, Portuguese &
 Latin American Studies, 2006, 27-46.
- Meihuizen, Nicholas. "Camões: Ambiguous Imperialist." *Portuguese Studies* 18 January 1 (2002): 24-40.
- Melo, Francisco Manuel de. *Carta de Guia de Casados* (1651), <u>http://www.uc.pt/uid/celga/recursosonline/cecppc/textosempdf/05cartadeguiadeca</u> <u>sados</u>. 04-23-2013.
- Meltzer, Gary S. "Where Is the Glory of Troy?" 'Kleos' In Euripides' 'Helen'." *Classical Antiquity* 13 (1994): 234-55.
- Messing, Andrew. "Protofeminist or Misogynist? Medea as a Case Study of Gendered
 Discourse in Euripidean Drama." *Kingston-Mann Award wining Essay* (2010).
 28-03-2010

<http://www.kmawards.umb.edu/essays2009/documents/Messing.pdf>.

Midgley, Clare. "Imperialism: Mapping the Connections." *Gender and Imperialism*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2006.

Miller, Dean. The Epic Hero. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 2000.

- Miranda, José da Costa. "Uma outra vez, Camões versus Ariosto?" *Revista Lusitana* (7) (1986), 5-28.
- Murrin, Michael. *History and Warfare in Renaissance Epic*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1994.

Montrose, Louis. "The Work of Gender in the Discourse of Discovery." *Representations*. Special Issue: The New World (Winter, 1991): 1-41.

Moser, Gerald. "Camões' Shipwreck." Hispania, 57 (1974): 213-219.

- Most, Glenn W. "Hellenistic Allegory and Early Imperial Rhetoric." *The Cambridge Companion to Allegory*. Ed. Copeland, Rita and Struck, Peter T. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010.
- Moura, Vasco Graça. *Luís De Camões : Alguns Desafios*. Lisboa: Editorial Vega, 1980.
- ---., "Oitavas Esquecidas De Camões." *Os Penhascos E a Serpente E Outros Ensaios Camonianos*. Lisboa: Quetzal Editores, 1987, 185-213.
- Myrttinen, Henri. "Disarming Masculinities." *Women, Men, Peace and Security* 4 (2003): 37-46.
- Negra, Henrique Manuel da Torre. Ilha Dos Amores (Dados para a sua Identificação). Lisboa, 1938.
- Newitt, Malyn. A History of Portuguese Overseas Expansion, 1400-1668. London: Routledge, 2005.
- Newitt, Maylin. The First Portuguese Colonial Empire University of Exeter Press, 1986.
- Nóbrega, Luiza. "A Traça no Pano (Contradicção de Baco n'*Os Lusíadas*)". Santa Barbara Portuguese Studies, Luiz Vaz de Camões Revistado. Volume VIII, Center for Portuguese Studies, University of California at Santa Barbara, 2003, 79-116.

- Nocentelli-Truett, Carmen. "Islands of Love: Europe, 'India', and Interracial Romance." Diss. Stanford University, 2004. *Dissertation Abstracts International, Section A: The Humanities and Social Sciences* 65 4 (2004): 1358.
- Oliveira Martins, J. P. *Camões, Os Lusíadas e a Renascença em Portugal.* Vol. 3. Lisboa: Guimarães, 1952.

Outram Evennett, H. "Towards a New Definition." *The Spirit of the Counter-Reformation*. Cambridge University Press, 1968, 1-22.

- Ovtcharenko, Olga. "A mulher na obra Camoniana." *Coloquio/Letras* 125-126, (1992), 9-13.
- Pearson, M.N. . *The Portuguese in India*. The New Cambridge History of India. Ed. Johnson, Gordon. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006.
- Perkins, Juliette. " 'D.Inês Tomou Conta das Nossas Almas:' the Enduring National Treasure." *Portuguese Studies* 13 (1997): 43-65.
- Petrarca, Francesco. *Petrarch: The Canzoniere, Or Rerum Vulgarium Fragmenta*. Translated with notes and comments by Mark Musa. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1999.
- Petropoulos, J.C.B. *Kleos in a Minor Key: The Homeric Education of a Little Prince*. Bloomington: Harvard University Press, 2011.
- Pierce, Frank. "Camões and Inês De Castro." Ocidente -Número especial. (1972): 123-32.
- ---., "The Place of Mythology in the Lusiads." *Comparative Literature* 6 No. 2 (Spring, 1954): 97-122.

- Piper, Anson C. "Direct Discourse in the Lusíadas." *Luso-Brazilian Review* 2 No. 1 (Summer, 1965): 57-65.
- ---., "The Feminine Presence in 'Os Lusíadas'." *Hispania: A Journal Devoted to the Teaching of Spanish and Portuguese* 57 2 (1974): 231-38.
- Poor, Sara and Jana Schulman. *Women and Medieval Epic: Gender, Genre, and the Limits of Epic Masculinity*. New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2007.
- Pucci, Pietro. "The Language of the Muses." In Classical Mythology in Twentieth Century Thought and Literature. Ed. Wendell M. Aycock and Theodore Klein. Lubbock: Texas Tech Press, 1980, 163-186.
- Quint, David. "The Epic Curse and Camões's Adamastor." *Epic and Empire: Politics and Generic Form from Virgil to Milton*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1993, 99-125.
- Rabassa, Clementine C. "Cynegetics and Irony in the Thematic Unity of The 'Lusiads'." *Luso-Brazilian Review* 10 No. 2 (Winter, 1973) (1973): 197-207.
- ---., "The Political Significance of Women in Canto III of the *Lusiads*." *Luso-Brazilian Review* 17 2 (1980): 187-97.
- Rajan, Balachandra. "The Lusiads and the Asian Reader." Under Western Eyes: India from Milton to Macaulay. Durham: Duke University Press, 1999, 31-49.
- Ramalho, Américo da Costa. *Estudos Camonianos*. Lisboa: Instituto Nacional de Investigação Científica, 1980.
- Raman, Shankar. "The Ambiguous Cosmos: Epic and Voyage in Luís Vaz De Camões's 'Os Lusíadas'." *Framing 'India': The Colonial Imaginary in Early*

Modern Culture. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2002, 29-88.

Ramos, Emanuel Paulo. Os Lusíadas de Luís de Camões. Porto: Porto Editora, 1980.

- Rector, Monica. *Mulher, objecto e sujeito da Literatura Portuguesa*. Porto: Edições Universidade Fernando Pessoa, 1999.
- Redfield, James M. *Nature and Culture in the Iliad: The Tragedy of Hector*. Duke University Press, 1994.
- Reeser, Todd W. *Moderating Masculinity in Early Modern Culture*. Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 2006.
- Rhodius, Apollonius. *The Argonautika: Expanded Edition*. Trans. Intro. Peter Green. California: University of California Press, 2007.
- Rose, Mary Beth *Gender and Heroism in Early Modern English Literature*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2002.
- Rothwell, Philip. *A Canon of Empty Fathers*. Lewisburg: Bucknell University Press, 2007.
- Salzmann-Mitchell, Patricia B. A Web of Fantasies: Gaze, Image, and Gender in Ovid's Metamorphoses. Columbus: Ohio State University Press, 2005.

Santos, Boaventura de Sousa. "Entre Próspero e Caliban: Colonialismo, Pós-

Colonialismo e Inter-Identidade." Luso-Brazilian Review 39 2 (2002): 9-43.

Saraiva, António José. Estudos Sobre a Arte d'Os Lusíadas. Lisboa: Gradiva, 1992.

---., Luís De Camões. Lisboa: Gradiva, 1997.

---., O Crepúsculo da Idade Média em Portugal. Lisboa: Gradiva, 1990.

Scott, Joan Wallach. "Gender: a Useful Category of Historical Analysis." *Gender and the Politics of History.* New York: Columbia University Press, 1988, 28-50.

- Sena, Jorge de. Trinta anos de Camões, 1948-1978 : Estudos Camonianos e correlatos. Lisboa: Edições 70, 1980.
- Segal, Charles. "*Kleos* and Its Ironies in the *Odyssey*." *Antiquité Classique* 52 (1983): 22-47.
- Sérgio, António. Em torno das ideias políticas de Camões; seguido de Camões panfletário (Camões e Dom Sebastião). Lisboa: Sá da Costa, 1977.
- Seznec, Jean. The Survival of the Pagan Gods. The Mythological Tradition and its Place in Renaissance Humanism and Art. Princeton University Press: 1981.
- Shephard, Alexandra. *Meanings of Manhood in Early Modern England*. Oxford University Press, 2006.
- Silva, John de Oliveira e. "Moving the Monarch : The Rhetoric of Persuasion in Camões's Lusiadas." *Renaissance Quarterly* 53 No. 3 (Autumn) (2000): 735-68.
- Silva, Vítor Manuel de Aguiar e. "Função e significado do episódio da 'Ilha dos Amores' na estrutura de Os Lusíadas." *Camões : Labirintos e Fascínios*. Lisboa: Cotovia, 1994, 145-53.
- Silva, Vítor Aguiar e. "O mito de Baco e seu significado n'Os Lusíadas." *A lira dourada e a tuba canora: novos ensaios camonianos*. Lisboa: Cotovia, 2008, 131-151.
- Sims, James H. "Delicious Paradise' In Os Lusíadas and in Paradise Lost." Ocidente -Número especial. (1972): 163-72.
- Skinner, Marilyn B. *Sexuality in Greek and Roman Culture*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2005.
- Soares, Anthony. "The Violent Maintenance of the Portuguese Colonial Identity and the Search for a Postcolonial One: Literary Images of Portugal as a Colonial and

Postcolonial Nation." *Ellipsis: Journal of the American Portuguese Studies Association* (4) (2006): 79-97.

- Sousa, Maria Leonor Machado de. "Camões e a divulgação do episódio de Inês de Castro." Camoniana Californiana: Commemorating the Quadricentennial of the Death of Luís Vaz De Camões: Proceedings of the Colloquium Held at the University of California, Santa Barbara, April 25 and 26, 1980. Ed. Maria de Lourdes Belchior and EnriqueMartinez-López. Santa Barbara: Jorge de Sena Center for Portuguese Studies, 1985, 145-154.
- Sousa, Ronald de. "Camões: The Noble Poet." *The Rediscoverers: Major Writers in the Portuguese Literature of National Regeneration*. University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1981, 11-45.
- ---., "Philosophical Implications of Camões: Use of Classical Mythological Tradition in the Adamastor Episode of Os Lusíadas." *Garcia de Orta* numéro especial (1972): 535-46.
- Souza, Valéria M. "'Irate, with no grace of style': Stuttering, Logorrhea and Disordered
 Speech among Male Characters in Luís Vaz de Camões' The Lusiads (1572)" *Talking Normal: Speech Disorders in Literature, Film, and Culture*. Ed. Chris
 Eagle. London: Routledge, 2013.

Steadman, John M. "The Arming of an Archetype. Heroic Virtue and the Conventions of Literary Epic." Ed.Reagan, Norman T. Burns & Christopher J. The Fourth and Fifth Annual Conferences of the Center for Medieval and Early Renaissance Studies. 1971-1972. State University of New York Press.

- Subrahmanyam, Sanjay. *The Career and Legend of Vasco Da Gama*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1997.
- ---., *The Portuguese Empire in Asia, 1500-1700: A Political and Economic History*. West Sussex: Wiley-Blackwell, 2012.
- Teixeira da Mota, Avelino. "A África Ocidental em Os Lusíadas." Garcia da Horta número especial (1972): 381-92.
- Tocco, Valeria. *A lira destemperada. sobre a tradição manuscrita de Os Lusíadas*. Bari: Adriatica Editrice, 2005.
- Underdown, D. E., "The Taming of the Scold: The Enforcement of Patriarchal Authority in Early Modern England." *Order and Disorder in Early Modern England*. Ed.
 Anthony Fletcher and John Stevenson. Cambridge University Press: 1985, 116-136.
- Vieira, Fátima. "The Concept of Utopia." *The Cambridge Companion to Utopian Literature*. Ed. Gregory Claes. Cambridge University Press, 2010, 3-27.
- Vieira, Yara Frateschi. "Mitologia, Alegoria e Erotismo: Observação sobre o "Discurso Alusivo" De Camões." *Revista Camoniana* III Publicação do centro de estudos portugueses da universidade de São Paulo (1980): 189-808.
- Walker, Roger M. "Reacção ou Progresso? Baco ou Vénus? Pergunta de Camões Ainda sem Resposta." Ocidente -Número especial. (1972): 173-81.
- Wiesner, Merry E. *Women and Gender in Early Modern Europe*. Cambridge University Press, 2000.
- Willis, Clive. "The Correspondence of Camões (with Introduction, Commentaries, Translation and Notes)." *Portuguese Studies* 11 (1995): 15-61.

- Winkler, Jack. "Gardens of Nymphs: Public and Private in Sappho's Lyrics." *Reading Sappho. Contemporary Aproaches*. Ed. Greene, Ellen. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1996, 89-112.
- Wofford, Susane Lindgren. *The Choice of Achilles: The Ideology of Figure in the Epic*. Stanford University Press, 1992.
- Wolfthal, Diane. *Images of Rape. The "Heroic" Tradition and Its Alternatives*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1999.
- Zemon Davis, Natalie. "Women on Top: Symbolic Sexual Inversion and Political
 Disorder in Early Modern Europe." Society and Culture in Early Modern France:
 Eight Essays by Natalie Zemon Davis. Stanford University Press, 1975, 147-190.